

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 35

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 4 July 2007 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon Ceajer CHAN Ka-keung, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-Wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

## Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Waste Disposal (Charges for Disposal of Chemical Waste) (Amendment) Regulation 2007 (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	133/2007
2. Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Replacement of Schedule 6) Order 2007 (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	134/2007
3. Designation of Museum (Fireboat Alexander Grantham Exhibition Gallery) Order (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	135/2007
4. Official Languages (Alternation of Text under Section 4D) (Miscellaneous) Order 2007 (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	136/2007
5. Closed Area (Hong Kong Section of the Shenzhen Bay Bridge and Deep Bay Link Portion) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	137/2007
6. Shenzhen Bay Port Hong Kong Port Area Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	138/2007
7. International Organizations (Privileges and Immunities) (United Nations and Associated Personnel) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	139/2007
8. Fugitive Offenders (Safety of United Nations and Associated Personnel) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 29.6.2007)	140/2007

## Other Papers

- No. 99 - Independent Commission Against Corruption Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Annual Report 2006 (published on 4.7.2007)
- No. 100 - Independent Commission Against Corruption Complaints Committee Annual Report 2006 (published on 4.7.2007)
- No. 101 - Sir Robert Black Trust Fund Annual Report for the year from 1 April 2006 to 31 March 2007 (published on 29.6.2007)

No. 102 - The Nineteenth Annual Report of The Ombudsman, Hong Kong (June 2007) (published on 4.7.2007)

Report of the Panel on Home Affairs 2006-2007 (published on 3.7.2007)

Report of the Panel on Financial Affairs 2006-2007 (published on 3.7.2007)

Report of the Panel on Welfare Services 2006-2007 (published on 3.7.2007)

Report of the Panel on Health Services 2006-2007 (published on 3.7.2007)

Report of the Panel on Environmental Affairs 2006-2007 (published on 28.6.2007)

### **Addresses**

Hon CHAN Kam-lam addressed the Council on the Independent Commission Against Corruption Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Annual Report 2006

Hon Tommy CHEUNG addressed the Council on the Independent Commission Against Corruption Complaints Committee Annual Report 2006.

Hon CHOY So-yuk, Chairman of the Panel on Home Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2006-2007.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Chairman of the Panel on Financial Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2006-2007.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han, Chairman of the Panel on Welfare Services, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2006-2007.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, Chairman of the Panel on Health Services, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2006-2007.

Hon Audrey EU, Chairman of the Panel on Environmental Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2006-2007.

### **Questions**

1. Dr Hon Philip WONG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

2. Dr Hon David LI asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon Bernard CHAN asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

4. Hon Margaret NG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

5. Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

6. Hon CHAN Yuen-han asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## Bills

### **Supplementary Appropriation (2006-2007) Bill**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 13 June 2007 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

#### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Supplementary Appropriation (2006-2007) Bill**.

Question that clauses 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the Schedule stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

#### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Supplementary Appropriation (2006-2007) Bill**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

## Members' Bills

**The Chinese University of Hong Kong (Declaration of Morningside College and S. H. Ho College as Constituent Colleges) Bill**



**Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 13 June 2007 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a Committee of the whole Council.

**Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered **The Chinese University of Hong Kong (Declaration of Morningside College and S. H. Ho College as Constituent Colleges) Bill**.

Question that clauses 1 to 5 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Three Members and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke on the motion.

Question that clauses 1 to 5 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that Schedules 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

**Third Reading**

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong reported that

**The Chinese University of Hong Kong (Declaration of Morningside College and S. H. Ho College as Constituent Colleges) Bill**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Strengthening the regulation of unscrupulous business practices in pay television, telecommunications and internet services

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the complaints about unscrupulous business practices in pay television, telecommunications and internet services have been on the rise in recent years, this Council urges the Government to review the existing mechanism, strengthen the regulation of the business practices of providers of such services, examine the extension of section 7M of the Telecommunications Ordinance, which regulates misleading or deceptive conduct of telecommunications operators, to cover pay television, and introduce a cooling-off period and standard terms in the contracts, so as to safeguard the rights and interests of consumers.

While Dr Hon YEUNG Sum was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 2:21 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon TSANG Yok-sing, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their amendments.

At 2:44 pm, while Hon TSANG Yok-sing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

17 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion:

To add "there are many loopholes in the operation and sales practices of telecommunications service providers," after "That, as"; to add "and such complaints from the public are often not followed up effectively by government departments," after "in recent years,"; to add "stipulate corresponding penalties" after "to cover pay television,"; and to add "; furthermore, as the Hong Kong Housing Authority has signed agreements with pay television operators, these operators can enter the buildings to set up and maintain communal aerial systems and can deploy front-line promoters to approach the residents to sell other various commercial services, using the provision of exclusive maintenance and supply services as a selling point and adopting unscrupulous means to entice or mislead the residents into signing an agreement with them, causing great disturbance to the residents; in this connection, the Government must adopt measures to combat such sales malpractices, take the initiative to inform public rental housing tenants of the rights and responsibilities of the operators and, when the operators resort to malpractices or malpractices are reported by residents, take immediate action to investigate the matter and issue warning to and penalize the operators concerned; the Government must also review the problem of inequity in accessing system information by consumers and the telecommunications service providers, whereby consumers have no means or right to obtain true and accurate information about the systems that they are using and can only pay the fees according to the volume, system and time slots of their calls shown on the records provided unilaterally by the service providers, and in case of queries about such information, the decision of the service providers prevails and there is no channel for the consumers to dispute or verify; to this end, the Government should expeditiously study how to ensure that consumers have the rights to know, choose, verify, appeal and claim for compensation in the provision of telecommunications services (including pay television, local and cross-boundary telecommunications and internet services)" after "in the contracts".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 12 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing moved the following amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion:

To add ", a procedure for contract verification" after "a cooling-off period".

Question on Hon TSANG Yok-sing's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum replied.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon TSANG Yok-sing put and agreed to.

**Developing environmental industries to create job opportunities**

Hon KWONG Chi-kin moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the increasing amount of waste in Hong Kong has exerted heavy pressure on landfills and the over-exploitation of global resources has led to tight supply of certain resources, such objective conditions have created opportunities for the development of environmental industries; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to formulate a comprehensive policy on environmental industries, which includes:

- (a) expeditiously implementing the Producer Responsibility Scheme to develop the work processes and economic activities relating to the recovery, disassembling, and recycling and reuse of resources;
- (b) strengthening publicity and education to enhance public awareness of waste separation, so as to increase the types and amount of recovered waste;
- (c) comprehensively implementing separation and recovery of wet and dry waste so as to pave the way for the recycling and reuse of commercial and domestic food waste; for example, the Government procures fertilizers converted from locally recovered food waste for use on plants grown in gardens and on roadsides;
- (d) retaining and setting up recovery stations and complementary facilities for wet and dry waste in various districts to facilitate the waste collectors' midway collection, sorting and transportation of waste;

- (e) formulating the Government's green procurement policy and requiring all departments and contractors to comply with it, so as to provide a steady outlet for green products and services; and implementing a green certification system for such products and services to facilitate the Government, private organizations and the public to identify those green products and services that meet the certification requirements when making procurement;
- (f) subsidizing the research and development of environmental industries, upgrading the technology, as well as improving the production environment of such industries, and building up a professional image for the industries, so as to attract more people to take up the related work; and
- (g) assisting social enterprises to participate in those environmental industries with prospects,

thereby promoting the economic development of environmental industries and creating related job opportunities.

While Hon KWONG Chi-kin was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 5:15 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHOY So-yuk, Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon Audrey EU, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their amendments.

Six other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 6:30 pm, the President resumed the chair.

Seven more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon KWONG Chi-kin spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following amendment to Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion:

To add "the economic activities of Hong Kong are getting busier by the day and its population keeps growing, and" after "That, as"; to add "generated" after "amount of waste"; to add "and trades" after "development of environmental industries"; to add "and trades" after "comprehensive policy on environmental industries"; to add "and principles such as 'polluter-pays' to reduce waste generation and increase incentive to recover waste and, at the same time, studying the feasibility of restricting the disposal of toxic waste in landfills, so as" after "Producer Responsibility Scheme"; to add "the Source Separation of Domestic Waste Programme as well as" after "comprehensively implementing"; to add "as well as separation" after "recovery stations"; to delete "and" after "green procurement policy" and substitute with ","; to add "and strongly urging public and private organizations to develop green procurement guidelines" after "to comply with it"; to add "and labelling" after "green certification"; to add "as well as establishing a database" after "products and services"; to add "expediting the tendering exercise for the remaining lots in Phase I of the EcoPark and expeditiously drawing up a timetable for the granting of lots in Phase II in order to develop high value-added environmental industries;" after "(f)"; to delete "and" after "related work;" and substitute with "(g) reviewing the existing legislation regulating environmental industries and trades and actively studying the feasibility of implementing a licensing regime for certain environmental industries and trades, in order to enable a healthy development of such enterprises and, at the same time, avoid causing unnecessary damage to the natural environment and nuisances to the residents in the vicinity; and"; to delete the original "(g)" and substitute with "(h)"; to add "and trades" after "participate in those environmental industries"; and to add "and trades" after "promoting the economic development of environmental industries".

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion proposed and put.

Hon Howard YEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment and three abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung moved the following amendment to Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion:

To add "in recent years" after "Hong Kong"; to add "(e) expediting the vetting and approval work of the tendering of the EcoPark to facilitate the development of recycling industries and expeditiously taking forward Phase II of the EcoPark development plan; (f) establishing a high-level inter-departmental industries facilitation council to formulate more effective strategies to support environmental recovery industries;" after "transportation of waste;"; to delete "(e) formulating the Government's" before "green procurement policy" and substitute with "(g) implementing a"; to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(h)"; to delete the original "(g)" and substitute with "(i)"; to delete "social" after "assisting" and substitute with "small and medium"; and to add ", and allowing social enterprises to join in, on the premise that they do not compete with the private sector for profits" after "those environmental industries with prospects".

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment to Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

As Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; and (j) establishing a licensing regime for waste collectors in order to upgrade the quality of the recovery trade" after "private sector for profits".

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment to Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung proposed and put.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon KWONG Chi-kin replied.

Question on Hon KWONG Chi-kin's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung put.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, 17 were in favour of the motion as amended and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 14 were in favour of the motion as amended, two against it and four abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended was carried.

### Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 5 July 2007 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 8:03 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong



投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 04/07/2007  
 時間 TIME: 05:07:24 下午

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對楊森議員的「加強監管收費電視、電訊及互聯網服務的不當營商行為」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO DR HON YEUNG SUM'S MOTION ON "STRENGTHENING THE REGULATION OF UNSCRUPULOUS BUSINESS PRACTICES IN PAY TELEVISION, TELECOMMUNICATIONS AND INTERNET SERVICES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	11	15	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	12	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 04/07/2007  
 時間 TIME: 07:44:22 下午

動議 MOTION: 蔡素玉議員對鄭志堅議員的「開拓環保工業、創造就業機會」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHOY SO-YUK TO HON KWONG CHI-KIN'S MOTION ON  
 "DEVELOPING ENVIRONMENTAL INDUSTRIES TO CREATE JOB OPPORTUNITIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	22	
投票 Vote	22	21	
贊成 Yes	11	18	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	11	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 04/07/2007  
 時間 TIME: 07:48:55 下午

動議 MOTION: 林健鋒議員對鄭志堅議員的「開拓環保工業、創造就業機會」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON JEFFREY LAM TO HON KWONG CHI-KIN'S MOTION ON  
 "DEVELOPING ENVIRONMENTAL INDUSTRIES TO CREATE JOB OPPORTUNITIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	23	
投票 Vote	22	22	
贊成 Yes	18	12	
反對 No	1	5	
棄權 Abstain	3	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 04/07/2007  
時間 TIME: 07:54:00 下午

動議 MOTION: 余若薇議員對鄭志堅議員就「開拓環保工業、創造就業機會」所提，經林健鋒議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON AUDREY EU TO HON KWONG CHI-KIN'S MOTION ON "DEVELOPING ENVIRONMENTAL INDUSTRIES TO CREATE JOB OPPORTUNITIES" AS AMENDED BY HON JEFFREY LAM

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇 Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	23	
投票 Vote	21	22	
贊成 Yes	9	16	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	12	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tomny CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 04/07/2007  
 時間 TIME: 08:02:44 下午

動議 MOTION: 由鄭志堅議員動議，經蔡素玉議員／及／林健鋒議員／及／余若薇議員修正的「開拓環保工業、創造就業機會」議案  
 MOTION MOVED BY HON KWONG CHI-KIN ON "DEVELOPING ENVIRONMENTAL INDUSTRIES TO CREATE JOB OPPORTUNITIES" AS AMENDED BY HON CHOY SO-YUK /AND/ HON JEFFREY LAM /AND/ HON AUDREY EU

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	21	
投票 Vote	19	20	
贊成 Yes	17	14	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	2	4	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳傳業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馬力 MA Lik	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		CHEUNG Hok-ming	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	張學明 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK