

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 27

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 May 2007 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

Prof the Hon Arthur LI Kwok-cheung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education and Manpower

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP  
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Road Traffic (Amendment: Extension of Permitted Area for New Territories Taxis to Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Regulation 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	68/2007
2. Closed Area (Hong Kong Section of the Shenzhen Bay Bridge and Deep Bay Link Portion) Order (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	69/2007
3. Immigration (Places of Detention) (Amendment: Lok Ma Chau Spur Line Control Point) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	70/2007
4. Immigration Service (Designated Places) (Amendment: Lok Ma Chau Spur Line Control Point) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	71/2007
5. Immigration (Places of Detention) (Amendment: Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	72/2007
6. Immigration Service (Designated Places) (Amendment: Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Order 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	73/2007
7. Frontier Closed Area (Permission to Enter) (Amendment) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	74/2007
8. Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area (Permission to Enter) Notice (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	75/2007
9. Antiquities and Monuments (Declaration of Historical Building) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 4.5.2007)	76/2007

**Questions**

1. Hon Tommy CHEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

2. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education and Manpower replied.

3. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

4. Hon Fred LI asked Question 4.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

One Member asked supplementary question and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Hon LEE Wing-tat asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied. While he was replying to the supplementary question, Hon Emily LAU raised a point of order on whether the Secretary had made an insulting remark about another director of bureau in his reply. The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour clarified that he had not and continued with his reply.

Three more Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Hon SIN Chung-kai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

6. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Combating unscrupulous shops**

Hon LAU Kong-wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the rising number of cases of Mainland tourists being cheated while shopping in Hong Kong, this Council urges the Government to adopt active measures to rigorously combat unscrupulous shops ripping off customers and to strengthen the regulation of the tourism industry, in order to restore the confidence of tourists coming to Hong Kong for shopping, including:

- (a) studying the consolidation of the provisions relating to protecting consumer rights and interests in the existing legislation into a Protection of Consumer Rights and Interests Ordinance;
- (b) comprehensively reviewing the existing legislation on protecting consumer rights and interests, and tightening up regulation to cover the marketing practices of alluding to particular brands or misleading the customers;
- (c) enhancing the regular inspections and "undercover" operations carried out by the Police and the Customs and Excise Department to crack down on shops engaging in fraudulent practices and selling fake products;
- (d) requesting the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong (TIC) to set up a complaint website, so that Mainland tourists may lodge complaints through the website after their departure from Hong Kong;

- (e) expeditiously discussing with the TIC the introduction of a demerit point system to regulate travel agents and tour guides; and
- (f) fully disclosing the parties involved in complaint cases, including the names of shops, the local and Mainland travel agents, as well as the tour guides concerned.

While Hon LAU Kong-wah was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:07 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon Fred LI would move amendments to the motion and that Hon SIN Chung-kai would move an amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Howard YOUNG, Hon Fred LI and Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon SIN Chung-kai was speaking, with the President's Deputy's permission, Hon Howard YOUNG elucidated on a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon SIN Chung-kai.

Two other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring that he was a Member of the Hong Kong Tourism Board, Hon Vincent FANG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 1:56 pm, while Hon Vincent FANG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring that he was the Chairman of the Hong Kong Tourism Board, Hon James TIEN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LAU Kong-wah spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion:

To delete "rising number of" after "in view of the" and substitute with "recent"; to add "which have aroused wide concern" after "shopping in Hong Kong"; to add "On the cooperation with the relevant Mainland authorities: (a) fully implementing the eight regulatory measures promulgated earlier by the China National Tourism Administration, including conducting regular inspections and imposing severe penalties on non-compliant travel agents, so as to thoroughly combat the problems arising from zero-fare and negative-fare tours; (b) prohibiting outbound travel agents in the Mainland from imposing additional charges on tour members for leaving the tour group before completion of the itinerary; (c) vigorously publicizing to tourists the risks involved in 'arranged shopping' tours and the protection available to them; (d) expeditiously allowing Hong Kong's reputable travel agents to operate Hong Kong and Macao tours in Guangdong Province, with a view to upgrading in the long run the quality of tourism services in the Mainland; On the local front:" after "coming to Hong Kong for shopping, including:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(e)"; to add "whether there is a need for" after "studying"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(g)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(h)"; to add ", and providing tourists with such information as the complaint hotline at border crossing points" after "departure from Hong Kong"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(i)"; to delete "and" after "travel agents and tour guides;"; to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(j) if the complaints are substantiated,"; and to add "; and (k) discussing with the industry the introduction of a tour guide fee system" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion proposed.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment:

To delete "providing tourists with such information as the complaint hotline at border crossing points" after "departure from Hong Kong, and" and substitute with "installing television facilities at border crossing points to publicize tourism information, as well as cooperating with telecommunications companies to provide inbound and outbound tourists with information such as the complaint hotline via mobile telephone short message service".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment, as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai, to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion put and agreed to.

As Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Fred LI to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Fred LI moved the following further amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon SIN Chung-kai, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; (l) in the cases of travel agents incurring demerit points due to non-compliance with the rules, examining how to prevent their directors from evading the penalty by changing their company names to continue operations; and (m) studying the transfer of the TIC's function of monitoring the tourism industry to a new statutory regulatory body to avoid the problem of 'the industry regulating its own members' " after "tour guide fee system".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon SIN Chung-kai proposed and put.

Hon Fred LI claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LAU Kong-wah replied.

Question on Hon LAU Kong-wah's motion as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon SIN Chung-kai put and agreed to.

### **Improving the planning for Hong Kong and reducing screen-like buildings**

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, despite the planning guidelines provided in the existing Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines on building density, layout, urban design and air ventilation etc, such guidelines are not legally binding, resulting in the recent emergence of a large number of screen-like buildings, which not only affect the air ventilation and lighting, etc of the neighbouring areas but also bring adverse impact on the planning of ancillary facilities, such as transport and public

realm, for the entire community; in view of the above, this Council urges the Government to thoroughly review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, consider introducing legislative measures to regulate the density and height of buildings, air ventilation and lighting, etc, and, at the same time, protect the ridgelines and harbour view, so as to ensure better planning for Hong Kong.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Audrey EU, Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing and Hon LEE Wing-tat, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments. Ten other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon James TIEN spoke on the motion and the amendments, and declared his interests that he had real estate projects under development.

Another three Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To delete "despite" after "That," and substitute with "since"; to delete ", such guidelines" after "air ventilation etc"; to delete "resulting in" after "legally binding," and substitute with "it has resulted in"; to add "and result in deteriorating air quality in areas farther away from the coastline (such as the old areas of Sham Shui Po and Yau Tsim Mong)," after "neighbouring areas"; and to add ", strengthen the ventilation requirements of the Buildings Department and the two railway companies (i.e. the MTR Corporation and the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation) in vetting and approving building designs" after "review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Improving the planning for Hong Kong and reducing screen-like buildings" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To delete "despite the planning guidelines provided in" after "That," and substitute with "since"; to delete "on building density, layout, urban design and air ventilation etc, such guidelines" after "the existing Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines"; to delete "resulting in" after "legally binding," and substitute with "it has resulted in"; to delete ", consider introducing legislative measures to regulate the density and height of buildings, air ventilation and lighting, etc, and, at the same time, protect the ridgelines and harbour view" after "review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines" and substitute with "and adopt the following measures"; and to add ": (a) extending the application of the Technical Circular on Air Ventilation Assessment (TC1/06), currently applicable to government building only, to all projects of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA), developments above railway stations and private developments; (b) taking a leading role to immediately and thoroughly review the design and scale of all current large-scale development projects, particularly the redevelopment projects of URA and the development projects above railway stations of wholly Government-owned railway corporation, so as to ensure compliance of all development projects with the requirements of the 'Qualitative Guidelines on Air Ventilation' in the 'Urban Design Guidelines' under Chapter 11 of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines, and the requirements of the Technical Circular on Air Ventilation Assessment, and reducing development density or improving design to prevent the occurrence of wall effect; (c) thoroughly reviewing all large-scale development projects which have been approved but not yet developed, in order to minimize the impact of wall effect

by improving their designs, such as increasing the distance between buildings, creating view corridors and breezeways, setting back developments from site boundaries, and enhancing the provision of public realm at ground level; (d) refraining from subsidizing railway developments, urban renewal projects, cultural venues and other public facilities through land exchange, development rights or additional plot ratio, because the density of land development in various districts should be based on professional planning decisions and not financial considerations; (e) thoroughly reviewing the development density of all districts including the metropolitan area and the new towns, in order to avoid the emergence of screen-like buildings, particularly at the ventilation points, such as harbour-front areas or areas facing large open spaces; Government land located in high density districts should not be sold for property development, and should be reserved for low density development or used as open space, so as to alleviate the increasing development density of private properties in the same district; newly planned sites should not be over-sized and should be separated by view corridors and breezeways to improve air ventilation at ground level; the amalgamation of sites should also be limited to mitigate wall effect; (f) amending existing legislation, such as section 16 of the Buildings Ordinance, or stipulating more objective guidelines through Practice Notes, to provide a clearer basis for the Building Authority and the industry, so as to avoid the construction of buildings, such as screen-like buildings, which will bring adverse ventilation impact on neighbouring buildings; (g) reviewing the various existing mechanisms and guidelines to avoid any unnecessary wall effect, such as over-sized car-parking podium, or the emergence of screen-like buildings due to lack of co-ordination among departments; (h) abandoning the current two-dimensional approach to town planning and replacing it with a three-dimensional approach; using three-dimensional physical models to assist in design during the planning process and as a means to communicate with the general public, so as to envisage at an early stage whether the development density, building mass and disposition will cause wall effect; apart from the existing Outline Zoning Plans and General Building Plans, district-specific Urban Design Guidelines should also be drawn up; (i) formulating relevant guidelines to prevent wall effect by making reference to overseas experience: (i) Shanghai has requirements to limit the width of slab block buildings to not more than 60 metres, etc; (ii) New York imposes control on street shadow area for buildings, so that super high buildings will not be linked up like the Great Wall; and (iii) Japan and Singapore have included height limits and massing control in the land leases or buildings regulations to prevent the emergence of screen-like buildings; (j) conducting assessment on sunlight, wind tunnel and micro-climatic analysis, etc, with reference to examples like the Ngau Tau Kok Upper Estate redevelopment project, while planning for new large-scale development sites, so as to minimize the adverse impact of new developments on

the community; (k) increasing the participation of non-government professionals and the community in the planning process, and considering the introduction of a 'Planning Aids Scheme' to assist the public in lodging planning applications when necessary, so that affected residents and shop operators can obtain independent and professional advice more easily, in order to ensure that the aspirations of the community can be taken care of in the planning process; and (l) in the long run, restructuring the Town Planning Board to ensure its independence from the Government; the current situation whereby the Government benefits from the sale of land on the one hand and takes charge of the town planning process on the other has inevitably led to conflicts of interest, and it is difficult to ensure that the Town Planning Board can make planning decisions impartially for the benefit of the community at large" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To delete "," after "layout" and substitute with "and"; to delete "and air ventilation etc, such guidelines are not legally binding, resulting in the recent emergence of" after "urban design" and substitute with ","; to add "still emerge in recent years" after "screen-like buildings"; and to delete "consider introducing legislative measures to regulate" after "review the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines," and substitute with "and, under the principle of not affecting private development rights, study the expedient introduction of greening ratio and regulation of".

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add ", while the Town Planning Board (TPB) fails to meet the public's expectation in preventing or minimizing such adverse impact" after "entire community"; to add "the composition and modus operandi of TPB with a view to enhancing public involvement and TPB's public representativeness; review relevant documents such as" after "thoroughly review"; and to delete ", consider introducing legislative measures to regulate the density and height of buildings, air ventilation and lighting, etc," after "the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines" and substitute with "and the Practice Notes for Professional Persons; strengthen legislation, including specifying the adoption of specific, clear and enforceable clauses, development parameters or procedures in relation to the density and height of buildings, air ventilation, lighting and conservation of historic buildings, as stated in the applicable chapters of the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines and relevant documents, such as the Practice Notes for Professional Persons, for land parcels in different zones on the statutory plans that carry legal effect, in order to reduce wall effect in an expedient and effective manner;".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing replied.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the motion and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 16 May 2006 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:47 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 03:39:03 下午

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員對劉江華議員就「打擊黑店」所提，經楊孝華議員（及單仲偕議員）修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON FRED LI TO HON LAU KONG-WAH'S MOTION ON "COMBATING UNSCRUPULOUS SHOPS" AS AMENDED BY HON HOWARD YOUNG (AND HON SIN CHUNG-KAI)

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	21	
投票 Vote	24	20	
贊成 Yes	9	12	
反對 No	13	2	
棄權 Abstain	2	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			何俊仁	Albert HO		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁家傑	Alan LEONG		
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權	ABSTAIN
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		

*Vivian Chan*

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
 時間 TIME: 06:33:30 下午

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
 "IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE  
 BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	18	
投票 Vote	22	17	
贊成 Yes	10	15	
反對 No	12	2	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周潔淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:36:45 下午

動議 MOTION: 余若薇議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON AUDREY EU TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
"IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE  
BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇 Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	20	
投票 Vote	22	19	
贊成 Yes	7	12	
反對 No	14	7	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
 時間 TIME: 06:39:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 劉秀成議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY PROF HON PATRICK LAU TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
 "IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE  
 BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉秀成Patrick LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	24	
投票 Vote	22	23	
贊成 Yes	18	10	
反對 No	3	13	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:41:31 下午

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員對王國興議員的「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON LEE WING-TAT TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON  
"IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE  
BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	9	15	
反對 No	14	3	
棄權 Abstain	1	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	棄權	ABSTAIN	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	棄權	ABSTAIN
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
林偉強	Daniel LAM			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying		
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 09/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:45:46 下午

動議 MOTION: 「改善香港規劃及減少屏風式建築物」議案  
MOTION ON "IMPROVING THE PLANNING FOR HONG KONG AND REDUCING SCREEN-LIKE BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	8	13	
反對 No	16	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK