

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 16

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 24 January 2007 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following paper was laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments

L.N. No.

Official Languages (Alteration of Text under Section 4D) (References to Citation of Various Items of Legislation in Chinese) Order (gazetted on 19.1.2007)

7/2007

Questions

1. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

2. Hon Miriam LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

3. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

4. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

5. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

6. Hon Audrey EU asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters Ordinance

The Secretary for Security moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Germany) Order, made by the Chief Executive in Council on 14 November 2006, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon James TO, Chairman of the Subcommittee on Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Germany) Order, spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Fully safeguarding the safety of food supply to Hong Kong

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the recent spate of food safety incidents have revealed that the food regulatory laws in Hong Kong are flawed with loopholes, and there is a lack of a comprehensive food safety policy, thereby subjecting the public to food safety hazards, this Council urges the Government to expeditiously adopt measures to fully safeguard the safety of food supply to Hong Kong, including:

- (a) drawing up a legislative timetable for prescribing standards for pesticide and chemical residues in vegetables and fruits;
- (b) enacting legislation to regulate imported foods, including setting up a licensing system for food importers, implementing mandatory inspection and testing at border control points, clearly specifying the penalties for non-compliance, and bringing live fish, egg products, vegetables and fruits into the regulatory ambit; and
- (c) establishing a food supply chain tracking mechanism to enable food surveillance and control at source, so as to achieve the objective of ensuring food safety "from farm to fork".

While Hon Fred LI was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:07 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon WONG Yung-kan, Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki would move amendments to the motion and that Hon WONG Ting-kwong would move an amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Yung-kan, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki, Hon WONG Ting-kwong, four other Members and Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:26 pm, while Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To delete "recent spate of" after "That, as the"; to add "which occurred successively in recent years" after "food safety incidents"; to add "the regulatory departments have failed to effectively perform their gate-keeping roles and" after "have revealed that"; to add "and food safety standards" after "a lack of a comprehensive food safety policy"; to delete "to regulate" after "enacting legislation" and substitute with "on a permission system for"; to add "setting comprehensive food safety standards, strictly regulating the use of drugs and chemicals, their residue contents as well as the microbe counts and heavy metal contents in foods, etc," after "setting up a licensing system for food importers,"; to add "expeditiously" after "clearly specifying the penalties for non-compliance, and"; to delete "and" after "egg products, vegetables and fruits into the regulatory ambit;"; to add ", and introducing legislation on withdrawal from sale and recall of problematic foods" after "establishing a food supply chain tracking mechanism"; and to add "; (d) reviewing the composition, functions and operation of existing food safety regulatory departments, with a view to raising their professional standards and enabling them to more effectively perform the gate-keeping roles required of them; and (e) perfecting the food safety notification mechanisms between Hong Kong and the Mainland as well as other places of origin of foods, and strengthening cooperation with the Mainland in combating the import of foods into Hong Kong through irregular channels" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed and put.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present and 19 were in favour of the amendment. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Fully safeguarding the safety of food supply to Hong Kong" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Yung-kan's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Tommy CHEUNG to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following further amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon WONG Yung-kan, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add ", and comprehensively consult the relevant trades" after "combating the import of foods into Hong Kong through irregular channels".

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon WONG Yung-kan proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Yung-kan's and Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following further amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon WONG Yung-kan and Hon Tommy CHEUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; the Government should also expeditiously adopt the following measures: (f) encouraging and allowing more local and international experts to participate in the work of the Expert Committee on Food Safety in order that the Centre for Food Safety can operate in a more professional manner, and drawing up reference benchmarks for food safety policies and standards which are suitable for Hong Kong and recognized by the international community, so as to ensure effective and comprehensive food safety management 'from farm to fork'; (g) enhancing the dissemination of information on food safety so that consumers can grasp such information expeditiously, and providing educational and training programmes run by officials responsible for food safety management, so as to promote the awareness of safeguarding food safety; and (h) organizing, supporting and encouraging the technological research and collaborative efforts of the food industry and academic bodies in the area of food safety" after "and comprehensively consult the relevant trades".

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon WONG Yung-kan and Hon Tommy CHEUNG proposed.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong moved the following revised amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment, and explained the terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "as well as members of the agriculture, fisheries and food industries" after "local and international experts".

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's amendment to Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment, as amended by Hon WONG Ting-kwong, to Hon Fred LI's motion which had been amended by Hon WONG Yung-kan and Hon Tommy CHEUNG put and agreed to.

Hon Fred LI replied.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon WONG Yung-kan, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki and Hon WONG Ting-kwong put and agreed to.

Urging the Government to make effective use of the surplus and plough it back into the community

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Government's finance returned to the surplus last year and the target fiscal surplus for this year will be attained, and the Government further anticipates a very robust financial position with a fiscal reserve exceeding \$400 billion by 2012, this Council urges that, having regard to the existing improved economic and financial situation, the Government should, in addition to reducing salary tax to alleviate the burden on the middle class, target at facilitating Hong Kong's long term development by making effective use of the surplus and investing more resources in:

- (a) setting up a children's development fund to provide opportunities for children from low-income families to participate in extra-curricular activities;
- (b) relaxing the eligibility criteria for travelling allowance for the low-income groups to encourage employment;
- (c) shortening the waiting time for care places for the elderly;

- (d) allowing the elderly to use public medical services at half price;
- (e) implementing cross-boundary and large-scale infrastructure projects to create jobs;
- (f) implementing small class teaching to improve the quality of education;
- (g) offering loans to associate degree graduates to study abroad, so as to nurture talents; and
- (h) implementing a green tax to encourage environmental protection by the public through economic incentives.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move amendments to the motion and that Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing would move an amendment to Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG, Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, and 20 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion:

To add "the disparity between the rich and the poor in Hong Kong continues to aggravate, whereas" after "That, as"; to delete ", in addition to" after "the Government should" and substitute with "accord priority to alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor and protecting the interests of the grass-roots workers and the disadvantaged groups before"; to add "and" after "burden on the middle class,"; to delete "relaxing the eligibility criteria for travelling allowance for the low-income groups to encourage employment" after "(b)" and substitute with "granting travelling allowance to the low-income groups residing in remote areas to relieve the problem of working poverty; (c) promoting the development of social enterprises by providing them with one-stop support, training and consultancy services, as well as offering them seed money, short-term rent remission and tax concessions"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(e)"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(g)"; to delete the

original "(g)" and substitute with "(h)"; and to delete the original "(h)" and substitute with "(i)".
Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 16 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The President stated that Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG had indicated that they would withdraw their amendments if Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment was agreed. Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG therefore withdrew their amendments. Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing therefore might not move his amendment to Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's amendment.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon SIN hung-kai's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; (j) relaxing the limit of absence from Hong Kong to one year in respect of the Old Age Allowance; (k) allowing tax deduction on loan repayment to various student financial assistance schemes; (l) raising the allowance for the first two children to \$50,000 and creating an allowance for unemployed dependent parents or grandparents aged over 50; (m) providing every household with a deduction of \$5,000 on rates; and (n) offering employees a tax concession of up to \$1,000 for voluntary contributions to the Mandatory Provident Fund" after "economic incentives".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon SIN Chung-kai replied.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 31 January 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:38 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 24/01/2007
 時間 TIME: 03:49:44 下午

動議 MOTION: 黃容根議員對李華明議員的「全面保障供港食物安全」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG YUNG-KAN TO HON FRED LI'S MOTION ON "FULLY SAFEGUARDING THE SAFETY OF FOOD SUPPLY TO HONG KONG"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	20	
投票 Vote	19	19	
贊成 Yes	15	19	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	4	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃直弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 24/01/2007
時間 TIME: 07:27:41 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對單仲偕議員的「促請政府善用盈餘回饋市民」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S MOTION ON
"URGING THE GOVERNMENT TO MAKE EFFECTIVE USE OF THE SURPLUS AND
PLOUGH IT BACK INTO THE COMMUNITY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	16	22	
投票 Vote	16	21	
贊成 Yes	9	15	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	7	6	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 24/01/2007
時間 TIME: 07:34:39 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對單仲偕議員就「促請政府善用盈餘回饋市民」所提，經馮檢基議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S MOTION ON "URGING THE GOVERNMENT TO MAKE EFFECTIVE USE OF THE SURPLUS AND PLOUGH IT BACK INTO THE COMMUNITY" AS AMENDED BY HON FREDERICK FUNG

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	23	
投票 Vote	17	22	
贊成 Yes	10	21	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	7	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES