

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 27

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 May 2007 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

**Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

| <b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>   | <b><u>L.N. No.</u></b> |
|--|------------------------|
| 1. Road Traffic (Amendment: Extension of Permitted Area for New Territories Taxis to Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Regulation 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007) | 68/2007                |
| 2. Closed Area (Hong Kong Section of the Shenzhen Bay Bridge and Deep Bay Link Portion) Order (gazetted on 4.5.2007)   | 69/2007                |
| 3. Immigration (Places of Detention) (Amendment: Lok Ma Chau Spur Line Control Point) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)  | 70/2007                |
| 4. Immigration Service (Designated Places) (Amendment: Lok Ma Chau Spur Line Control Point) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)                                      | 71/2007                |
| 5. Immigration (Places of Detention) (Amendment: Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)  | 72/2007                |
| 6. Immigration Service (Designated Places) (Amendment: Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)                                    | 73/2007                |
| 7. Frontier Closed Area (Permission to Enter) (Amendment) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)   | 74/2007                |
| 8. Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area (Permission to Enter) Notice (gazetted on 4.5.2007)   | 75/2007                |
| 9. Antiquities and Monuments (Declaration of Historical Building) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)   | 76/2007                |

**Questions**

1. Hon Tommy CHEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

2. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

3. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

4. Hon Fred LI asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

One Member asked supplementary question and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Hon LEE Wing-tat asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied. While he was replying to the supplementary question, Hon Emily LAU raised a point of order on whether the Secretary had made an insulting remark about another director of bureau in his reply. The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour clarified that he had not and continued with his reply.

Three more Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Hon SIN Chung-kai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

6. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Combating unscrupulous shops**

Hon LAU Kong-wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the rising number of cases of Mainland tourists being cheated while shopping in Hong Kong, this Council urges the Government to adopt active measures to rigorously combat unscrupulous shops ripping off customers and to strengthen the regulation of the tourism industry, in order to restore the confidence of tourists coming to Hong Kong for shopping, including:

- (a) studying the consolidation of the provisions relating to protecting consumer rights and interests in the existing legislation into a Protection of Consumer Rights and Interests Ordinance;
- (b) comprehensively reviewing the existing legislation on protecting consumer rights and interests, and tightening up regulation to cover the marketing practices of alluding to particular brands or misleading the customers;
- (c) enhancing the regular inspections and "undercover" operations carried out by the Police and the Customs and Excise Department to crack down on shops engaging in fraudulent practices and selling fake products;
- (d) requesting the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong (TIC) to set up a complaint website, so that Mainland tourists may lodge complaints through the website after their departure from Hong Kong;

- (e) expeditiously discussing with the TIC the introduction of a demerit point system to regulate travel agents and tour guides; and
- (f) fully disclosing the parties involved in complaint cases, including the names of shops, the local and Mainland travel agents, as well as the tour guides concerned.

While Hon LAU Kong-wah was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:07 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon Fred LI would move amendments to the motion and that Hon SIN Chung-kai would move an amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Howard YOUNG, Hon Fred LI and Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon SIN Chung-kai was speaking, with the President's Deputy's permission, Hon Howard YOUNG elucidated on a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon SIN Chung-kai.

Two other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring that he was a Member of the Hong Kong Tourism Board, Hon Vincent FANG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 1:56 pm, while Hon Vincent FANG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring that he was the Chairman of the Hong Kong Tourism Board, Hon James TIEN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LAU Kong-wah spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion:



To delete "rising number of" after "in view of the" and substitute with "recent"; to add "which have aroused wide concern" after "shopping in Hong Kong"; to add "On the cooperation with the relevant Mainland authorities: (a) fully implementing the eight regulatory measures promulgated earlier by the China National Tourism Administration, including conducting regular inspections and imposing severe penalties on non-compliant travel agents, so as to thoroughly combat the problems arising from zero-fare and negative-fare tours; (b) prohibiting outbound travel agents in the Mainland from imposing additional charges on tour members for leaving the tour group before completion of the itinerary; (c) vigorously publicizing to tourists the risks involved in 'arranged shopping' tours and the protection available to them; (d) expeditiously allowing Hong Kong's reputable travel agents to operate Hong Kong and Macao tours in Guangdong Province, with a view to upgrading in the long run the quality of tourism services in the Mainland; On the local front:" after "coming to Hong Kong for shopping, including:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(e)"; to add "whether there is a need for" after "studying"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(g)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(h)"; to add ", and providing tourists with such information as the complaint hotline at border crossing points" after "departure from Hong Kong"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(i)"; to delete "and" after "travel agents and tour guides;"; to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(j) if the complaints are substantiated,"; and to add "; and (k) discussing with the industry the introduction of a tour guide fee system" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion proposed.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment:

To delete "providing tourists with such information as the complaint hotline at border crossing points" after "departure from Hong Kong, and" and substitute with "installing television facilities at border crossing points to publicize tourism information, as well as cooperating with telecommunications companies to provide inbound and outbound tourists with information such as the complaint hotline via mobile telephone short message service".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment, as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai, to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion put and agreed to.

As Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Fred LI to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Fred LI moved the following further amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon SIN Chung-kai, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; (l) in the cases of travel agents incurring demerit points due to non-compliance with the rules, examining how to prevent their directors from evading the penalty by changing their company names to continue operations; and (m) studying the transfer of the TIC's function of monitoring the tourism industry to a new statutory regulatory body to avoid the problem of 'the industry regulating its own members' " after "tour guide fee system".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon SIN Chung-kai proposed and put.

Hon Fred LI claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LAU Kong-wah replied.

Question on Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon SIN Chung-kai put and agreed to.

### **Improving the planning for Hong Kong and reducing screen-like buildings**

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, despite the planning guidelines provided in the existing Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines on building density, layout, urban design and air ventilation etc, such guidelines are not legally binding, resulting in the recent emergence of a large number of screen-like buildings, which not only affect the air ventilation and lighting, etc of the neighbouring areas but also bring adverse impact on the planning of ancillary facilities, such as transport and public

realm, for the entire community; in view of the above, this Council urges the Government to thoroughly review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, consider introducing legislative measures to regulate the density and height of buildings, air ventilation and lighting, etc, and, at the same time, protect the ridgelines and harbour view, so as to ensure better planning for Hong Kong.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Audrey EU, Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing and Hon LEE Wing-tat, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments. Ten other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TIEN spoke on the motion and the amendments, and declared his interests that he had real estate projects under development.

Another three Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To delete "despite" after "That," and substitute with "since"; to delete ", such guidelines" after "air ventilation etc"; to delete "resulting in" after "legally binding," and substitute with "it has resulted in"; to add "and result in deteriorating air quality in areas farther away from the coastline (such as the old areas of Sham Shui Po and Yau Tsim Mong)," after "neighbouring areas"; and to add ", strengthen the ventilation requirements of the Buildings Department and the two railway companies (i.e. the MTR Corporation and the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation) in vetting and approving building designs" after "review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Improving the planning for Hong Kong and reducing screen-like buildings" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To delete "despite the planning guidelines provided in" after "That," and substitute with "since"; to delete "on building density, layout, urban design and air ventilation etc, such guidelines" after "the existing Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines"; to delete "resulting in" after "legally binding," and substitute with "it has resulted in"; to delete ", consider introducing legislative measures to regulate the density and height of buildings, air ventilation and lighting, etc, and, at the same time, protect the ridgelines and harbour view" after "review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines" and substitute with "and adopt the following measures"; and to add ": (a) extending the application of the Technical Circular on Air Ventilation Assessment (TC1/06), currently applicable to government building only, to all projects of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA), developments above railway stations and private developments; (b) taking a leading role to immediately and thoroughly review the design and scale of all current large-scale development projects, particularly the redevelopment projects of URA and the development projects above railway stations of wholly Government-owned railway corporation, so as to ensure compliance of all development projects with the requirements of the 'Qualitative Guidelines on Air Ventilation' in the 'Urban Design Guidelines' under Chapter 11 of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, and the requirements of the Technical Circular on Air Ventilation Assessment, and reducing development density or improving design to prevent the occurrence of wall effect; (c) thoroughly reviewing all large-scale development projects which have been approved but not yet developed, in order to minimize the impact of wall effect

by improving their designs, such as increasing the distance between buildings, creating view corridors and breezeways, setting back developments from site boundaries, and enhancing the provision of public realm at ground level; (d) refraining from subsidizing railway developments, urban renewal projects, cultural venues and other public facilities through land exchange, development rights or additional plot ratio, because the density of land development in various districts should be based on professional planning decisions and not financial considerations; (e) thoroughly reviewing the development density of all districts including the metropolitan area and the new towns, in order to avoid the emergence of screen-like buildings, particularly at the ventilation points, such as harbour-front areas or areas facing large open spaces; Government land located in high density districts should not be sold for property development, and should be reserved for low density development or used as open space, so as to alleviate the increasing development density of private properties in the same district; newly planned sites should not be over-sized and should be separated by view corridors and breezeways to improve air ventilation at ground level; the amalgamation of sites should also be limited to mitigate wall effect; (f) amending existing legislation, such as section 16 of the Buildings Ordinance, or stipulating more objective guidelines through Practice Notes, to provide a clearer basis for the Building Authority and the industry, so as to avoid the construction of buildings, such as screen-like buildings, which will bring adverse ventilation impact on neighbouring buildings; (g) reviewing the various existing mechanisms and guidelines to avoid any unnecessary wall effect, such as over-sized car-parking podium, or the emergence of screen-like buildings due to lack of co-ordination among departments; (h) abandoning the current two-dimensional approach to town planning and replacing it with a three-dimensional approach; using three-dimensional physical models to assist in design during the planning process and as a means to communicate with the general public, so as to envisage at an early stage whether the development density, building mass and disposition will cause wall effect; apart from the existing Outline Zoning Plans and General Building Plans, district-specific Urban Design Guidelines should also be drawn up; (i) formulating relevant guidelines to prevent wall effect by making reference to overseas experience: (i) Shanghai has requirements to limit the width of slab block buildings to not more than 60 metres, etc; (ii) New York imposes control on street shadow area for buildings, so that super high buildings will not be linked up like the Great Wall; and (iii) Japan and Singapore have included height limits and massing control in the land leases or buildings regulations to prevent the emergence of screen-like buildings; (j) conducting assessment on sunlight, wind tunnel and micro-climatic analysis, etc, with reference to examples like the Ngau Tau Kok Upper Estate redevelopment project, while planning for new large-scale development sites, so as to minimize the adverse impact of new developments on

the community; (k) increasing the participation of non-government professionals and the community in the planning process, and considering the introduction of a 'Planning Aids Scheme' to assist the public in lodging planning applications when necessary, so that affected residents and shop operators can obtain independent and professional advice more easily, in order to ensure that the aspirations of the community can be taken care of in the planning process; and (l) in the long run, restructuring the Town Planning Board to ensure its independence from the Government; the current situation whereby the Government benefits from the sale of land on the one hand and takes charge of the town planning process on the other has inevitably led to conflicts of interest, and it is difficult to ensure that the Town Planning Board can make planning decisions impartially for the benefit of the community at large" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To delete "," after "layout" and substitute with "and"; to delete "and air ventilation etc, such guidelines are not legally binding, resulting in the recent emergence of" after "urban design" and substitute with ","; to add "still emerge in recent years" after "screen-like buildings"; and to delete "consider introducing legislative measures to regulate" after "review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines," and substitute with "and, under the principle of not affecting private development rights, study the expedient introduction of greening ratio and regulation of".

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add ", while the Town Planning Board (TPB) fails to meet the public's expectation in preventing or minimizing such adverse impact" after "entire community"; to add "the composition and modus operandi of TPB with a view to enhancing public involvement and TPB's public representativeness; review relevant documents such as" after "thoroughly review"; and to delete ", consider introducing legislative measures to regulate the density and height of buildings, air ventilation and lighting, etc," after "the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines" and substitute with "and the Practice Notes for Professional Persons; strengthen legislation, including specifying the adoption of specific, clear and enforceable clauses, development parameters or procedures in relation to the density and height of buildings, air ventilation, lighting and conservation of historic buildings, as stated in the applicable chapters of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines and relevant documents, such as the Practice Notes for Professional Persons, for land parcels in different zones on the statutory plans that carry legal effect, in order to reduce wall effect in an expedient and effective manner;".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing replied.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the motion and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 16 May 2006 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:47 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong



投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 03:39:03 下午

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員對劉江華議員就「打擊黑店」所提，經楊孝華議員（及單仲偕議員）修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON FRED LI TO HON LAU KONG-WAH'S MOTION ON "COMBATING UNSCRUPULOUS SHOPS" AS AMENDED BY HON HOWARD YOUNG (AND HON SIN CHUNG-KAI)

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 24                                | 21                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 24                                | 20                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 9                                 | 12                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 13                                | 2                                   |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 2                                 | 6                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 否決 Negatived                      | 通過 Passed                           | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員                                    | MEMBER             | 投票 | VOTE    | 議員                                      | MEMBER          | 投票 | VOTE    |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------|----|---------|---|-----------------|----|---------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |                    |    |         | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |                 |    |         |
| 何鍾泰                                   | Dr Raymond HO      | 反對 | NO      | 范徐麗泰                                    | Mrs Rita FAN    | 出席 | PRESENT |
| 李國寶                                   | Dr David LI        |    |         | 田北俊                                     | James TIEN      | 反對 | NO      |
| 呂明華                                   | Dr LUI Ming-wah    |    |         | 何俊仁                                     | Albert HO       |    |         |
| 吳靄儀                                   | Margaret NG        | 贊成 | YES     | 李卓人                                     | LEE Cheuk-yan   | 贊成 | YES     |
| 張文光                                   | CHEUNG Man-kwong   | 贊成 | YES     | 李柱銘                                     | Martin LEE      | 贊成 | YES     |
| 陳智思                                   | Bernard CHAN       |    |         | 李華明                                     | Fred LI         | 贊成 | YES     |
| 梁劉柔芬                                  | Mrs Sophie LEUNG   | 反對 | NO      | 周梁淑怡                                    | Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 | NO      |
| 單仲偕                                   | SIN Chung-kai      | 贊成 | YES     | 涂謹申                                     | James TO        | 贊成 | YES     |
| 黃宜弘                                   | Dr Philip WONG     |    |         | 陳婉嫻                                     | CHAN Yuen-han   |    |         |
| 黃容根                                   | WONG Yung-kan      | 棄權 | ABSTAIN | 陳鑑林                                     | CHAN Kam-lam    | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 楊孝華                                   | Howard YOUNG       | 反對 | NO      | 梁耀忠                                     | LEUNG Yiu-chung |    |         |
| 劉皇發                                   | LAU Wong-fat       | 反對 | NO      | 曾鈺成                                     | TSANG Yok-sing  | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 劉健儀                                   | Miriam LAU         | 反對 | NO      | 楊森                                      | Dr YEUNG Sum    | 贊成 | YES     |
| 霍震霆                                   | Timothy FOK        | 反對 | NO      | 劉千石                                     | LAU Chin-shek   |    |         |
| 石禮謙                                   | Abraham SHEK       | 反對 | NO      | 劉江華                                     | LAU Kong-wah    | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 李鳳英                                   | LI Fung-ying       | 贊成 | YES     | 劉慧卿                                     | Emily LAU       | 贊成 | YES     |
| 張宇人                                   | Tommy CHEUNG       | 反對 | NO      | 蔡素玉                                     | CHOY So-yuk     |    |         |
| 方剛                                    | Vincent FANG       | 反對 | NO      | 鄭家富                                     | Andrew CHENG    | 贊成 | YES     |
| 王國興                                   | WONG Kwok-hing     | 贊成 | YES     | 譚耀宗                                     | TAM Yiu-chung   | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟                                   | Dr Joseph LEE      | 贊成 | YES     | 陳偉業                                     | Albert CHAN     | 贊成 | YES     |
| 林偉強                                   | Daniel LAM         | 反對 | NO      | 馮檢基                                     | Frederick FUNG  | 贊成 | YES     |
| 林健鋒                                   | Jeffrey LAM        | 反對 | NO      | 余若薇                                     | Audrey EU       | 贊成 | YES     |
| 梁君彥                                   | Andrew LEUNG       | 反對 | NO      | 李永達                                     | LEE Wing-tat    | 贊成 | YES     |
| 郭家麒                                   | Dr KWOK Ka-ki      | 贊成 | YES     | 李國英                                     | LI Kwok-ying    | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 張超雄                                   | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 | YES     | 馬力                                      | MA Lik          |    |         |
| 黃定光                                   | WONG Ting-kwong    | 棄權 | ABSTAIN | 梁家傑                                     | Alan LEONG      |    |         |
| 詹培忠                                   | CHIM Pui-chung     |    |         | 梁國雄                                     | LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 | YES     |
| 劉秀成                                   | Prof Patrick LAU   | 反對 | NO      | 張學明                                     | CHEUNG Hok-ming | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 鄭志堅                                   | KWONG Chi-kin      |    |         | 湯家驊                                     | Ronny TONG      |    |         |
| 譚香文                                   | TAM Heung-man      | 贊成 | YES     | 鄭經翰                                     | Albert CHENG    |    |         |

*Wilson Chan*

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:33:30 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
"IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 22                                | 18                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 22                                | 17                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 10                                | 15                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 12                                | 2                                   |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0                                 | 0                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 否決 Negatived                      | 通過 Passed                           | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員<br>MEMBER                          | 投票<br>VOTE | 議員<br>MEMBER                            | 投票<br>VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |            | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |            |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO                     | 反對 NO      | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN                       | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI                       |            | 田北俊 James TIEN                          | 反對 NO      |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah                   |            | 何俊仁 Albert HO                           |            |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG                       | 贊成 YES     | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong                  | 贊成 YES     | 李柱銘 Martin LEE                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN                      |            | 李華明 Fred LI                             | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG                 | 反對 NO      | 周潔淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW                    | 反對 NO      |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai                     | 贊成 YES     | 涂謹申 James TO                            | 贊成 YES     |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG                    | 贊成 YES     | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han                       |            |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat                      | 反對 NO      | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU                        | 反對 NO      | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK                       | 反對 NO      | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek                       |            |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK                      | 反對 NO      | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying                      | 贊成 YES     | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU                           |            |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk                         |            |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG                       | 反對 NO      | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG                        |            |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing                    | 贊成 YES     | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM                        |            | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM                       | 反對 NO      | 余若薇 Audrey EU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat                        |            |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki                     | 贊成 YES     | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying                        |            |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG                |            | 馬力 MA Lik                               |            |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong                   |            | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG                          |            |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung                    |            | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung                     |            |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU                  | 反對 NO      | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin                     |            | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG                          |            |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man                     | 贊成 YES     | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG                        | 贊成 YES     |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:36:45 下午

動議 MOTION: 余若薇議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON AUDREY EU TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
"IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE  
BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇 Audrey EU

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 22                                | 20                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 22                                | 19                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 7                                 | 12                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 14                                | 7                                   |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 1                                 | 0                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 否決 Negatived                      | 通過 Passed                           | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員                                    | MEMBER             | 投票 | VOTE    | 議員                                      | MEMBER          | 投票 | VOTE    |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------|----|---------|---|-----------------|----|---------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |                    |    |         | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |                 |    |         |
| 何鍾泰                                   | Dr Raymond HO      | 反對 | NO      | 范徐麗泰                                    | Mrs Rita FAN    | 出席 | PRESENT |
| 李國寶                                   | Dr David LI        |    |         | 田北俊                                     | James TIEN      | 反對 | NO      |
| 呂明華                                   | Dr LUI Ming-wah    |    |         | 何俊仁                                     | Albert HO       | 贊成 | YES     |
| 吳靄儀                                   | Margaret NG        | 贊成 | YES     | 李卓人                                     | LEE Cheuk-yan   | 贊成 | YES     |
| 張文光                                   | CHEUNG Man-kwong   | 贊成 | YES     | 李柱銘                                     | Martin LEE      | 贊成 | YES     |
| 陳智思                                   | Bernard CHAN       |    |         | 李華明                                     | Fred LI         | 贊成 | YES     |
| 梁劉柔芬                                  | Mrs Sophie LEUNG   | 反對 | NO      | 周梁淑怡                                    | Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 | NO      |
| 單仲偕                                   | SIN Chung-kai      | 贊成 | YES     | 涂謹申                                     | James TO        | 贊成 | YES     |
| 黃宜弘                                   | Dr Philip WONG     | 反對 | NO      | 陳婉嫻                                     | CHAN Yuen-han   |    |         |
| 黃容根                                   | WONG Yung-kan      | 反對 | NO      | 陳鑑林                                     | CHAN Kam-lam    | 反對 | NO      |
| 楊孝華                                   | Howard YOUNG       | 反對 | NO      | 梁耀忠                                     | LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 | YES     |
| 劉皇發                                   | LAU Wong-fat       | 反對 | NO      | 曾鈺成                                     | TSANG Yok-sing  | 反對 | NO      |
| 劉健儀                                   | Miriam LAU         | 反對 | NO      | 楊森                                      | Dr YEUNG Sum    | 贊成 | YES     |
| 霍震霆                                   | Timothy FOK        | 反對 | NO      | 劉千石                                     | LAU Chin-shek   |    |         |
| 石禮謙                                   | Abraham SHEK       | 反對 | NO      | 劉江華                                     | LAU Kong-wah    | 反對 | NO      |
| 李鳳英                                   | LI Fung-ying       | 贊成 | YES     | 劉慧卿                                     | Emily LAU       | 贊成 | YES     |
| 張宇人                                   | Tommy CHEUNG       | 反對 | NO      | 蔡素玉                                     | CHOY So-yuk     |    |         |
| 方剛                                    | Vincent FANG       | 反對 | NO      | 鄭家富                                     | Andrew CHENG    |    |         |
| 王國興                                   | WONG Kwok-hing     | 棄權 | ABSTAIN | 譚耀宗                                     | TAM Yiu-chung   | 反對 | NO      |
| 李國麟                                   | Dr Joseph LEE      | 贊成 | YES     | 陳偉業                                     | Albert CHAN     | 贊成 | YES     |
| 林偉強                                   | Daniel LAM         |    |         | 馮檢基                                     | Frederick FUNG  | 贊成 | YES     |
| 林健鋒                                   | Jeffrey LAM        | 反對 | NO      | 余若薇                                     | Audrey EU       | 贊成 | YES     |
| 梁君彥                                   | Andrew LEUNG       | 反對 | NO      | 李永達                                     | LEE Wing-tat    |    |         |
| 郭家麒                                   | Dr KWOK Ka-ki      | 贊成 | YES     | 李國英                                     | LI Kwok-ying    |    |         |
| 張超雄                                   | Dr Fernando CHEUNG |    |         | 馬力                                      | MA Lik          |    |         |
| 黃定光                                   | WONG Ting-kwong    |    |         | 梁家傑                                     | Alan LEONG      |    |         |
| 詹培忠                                   | CHIM Pui-chung     |    |         | 梁國雄                                     | LEUNG Kwok-hung |    |         |
| 劉秀成                                   | Prof Patrick LAU   | 反對 | NO      | 張學明                                     | CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 | NO      |
| 鄭志堅                                   | KWONG Chi-kin      |    |         | 湯家驊                                     | Ronny TONG      |    |         |
| 譚香文                                   | TAM Heung-man      | 贊成 | YES     | 鄭經翰                                     | Albert CHENG    | 贊成 | YES     |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
 時間 TIME: 06:39:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 劉秀成議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY PROF HON PATRICK LAU TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
 "IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE  
 BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉秀成Patrick LAU

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 22                                | 24                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 22                                | 23                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 18                                | 10                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 3                                 | 13                                  |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 1                                 | 0                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 通過 Passed                         | 否決 Negatived                        | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員<br>MEMBER                          | 投票<br>VOTE | 議員<br>MEMBER                            | 投票<br>VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |            | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |            |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO                     | 贊成 YES     | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN                       | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI                       |            | 田北俊 James TIEN                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah                   |            | 何俊仁 Albert HO                           | 反對 NO      |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG                       |            | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan                       | 反對 NO      |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong                  | 反對 NO      | 李柱銘 Martin LEE                          | 反對 NO      |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN                      |            | 李華明 Fred LI                             | 反對 NO      |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG                 | 贊成 YES     | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW                    | 贊成 YES     |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai                     | 反對 NO      | 涂謹申 James TO                            | 反對 NO      |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG                    | 贊成 YES     | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han                       |            |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG                      | 贊成 YES     | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung                     | 反對 NO      |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat                      | 贊成 YES     | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU                        | 贊成 YES     | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum                         | 反對 NO      |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK                       | 贊成 YES     | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek                       |            |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK                      | 贊成 YES     | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying                      | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU                           | 反對 NO      |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG                      | 贊成 YES     | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG                       | 贊成 YES     | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG                        |            |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing                    | 反對 NO      | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN                         | 反對 NO      |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM                        |            | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG                      | 反對 NO      |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM                       | 贊成 YES     | 余若薇 Audrey EU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG                      | 贊成 YES     | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat                        | 反對 NO      |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki                     | 贊成 YES     | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying                        |            |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG                | 贊成 YES     | 馬力 MA Lik                               |            |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong                   |            | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung                    |            | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung                     | 反對 NO      |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU                  | 贊成 YES     | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin                     |            | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG                          |            |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man                     | 贊成 YES     | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG                        | 反對 NO      |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:41:31 下午

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON LEE WING-TAT TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
"IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE  
BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 24                                | 24                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 24                                | 23                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 9                                 | 15                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 14                                | 3                                   |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 1                                 | 5                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 否決 Negatived                      | 通過 Passed                           | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員<br>MEMBER                          | 投票<br>VOTE | 議員<br>MEMBER                            | 投票<br>VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |            | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |            |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO                     | 反對 NO      | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN                       | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI                       |            | 田北俊 James TIEN                          | 反對 NO      |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah                   |            | 何俊仁 Albert HO                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG                       | 贊成 YES     | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong                  | 贊成 YES     | 李柱銘 Martin LEE                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN                      | 反對 NO      | 李華明 Fred LI                             | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG                 | 反對 NO      | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW                    | 反對 NO      |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai                     | 贊成 YES     | 涂謹申 James TO                            | 贊成 YES     |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG                    | 反對 NO      | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han                       |            |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan                     | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam                        | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat                      | 反對 NO      | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing                      | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU                        | 反對 NO      | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK                       | 反對 NO      | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek                       |            |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK                      | 反對 NO      | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah                        | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying                      | 贊成 YES     | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk                         | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG                       | 反對 NO      | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG                        |            |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing                    | 贊成 YES     | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung                       | 棄權 ABSTAIN |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM                        |            | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM                       | 反對 NO      | 余若薇 Audrey EU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki                     | 贊成 YES     | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying                        |            |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG                | 贊成 YES     | 馬力 MA Lik                               |            |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong                   |            | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung                    |            | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU                  | 反對 NO      | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming                     | 反對 NO      |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin                     |            | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG                          |            |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man                     | 贊成 YES     | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG                        | 贊成 YES     |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:45:46 下午

動議 MOTION: 「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案  
MOTION ON "IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

|            | 功能團體<br>Functional Constituencies | 地方選區<br>Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果<br>Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 24                                | 24                                  |                      |
| 投票 Vote    | 24                                | 23                                  |                      |
| 贊成 Yes     | 8                                 | 13                                  |                      |
| 反對 No      | 16                                | 10                                  |                      |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0                                 | 0                                   |                      |
| 結果 Result  | 否決 Negatived                      | 通過 Passed                           | 否決 Negatived         |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員<br>MEMBER                          | 投票<br>VOTE | 議員<br>MEMBER                            | 投票<br>VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| <b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b> |            | <b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b> |            |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO                     | 反對 NO      | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN                       | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI                       |            | 田北俊 James TIEN                          | 反對 NO      |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah                   |            | 何俊仁 Albert HO                           | 反對 NO      |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG                       | 贊成 YES     | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong                  | 反對 NO      | 李柱銘 Martin LEE                          | 反對 NO      |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN                      | 反對 NO      | 李華明 Fred LI                             | 反對 NO      |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG                 | 反對 NO      | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW                    | 反對 NO      |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai                     | 反對 NO      | 涂謹申 James TO                            | 反對 NO      |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG                    | 反對 NO      | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han                       |            |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat                      | 反對 NO      | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU                        | 反對 NO      | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum                         | 反對 NO      |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK                       | 反對 NO      | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek                       |            |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK                      | 反對 NO      | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah                        | 贊成 YES     |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying                      | 贊成 YES     | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU                           | 反對 NO      |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG                       | 反對 NO      | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG                        |            |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing                    | 贊成 YES     | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung                       | 贊成 YES     |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE                     | 贊成 YES     | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN                         | 贊成 YES     |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM                        |            | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG                      | 贊成 YES     |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM                       | 反對 NO      | 余若薇 Audrey EU                           | 贊成 YES     |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG                      | 反對 NO      | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat                        | 反對 NO      |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki                     | 贊成 YES     | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying                        |            |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG                | 贊成 YES     | 馬力 MA Lik                               |            |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong                   |            | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG                          | 贊成 YES     |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung                    |            | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU                  | 反對 NO      | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming                     | 贊成 YES     |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin                     |            | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG                          |            |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man                     | 贊成 YES     | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG                        | 反對 NO      |

秘書 CLERK