

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 23

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 18 April 2007 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Rafael HUI Si-yan, GBS, JP

The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP

The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP

The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP

Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP  
Head, Central Policy Unit

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

**Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Designation of Museum (Ping Shan Tang Clan Gallery cum Heritage Trail Visitors Centre) Order (gazetted on 30.3.2007)	53/2007
2. Lands Tribunal (Amendment) Rules 2006 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.3.2007)	54/2007
3. Human Reproductive Technology (Licensing) Regulation (gazetted on 4.4.2007)	55/2007
4. Human Reproductive Technology (Fees) Regulation (gazetted on 13.4.2007)	56/2007

**Other Papers**

- No.81 - Report No. 48 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits - March 2007 (published on 18.4.2007)
- No.82 - Annual Report and Financial Report 2005-2006 of the Vocational Training Council (published on 12.4.2007)
- No.83 - Audited Statement of Accounts of and the Director of Audit's Report on the Quality Education Fund for the year ended 31 August 2006 (published on 12.4.2007)
- No.84 - Approved Estimates of Income and Expenditure for the financial year 2007-2008, Securities and Futures Commission (published on 13.4.2007)
- No.85 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Early Retirement Ex-gratia Payment Fund for Aided Primary School Teachers together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 August 2006 (published on 13.4.2007)
- No.86 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Early Retirement Ex-gratia Payment Fund for Aided Secondary School Teachers together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 August 2006 (published on 13.4.2007)

- No.87 - Audited Statement of Accounts of the Education Development Fund together with the Director of Audit's Report for the year ended 31 August 2006 (published on 13.4.2007)

### Questions

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### Bills

#### First Reading

**Patents (Amendment) Bill 2007**  
**Import and Export (Amendment) Bill 2007**  
**Tsing Sha Control Area Bill**  
**Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Bill**

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

#### Second Reading

**Patents (Amendment) Bill 2007**  
**Import and Export (Amendment) Bill 2007**

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the Second Reading of each of the above two Bills and addressed the Council thereon.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

**Tsing Sha Control Area Bill**  
**Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Bill**

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the Second Reading of each of the above two Bills and addressed the Council thereon.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debates on the above Bills were adjourned and the Bills were referred to the House Committee.

## **Appropriation Bill 2007**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which had been moved on 28 February 2007 resumed.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works, as well as the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Hon SIN Chung-kai requested the President to suspend the meeting to allow Members to consider how they would vote on the motion. The President acceded to the request and suspended the meeting for five minutes at 12:30 pm.

At 12:35 pm, the Council resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 51 Members were present, 48 were in favour of the motion and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Appropriation Bill 2007**.

In accordance with Rule 68 of the Rules of Procedure, the Committee first considered the schedule to the Bill.

Question that the sums for heads 21 to 28, 30, 31, 33, 35, 37, 39, 42, 44 to 49, 51, 53, 55, 59, 60, 62, 63, 70, 72, 74, 76, 78, 79, 80, 82, 90, 91, 92, 94, 95, 96, 100, 106, 112, 114, 116, 118, 120, 121, 136, 138, 139, 140, 142 to 145, 147, 148, 151, 152, 155, 156, 158, 159, 160, 162, 163, 166, 168, 169, 170, 173, 174, 180, 181, 184, 186, 188, 190 and 194 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed.

Hon James TO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$45,170,000 in respect of subhead 000 and addressed the Committee.

While Hon James TO was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 12:42 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members and the Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

At 1:23 pm, while the Secretary for Security was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved that head 122 be reduced by \$80,000,000 in respect of subhead 103 and addressed the Committee.

One Member and the Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.



Question that the sum for head 122 stand part of the schedule proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the schedule stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Financial Secretary reported that

the **Appropriation Bill 2007**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 53 Members were present, 50 were in favour of the motion and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 25 April 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 2:30 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 18/04/2007  
 時間 TIME: 12:39:13 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2007年撥款條例草案》- 二讀  
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2007 - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :51  
 投票 Vote :50  
   贊成 Yes :48  
   反對 No :2  
   棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			馬力	MA Lik		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 18/04/2007  
時間 TIME: 01:42:59 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2007年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目000而將總目122削減45,170,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2007 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE REDUCED BY \$45,170,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 000

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	22	
投票 Vote	26	21	
贊成 Yes	5	10	
反對 No	21	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉卓發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 18/04/2007  
時間 TIME: 02:23:28 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2007年撥款條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 為削減分目103而將總目122, (進一步) 削減80,000,000元  
APPROPRIATION BILL 2007 - COMMITTEE STAGE - HEAD 122 BE (FURTHER) REDUCED BY \$80,000,000 IN RESPECT OF SUBHEAD 103

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	24	
投票 Vote	25	23	
贊成 Yes	5	12	
反對 No	20	11	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 18/04/2007  
 時間 TIME: 02:30:02 下午

動議 MOTION: 《2007年撥款條例草案》- 三讀  
 APPROPRIATION BILL 2007 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財政司司長 Financial Secretary

出席 Present :53  
 投票 Vote :52  
     贊成 Yes :50  
     反對 No :2  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			Albert CHAN	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			馬力	MA Lik		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Aian LEONG	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES