

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 8

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 22 November 2006 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Financial Secretary

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Fugitive Offenders (Germany) Order (gazetted on 17.11.2006)	251/2006
2. Fugitive Offenders (Republic of Korea) Order (gazetted on 17.11.2006)	252/2006
3. Antiquities and Monuments (Declaration of Historical Building) Notice 2006 (gazetted on 17.11.2006)	253/2006
4. Banking (Specification of Multilateral Development Bank) (Amendment) Notice 2006 (gazetted on 17.11.2006)	254/2006
5. Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Seventh Schedule) (Bangladesh) Notice 2006 (gazetted on 17.11.2006)	255/2006
6. Market to which the Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance applies Declaration 2006 (gazetted on 17.11.2006)	256/2006

Questions

1. In accordance with Rule 26(6) of the Rules of Procedure, Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 1 on behalf of Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, who was absent.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Nine Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

2. Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

3. Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

4. Hon Martin LEE asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

5. Hon SIN Chung-kai asked Question 5.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Four Members asked supplementaries and the Financial Secretary replied.

6. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementaries and the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Leisure, gaming and entertainment complex

Hon James TIEN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to actively study the feasibility of establishing a leisure, gaming and entertainment complex on Lantau, and to conduct extensive consultation in this regard.

While Hon James TIEN was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:10 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon James TIEN's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit would move an amendment to the motion and that Hon Mrs Selina CHOW would also move an amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "to actively study" after "urges the Government" and substitute with ", before studying"; to delete "and to conduct extensive" after "entertainment complex on Lantau," and substitute with "to first look into the following three issues and conduct community-wide"; to delete "in this regard" after "consultation"; and to add ": (a) whether Hong Kong should maintain the existing policy of not encouraging gaming; (b) the cost-effectiveness of establishing a gaming and entertainment venue, as well as its impact on residents and environmental conservation; and (c) whether there is a need and any suitable location for a gaming and entertainment venue in Hong Kong" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion proposed.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment and addressed the Council:

To delete "three" after "look into the following"; to delete "and" after "environmental conservation"; and to add "; (d) the public revenue generated for Hong Kong, the number of job opportunities created, the benefits to the local economy and how far Hong Kong's competitiveness can be enhanced by establishing a leisure, gaming and entertainment complex; and (e) convention and exhibition facilities should be provided in the leisure, gaming and entertainment complex to meet future demands" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment proposed.

Three Members and Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:05 pm while Hon CHAN Yuen-han was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

15 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TIEN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon James TIEN's motion put.

Hon CHAM Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and eight abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TIEN replied.

Question on Hon James TIEN's motion put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion, 15 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, two were in favour of the motion and 24 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council considers the year 2012 appropriate for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Howard YOUNG would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "the year 2012 appropriate for electing the Chief Executive by universal suffrage" after "That this Council considers" and substitute with "that, should the pertinent conditions be ripe, meaning that there is a nominating committee which is broadly representative and acceptable to both the Central Government and Hong Kong, and the relationship between the Executive and the Legislature has been rationalized and is harmonious, this Council hopes that the election of the Chief Executive by universal suffrage will be held in 2012".

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion proposed.

Nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon LEE wing-tat drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Four other Members and Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:02 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 6:04 pm, while Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

While Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, Hon LEE Cheuk-yan drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung continued to speak.

One more Member and Hon Martin LEE spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Martin LEE was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:22 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another four Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 6:57 pm while the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 17 against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah replied.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's motion put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, five against it and 15 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 29 November 2006 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:25 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 22/11/2006
時間 TIME: 04:05:41 下午

動議 MOTION: 周梁淑怡議員就梁家傑議員對田北俊議員的「綜合消閒博彩娛樂中心」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON MRS SELINA CHOW'S AMENDMENT TO HON ALAN LEONG'S AMENDMENT TO HON JAMES TIEN'S MOTION ON "LEISURE, GAMING AND ENTERTAINMENT COMPLEX"

動議人 MOVED BY: 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	26	25	
贊成 Yes	10	2	
反對 No	13	16	
棄權 Abstain	3	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Aibert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 22/11/2006
 時間 TIME: 04:09:54 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對田北俊議員的「綜合消閒博彩娛樂中心」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON JAMES TIEN'S MOTION ON "LEISURE, GAMING AND ENTERTAINMENT COMPLEX"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	26	25	
贊成 Yes	13	4	
反對 No	10	13	
棄權 Abstain	3	8	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 22/11/2006
時間 TIME: 04:17:44 下午

動議 MOTION: 「綜合消閒博彩娛樂中心」議案
MOTION "LEISURE, GAMING AND ENTERTAINMENT COMPLEX"

動議人 MOVED BY: 田北俊 James TIEN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	27	
投票 Vote	26	26	
贊成 Yes	10	2	
反對 No	15	24	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 22/11/2006
 時間 TIME: 07:16:30 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊孝華議員對湯家驊議員的「普選行政長官」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON HOWARD YOUNG TO HON RONNY TONG'S MOTION ON
 "ELECTING THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE BY UNIVERSAL SUFFRAGE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	8	2	
反對 No	12	17	
棄權 Abstain	7	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 22/11/2006
 時間 TIME: 07:24:09 下午

動議 MOTION: 「普選行政長官」議案
 MOTION "ELECTING THE CHIEF EXECUTIVE BY UNIVERSAL SUFFRAGE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	7	15	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	15	11	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		陳偉業 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES