

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 30

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 30 May 2007 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP  
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

Dr the Hon Patrick HO Chi-ping, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
Fugitive Offenders (Corruption) Order (gazetted on 25.5.2007)	100/2007

### **Other Paper**

No.93 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the fourth quarter of 2006-2007 (Public Finance Ordinance : Section 8) (published on 25.5.2007)

### **Questions**

1. Hon Albert HO asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

2. Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

3. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

4. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

5. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

6. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Bills**

#### **First Reading**

##### **The English Schools Foundation (Amendment) Bill 2007**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

#### **Second Reading**

##### **The English Schools Foundation (Amendment) Bill 2007**

Hon Abraham SHEK moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

Hon LAU Kong-wah moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the -

- (a) Road Traffic (Amendment: Extension of Permitted Area for New Territories Taxis to Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Regulation 2007, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 68 of 2007;
- (b) Closed Area (Hong Kong Section of the Shenzhen Bay Bridge and Deep Bay Link Portion) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 69 of 2007;
- (c) Immigration (Places of Detention) (Amendment: Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Order 2007, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 72 of 2007;
- (d) Immigration Service (Designated Places) (Amendment: Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area) Order 2007, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 73 of 2007; and
- (e) Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area (Permission to Enter) Notice, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 75 of 2007,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 9 May 2007, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 27 June 2007.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

#### **Fostering the development of the tourism industry**

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, Hong Kong is a cosmopolitan city popular among tourists all over the world, and the SAR Government has all along supported the development of the local tourism industry, which being one of the four pillars of the local economy, should have had immense room for development; however, as most travel agencies in Hong Kong are small and medium enterprises operating on narrow profit margins and have recently been affected by some negative factors, coupled with the internal conflicts in the industry, the tourism industry is encountering difficulties in business operation; as such, this Council urges the Government to face up to the problems and discuss with the industry measures to enhance the level of professional services and promote the long-term development of the industry, which include:

- (a) providing more training courses by the Government to upgrade the quality of professional services of the employees in the tourism industry, in particular that of the tourist guides; and
- (b) assisting in resolving internal conflicts in the industry, eliminating uneven distribution of interests and rationalizing the cooperative relationship among stakeholders in the industry.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Fred LI, Hon TAM Heung-man and Hon CHAN Kam-lam would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen and Hon Howard YOUNG would move amendments to Hon TAM Heung-man's and Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendments respectively. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Fred LI, and Hon TAM Heung-man spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon TAM Heung-man was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:44 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, Hon Howard YOUNG, and seven other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

After declaring that he was the Chairman of the Hong Kong Tourism Board, Hon James TIEN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:08 pm while Hon James TIEN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion:

To add "although" after "That, "; to delete "and" after "all over the world, "; to delete "has all along supported" after "the SAR Government" and substitute with "still needs to strengthen its support for"; to add "(a) in view of the difficult business situation of the industry, allocating more resources to promote monument sponsorship, green ecology and local customs, and setting a timetable for developing Hong Kong's cultural characteristics of the east meeting the west under 'one country, two systems', thereby improving the hardware and software of the industry's business environment on a broader level; (b) restructuring the Hong Kong Tourism

Board and Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong to enhance their representation and further include the participation of trade union representatives; (c) further promoting good labour relations in the industry, comprehensively perfecting the employment system and formulating reasonable employment conditions (including basic salaries, employees' compensation insurance, mandatory provident fund, medical benefits and holidays, etc), improving the employee-employer and staff-management communication mechanisms and promoting cooperation between the employees and employers in order to create a win-win situation for both sides, so that both sides can join hands in promoting the development of the industry; (d) through commending trustworthy shops and tourist guides and employees in the industry who are professional, sincere, friendly, hospitable and make tourists feel welcomed, establishing quality brand names and goodwill of local tour reception agencies to improve the image of the local tourism industry;" after "which include:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(e)"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete ", eliminating uneven distribution of interests" after "internal conflicts in the industry"; and to add ", so as to foster a sustainable and healthy development in the local tourism industry" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion proposed and put.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, 12 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Fred LI rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Fostering the development of the tourism industry" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Fred LI moved the following amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion:

To add "and the provinces and municipalities in the Mainland continue to introduce the 'Individual Visit Scheme' " after

"all over the world,"; and to add "; feasible measures include expanding the representation of the Board of Directors of the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong by adding to it lay members and representatives from tourist guides" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion proposed and put.

Hon Fred LI claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment and two against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon TAM Heung-man moved the following amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion:

To delete "and" after "the level of professional services" and substitute with ", the quality of corporate governance and its regulatory mechanism, so as to"; to delete "and" after "tourist guides;"; and to add "; (c) considering further enhancing the operation efficiency and corporate governance of the Hong Kong Tourism Board; and (d) considering establishing a better regulatory mechanism for the tourism industry, including reviewing the composition of the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong, to avoid conflicts of interests in the tourism industry" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon TAM Heung-man's amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion proposed.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's amendment:

To add "how (such as considering allocating more resources) to assist in" after "(c) considering"; to delete "establishing a better" after "(d) considering" and substitute with "perfecting the existing"; and to delete ", to avoid" after "composition of the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong" and substitute with "and strengthening its power and resources, so as to satisfy the community's expectation of its function to monitor the industry and at the same time avoid the possibility of".

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment to Hon TAM Heung-man's amendment proposed and put.

Hon TAM Heung-man claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon TAM Heung-man's amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion put.

Hon TAM Heung-man claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion:

To delete "and" after "tourist guides;"; and to delete "assisting in resolving internal conflicts in the industry, eliminating uneven distribution of interests and rationalizing the cooperative relationship among stakeholders in the industry" after "(b)" and substitute with "consolidating the level playing field and free business environment for the tourism industry; (c) urging the Travel Industry Council of Hong Kong to expeditiously introduce an indemnity insurance system for the tourism industry in order to strengthen the protection for the industry and tourists; (d) communicating with the representatives of travel agencies and tourist guides to study the feasibility of introducing a basic salary system for tourist guides; and (e) rigorously combating unscrupulous shops and penalizing the non-compliant travel agencies so as to enhance the service standard of the tourism industry".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion proposed.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment:

To add "and considering extending the function of the Travel Industry Compensation Fund for such purpose" after "protection for the industry and tourists".

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment, as amended by Hon Howard YOUNG, to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion put and agreed to.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung replied.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's motion as amended by Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Howard YOUNG put and agreed to.

#### **The 4 June incident**

Hon Martin LEE moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges that: the 4 June incident be not forgotten, the 1989 pro-democracy movement be vindicated, the civil rights movement be supported, and a constitutional democracy be established.

Question on the motion proposed.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

10 other Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

12 more Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Martin LEE replied.

Question on the motion put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, five against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the motion, and six against it and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

#### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 6 June 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:14 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 30/05/2007  
 時間 TIME: 03:54:15 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對林健鋒議員的「促進旅遊業界發展」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON JEFFREY LAM'S MOTION  
 ON "FOSTERING THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	11	21	
反對 No	12	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Minam LAU		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 30/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 03:57:26 下午

動議 MOTION: 李華明議員對林健鋒議員的「促進旅遊業界發展」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON FRED LI TO HON JEFFREY LAM'S MOTION ON "FOSTERING THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李華明 Fred LI

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	25	
投票 Vote	24	24	
贊成 Yes	12	22	
反對 No	11	2	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 30/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 04:00:41 下午

動議 MOTION: 梁君彥議員就譚香文議員對林健鋒議員的「促進旅遊業界發展」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON ANDREW LEUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON TAM HEUNG-MAN'S AMENDMENT TO HON JEFFREY LAM'S MOTION ON "FOSTERING THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	25	
投票 Vote	24	24	
贊成 Yes	16	9	
反對 No	6	15	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉焯發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

*Victoria Lam*

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 30/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 04:03:00 下午

動議 MOTION: 譚香文議員對林健鋒議員的「促進旅遊業界發展」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON TAM HEUNG-MAN TO HON JEFFREY LAM'S MOTION ON  
"FOSTERING THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE TOURISM INDUSTRY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚香文 TAM Heung-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	25	
投票 Vote	24	24	
贊成 Yes	12	22	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	11	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

*William Chan*

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 30/05/2007  
時間 TIME: 07:12:48 下午

動議 MOTION: 「六四事件」議案  
MOTION ON "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李柱銘 Martin LEE

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	26	
投票 Vote	22	25	
贊成 Yes	7	17	
反對 No	5	6	
棄權 Abstain	10	2	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES