立法會 Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)2513 /07-08 (These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref: CB2/BC/13/06

Bills Committee on Independent Police Complaints Council Bill

Minutes of meeting held on Tuesday, 27 May 2008, at 11:00 am in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

Members : Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP (Chairman)

present Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

Hon Margaret NG

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

Hon James TO Kun-sun

Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Hon KWONG Chi-kin

Members : Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

absent Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

Public Officers: The Administration attending

Mrs Jessie TING, JP

Deputy Secretary for Security

Ms Manda CHAN

Principal Assistant Secretary for Security

Ms Jane LEE

Assistant Secretary for Security

Mr FAN Sik-ming

Chief Superintendent of Police (Complaints and Internal Investigations Branch)

Ms WONG Ching-han Senior Inspector of Police

Ms Fanny IP

Senior Assistant Law Draftsman

Independent Police Complaints Council

Mrs Philomena LEUNG

Secretary, Independent Police Complaints Council

Mr Brandon CHAU

Deputy Secretary, Independent Police Complaints Council

Clerk in : Mrs Sharon TONG

attendance Chief Council Secretary (2) 1

Staff in : Mr LEE Yu-sung

attendance Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 1

Mr Raymond LAM

Senior Council Secretary (2) 5

Ms Camy YOONG Clerical Assistant (2) 1

I. Continue discussion on the Bill

The Bills Committee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

2. The Bills Committee requested the Administration -

- (a) to review the scope of clause 20(1)(a), having regard to the definition of "material" in the Organized and Serious Crimes Ordinance;
- (b) to consider adding "and investigation report" after "relating to a reportable complaint" in clause 20(1)(a);
- (c) to consider amending clause 20(1)(b) along the lines of "to clarify any fact, discrepancy, allegation or conclusion relating to a reportable complaint and investigation report and to provide further information or material relating to such clarification";
- (d) to consider adding ", information or material" after "explanations" in clause 15(3);
- (e) to consider revising the drafting of clause 21(2)(b) in relation to the word "notified":
- (f) to consider requiring a notification under clause 21(2)(b) to be given by registered post and setting out such a requirement in the Bill;
- (g) to consider amending clause 23(1) along the lines that a member of the Council might, at any time and without appointment, attend interviews or observe the investigation of a reportable complaint, including but not limited to subclauses (a) and (b); and
- (h) to consider providing in sections 10 and 14 of Schedule 1 to the Bill how a member of IPCC or its committee who had an interest in a matter being discussed or to be discussed should be handled, taking into account the requirement for observers to withdraw from an interview or observation of collection of evidence as specified in clause 34(3)(c).
- 3. The Bills Committee noted that IPCC had confirmed that its suggested amendments to clause 20 as attached to its letter of 16 May 2008 represented IPCC's latest position regarding the draft wording for its proposed amendment to clause 20 of the Bill.
- 4. In connection with clause 22, the Administration informed the Bills Committee that -
 - (a) it would propose amendments to the effect that the Commissioner of Police must inform a complainant or his representative of the classification of his complaint and the reason for the classification, and that the clause did not apply to cases where the complainant

- or his representative had indicated to the Commissioner of Police that he did not wish to be so informed; and
- (b) the Police would in future address questions from complainants relating to operational matters and unrelated to the complaint in question so that IPCC's replies to complainants would be confined to matters related to the latter's request for review.

II. Date of next meeting

- 5. The Bills Committee noted that the next meeting had been scheduled for 29 May 2008 at 10:45 am. The Bills Committee also noted that if the business on the Agenda of the Council meeting of 28 May 2008 could not be finished on the same day and the Council meeting was to be resumed in the morning of 29 May 2008, the Bills Committee meeting scheduled for 29 May 2008 would be cancelled.
- 6. The meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

Council Business Division 2 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 4 July 2008

Proceedings of meeting of the Bills Committee on Independent Police Complaints Council Bill on Tuesday, 27 May 2008, at 11:00 am in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|---|--|---|
| 000000 - 000337 | Chairman Hon Emily LAU Clerk | Arrangements for the next meeting to be held on 29 May 2008 | |
| 000338 - 002100 | Admin Hon James TO Chairman | Draft amendments proposed by the Independent Police Complaints Council (IPCC) to clause 20; IPCC's latest position regarding the draft wording for its proposed amendment to clause 20 of the Bill; Administration's position regarding the amendments proposed by IPCC to clause 20 | |
| 002101 - 003728 | Hon Alan LEONG Hon Mrs Selina CHOW Hon Margaret NG Chairman Admin | Whether the Commissioner of Police should be required to provide a brief summary of the information/material referred to in the new subclause proposed by IPCC to clause 20 | |
| 003729 - 004522 | Hon James TO Admin Chairman | Scope of clause 20(1)(a); definition of "material" in the Organized and Serious Crimes Ordinance | Admin to review the scope of clause 20(1)(a), having regard to the definition of "material" in the Organized and Serious Crimes Ordinance |
| 004523 - 011009 | Hon James TO Hon Mrs Selina CHOW Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Admin Chairman Secretary of IPCC | Scope of clause 20 (1)(b); adding "and investigation report" after "relating to a reportable complaint" in clause 20(1)(a); amending clause 20(1)(b) along the lines of "to clarify any fact, discrepancy, allegation or | Admin to consider adding "and investigation report" after "relating to a reportable complaint" in |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action Required |
|--------------------|---|--|---|
| | | conclusion relating to a reportable complaint and investigation report and to provide further information or material relating to such clarification" | clause 20(1)(a); to consider amending clause 20(1)(b) along the lines of "to clarify any fact, discrepancy, allegation or conclusion relating to a reportable complaint and investigation report and to provide further information or material relating to such clarification" |
| 011010 - 011442 | Hon James TO Chairman Admin | Clauses relating to the categorisation of notifiable complaints; adding ", information or material" after "explanations" in clause 15(3) | Admin to consider adding ", information or material" after "explanations" in clause 15(3) |
| 011443 - 011638 | Admin | Briefing on clause 21 | |
| 011639 - 012950 | Hon James TO Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung Admin Chairman SALA1 | Examination of clause 21; provisions regarding service by post in the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1); meaning of clause 21(2)(b) in relation to the word "notified"; requiring a notification under clause 21(2)(b) to be given by registered post and setting out such a requirement in the Bill | Admin to consider revising the drafting of clause 21(2)(b) in relation to the word "notified"; to consider requiring a notification under clause 21(2)(b) to be given by registered post and setting out such a requirement in the Bill |

| Time | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action |
|--------------------|--|--|---|
| 012951 - 013757 | Admin Chairman Hon James TO Secretary of IPCC | Examination of clause 22; amendments to be proposed by the Administration to clause 22 and steps to be taken by the Police in respect of questions from complainants relating to operational matters and unrelated to the complaint in question | Required |
| 013758 - 014315 | Admin Hon James TO Chairman | Examination of clause 23; amending clause 23(1) along the lines that a member of the Council might, at any time and without appointment, attend interviews or observe the investigation of a reportable complaint, including but not limited to subclauses (a) and (b) | Admin to consider amending clause 23(1) along the lines that a member of the Council might, at any time and without appointment, attend interviews or observe the investigation of a reportable complaint, including but not limited to subclauses (a) and (b) |
| 014316 - 015942 | Hon James TO Chairman Admin SALA1 | Providing in sections 10 and 14 of Schedule 1 to the Bill how a member of IPCC or its committee who had an interest in a matter being discussed or to be discussed should be handled, taking into account the requirement for observers to withdraw from an interview or observation of collection of evidence as specified in clause 34(3)(c) | Admin to consider providing in sections 10 and 14 of Schedule 1 to the Bill how a member of IPCC or its committee who had an interest in a matter being discussed or to be discussed should be handled, taking into account the requirement for observers to withdraw from an interview or observation of collection of |

| Time | Speaker | Subject(s) | Action |
|--------|---------|------------|--|
| marker | | | Required |
| | | | evidence as specified in clause 34(3)(c) |

Council Business Division 2 <u>Legislative Council Secretariat</u> 4 July 2008