

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 29

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 23 May 2007 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Joseph WONG Wing-ping, GBS, JP
Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Fugitive Offenders (Malaysia) (Amendment) Order 2007 (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	82/2007
2. Fugitive Offenders (Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism) Order (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	83/2007
3. Telecommunications (Method for Determining Spectrum Utilization Fee) (Code Division Multiple Access Mobile Telecommunications Service) Regulation (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	84/2007
4. Telecommunications (Designation of Frequency Bands Subject to Payment of Spectrum Utilization Fee) (Amendment) Order 2007 (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	85/2007
5. Companies Ordinance (Amendment of Eighth Schedule) Order 2007 (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	86/2007
6. Registration of Persons (Invalidation of Identity Cards) Order 2007 (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	87/2007
7. Road Traffic (Traffic Control) (Designation of Prohibited and Restricted Zones) (Amendment) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	88/2007
8. Specification of Factors (Financial Exposure of Authorized Institution) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	89/2007
9. Accreditation of Academic and Vocational Qualifications Ordinance (Commencement) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	90/2007
10. Births, Deaths and Marriages (Digital Image) Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 18.5.2007)	91/2007

- | | |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| 11. Building Management (Amendment) Ordinance 2007
(Commencement) Notice 2007 (gazetted on
18.5.2007) | 92/2007 |
| 12. Construction Workers Registration Ordinance
(Commencement) (No. 2) Notice 2007 (gazetted on
18.5.2007) | 93/2007 |
| 13. Employment (Amendment) Ordinance 2007
(Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 18.5.2007) | 94/2007 |
| 14. Import and Export (Fees) (Amendment) Regulation
2007 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on
18.5.2007) | 95/2007 |

Other Papers

No. 92 - Annual Report 2005-2006
Hong Kong Broadcasting Authority (published on
22.5.2007)

Report of the Bills Committee on Unsolicited Electronic
Messages Bill (published on 17.5.2007)

Questions

1. Hon Vincent FANG Kang asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

One Member asked a supplementary question and the
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works
replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works
replied.

3. Hon TSANG Yok-sing asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology
replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

4. Hon TAM Heung-man asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

6. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Import and Export (Amendment) Bill 2007

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 18 April 2007 resumed.

One Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Import and Export (Amendment) Bill 2007**.

Question that clauses 1, 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology reported that

the **Import and Export (Amendment) Bill 2007**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Unsolicited Electronic Messages Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 12 July 2006 resumed.

Hon Howard YOUNG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Unsolicited Electronic Messages Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

While Hon Howard YOUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:03 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Four Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology replied.

At 1:59 pm, while the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Unsolicited Electronic Messages Bill**.

Question that clauses 3, 4, 9, 11, 12, 13, 19, 20, 22, 35, 36, 41, 44, 47 to 50, 53, 55, 56 and 57 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 6 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure that Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended to enable the Committee of the whole Council to consider Schedule 1 together with clause 6.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

Question that Schedule 1 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology and Hon WONG Ting-kwong had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 6 and Schedule 1. She ordered that the clause 6 and Schedule 1 as well as amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved amendments to clause 6 and Schedule 1 and addressed the Committee.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke on the amendments moved and his proposed amendments.

Four Members spoke on the amendments, and one Member who had spoken spoke again.

One other Member spoke on the amendments.

One Member who had spoken twice spoke another time.

Two Members who had spoken once and Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke again.

Three more Members spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology spoke again.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology put.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 44 Members were present, 26 were in favour of the amendments, 16 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the amendments moved by the Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology had been passed, Hon WONG Ting-kwong might not move his amendments to clause 6 and Schedule 1, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 6 and Schedule 1, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 5, 7, 8, 10, 14 to 18, 21, 23 to 34, 37 to 40, 42, 43, 45, 46, 51, 52 and 54 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the deletion of clause 32 and amendments to the other aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the amendment to clause 32, which dealt with deletion, had been agreed, clause 32 was therefore deleted from the Bill.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 5, 7, 8, 10, 14 to 18, 21, 23 to 31, 33, 34, 37 to 40, 42, 43, 45, 46, 51, 52 and 54, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 5A, 30A, 34A, 40A and 52A read the first time.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses proposed.

Three Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses put and agreed to.

New clauses 5A, 30A, 34A, 40A and 52A read the second time.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology moved amendments to Schedule 2 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that Schedule 2, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology reported that

the Unsolicited Electronic Messages Bill

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Revenue (No. 2) Bill 2007

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 2 May 2007 resumed.

One Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Revenue (No. 2) Bill 2007**.

Question that clauses 1 to 9 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Revenue (No. 2) Bill 2007**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Policies on sustainable urban development and green buildings

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of the United Nations' earlier warning that within this century, global warming will cause hundreds of millions of people to face disasters such as fresh water shortage, famine, flooding, diseases, and the rise in sea level will even pose a threat to the coastal lands in Asia including the Pearl River Delta region, from which Hong Kong can hardly be immune; in order to alleviate the greenhouse effect arising from imbalanced urban development and to eliminate the adverse effects of undesirable high-density building developments on weather and the environment, this Council urges the Government to expeditiously formulate and implement policies on sustainable urban development and green buildings, including:

- (a) reviewing the existing legislation relating to urban planning and buildings, and introducing sustainable planning and green building principles;
- (b) studying the formulation of a Code of Practice for introducing a "green building labelling" system, and fully assessing the environmental performance of buildings during the design stage and after their being put to use on the basis of energy efficiency, greening ratio, air ventilation, renewable energy, household waste treatment and design parameters which are conducive to good weather and urban environment; and
- (c) the Government and public organizations taking the lead in fully applying the relevant policies to both new and existing public buildings, educating the public, and offering incentives to actively promote market compliance,

so as to alleviate the impact of global warming on Hong Kong and to build a pleasant city which is sustainable through the implementation of policies on urban development and green buildings that are conducive to good weather and environment.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed.

The President stated that Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki moved the following amendment to Hon Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete ", in view of" after "That" and substitute with "this Council agrees with"; to delete "this Council urges" after "the environment,"; to add "has" before "to expeditiously formulate"; to add "(a) reorganizing the Town Planning Board (TPB), appointing a non-government official as its chairman and setting up an independent secretariat, so that the decisions of the TPB can more fairly and truly reflect public opinion;" after "including:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(b)"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete "fully" after "taking the lead in"; and to delete "both new and existing public buildings" after "relevant policies to" and substitute with "various development projects, including property developments above the stations of the two railways, redevelopment projects of the Urban Renewal Authority, the West Kowloon Cultural District, waterfront developments along Central, Wanchai and Causeway Bay, as well as public buildings to be developed in the future".

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed.

Nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion put.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 15 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, and four against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing replied.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion put and agreed to.

Safeguarding the safety of live and fresh food

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Mainland Government has, with effect from 1 April this year, strengthened its inspection and quarantine management system for vegetables supplied to Hong Kong, including designating supply farms, implementing label identification and lead-seal control, and regularizing certification and voucher management, etc, and such requirements will be extended to fruits and melons on 1 July and 1 October respectively; furthermore, quarantine and seal identification measures for vessels carrying fresh water fish from Guangdong Province to Hong Kong have also been enforced since 1 May, so as to eradicate the smuggling of fish into Hong Kong; however, the Hong Kong SAR Government has not yet made any complementary import quarantine arrangements, nor has it publicized the Mainland Government's new regulations to the

public, hence making it possible for unscrupulous traders to exploit Hong Kong's import quarantine loopholes and bring unquarantined live and fresh food into the territory for sale in the market, thereby endangering the public's health, this Council urges the Government to expeditiously adopt measures to complement the Mainland's new management regulations for food supplied to Hong Kong, and fully safeguard the safety standards of live and fresh food in the territory, including:

- (a) enacting a food safety law to bring live and fresh food such as vegetables and fruits, aquatic products and poultry eggs, etc, into the regulatory ambit, prescribing relevant food safety standards and enforcing import quarantine at border control points, so as to ensure the safety of imported live and fresh food;
- (b) implementing a food importer registration scheme and requiring food importers to keep their import and sales records, so as to enhance the enforcement authorities' ability to trace the sources and destinations of food;
- (c) disseminating information about the new regulations promulgated by the Mainland Government and the list of designated food supply bases to the trade, and uploading such information onto the Government's website, so as to enhance the awareness of the trade and the public; and
- (d) strengthening liaison with the local trade to assess the impact of the new regulatory measures implemented by the Mainland and Hong Kong on the operations of the trade, and assisting the trade in making adaptation;

besides, the Government should also assist in improving the mode of operation of local agricultural and breeding farms, so as to increase the supplies of safe and high quality local agricultural and fishery products.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Vincent FANG Kang and Hon Fred LI would move amendments to the motion and that Hon Tommy CHEUNG would move an amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the two amendments and the amendment to amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang, Hon Fred LI, Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:55 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Seven other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendments. At 7:54 pm, while he was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion:

To add "the Hong Kong SAR Government has indicated that legislation will be enacted within the current year to strengthen the control of imported poultry eggs and cultured aquatic products, while" after "That, as"; to add "so far" after "however,"; to delete "complementary" after "not yet made any"; to add "and complementary management measures" after "import quarantine arrangements"; to add "and market management" after "Hong Kong's import quarantine"; to add "set of comprehensive live and fresh" after "enacting a"; to add "according to international practices and local needs," after "food safety standards"; to add "as well as implementing the arrangement for all live and fresh food to be distributed in the Government's wholesale food markets," after "border control points,"; to add "while enacting the above legislation, setting up at the same time an emergency relief fund for the live and fresh food industry to provide, in the event of adversity in the industry, emergency assistance to the affected trades, so as to tide them over the difficult times;" after "imported live and fresh food;"; and to add ", and assist Hong Kong businesses which invest in agriculture and fishery industries in the Mainland in obtaining priority for reverse export of their standards-compliant products to Hong Kong for sale in the market" after "agricultural and fishery products".

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon Tommy CHEUNG had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment to Hon Fred LI's amendment if Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment was agreed. Hon Tommy CHEUNG had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Fred LI to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Fred LI moved the following further amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon Vincent FANG Kang and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; and study the expansion of the Man Kam To Food Control Office, step up random inspection of vehicles carrying vegetables and fruits to reduce the chance of vegetables and fruits from unknown sources being brought into Hong Kong, and further promote organic farming, including rendering more

technical support to farmers and assisting the trade in expanding the market" after "to Hong Kong for sale in the market".

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon Vincent FANG Kang proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung replied.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon Vincent FANG Kang and Hon Fred LI put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 30 May 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:19 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 23/05/2007
 時間 TIME: 03:53:00 下午

動議 MOTION: 《非應邀電子訊息條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第6條及附表1
 UNSOLICITED ELECTRONIC MESSAGES BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO
 CLAUSE 6 AND SCHEDULE 1

動議人 MOVED BY: 工商及科技局局長 Secretary for Commerce, Industry and Technology

出席 Present :44
 投票 Vote :43
 贊成 Yes :26
 反對 No :16
 棄權 Abstain :1
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE			張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	反對	NO
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	馬力	MA Lik		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum			黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 23/05/2007
時間 TIME: 06:14:26 下午

動議 MOTION: 郭家麒議員對劉秀成議員的「可持續發展的城市發展及環保樓宇政策」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY DR HON KWOK KA-KI TO PROF HON PATRICK LAU'S MOTION ON "POLICIES ON SUSTAINABLE URBAN DEVELOPMENT AND GREEN BUILDINGS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	15	
投票 Vote	22	14	
贊成 Yes	6	10	
反對 No	15	4	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES