

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 33

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 20 June 2007 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Public officers attending:

Dr the Hon Sarah LIAO Sau-tung, JP
Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Legal Aid (Assessment of Resources and Contributions) (Amendment) Regulation 2007 (gazetted on 15.6.2007)	114/2007
2. Environmental Impact Assessment (Exemption of Shenzhen Section of the Shenzhen Bay Bridge) Order (gazetted on 15.6.2007)	115/2007
3. Declaration of Increase in Pensions Notice 2007 (gazetted on 15.6.2007)	116/2007
4. Widows and Orphans Pension (Increase) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 15.6.2007)	117/2007
5. Import and Export (General) Regulations (Amendment of Seventh Schedule) (Liberia) Notice 2007 (gazetted on 15.6.2007)	118/2007
6. Legal Aid Ordinance - Resolution of the Legislative Council (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 15.6.2007)	119/2007

Other Paper

No.96 - Construction Industry Training Authority Annual Report 2006 (published on 14.6.2007)

Questions

1. Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

2. Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional Affairs replied.

3. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

4. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

5. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food replied.

6. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolutions under the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance

As Hon James TO, who was to move the first motion, was not in the Chamber, the President called upon Hon Margaret NG to speak and move the second motion first.

1. Fugitive Offenders (Corruption) Order

Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Fugitive Offenders (Corruption) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 100 of 2007 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 30 May 2007, the period for repealing an order referred to in section 3(3) of the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance (Cap. 503) be extended under section 3(5) of that Ordinance to the first sitting (within the meaning of section 3(16) thereof) of the next session of the Legislative Council.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

2. Fugitive Offenders (Malaysia) (Amendment) Order 2007 and the Fugitive Offenders (Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism) Order

Hon James TO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the –

- (a) Fugitive Offenders (Malaysia) (Amendment) Order 2007, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 82 of 2007; and
- (b) Fugitive Offenders (Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 83 of 2007,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 23 May 2007, the period for repealing an order referred to in section 3(3) of the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance (Cap. 503) be extended under section 3(5) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 11 July 2007.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Policy on nursing manpower

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, despite the increasing demand for health care services in Hong Kong in recent years, the Government has failed to work out a long-term plan for nursing human resources, resulting in a significant shortage of nurses over the years, and the lack of promotion prospects in public hospitals has led to low morale and persistent wastage of nurses; moreover, the Hospital Authority has recently projected that the number

of nurses would still fall short of the demand in the coming years; in view of the above factors, this Council is worried that the quality of nursing services in public hospitals will decline and therefore urges the Government to expeditiously implement the following measures to maintain the quality of nursing services in Hong Kong:

- (a) devising a comprehensive and long-term plan for human resources for general and psychiatric nursing services;
- (b) formulating an appropriate manpower ratio between nurses and clients of nursing care;
- (c) allocating more resources to the training of nurses and increasing the places for degree programmes on nursing;
- (d) improving the pay and promotion prospects of nurses in public hospitals to curb the wastage of nurses; and
- (e) facing up to the problem of "de-nursing" and ensuring that nursing services are provided by nurses to clients of nursing care.

While Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:01 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion and addressed the Council:

To add "because of the continuous ageing of the population" after "increasing demand for health care services in Hong Kong in recent years"; to add "and it is even more difficult for the social welfare sector to recruit nursing staff due to the implementation of the Lump Sum Grant (LSG) subvention system, thus seriously affecting the quality of elderly and rehabilitation services;" after "the number of nurses would still fall short of the demand in the coming years;"; to add "and in the social welfare sector" after "this Council is worried that the quality of nursing services in public hospitals"; to add "nursing" after "devising a comprehensive and long-term plan for"; to delete "nursing services;" after "human resources for general and psychiatric" and substitute with "services as well as for the social welfare sector, including a comprehensive survey on the manpower demand for nurses; (b) immediately conducting a comprehensive review of the LSG subvention system implemented in the social welfare

sector, and ensuring that sufficient nursing staff can be recruited in the market by organizations providing elderly and rehabilitation services with a view to enhancing service quality;"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to add "for public hospitals as well as for elderly and rehabilitation services" after "manpower ratio between nurses and clients of nursing care"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(e)"; to add "and in the social welfare sector" after "promotion prospects of nurses in public hospitals"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(f)"; and to add ", in particular the common practice of assigning health workers to undertake certain nursing duties in the social welfare sector," after "facing up to the problem of 'de-nursing' " .

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion proposed.

Six Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long spoke on the amendment.

At 2:04 pm, while Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Health, Welfare and Food spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion put and agreed to.

Question on Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's motion as amended by Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG put.

Hon Martin LEE claimed a division. Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 15 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion as amended and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion as amended. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended was carried.

Demonstrating the people's power on 1 July

Hon James TO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council appeals to all the people of Hong Kong to demonstrate the people's power once again on 1 July this year to fight for the building of a society of democracy, prosperity and social justice for Hong Kong.

Question on Hon James TO's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Martin LEE would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Martin LEE moved the following amendment to Hon James TO's motion and addressed the Council:

To add ", as the remarks made by Mr WU Bangguo, Chairman of the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress, at the Seminar in Commemoration of the 10th Anniversary of the Implementation of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region that 'the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region has as much power as that granted by the Central Authorities' have aroused a high level of concern among the people of Hong Kong," after "That"; and to add ", with a view to defending 'one country, two systems', 'Hong Kong people ruling Hong Kong' and 'a high degree of autonomy'" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Martin LEE's amendment to Hon James TO's motion proposed.

17 Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Question on Hon Martin LEE's amendment to Hon James TO's motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO replied.

Question on Hon James TO's motion put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, 10 against it and nine abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 14 were in favour of the motion, eight against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 27 June 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 5:31 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 20/06/2007
時間 TIME: 02:34:28 下午

動議 MOTION: 由李國麟議員動議，經張超雄議員修正的「護理人手政策」議案
MOTION MOVED BY DR HON JOSEPH LEE ON "POLICY ON NURSING MANPOWER" AS AMENDED BY DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG

動議人 MOVED BY: 李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	15	20	
投票 Vote	15	19	
贊成 Yes	13	19	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU		楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 20/06/2007
 時間 TIME: 05:23:40 下午

動議 MOTION: 李柱銘議員對涂謹申議員的「七一展示人民力量」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON MARTIN LEE TO HON JAMES TO'S MOTION ON
 "DEMONSTRATING THE PEOPLE'S POWER ON 1 JULY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李柱銘 Martin LEE

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	24	
投票 Vote	26	23	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	18	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 20/06/2007
 時間 TIME: 05:31:45 下午

動議 MOTION: 「七一展示人民力量」議案
 MOTION ON "DEMONSTRATING THE PEOPLE'S POWER ON 1 JULY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	24	
投票 Vote	26	23	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	10	8	
棄權 Abstain	9	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	