

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. PWSC 18/06-07

(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/2/2

**Public Works Subcommittee of the Finance Committee  
of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting  
held in the Conference Room A of Legislative Council Building  
on Wednesday, 22 November 2006, at 8:30 am**

**Members present:**

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP (Chairman)  
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP  
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP  
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

**Members absent:**

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP  
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
Hon CHOY So-yuk  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP  
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
Hon TAM Heung-man

**Public officers attending:**

Mr Joe C C WONG	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) <sup>3</sup>
Mr MAK Chai-kwong, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Works)
Mrs Rita LAU, JP	Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Planning and Lands)
Ms Anissa WONG, JP	Permanent Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Environment)
Mr Davey CHUNG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) (Works)
Mr F K LAI, JP	Director of Drainage Services (Acting)
Mr K W MAK	Chief Engineer (Consultants Management), Drainage Services Department
Dr M J BROOM	Assistant Director (Water Policy), Environmental Protection Department
Mr W C IP	Chief Engineer (Project Management), Drainage Services Department
Mr CHAN Chi-chiu, JP	Director of Water Supplies
Mr NG Chi-ho	Assistant Director (New Works) (Acting), Water Supplies Department
Mr Robin IP, JP	Deputy Secretary for Housing, Planning and Land (Planning and Lands) <sup>1</sup>
Ms Maisie CHENG	Deputy Commissioner for Tourism, Tourism Commission, Economic Development and Labour Bureau
Mr John CHAI, JP	Director of Civil Engineering and Development
Mr Enoch LAM	Deputy Project Manager (Kowloon), Civil Engineering and Development Department
Ms Ophelia WONG	Deputy Director of Planning (District), Planning Department
Mr CHOI Lap-yiu	Deputy Government Property Administrator, Government Property Agency
Mr Chris GABRIEL	Assistant Director (Development and Procurement), Housing Department
Mr LAM Hon	Chief Engineer/Traffic Engineering (Kowloon), Transport Department
Mr C H YUE, JP	Director of Architectural Services

**Clerk in attendance:**

Ms Rosalind MA	Senior Council Secretary (1) <sup>8</sup>
----------------	---

**Staff in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG	Assistant Secretary General 1
Mr Anthony CHU	Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Alice CHEUNG	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1
Mr Frankie WOO	Legislative Assistant (1)2

---

Action

**HEAD 704 – DRAINAGE**

**PWSC(2006-07)42      52DS      Ting Kau sewerage stage 2**

The Chairman advised members that the Panel on Environmental Affairs was consulted on this project and the following item under PWSC(2006-07)43 at its meeting on 22 May 2006. The Panel had no objection to the proposals in principle but considered it necessary for the Administration to expedite the implementation of sewerage projects in general to improve the environment. In this connection, members requested the Administration to provide information on the implementation schedule of the projects and the impact of the Sham Tseng Sewage Treatment Works (STSTW) on the nearby water quality.

2. Noting from the Administration's proposal that the scope of works under the project comprised the construction of 1.6 kilometers (km) of sewers in Ting Kau Village, Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming enquired whether the proposed sewers would collect and convey sewage from all the village houses in the village (about 40 in number).

3. The Chief Engineer (Consultants Management), Drainage Services Department, (CE/CM, DSD) advised that in addition to some 40 village houses in the Ting Kau Village, the proposed sewers were planned for connection to about 60 village houses to the east of Ting Kau Village as well. However, given the topographical and spatial constraints of the project sites, the Administration had only confirmed the technical feasibility for connecting 80% of the houses (i.e. about 80 houses) and was still exploring means for the remaining 20%. CE/CM, DSD assured members that the Administration would make every effort to overcome the technical difficulties in this regard with a view to providing public sewerage to as many village houses in the village areas of Ting Kau as possible. Responding to Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's further enquiry, CE/CM, DSD confirmed that the costs for providing public sewerage to the remaining 20% of village houses (if the technical feasibility was confirmed) could be covered under the current project estimate.

4. In response to Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming's enquiry on the purpose of providing for contingencies under the project estimate, CE/CM, DSD advised that as a normal practice, contingencies amounting to about 10% of the total project cost estimates would be included in capital works projects to cater for additional expenses arising from unforeseeable circumstances. As for the current project

proposal, contingencies might be required to cover costs such as those for providing public sewerage to more village houses or re-aligning sewers to avoid underground utilities. The amount of \$5.6 million for contingencies was about 10% of the total project estimate.

5. Prof Patrick LAU raised concern about the large proportion of consultants' fees for resident site staff (with an estimate of \$6.9 million) as compared with the fees for the construction stage (with an estimate of 0.7 million). In response, the Director of Drainage Services (Acting) (DDS (Atg)) said that as the current proposal covered a number of village areas stretching from Ting Kau to Sham Tseng, more resident site staff would be required for work supervision at a number of works fronts, with works commencing concurrently. CE/CM, DSD added that about 10 resident site staff would be required for day-to-day site inspections for the project whereas the consultants' fee for the construction stage would cover costs for slight modifications to project design.

6. Noting that the estimated project duration would span over three summers from February 2007 to December 2009, Mrs Selina CHOW expressed concern about the impact of the works on the Ting Kau Beach and the possible inconvenience caused to the swimmers. She urged the Administration to reduce the project duration as far as possible to minimize impact on the public.

7. The Assistant Director (Water Policy), Environmental Protection Department advised that the Ting Kau Beach had been closed for some time due to water quality problem caused by pollution. Nevertheless, he pointed out that the proposed sewerage works would not affect public access to the Ting Kau Beach and swimmers who wished to use the beach would still be able to do so during the works period. He further remarked that upon completion of the works and subsequent connection of the village houses to the public sewers, the pollution problem caused by sewage discharged from unsewered village areas in Ting Kau would be alleviated, hence improving water quality and facilitating the re-opening of the beach.

8. Mrs Selina CHOW expressed concern about the traffic impact of the proposed works and enquired whether major roads in the area would be affected. In response, DDS (Atg) said that majority of the construction works under the project would be undertaken along local roads and village footpaths instead of major roads. The project would be carried out by phases and appropriate mitigation measures would be put in place for vehicular and pedestrian traffic control to minimize any disruption to local traffic. Provisions would also be incorporated into the works contracts for staggering construction works at different sites to minimize the traffic impact.

9. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**PWSC(2006-07)43      126DS      Sham Tseng sewerage stage 3**

10. In response to Mr LI Kwok-ying's enquiry, DDS (Atg) confirmed that the proposed sewerage would collect and convey sewage from the unsewered areas of Sham Tseng and Tsing Lung Tau to STSTW for proper treatment and disposal through the submarine outfall.

11. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**PWSC(2006-07)45      112CD      Drainage improvement in Northern New Territories – package A**

12. The Chairman advised members that this was a re-submitted item. The item had previously been considered by the Public Works Subcommittee (PWSC) but withdrawn by the Administration at the last meeting on 25 October 2006.

13. Mr LI Kwok-ying recapped that at the last PWSC meeting on 25 October 2006, he had conveyed the concerns of the village representatives of Tai Hang that their objections to the project had not been properly addressed by the Administration. Mr LI noted that DSD officials had subsequently arranged meetings with the village representatives of Tai Hang and had undertaken to make suitable modifications to the project plan to address their concerns. The village representatives of Tai Hang had accepted the proposed works with the modifications put forth by DSD.

14. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**HEAD 709 – WATERWORKS**

**PWSC(2006-07)44      238WF      Mainlaying between Sham Tseng and So Kwun Tan**

15. The Chairman advised members that an information paper on the project had been circulated to the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works (PLW Panel) on 16 October 2006.

16. The item was voted on and endorsed.

**HEAD 707 – NEW TOWNS AND URBAN AREA DEVELOPMENT**

**PWSC(2006-07)46    719CL    Kai Tak development – engineering review**  
**711CL    Kai Tak development – advance**  
**infrastructure works for developments at**  
**the southern part of the former runway**

17.    The Chairman advised members that the PLW Panel was consulted on the project at its meeting on 24 October 2006.

18.    Prof Patrick LAU, Deputy Chairman of the PLW Panel, said that Panel members expressed concern on whether the underwater town gas pipe off the former runway would be affected by dredging required for the construction of the third berth and were advised by the Administration that the need and timing for constructing the third berth had yet to be confirmed and would therefore not be included in the present works projects. On members' enquiry about the need to widen or enhance the existing vehicle bridge over Kai Tak Approach Channel (KTAC), the Administration pointed out that the structure and width of the existing vehicle bridge could cope with future traffic but some enhancement works might be required to make room for public utilities. As to members' dissatisfaction about the absence of a breakdown of the estimates of the two projects in the Administration's paper, the Administration undertook to provide a detailed breakdown of the estimated costs for the two projects in its submission to PWSC. The Panel expressed support for the Administration to submit the proposals to PWSC for consideration.

19.    Mrs Selina CHOW expressed full support for the projects and urged the Administration to expedite the projects to facilitate early implementation of the new cruise terminal development.

20.    Noting the completion of the Stage 3 public participation on the Preliminary Outline Development Plan of the Kai Tak development (KTD) and the current project proposals covered only preparatory works for KTD, Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that she had no objection to the projects. Miss CHAN however expressed concern about the impact of the proposed works under KTD, including environmental impacts arising from works associated with the proposed reclamation in KTAC and the dredging works for the cruise terminal, as well as traffic implications of KTD on areas in the South East Kowloon.

21.    In reply, the Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Planning and Lands) (PS(PL)) said that the scope of the projects comprised a study to confirm the detailed engineering feasibility for KTD (the Feasibility Study) covering relevant aspects including transport and traffic, drainage and sewerage, environmental impacts etc. The findings of the Feasibility Study would assist the Administration in devising necessary mitigation measures to alleviate any impacts on the environment and the local community. The Director of Civil Engineering and Development (DCED) added that the Administration had not made a final decision on the proposed reclamation of KTAC. DCED assured

members that the Administration would take forward the improvement works to the Kai Tak Nullah and KTAC having regard to the findings of the Feasibility Study as well as public concerns about the environmental impact, with a view to making a fair, justified and lawful decision. As to the traffic implications of KTD on areas in the South East Kowloon, DCED said that the Feasibility Study would cover the transport and traffic aspects of KTD for the Administration to devise feasible options to address concerns about transport and traffic needs arising from the development.

22. Miss CHAN Yuen-han also expressed concern about the environmental impact on the marine habitat of surrounding waters caused by the dredging works for the cruise terminal and the possible impact on the fishing community operating in the Kowloon Bay area. PS(PL) assured members that in taking forward KTD, the Administration would be mindful of the need to ensure minimum disruption to the operation of relevant industries in the area and necessary mitigation measures would be put in place in this regard.

23. The item was voted on and endorsed.

### **HEAD 703 – BUILDINGS**

#### **PWSC(2006-07)47      307EP      An 18-classroom primary school at Tai Pak Tin Street, Kwai Chung**

24. The Chairman advised members that an information paper on the project had been circulated to the Panel on Education on 9 November 2006.

25. Mrs Selina CHOW said that residents of Kwai Chung were supportive of the proposed project to construct a new school premises for the whole-day conversion of an existing bi-sessional primary school. However, she relayed the concerns of some parents on the description of the school design as "non-standard" which might give an impression that the school design was somewhat sub-standard. To allay parents' concern about the standard of the new school premises, Mrs CHOW called on the Administration to consider adopting another description for school designs other than the standard one. The Director of Architectural Services appreciated Mrs CHOW's concern and advised that unique and new school designs other than the standard one had been adopted for new schools in recent years. He undertook to convey Mrs CHOW's concern to the relevant policy bureau for consideration.

26. The item was voted on and endorsed.

27. The meeting ended at 9:03 am.