

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 4

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 25 October 2006 at 11:00 am,
Thursday 26 October 2006 at 9:00 am and Friday 27 October 2006 at 9:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
(absent on 26.10.2006 & 27.10.2006)

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP (absent on 26.10.2006)

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP (absent on 27.10.2006)

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP (absent on 25.10.2006)

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (absent on 26.10.2006)

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP (absent on 27.10.2006)
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung (absent on 25.10.2006 & 26.10.2006)
Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG
The Hon KWONG Chi-kin
The Hon TAM Heung-man

Public officers attending:

On 25.10.2006, 26.10.2006 and 27.10.2006

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

On 25.10.2006

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

On 25.10.2006 and 27.10.2006

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

On 26.10.2006 and 27.10.2006

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

On 27.10.2006

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP
Head, Central Policy Unit

Clerks in attendance:

On 25.10.2006, 26.10.2006 and 27.10.2006

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 25.10.2006

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels) (Fees) Regulation (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	212/2006
2. Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels) (Amount of Insurance Cover) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	213/2006
3. Designation of Museum (Dr Sun Yat-sen Museum) Order (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	214/2006
4. Carriage by Air (Amendment) Ordinance 2005 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	215/2006
5. Freight Containers (Safety) Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	216/2006
6. Freight Containers (Safety) (Applications for Approval of Containers) Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	217/2006
7. Freight Containers (Safety) (Fees) Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	218/2006
8. Freight Containers (Safety) (Arrangements for Authorized Persons) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	219/2006
9. Freight Containers (Safety) (Examination Procedure) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	220/2006
10. Freight Containers (Safety) (Amendment) Ordinance 2006 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 20.10.2006)	221/2006

Other Papers

- No.15 - Report by the Trustee of the Prisoners' Education Trust Fund for the period from 1 April 2005 to 31 March 2006 (published on 18.10.2006)
- No.16 - Audited Financial Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report for the Fish Marketing Organization for the year ended 31 March 2006 (published on 20.10.2006)

- No.17 - Audited Financial Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report for the Vegetable Marketing Organization for the year ended 31 March 2006 (published on 20.10.2006)
- No.18 - Marine Fish Scholarship Fund Trustee's Report and Audited Financial Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report on the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2006 (published on 20.10.2006)
- No.19 - Agricultural Products Scholarship Fund Trustee's Report and Audited Financial Statement of Accounts and Auditors' Report on the Fund for the year ended 31 March 2006 (published on 20.10.2006)
- No.20 - Office of the Telecommunications Authority Trading Fund Annual Report for the year 2005/06, together with the certified statements and the report of the Director of Audit for the Fund (published on 23.10.2006)
- No.21 - Post Office Trading Fund Annual Report for the year 2005/06, together with the certified statements and the report of the Director of Audit for the Fund (published on 25.10.2006)

Questions

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Motion of Thanks

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council thanks the Chief Executive for his address.

Question on the motion proposed. The President stated that Hon LEE Cheuk-yan and Hon Albert CHAN would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

The President announced the commencement of the first debate session, which covered the following policy areas: administration of justice and legal services, constitutional affairs, public service and security.

15 Members and Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung spoke.

While Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:31 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another seven Members and Hon Emily LAU spoke.

At 2:36 pm, while Hon Emily LAU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Nine more Members spoke.

At 5:21 pm, the President suspended the meeting for 10 minutes.

The Council resumed at 5:31 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Chief Secretary for Administration, the Secretary for the Civil Service, the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs, the Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Justice spoke.

The President announced the end of the first debate session and the commencement of the second debate session, which covered the following policy areas: commerce and industry, economic services, financial affairs, information technology and broadcasting and labour.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke.

While Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:50 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another four Members and Hon CHAN Kam-lam spoke.

At 8:02 pm, while Hon CHAN Kam-lam was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five more Members spoke.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:02 pm.

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 26 October 2006 to continue the second debate session of the Motion of Thanks.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Another 16 Members and Hon TSANG Yok-sing spoke.

While Hon TSANG Yok-sing was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Five more Members and Hon KWONG Chi-kin spoke.

At 1:52 pm, while Hon KWONG Chi-kin was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

One more Member spoke.

At 2:30 pm, the President suspended the meeting for 10 minutes.

The Council resumed at 2:40 pm.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury, the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology, the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs, the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour and the Financial Secretary spoke.

The President announced the end of the second debate session and the commencement of the third debate session, which covered the following policy areas: education, home affairs and manpower planning.

10 Members spoke.

At 5:21 pm, the President suspended the meeting for 10 minutes.

The Council resumed at 5:31 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Secretary for Home Affairs and the Secretary for Education and Manpower spoke.

The President announced the end of the third debate session and the commencement of the fourth debate session, which covered the following policy areas: housing, planning, lands and works, environmental affairs and transport.

Four Members and Hon Tommy CHEUNG spoke.

While Hon Tommy CHEUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:25 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two other Members and Hon Andrew CHENG spoke.

At 6:53 pm, while Hon Andrew CHENG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another 14 Members spoke.

The President suspended the meeting at 9:00 pm.

* * * * *

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 27 October 2006 to continue the fourth debate session of the Motion of Thanks.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke.

The President announced the end of the fourth debate session and the commencement of the fifth debate session, which covered the following policy areas: food safety and environmental hygiene, health services and welfare services.

14 Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:50 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another five Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke.

At 1:45 pm, while Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two more Members spoke.

At 2:31 pm, the President suspended the meeting for 10 minutes.

The Council resumed at 2:41 pm.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke.

The President announced the end of the fifth debate session.

Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the amendments.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add ", but expresses deep regret at the Government's refusal to legislate for a minimum wage at this stage" after "his address".

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion:

To add ", but expresses deep regret that the address fails to put forward any measure to alleviate the disparity between the rich and the poor and the problem of plutocratic monopoly" after "his address".

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's amendment to Hon Miriam LAU's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's motion put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion, five against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion, nine against it and eight abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 1 November 2006 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 3:30 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 27/10/2006
時間 TIME: 03:19:11 下午

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對劉健儀議員所提的「致謝議案」作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	28	
投票 Vote	27	27	
贊成 Yes	8	17	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	3	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey BU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 27/10/2006
時間 TIME: 03:23:33 下午

動議 MOTION: 陳偉業議員對劉健儀議員所提的「致謝議案」作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT CHAN TO HON MIRIAM LAU'S "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	28	
投票 Vote	27	27	
贊成 Yes	6	17	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	5	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 27/10/2006
 時間 TIME: 03:30:17 下午

動議 MOTION: 「致謝議案」
 "MOTION OF THANKS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	28	
投票 Vote	27	27	
贊成 Yes	19	10	
反對 No	5	9	
棄權 Abstain	3	8	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK