

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 31

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 6 June 2007 at 11:00 am,
Thursday 7 June 2007 at 2:30 pm and Friday 8 June 2007 at 9:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP (absent on 7.6.2007 & 8.6.2007)

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP (absent on 7.6.2007 & 8.6.2007)

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG (absent on 8.6.2007)

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

On 6.6.2007, 7.6.2007 and 8.6.2007

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

On 6.6.2007

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

On 6.6.2007 and 8.6.2007

The Hon Stephen IP Shu-kwan, GBS, JP
Secretary for Economic Development and Labour

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

On 7.6.2007 and 8.6.2007

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

On 6.6.2007, 7.6.2007 and 8.6.2007

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

| <u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u> | <u>L.N. No.</u> |
|---|-----------------|
| 1. Exemption from Salaries Tax (International Finance Corporation) Order (gazetted on 1.6.2007) | 101/2007 |
| 2. Bankruptcy Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 1.6.2007) | 102/2007 |
| 3. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No.3) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 1.6.2007) | 103/2007 |
| 4. Financial Reporting Council Ordinance (Commencement) (No.2) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 1.6.2007) | 104/2007 |

Other Papers

No.94 - Securities and Futures Commission Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 6.6.2007)

Report of the Bills Committee on Rail Merger Bill (published on 5.6.2007)

Questions

1. In accordance with Rule 26(6) of the Rules of Procedure, Hon Vincent FANG Kang asked Question 1 on behalf of Hon Howard YOUNG, who was not present to ask his question.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

2. Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

3. Hon Martin LEE asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

4. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour replied.

5. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

6. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Rail Merger Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 5 July 2006 resumed.

Hon Miriam LAU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Rail Merger Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. She then spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the Bill.

While Hon Andrew CHENG was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:27 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

One Member and Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the Bill.

At 2:06 pm, while Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member and Hon TAM Heung-man spoke on the Bill.

While Hon TAM Heung-man was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:31 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Six other Members and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the Bill.

At 4:06 pm, while Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Emily LAU spoke on the Bill.

While Hon Emily LAU was speaking, several persons in the Public Gallery clapped their hands and yelled. The President ordered them to keep quiet.

Hon Emily LAU continued to speak on the Bill.

Seven more Members and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the Bill.

With the President's permission, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW elucidated on a point she had made earlier which she considered to be wrongly quoted by Hon LEE Wing-tat.

With the President's permission, Hon LEE Wing-tat elucidated on what he had said earlier, and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW further explained her point.

Two more Members and Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the Bill.

While Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:23 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

With the permission of the President's Deputy, Hon Emily LAU elucidated on a point she had made earlier which she considered to be misunderstood by Hon TAM Yiu-chung.

One other Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

At 6:55 pm, while the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 53 Members were present, 32 were in favour of the motion and 20 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

Several women in the Public Gallery suddenly stood up and yelled. As these women ignored the President's order to keep quiet, the President suspended the meeting at 7:22 pm.

The Council resumed at 7:25 pm.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam sought the President's ruling on whether it was permissible for a Member to ask his wife to make a row in the Public Gallery, and interrupt the Council's proceedings. The President stated that every person should be responsible for his own action. In additions, as she had no information proving any kinship existed between any Member present and any person in the Public Gallery, she could not make such a ruling. Dr Hon Philip WONG sought the President's permission to ask Hon CHAN Kam-lam to elucidate on which Member he was referring to. The President stated that she would not accede to the request as it was not directly related to the Bill under consideration. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum made a protest against the frivolous remarks made by the two Members. The President stated that the Rules of Procedure did not permit him to make such a protest.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Rail Merger Bill**.

Question that clauses 1, 4, 7, 13, 20, 24, 26, 27 and 29 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke. The Chairman interrupted him as the contents of his speech were not relevant to the clauses being dealt with by the Committee. She stated that he could speak on the long title on the Bill when clause 3 was being dealt with later.

Question that clauses 1, 4, 7, 13, 20, 24, 26, 27 and 29 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2, Heading of Division 1 in Part 2, clauses 3, 6, 9 to 12, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19, 22, 23, 25 and 28 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the amendments. While Hon Andrew CHENG was speaking, Hon Miriam LAU raised a point of order on whether Hon Andrew CHENG's speech was related to the clauses and amendments being dealt with. The Chairman stated that she had now realized that clause 3 actually dealt with the long title of the Mass Transit Railway Ordinance, and not the long title of the Bill. The Chairman then asked Hon Andrew CHENG to speak only on the clauses and amendments being dealt with by the Committee.

Hon Andrew CHENG continued to speak.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke. While he was speaking, Hon Miriam LAU raised a point of order on whether Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's speech was related to the clauses and amendments being dealt with by the Committee. The Chairman asked Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG to speak only on such clauses and amendments. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG continued to speak. The Chairman then asked him to stop speaking as the contents of his speech were not relevant to the clauses and amendments under consideration.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, Heading of Division 1 in Part 2, clauses 3, 6, 9 to 12, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19, 22, 23, 25 and 28, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 5 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved amendments to clause 5 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Hon Andrew CHENG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure that Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended to enable the Committee of the whole Council to consider new clauses 10A and 21F, new heading before new clause 15A and new clause 15A together with clause 5.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

New clauses 10A and 21F read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Hon Andrew CHENG had given notice to move an amendment to add the definition of "scheduled occurrence" to clause 5 and the addition of new clauses 10A and 21F to the bill. She ordered that the aforesaid clauses and amendment be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the second reading of new clauses 10A and 21F and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 10A and 21F proposed.

Two Members spoke on the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke again.

One Member spoke on the amendments.

One Member who had spoken spoke again.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke again.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 10A and 21F put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The Chairamn then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, six were in favour of the motion and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the motion and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in respect of the remaining provisions of the Rail Merger Bill or amendments thereto, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as Hon Andrew CHENG's motion had been negatived, he might not move his amendment to add the definition of "scheduled occurrence" to clause 5, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

New heading before new clause 15A and new clause 15A read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Hon Andrew CHENG had given notice to move an amendment to add the definitions of "Committee" and "Fund" to clause 5 and the addition of the new heading before new clause 15A and new clause 15A to the bill. She ordered that the aforesaid clauses and amendments be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the Second Reading of the new heading before new clause 15A and new clause 15A and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the new heading before new clause 15A and new clause 15A proposed.

Two Members spoke on the amendments.

With the Chairman's permission, Hon Miriam LAU elucidated on certain remarks she had made earlier which she considered to be misunderstood by Hon LEE wing-tat.

One other Member spoke on the amendments.

With the Chairman's permission, Hon Miriam LAU elucidated on a point she had made earlier which she considered to be misunderstood by Hon TAM Heung-man.

Five more Members and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG and two Members who had spoken spoke again.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke for the third time.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke again.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke for the fourth time.

One Member who had spoken twice spoke again and another Member spoke on the amendments.

One more Member who had spoken twice spoke again.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 11:04 pm.

* * * * *

The Committee resumed at 2:30 pm on 7 June 2007.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Two Members who had spoken on the previous day spoke another time and two other Members spoke on the amendments.

One Member who had spoken and a Member who had spoken thrice spoke again.

One more Member spoke on the amendments.

One Member who had spoken twice spoke again.

With the Chairman's permission, Hon James TO elucidated on a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon Miriam LAU.

Another Member spoke on the amendments.

One Member who had spoken spoke another time.

One Member spoke on the amendments. Another Member who had spoken thrice and the other Member who had spoken once spoke another time.

Hon Andrew CHENG and one Member who had spoken four times spoke again.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke again.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke for the fifth time.

Question on the Second Reading of new heading before new clause 15A and new clause 15A put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, five were in favour of the motion and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 17 were present, nine were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon Andrew CHENG's motion had been negatived, he might not move his amendment to add the definitions of "Committee" and "Fund" to clause 5, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 5, as amended earlier by the amendments moved by the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 8 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Hon Andrew CHENG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure that Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended to enable the Committee of the whole Council to consider the proposed new clause 21E together with clause 8.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

New clause 21E read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Hon Andrew CHENG had given notice to move an amendment to clause 8 and the addition of new clause 21E, which sought to amend section 9 of the Mass Transit Railway Ordinance and add Schedule 7 thereto. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works had also separately given notice to move amendments to clause 8 to amend section 9 thereof. She ordered that the aforesaid clauses and amendments be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the amendment to clause 8 and addressed the Committee.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment and their proposed amendments.

Three Members spoke on these amendments.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and one Member who had spoken spoke again.

Two more Members spoke on these amendments.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke for the third time.

Two more Members spoke on these amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works and Hon Andrew CHENG spoke the second time.

Three more Members spoke on these amendments.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke for the fourth time.

Another two Members who had spoken once spoke for the second time.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke for the third time.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works and one Member who had spoken twice spoke again.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon Andrew CHENG spoke again.

Another Member who had spoken once spoke for the second time.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan drew the attention of the Chairman to the absence of a quorum. The Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Before putting to Members the question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to clause 8, the Chairman reminded Members that if Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment was agreed, he might move the second reading of new clause 21E. If Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment was negatived, he might not move the second reading of new clause 21E.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon Andrew CHENG put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, five were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the amendment to clause 8.

Question on the amendment moved by Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG put.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the amendment to clause 8.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 40 Members were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Question that clause 8 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 16 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs, who stood in for the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works, moved amendments to clause 16 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved a further amendment to clause 16 to amend section 33 of the Mass Transit Railway Ordinance and addressed the Committee.

While Andrew CHENG was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 7:18 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the amendment.

At 7:21 pm, while the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Hon Andrew CHENG and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke another time.

One Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke again.

Hon James TO drew the attention of the Chairman to the absence of a quorum. The Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon Andrew CHENG put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 13 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 16 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix VII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 16 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 21 and 30 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Hon Andrew CHENG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure that Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure be suspended to enable the Committee of the whole Council to consider new clauses 20A and 21D, new heading before new clause 29C and new clause 29C together with clauses 21 and 30.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

New clauses 20A and 21D read the first time.

As Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, who was next to move amendments to the Bill, was not in the Chamber, the Chairman suspended the meeting at 7:43 pm.

The Committee resumed at 7:47 pm. The Chairman left the chair temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the Chairman's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The Chairman's Deputy stated that Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung had given notice to move the addition of new clauses 20A and 21D to the bill to repeal section 54 of and Schedule 2 to the Mass Transit Railway Ordinance. Hon Andrew CHENG had also given notice to move the addition of such clauses to amend section 54 and Schedule 2 thereof. She ordered that the aforesaid clauses be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the Second Reading of new clauses 20A and 21D and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 20A and 21D proposed.

As Hon Andrew CHENG, who was next to speak on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's and his own proposed amendments to the Bill, was not in the Chamber, the Chairman's Deputy suspended the meeting at 7:58 pm.

The Committee resumed at 7:59 pm.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the Chairman's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the motion and his proposed new clauses.

Three other Members and Hon TAM Heung-man spoke on the motion and the new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

At 8:56 pm, while Hon TAM Heung-man was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Three more Members spoke on the motion and the new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke again.

Another three Members spoke on the motion and the new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

Three Members who had spoken and Hon Andrew CHENG who had spoken twice spoke another time.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 10:06 pm.

* * * * *

The Committee resumed at 9:00 am on 8 June 2007.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Andrew CHENG who had spoken thrice and one Member who had spoken twice spoke again.

While Hon James TO was speaking, Hon Miriam LAU sought his elucidation on a point he had just made. Hon James TO elucidated and continued to speak.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke again.

One Member who had spoken twice and one Member who had spoken thrice spoke again.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke for the third time.

The Member who had spoken thrice spoke again.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke for the fourth time.

One more Member spoke on the motion and the new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke for the fifth time.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the motion and the new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

One Member who had spoken spoke for the second time.

One other Member spoke on the motion and new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke for the sixth time.

One more Member spoke on the motion and new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

One other Member who had spoken twice spoke for the third time.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke for the fifth time.

One Member who had spoken and the other Member who had spoken twice spoke again.

Three Members who had spoken spoke again and four more Members spoke on the motion and new clauses proposed by Hon Andrew CHENG.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke for the sixth time.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 11:33 am temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

One Member who had spoken and the other Member who had spoken four times spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 20A and 21D put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman Deputy then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 11:40 am, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 17 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix VIII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the Second Reading of new clauses 20A and 21D.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 20A and 21D proposed and put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, 15 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix IX.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved amendments to clauses 21 and 30 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 47 Members were present, 28 were in favour of the amendments, 17 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix X.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

Question that clause 21 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New heading before new clause 29C and new clause 29C read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung had given notice to move the addition of new heading before new clause 29C and new clause 29C as well as an amendment to clause 30. She ordered that the aforesaid heading, clause and amendment be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the Second Reading of new heading before new clause 29C and new clause 29C and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of new heading before new clause 29C and new clause 29C proposed.

Two Members and Hon Emily LAU spoke on the amendments.

While Hon Emily LAU was speaking, there was noise from the Public Gallery caused by a person's sound emitting device. As the person refused to switch off the device, the Chairman ordered that the person be removed from the meeting.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke again.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 12:44 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

One Member who had spoken and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the amendments twice alternately.

Another Member who had spoken and a Member who had spoken thrice spoke again.

Question on the Second Reading of new heading before new clause 29C and new clause 29C put.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong drew the attention of the Chairman's Deputy to the absence of a quorum. The Chairman's Deputy directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

At 1:01 pm, the Chairman resumed the chair and a quorum was then present.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, five were in favour of the motion and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix XI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's motion had been negatived, he might not move his amendment to clause 30, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 30, as amended earlier by the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 6A read the first time.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the Second Reading of new clause 6A and addressed the Committee.

While Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 1:09 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 6A proposed.

One Member spoke on the motion.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke another time and one Member spoke on the motion.

One Member who had spoken spoke again. The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works spoke on the motion.

At 1:43 pm, while the Secretary for Environment, Transport and Works was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke again.

One Member who had spoken spoke another time.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 6A put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, two were in favour of the motion, 15 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix XII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

New heading before new clause 18A, new clauses 18A, 21A, 21B, 21C, 29A and 29B read the first time.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid new heading and new clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid new heading and new clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New heading before new clause 18A, new clauses 18A, 21A, 21B, 21C, 29A and 29B read the second time.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved the addition of the aforesaid new heading and new clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Schedules 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works moved amendments to Schedules 1 and 2 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that Schedules 1 and 2 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works reported that

the **Rail Merger Bill**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

13 Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Question on the Third Reading put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 49 Members were present, 30 were in favour of the motion, 17 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix XIII.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Commission on Children

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to set up a Commission on Children to fulfill the obligations under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, safeguard the well-being of children, and ensure that children's perspectives are fully taken into account in the process of formulating government policies.

Question on the motion proposed.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 3:54 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Seven other Members and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion.

At 4:52 pm, while Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

12 more Members and the Secretary for Economic Development and Labour spoke on the motion.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Concern about students with special educational needs

Hon Bernard CHAN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as integrated education in Hong Kong is currently implemented by a whole-school approach, and as some schools do not have sufficient complementary facilities and adequate training for frontline teachers, and they have to take care of too many types of students with special needs, the result achieved is not proportionate to the efforts made; for example, although some autistic students have excellent learning abilities, not only do they fail to exploit their strengths in class, their social adjustment and communication difficulties also make it difficult for teachers to deal with their behaviour, emotions and discipline in class, this Council urges the Government to deploy more resources to mainstream schools which admit students with special educational needs, so as to consolidate the foundation of such students for learning and help them integrate into mainstream education as soon as possible.

Question on the motion proposed.

Two Members and Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion.

While Hon Audrey EU was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:54 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three more Members and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion.

At 7:24 pm, while Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Six more Members and the Secretary for the Civil Service spoke on the motion.

Hon Bernard CHAN replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 13 June 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:26 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 06/06/2007
 時間 TIME: 07:21:38 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》 - 二讀
 RAIL MERGER BILL - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境運輸及工務局局長 Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

出席 Present :53
 投票 Vote :52
 贊成 Yes :32
 反對 No :20
 棄權 Abstain :0
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE | 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE |
|------|------------------|----|---------|-----|--------------------|----|------|
| 范徐麗泰 | Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 | PRESENT | 鄭家富 | Andrew CHENG | 反對 | NO |
| 田北俊 | James TIEN | 贊成 | YES | 霍震霆 | Timothy FOK | | |
| 何俊仁 | Albert HO | 反對 | NO | 譚耀宗 | TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 | YES |
| 何鍾泰 | Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 | YES | 石禮謙 | Abraham SHEK | 贊成 | YES |
| 李卓人 | LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 | NO | 李鳳英 | LI Fung-ying | 贊成 | YES |
| 李柱銘 | Martin LEE | 反對 | NO | 張宇人 | Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 李國寶 | Dr David LI | | | 陳偉業 | Albert CHAN | | |
| 李華明 | Fred LI | 反對 | NO | 馮檢基 | Frederick FUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 呂明華 | Dr LUI Ming-wah | | | 余若薇 | Audrey EU | 反對 | NO |
| 吳靄儀 | Margaret NG | 反對 | NO | 方剛 | Vincent FANG | 贊成 | YES |
| 周梁淑怡 | Mrs Selina CHOW | 贊成 | YES | 王國興 | WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 | YES |
| 涂謹申 | James TO | 反對 | NO | 李永達 | LEE Wing-tat | 反對 | NO |
| 張文光 | CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 | NO | 李國英 | LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳婉嫻 | CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 | YES | 李國麟 | Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳智思 | Bernard CHAN | 贊成 | YES | 林偉強 | Daniel LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳鑑林 | CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 | YES | 林健鋒 | Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 | Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 贊成 | YES | 馬力 | MA Lik | | |
| 梁耀忠 | LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 | NO | 梁君彥 | Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 單仲偕 | SIN Chung-kai | | | 梁家傑 | Alan LEONG | 反對 | NO |
| 黃宜弘 | Dr Philip WONG | 贊成 | YES | 梁國雄 | LEUNG Kwok-hung | 反對 | NO |
| 黃容根 | WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 | YES | 郭家麒 | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 反對 | NO |
| 曾鈺成 | TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 | YES | 張超雄 | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 | NO |
| 楊孝華 | Howard YOUNG | 贊成 | YES | 張學明 | CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 | YES |
| 楊森 | Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 | NO | 黃定光 | WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉千石 | LAU Chin-shek | 反對 | NO | 湯家驊 | Ronny TONG | 反對 | NO |
| 劉江華 | LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 | YES | 詹培忠 | CHIM Pui-chung | | |
| 劉皇發 | LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 | YES | 劉秀成 | Prof Patrick LAU | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉健儀 | Miriam LAU | 贊成 | YES | 鄭經翰 | Albert CHENG | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉慧卿 | Emily LAU | 反對 | NO | 鄭志堅 | KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 | YES |
| 蔡素玉 | CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 | YES | 譚香文 | TAM Heung-man | 反對 | NO |

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 06/06/2007
時間 TIME: 08:56:19 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第10A及21F條，予以二讀
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSES 10A AND 21F BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 22 | |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 21 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 6 | 12 | |
| 反對 No | 17 | 9 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 反對 NO | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | 反對 NO | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 07/06/2007
時間 TIME: 03:46:27 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第15A條前的新標題及新訂的第15A條，予以二讀
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW HEADING BEFORE NEW CLAUSE 15A AND NEW CLAUSE 15A BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 21 | 17 | |
| 投票 Vote | 21 | 16 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 5 | 9 | |
| 反對 No | 16 | 7 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 贊成 YES | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 07/06/2007
時間 TIME: 07:09:24 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第8條
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 8

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 17 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 17 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 5 | 12 | |
| 反對 No | 12 | 8 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | | 李華明 Fred LI | |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 07/06/2007
時間 TIME: 07:12:10 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第8條
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 8

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 18 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 18 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 6 | 12 | |
| 反對 No | 12 | 8 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | | 李華明 Fred LI | |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 贊成 YES | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6
日期 DATE: 07/06/2007
時間 TIME: 07:14:22 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第8條
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 8

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境運輸及工務局局長 Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

出席 Present :40
投票 Vote :39
贊成 Yes :23
反對 No :16
棄權 Abstain :0
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE | 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE |
|------|------------------|----|---------|-----|--------------------|----|------|
| 范徐麗泰 | Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 | PRESENT | 鄭家富 | Andrew CHENG | 反對 | NO |
| 田北俊 | James TIEN | 贊成 | YES | 霍震霆 | Timothy FOK | | |
| 何俊仁 | Albert HO | 反對 | NO | 譚耀宗 | TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 | YES |
| 何鍾泰 | Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 | YES | 石禮謙 | Abraham SHEK | | |
| 李卓人 | LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 | NO | 李鳳英 | LI Fung-ying | 反對 | NO |
| 李柱銘 | Martin LEE | | | 張宇人 | Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 李國寶 | Dr David LI | | | 陳偉業 | Albert CHAN | | |
| 李華明 | Fred LI | | | 馮檢基 | Frederick FUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 呂明華 | Dr LUI Ming-wah | | | 余若薇 | Audrey EU | | |
| 吳靄儀 | Margaret NG | 反對 | NO | 方剛 | Vincent FANG | 贊成 | YES |
| 周梁淑怡 | Mrs Selina CHOW | 贊成 | YES | 王國興 | WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 | YES |
| 涂謹申 | James TO | 反對 | NO | 李永達 | LEE Wing-tat | 反對 | NO |
| 張文光 | CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 | NO | 李國英 | LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳婉嫻 | CHAN Yuen-han | | | 李國麟 | Dr Joseph LEE | | |
| 陳智思 | Bernard CHAN | | | 林偉強 | Daniel LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳鑑林 | CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 | YES | 林健鋒 | Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 | Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 贊成 | YES | 馬力 | MA Lik | | |
| 梁耀忠 | LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 | NO | 梁君彥 | Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 單仲偕 | SIN Chung-kai | | | 梁家傑 | Alan LEONG | 反對 | NO |
| 黃宜弘 | Dr Philip WONG | 贊成 | YES | 梁國雄 | LEUNG Kwok-hung | 反對 | NO |
| 黃容根 | WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 | YES | 郭家麒 | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | |
| 曾鈺成 | TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 | YES | 張超雄 | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 | NO |
| 楊孝華 | Howard YOUNG | 贊成 | YES | 張學明 | CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 | YES |
| 楊森 | Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 | NO | 黃定光 | WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉千石 | LAU Chin-shek | | | 湯家驊 | Ronny TONG | 反對 | NO |
| 劉江華 | LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 | YES | 詹培忠 | CHIM Pui-chung | | |
| 劉皇發 | LAU Wong-fat | | | 劉秀成 | Prof Patrick LAU | | |
| 劉健儀 | Miriam LAU | 贊成 | YES | 鄭經翰 | Albert CHENG | | |
| 劉慧卿 | Emily LAU | 反對 | NO | 鄭志堅 | KWONG Chi-kin | | |
| 蔡素玉 | CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 | YES | 譚香文 | TAM Heung-man | 反對 | NO |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7
 日期 DATE: 07/06/2007
 時間 TIME: 07:39:45 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 進一步修正第16條
 RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - FURTHER AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 16

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 17 | 16 | |
| 投票 Vote | 17 | 15 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 4 | 7 | |
| 反對 No | 13 | 8 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | 反對 NO |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | 反對 NO | 李華明 Fred LI | |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | 反對 NO | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | 反對 NO |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2007
 時間 TIME: 11:41:05 上午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第20A及21D條，予以二讀
 RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSES 20A AND 21D BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 23 | |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 22 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 4 | 15 | |
| 反對 No | 17 | 7 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 2 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | 贊成 YES |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 反對 NO | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 反對 NO | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

Vivian Chan

投票 VOTE: 9
日期 DATE: 08/06/2007
時間 TIME: 11:43:37 上午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第20A及21D條，予以二讀
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSES 20A AND 21D BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 23 | 24 | |
| 投票 Vote | 23 | 23 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 7 | 16 | |
| 反對 No | 15 | 7 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 1 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | 贊成 YES |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 YES |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | 贊成 YES |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | 贊成 YES | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 YES | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | 贊成 YES |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | 贊成 YES | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

Van der Meer

投票 VOTE: 10
日期 DATE: 08/06/2007
時間 TIME: 11:47:00 上午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第21及30條
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSES 21 AND 30

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境運輸及工務局局長 Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

出席 Present :47
投票 Vote :46
贊成 Yes :28
反對 No :17
棄權 Abstain :1
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE | 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE |
|------|------------------|----|---------|-----|--------------------|----|---------|
| 范徐麗泰 | Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 | PRESENT | 鄭家富 | Andrew CHENG | 反對 | NO |
| 田北俊 | James TIEN | | | 霍震霆 | Timothy FOK | | |
| 何俊仁 | Albert HO | 反對 | NO | 譚耀宗 | TAM Yiu-chung | | |
| 何鍾泰 | Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 | YES | 石禮謙 | Abraham SHEK | 贊成 | YES |
| 李卓人 | LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 | NO | 李鳳英 | LI Fung-ying | | |
| 李柱銘 | Martin LEE | 反對 | NO | 張宇人 | Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 李國寶 | Dr David LI | | | 陳偉業 | Albert CHAN | | |
| 李華明 | Fred LI | 反對 | NO | 馮檢基 | Frederick FUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 呂明華 | Dr LUI Ming-wah | | | 余若薇 | Audrey EU | 反對 | NO |
| 吳靄儀 | Margaret NG | 反對 | NO | 方剛 | Vincent FANG | 贊成 | YES |
| 周梁淑怡 | Mrs Selina CHOW | 贊成 | YES | 王國興 | WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 | YES |
| 涂謹申 | James TO | 反對 | NO | 李永達 | LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 | YES |
| 張文光 | CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 | NO | 李國英 | LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳婉嫻 | CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 | YES | 李國麟 | Dr Joseph LEE | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳智思 | Bernard CHAN | | | 林偉強 | Daniel LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳鑑林 | CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 | YES | 林健鋒 | Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 | Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 贊成 | YES | 馬力 | MA Lik | | |
| 梁耀忠 | LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 | NO | 梁君彥 | Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 單仲偕 | SIN Chung-kai | | | 梁家傑 | Alan LEONG | 反對 | NO |
| 黃宜弘 | Dr Philip WONG | 贊成 | YES | 梁國雄 | LEUNG Kwok-hung | 反對 | NO |
| 黃容根 | WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 | YES | 郭家麒 | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | |
| 曾鈺成 | TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 | YES | 張超雄 | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 | NO |
| 楊孝華 | Howard YOUNG | 贊成 | YES | 張學明 | CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 | YES |
| 楊森 | Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 | NO | 黃定光 | WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉千石 | LAU Chin-shek | | | 湯家驊 | Ronny TONG | 反對 | NO |
| 劉江華 | LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 | YES | 詹培忠 | CHIM Pui-chung | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 劉皇發 | LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 | YES | 劉秀成 | Prof Patrick LAU | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉健儀 | Miniam LAU | 贊成 | YES | 鄭經翰 | Albert CHENG | | |
| 劉慧卿 | Emily LAU | 反對 | NO | 鄭志堅 | KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 | YES |
| 蔡素玉 | CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 | YES | 譚香文 | TAM Heung-man | 反對 | NO |

Viola Chan

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 11
日期 DATE: 08/06/2007
時間 TIME: 01:06:11 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第29C條前的新標題及新訂的第29C條，予以二讀
RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW HEADING BEFORE NEW CLAUSE 29C AND NEW CLAUSE 29C BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 20 | 21 | |
| 投票 Vote | 20 | 20 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 5 | 13 | |
| 反對 No | 15 | 7 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 0 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | 贊成 YES | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 YES |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | 反對 NO | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 LI Fung-ying | | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 YES | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | 贊成 YES |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 YES | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

投票 VOTE: 12
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2007
 時間 TIME: 01:58:24 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第6A條，予以二讀
 RAIL MERGER BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSE 6A BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達 LEE Wing-tat

| | 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | 最後結果 Final Result |
|------------|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|----------------------|
| 出席 Present | 19 | 18 | |
| 投票 Vote | 19 | 17 | |
| 贊成 Yes | 2 | 10 | |
| 反對 No | 15 | 7 | |
| 棄權 Abstain | 2 | 0 | |
| 結果 Result | 否決 Negatived | 通過 Passed | 否決 Negatived |

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE | 議員 MEMBER | 投票 VOTE |
|---------------------------------------|------------|---|------------|
| 功能團體 Functional Constituencies | | 地方選區 Geographical Constituencies | |
| 何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO | 反對 NO | 范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 PRESENT |
| 李國寶 Dr David LI | | 田北俊 James TIEN | |
| 呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah | | 何俊仁 Albert HO | 贊成 YES |
| 吳靄儀 Margaret NG | 贊成 YES | 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan | 贊成 YES |
| 張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong | | 李柱銘 Martin LEE | |
| 陳智思 Bernard CHAN | | 李華明 Fred LI | 贊成 YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 反對 NO | 周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW | 反對 NO |
| 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai | | 涂謹申 James TO | 贊成 YES |
| 黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG | 反對 NO | 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han | |
| 黃容根 WONG Yung-kan | 反對 NO | 陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam | 反對 NO |
| 楊孝華 Howard YOUNG | 反對 NO | 梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung | 贊成 YES |
| 劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat | 反對 NO | 曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing | 反對 NO |
| 劉健儀 Miriam LAU | 反對 NO | 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum | 贊成 YES |
| 霍震霆 Timothy FOK | | 劉千石 LAU Chin-shek | |
| 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK | | 劉江華 LAU Kong-wah | 反對 NO |
| 李鳳英 Li Fung-ying | 反對 NO | 劉慧卿 Emily LAU | 贊成 YES |
| 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG | 反對 NO | 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk | 反對 NO |
| 方剛 Vincent FANG | 反對 NO | 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG | 贊成 YES |
| 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung | |
| 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE | 反對 NO | 陳偉業 Albert CHAN | |
| 林偉強 Daniel LAM | 反對 NO | 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG | 贊成 YES |
| 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM | 反對 NO | 余若薇 Audrey EU | |
| 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG | 反對 NO | 李永達 LEE Wing-tat | 贊成 YES |
| 郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki | | 李國英 LI Kwok-ying | 反對 NO |
| 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 贊成 YES | 馬力 MA Lik | |
| 黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong | 反對 NO | 梁家傑 Alan LEONG | |
| 詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung | | 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung | |
| 劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU | | 張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming | 反對 NO |
| 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin | 棄權 ABSTAIN | 湯家驊 Ronny TONG | |
| 譚香文 TAM Heung-man | | 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG | |

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 13
 日期 DATE: 08/06/2007
 時間 TIME: 03:39:38 下午

動議 MOTION: 《兩鐵合併條例草案》 - 三讀
 RAIL MERGER BILL - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境運輸及工務局局長 Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

出席 Present :49
 投票 Vote :48
 贊成 Yes :30
 反對 No :17
 棄權 Abstain :1
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

| 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE | 議員 | MEMBER | 投票 | VOTE |
|------|------------------|----|---------|-----|--------------------|----|---------|
| 范徐麗泰 | Mrs Rita FAN | 出席 | PRESENT | 鄭家富 | Andrew CHENG | 反對 | NO |
| 田北俊 | James TIEN | 贊成 | YES | 霍震霆 | Timothy FOK | | |
| 何俊仁 | Albert HO | 反對 | NO | 譚耀宗 | TAM Yiu-chung | 贊成 | YES |
| 何鍾泰 | Dr Raymond HO | 贊成 | YES | 石禮謙 | Abraham SHEK | 贊成 | YES |
| 李卓人 | LEE Cheuk-yan | 反對 | NO | 李鳳英 | LI Fung-ying | 贊成 | YES |
| 李柱銘 | Martin LEE | | | 張宇人 | Tommy CHEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 李國寶 | Dr David LI | | | 陳偉業 | Albert CHAN | | |
| 李華明 | Fred LI | 反對 | NO | 馮檢基 | Frederick FUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 呂明華 | Dr LUI Ming-wah | | | 余若薇 | Audrey EU | 反對 | NO |
| 吳靄儀 | Margaret NG | 反對 | NO | 方剛 | Vincent FANG | 贊成 | YES |
| 周梁淑怡 | Mrs Selina CHOW | 贊成 | YES | 王國興 | WONG Kwok-hing | 贊成 | YES |
| 涂謹申 | James TO | 反對 | NO | 李永達 | LEE Wing-tat | | |
| 張文光 | CHEUNG Man-kwong | 反對 | NO | 李國英 | LI Kwok-ying | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳婉嫻 | CHAN Yuen-han | 贊成 | YES | 李國麟 | Dr Joseph LEE | | |
| 陳智思 | Bernard CHAN | 贊成 | YES | 林偉強 | Daniel LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 陳鑑林 | CHAN Kam-lam | 贊成 | YES | 林健鋒 | Jeffrey LAM | 贊成 | YES |
| 梁劉柔芬 | Mrs Sophie LEUNG | 贊成 | YES | 馬力 | MA Lik | | |
| 梁耀忠 | LEUNG Yiu-chung | 反對 | NO | 梁君彥 | Andrew LEUNG | 贊成 | YES |
| 單仲偕 | SIN Chung-kai | | | 梁家傑 | Alan LEONG | 反對 | NO |
| 黃宜弘 | Dr Philip WONG | 贊成 | YES | 梁國雄 | LEUNG Kwok-hung | 反對 | NO |
| 黃容根 | WONG Yung-kan | 贊成 | YES | 郭家麒 | Dr KWOK Ka-ki | 反對 | NO |
| 曾鈺成 | TSANG Yok-sing | 贊成 | YES | 張超雄 | Dr Fernando CHEUNG | 反對 | NO |
| 楊孝華 | Howard YOUNG | 贊成 | YES | 張學明 | CHEUNG Hok-ming | 贊成 | YES |
| 楊森 | Dr YEUNG Sum | 反對 | NO | 黃定光 | WONG Ting-kwong | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉千石 | LAU Chin-shek | | | 湯家驊 | Ronny TONG | 反對 | NO |
| 劉江華 | LAU Kong-wah | 贊成 | YES | 詹培忠 | CHIM Pui-chung | 棄權 | ABSTAIN |
| 劉皇發 | LAU Wong-fat | 贊成 | YES | 劉秀成 | Prof Patrick LAU | 贊成 | YES |
| 劉健儀 | Miriam LAU | 贊成 | YES | 鄭經翰 | Albert CHENG | | |
| 劉慧卿 | Emily LAU | 反對 | NO | 鄭志堅 | KWONG Chi-kin | 贊成 | YES |
| 蔡素玉 | CHOY So-yuk | 贊成 | YES | 譚香文 | TAM Heung-man | 反對 | NO |