

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 15

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 17 January 2007 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Designation of Museums (Amendment) Order 2007 (gazetted on 12.1.2007)	5/2007
2. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Civic Centres) (Amendment of Thirteenth Schedule) Order 2007 (gazetted on 12.1.2007)	6/2007

### Other Papers

- No.57 - Equal Opportunities Commission  
Annual Report 2005-2006 (published on 10.1.2007)
- No.58 - Hong Kong Arts Development Council  
Annual Report 2005-2006 (published on 10.1.2007)
- No.59 - Legal Aid Services Council  
Annual Report 2005-2006 (published on 11.1.2007)

### Questions

1. Hon Howard YOUNG asked Question 1.
- The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.
- Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.
2. Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit asked Question 2.
- The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.
- Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.
3. Hon CHAN Yuen-han asked Question 3.
- The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Hon Martin LEE asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

5. Hon Albert HO asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

6. Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **District Councils (Amendment) Bill 2006**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 20 December 2006 resumed.

Seven Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **District Councils (Amendment) Bill 2006**.

Question that clauses 1 to 16 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs reported that

the **District Councils (Amendment) Bill 2006**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### Motions

#### Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

Resolved that the Air Pollution Control (Volatile Organic Compounds) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 258 of 2006 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 29 November 2006, be repealed.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion as Chairman of the Subcommittee on Air Pollution Control (Volatile Organic Compounds) Regulation, and then in her personal capacity as a Member.

One Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

## Members' Motions

### Policy on conservation of monuments

Hon Audrey EU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the demolition of the Central Star Ferry Pier by the Government has aroused wide concern in the community, which reflects an increasing public awareness of and participation in the conservation of monuments, preservation of cultural environment and good town planning, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) establish a monuments conservation fund to enhance the conservation of monuments;
- (b) formulate codes for the evaluation of social benefits and proper consultation procedures setting out in detail the cost-effectiveness of various options and their impact on monuments, having regard to the preservation of collective memories; and
- (c) enhance the participation of such concern groups as District Councils, professional bodies and resident groups in the decision-making process of town planning.

While Hon Audrey EU was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 2:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki, Hon CHOY So-yuk and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon Albert HO would move amendments to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's and Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendments respectively. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki, Hon CHOY So-yuk, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, Hon Howard YOUNG, Hon Albert HO and Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:40 pm, while Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

One other Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring his interest that his company held the title to a house which had been included in the list of monuments, Hon LAU Wong-fat spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Another 12 Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Audrey EU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion:

To add "policies and laws on the protection and conservation of antiquities and monuments in Hong Kong are imperfect, and the" after "That, as the"; to add "antiquities and" after "public awareness of and participation in the conservation of"; to add "(a) reform the policies and laws on the protection and conservation of antiquities and monuments on the basis of comprehensive consultation, and formulate a timetable for legislative amendments;" after "this Council urges the Government to:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(b)"; to delete "monuments conservation" after "establish a"; to add "on protection and conservation of antiquities and monuments" after "fund"; to add "protection and" after "to enhance the"; to add "antiquities and" after "conservation of"; to add ", as well as for repair, education and promotion work" after "monuments"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to add "antiquities and" after "various options and their impact on"; to delete ", having regard to the preservation of collective memories; and" after "monuments" and substitute with "(d) formulate criteria for the preservation of collective memories, community sights and regional cultural characteristics;"; to delete the original "(c) enhance" and substitute with "(e) establish a mechanism for"; to add "as well as the public" after "professional bodies and resident groups"; and to add "and community redevelopment; (f) consider adopting such means as land exchange and transfer of plot ratios to preserve more privately-owned monuments and prevent them from being demolished; (g) make reference to the sponsorship policies on antiquities and monuments, including sponsorship by individuals, enterprises and communities, etc, which have been implemented for many years in such countries as the UK, the USA and France, so as to pave a new way for the protection and conservation of antiquities and monuments in Hong Kong; and (h) draw from the successful experience in revitalizing antique buildings, such as the derelict industrial park on Vancouver's Granville Island, Japan's Otaru warehouses and the Taipei Story House, to promote multi-faceted development in humanities, history education, art, creative industries, tourism and community involvement, etc, thereby creating more employment opportunities" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion proposed.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment:

To add "providing economic incentives to private property owners, including" after "(f) consider"; to add "acquisition," after "adopting such means as"; and to add "," after "land exchange and transfer of plot ratios".

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment, as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG, to Hon Audrey EU's motion put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG had been agreed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following further amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Howard YOUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; and (i) through reforming the Town Planning Board and relevant legislation, make the protection of monuments and preservation of cultural environment, etc the overriding principle in town planning in Hong Kong" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Howard YOUNG proposed.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment:

To add "one of" after "protection of monuments and preservation of cultural environment, etc"; and to delete "principle" after "the overriding" and substitute with "principles".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Howard YOUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour

of the amendment, two against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Policy on conservation of monuments" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Howard YOUNG put.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG had been agreed earlier, the President granted leave for Hon CHOY So-yuk to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following further amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Howard YOUNG, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; and (i) conduct a comprehensive and extensive consultation on the built heritage conservation policy and expeditiously formulate a proper built heritage conservation policy, with the aim of striking a balance between heritage conservation and urban development, so as to facilitate a sustainable and balanced development of the community" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Howard YOUNG proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon YEUNG Sum to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following further amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon CHOY So-yuk, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; and (j) apart from the existing Antiquities Advisory Board, set up a statutory body on antiquities protection to take charge of related consultation and protection work (including compensation, land acquisition and conservation, etc), and allow the statutory body to directly acquire and operate any public or private monument items" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon CHOY So-yuk proposed and put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Audrey EU replied.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon CHOY So-yuk put and agreed to.

**Retaining and supporting the development of commercial districts and bazaars with local characteristics**

Hon Vincent FANG Kang moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as a number of Hong Kong's commercial districts and bazaars with local characteristics have been relocated due to the redevelopment of old areas and hence have fallen into decline, and the existence and development of many other similar commercial districts and bazaars are also facing the same threats, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) retain the existing commercial districts and bazaars with local characteristics at the town planning stage;
- (b) formulate special management rules and regulations to balance the need to retain such commercial districts and bazaars and that for urban development and environmental hygiene; and
- (c) make reference to the practices of major cities in the Mainland and overseas, such as Singapore's Chinatown, London's Covent Garden and Shunde's Old Town district, and provide support and assistance through various policy bureaux for the development of such distinctive commercial districts and bazaars, so as to enhance their vitality, promote the local business economy and ensure that local characteristics are passed on.

While Hon Vincent FANG kang was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 6:09 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum would move amendments to the motion and that Hon Albert HO would also move an amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, Hon Albert HO and two other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the motion and the amendments. At 7:02 pm, while he was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

12 more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion:

To add "or cleared in recent years" after "have been relocated"; and to add ", with their integrity and in situ development as principles, and involve the participation of local residents and small traders in deciding the development or renewal plans, so as to facilitate sustainable development of the economy of the community" after "town planning stage".

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion proposed.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment:

To delete ", and involve the participation of" after "principles" and substitute with "as far as possible, and allow"; to delete "small" after "local residents and" and substitute with "affected"; and to delete "in deciding" after "traders" and substitute with "to participate in".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment, as amended by Hon Albert HO, to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment as amended by Hon Albert HO had been agreed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon YEUNG Sum to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following further amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion as amended by Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's and Hon Albert HO, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add ", and to enhance public consultation to allow greater public participation" after "facilitate sustainable development of the economy of the community".

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion as amended by Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki and Hon Albert HO proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang replied.

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's motion as amended by Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki, Hon Albert HO and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put and agreed to.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 24 January 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:58 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 17/01/2007  
時間 TIME: 05:55:57 下午

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員就郭家麒議員對余若薇議員的「古蹟保護政策」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON ALBERT HO'S AMENDMENT TO DR HON KWOK KA-KI'S AMENDMENT TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "POLICY ON CONSERVATION OF MONUMENTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	10	15	
反對 No	7	2	
棄權 Abstain	7	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 17/01/2007  
時間 TIME: 05:59:11 下午

動議 MOTION: 郭家麒議員就經王國興議員及楊孝華議員修正的余若薇議員的「古蹟保護政策」議案的修正案  
DR HON KWOK KA-KI'S AMENDMENT TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "POLICY ON CONSERVATION OF MONUMENTS" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING (AND HON HOWARD YOUNG)

動議人 MOVED BY: 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	24	
投票 Vote	25	23	
贊成 Yes	8	10	
反對 No	10	8	
棄權 Abstain	7	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Aibert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 17/01/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:05:29 下午

動議 MOTION: 楊森議員對余若薇議員就「古蹟保護政策」所提，經王國興議員（及楊孝華議員）／郭家麒議員（及何俊仁議員）／王國興議員（及楊孝華議員）及蔡素玉議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY DR HON YEUNG SUM TO HON AUDREY EU'S MOTION ON "POLICY ON CONSERVATION OF MONUMENTS" AS AMENDED BY HON WONG KWOK-HING (AND HON HOWARD YOUNG) / DR HON KWOK KA-KI (AND HON ALBERT HO) / HON WONG KWOK-HING (AND HON HOWARD YOUNG) AND HON CHOY SO-YUK

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	24	
投票 Vote	25	23	
贊成 Yes	10	15	
反對 No	8	2	
棄權 Abstain	7	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

*William Chan*