

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1085/06-07

Ref: CB1/HS/2/04

**Paper for the House Committee meeting
on 9 March 2007**

**Progress report of
the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

Purpose

This paper reports on the progress of the work of the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development (the Subcommittee) and on the Subcommittee's plan to issue a position statement setting out its views on the Government's current approach in taking forward the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project.

Background

2. The Subcommittee was set up by the House Committee on 21 January 2005 to study and follow up issues relating to the development of WKCD. The Subcommittee submitted two reports to the House Committee on its Phase I and Phase II study on 6 July 2005 and 6 January 2006 respectively. On 8 February 2006, the Council endorsed the two reports of the Subcommittee upon a relevant motion moved by Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, Chairman of the Subcommittee.

3. At the Subcommittee meeting on 21 February 2006, the Chief Secretary for Administration announced that the Government would not further pursue the WKCD under the Invitation for Proposals (IFP) process as none of the shortlisted proponents made any firm and clear commitment that they would continue to pursue the WKCD under the modified IFP framework announced by the Administration on 7 October 2005.

Developments since the termination of the IFP process

4. In April 2006, the Administration established the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural

District (Consultative Committee) and its three advisory groups, namely the Performing Arts and Tourism Advisory Group, the Museums Advisory Group and the Financial Matters Advisory Group to take forward the WKCD project with a new approach. The foremost task of the Consultative Committee and its three Advisory Groups is to re-examine, with a view to re-confirming if appropriate, the need for Core Arts and Cultural Facilities as defined in the IFP and other arts and cultural facilities to be provided in the WKCD and the financial implications of developing and operating these facilities. At the meeting of the Subcommittee on 6 April 2006, the Subcommittee discussed with the Administration the new approach for taking forward the WKCD project, and noted that the Consultative Committee would deliberate on the recommendations of the three advisory groups and thereafter submit its recommendations to the Chief Executive on the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD and the possible financing approaches for developing and operating those facilities. The Subcommittee decided that it would continue to study and monitor the development of issues relating to the WKCD.

5. From June 2006 to January 2007, the Subcommittee held three open meetings to receive briefings by the Administration on the progress of its work and that of the Consultative Committee and its advisory groups and to meet with deputations to listen to their views on how the WKCD project should be taken forward and on the work done so far by the Government.

Position statement of the Subcommittee

6. Having regard to the developments and the views and concerns raised by deputations, the Subcommittee decided at the meeting on 6 January 2007 that the Subcommittee should undertake an overall review of the work done so far by the Administration since the termination of the IFP process in February 2006. For the purpose, the Subcommittee held two closed meetings on 29 January and 26 February 2007 for internal deliberation on the following aspects of the Government's current work on WKCD --

- (a) public involvement in the planning and implementation of the project;
- (b) adoption of an integrated and coordinated approach in the planning of West Kowloon Reclamation;
- (c) overall planning for the 40-hectare site for the WKCD project; and
- (d) establishment of an overseeing authority to steer the WKCD project.

7. As a result of the deliberations, the Subcommittee has agreed on a position statement setting out the views of the Subcommittee on the Government's current approach in taking forward the WKCD project. A copy of the position statement is attached in the **Appendix**.

Advice sought

8. Members are requested to note this progress report and the position statement attached.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
8 March 2007

**Position statement of the
Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development
on the Government's approach in taking forward
the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

The Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development (the Subcommittee) presents this position statement to the Administration to set out its views on the Government's current approach in taking forward the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project. The Subcommittee hopes that the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities of the West Kowloon Cultural District (the Consultative Committee) would take into account the Subcommittee's views before it concludes its findings.

2. The Subcommittee was formed under the House Committee of the Legislative Council on 21 January 2005. Since then, it has published two reports on the WKCD project. Following the Chief Secretary for Administration (CS)'s announcement on 21 February 2006 that the Administration had decided not to pursue WKCD under the Invitation for Proposal (IFP) process and it would re-examine the original planning basis for the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities (CACF) as defined in the IFP, the Subcommittee has continued to monitor the work of the Consultative Committee, which was set up by the Government to advise on the justifications for the CACF and other types of arts and cultural facilities to be provided at the WKCD and the financial implications for developing and operating the facilities.

The Government's new direction for WKCD

3. The Subcommittee welcomes the Government's decision to terminate the IFP process and the establishment of the Consultative Committee with a view to taking forward the WKCD in full speed. The Subcommittee shares the Administration's objective of developing a world-class integrated arts, culture and entertainment district on the 40-hectare West Kowloon Reclamation (WKR) site. The Subcommittee also agrees that to meet the public's aspirations on WKCD, the project should be taken forward without further unnecessary delays. To ensure that the public's needs and preferences are adequately reflected and to foster a sense of ownership among the general public, the Subcommittee has stressed that the project must be planned and implemented using a people-oriented approach with adequate opportunities for public involvement.

Public involvement

4. The Subcommittee has emphasized in its reports that public involvement is of paramount importance so that the aspirations and needs of the people and stakeholders are well taken into account. It is necessary to establish some form of consultative machinery to formalize the consultation process, so that the views and suggestions of the public and stakeholders would be properly channelled to the decision-making authority.¹ The Subcommittee therefore, before and after two of the Advisory Groups of the Consultative Committees published their respective reports in September 2006 and November 2006, has conducted two rounds of consultation with the organizations and individuals which/who had previously submitted views to the Subcommittee.

5. The Subcommittee has noticed in particular that there are strong views among the deputations about the recommendation of the Museums Advisory Group (MAG) for establishing a Museum Plus (M+). The opposing views in fact come from the local museum professionals and some of the members of MAG. The Subcommittee considers that there is insufficient information for it to comment on the concept of M+ at this stage, but the Subcommittee is more concerned about the way the Administration involves the public in planning and implementing the WKCD project, as revealed in the working mechanism of the Consultative Committee and its Advisory Groups.

6. The Subcommittee is aware that the Administration has enlisted the participation of professionals and practitioners in re-examining the scope of arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD through their appointments to the Consultative Committee and its three Advisory Groups. The Performing Arts and Tourism Advisory Group (PATAG) and the MAG have conducted public forums and focus group meetings to gauge public views on matters under their purview, and their recommendation reports have included a summary of the views received. The Subcommittee however also notes that those consultation activities were conducted when the two Advisory Groups had yet to formulate their recommendations. There appears to be no further consultation on the recommendations. Even in the handling of divergent views, the Subcommittee notes that there is very little information on why MAG has rejected the minority views within MAG that there should be a separate broad grouping for ink art and a children's museum in M+. If at this juncture the Consultative Committee does not further examine the recommendations of these two Advisory Groups and address the opposing views, the Financial Matters Advisory Group (FMAG) and eventually the Consultative Committee in formulating their proposals may be working on premises that are not supported by the public and stakeholders. Besides, the FMAG has not carried out any public consultation at all. There is actually no avenue for the opposing views to be channelled to the Consultative Committee.

¹ The relevant recommendations of the Subcommittee are set out paragraphs 5.27 and 5.28 of its Report on Phase I Study and paragraph 6.31 of its Report on Phase II Study.

7. The Subcommittee wishes to reiterate its recommendation that there is a need to put in place as early as possible a standing mechanism to conduct public consultation in an open and structured manner. The Administration has the duty to reach out to the public to explain to them the vision and objectives of the WKCD project and to enlist their participation in the planning process through structured public engagement activities. The Subcommittee also considers that it would only be prudent for the Consultative Committee to further examine any minority views and provide an explanation to the public if any of these views is not accepted.

Adoption of an integrated and coordinated approach in the planning of West Kowloon Reclamation

8. During the two rounds of consultations conducted by the Subcommittee on the Administration's current approach in pursuing the WKCD project, there was strong support for the Subcommittee's views about the need to adopt an integrated and coordinated approach in planning the WKCD to ensure that the WKCD project could meet the long-term hardware and software needs of Hong Kong in the development of arts and culture.²

9. The Subcommittee is of the view that the Administration should first articulate on what the developments on WKR should help to achieve in the overall development of Hong Kong and how WKCD is strategically placed to catalyze the realization of a long-term arts and cultural vision for Hong Kong, and then formulate appropriate strategies and mechanisms to ensure efficacy of planning and to facilitate public involvement in the whole process.

10. The Subcommittee observes that since the termination of the IFP process, the Administration has expressed its "vision" for WKCD and its cultural policy in very broad terms only. There are no details on how the planning for WKR would be integrated with the overall planning objectives for the city in social, economic and environmental terms, and how the other spheres of cultural planning such as art education for the community, development of art talents and promotion of creative industries etc. would complement the WKCD project.

11. In addition to the lack of a clear vision and a substantiated cultural policy, the Subcommittee also observes that the Administration has not yet formulated any plans to put in place the necessary mechanisms for effective coordination among relevant policy bureaux and departments and for structured public involvement in the planning and implementation processes, as explained in paragraph 4 above. The Subcommittee considers that the problems can be partly attributed to the lack of a proper institutional setup to steer the WKCD

² The relevant recommendations of the Subcommittee are set out in paragraphs 6.20 and 6.21 of its Report on Phase II Study.

project. In this regard, the Subcommittee would like to reiterate its recommendation that the Administration should establish an overseeing authority as soon as possible to steer the way forward for WKCD. This body should have an active role to play in both the planning and implementation stages of WKCD, and not just in the management and maintenance of the hardware facilities after their construction. The Subcommittee recognizes that it will take time to prepare the enabling legislation for the setting up of a statutory body. To empower the overseeing authority to function as early as possible, the Administration should now establish a provisional authority with representative composition to take up from the Government the planning and implementation of the WKCD.

Lack of a masterplan for WKR

12. The Subcommittee considers that the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD should be planned having regard to the opportunities and constraints provided in the project area, and it would be conducive to effective planning if certain basic planning parameters for the WKR are established in the first place. According to their terms of reference, the Consultative Committee and its Advisory Groups do not have a duty to study and consult the public on the planning parameters for the WKR. The situation at present is that the Consultative Committee and its Advisory Groups are formulating their recommendations without any planning parameters. The Subcommittee is concerned that certain needs of the community which can only be reflected and safeguarded through planning may have been and would be overlooked in the studies of the Consultative Committee and its Advisory Groups.

13. The Subcommittee understands that before the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD are confirmed, it may not be possible to draw up a detailed masterplan for the WKR site. However, the Subcommittee considers that it would be very difficult for the public to visualize how the varying needs of different stakeholders can be met without a master plan for the WKR site. The public have expressed their aspiration that the 40-hectare site should be utilized to meet the long-term needs of Hong Kong and the planning should ensure sustainable development. It is therefore unreasonable to expect the public to give their support without an overall picture of the other aspects of the planning for the project area, in particular the provision of open space and amenities for public enjoyment and the amount and intensity of commercial and residential developments.

14. As such, the Subcommittee considers that the priority task for the Administration is to provide outline concept plans for WKR as planning options with different emphases in land use for public discussion. This task should preferably be done before the Consultative Committee takes a confirmed view on the recommendations of the Advisory Groups and at the latest before the

Administration takes a confirmed view on the recommendations of the Consultative Committee. The outline concept plans should set out the vision for the WKCD, the planning principles adopted, and the respective proposed development mix with estimations on the site coverage and plot ratios for various proposed land uses. The publication of three outline concept plans for the Stage 2 Public Participation of the Kai Tak Planning Review in November 2005 is a good example of using outline concept plans to solicit public views at an early planning stage for a large-scale development area. The Subcommittee believes that such outline concept plans would provide the community with a meaningful basis to formulate views on the planning for WKCD at an early stage.

Request for the Administration's detailed work plan

15. The Subcommittee recognizes that its work should not duplicate that of the Administration. So far, the Administration has provided the Subcommittee with very piecemeal information on how it would take forward the project. To facilitate the Subcommittee's monitoring of the Administration's work on WKCD, the Subcommittee finds it necessary to have a detailed work plan from the Administration with indicative timing for various aspects of the work on WKCD and with the following information --

- (a) before the Administration takes a confirmed view on the arts and cultural facilities to be provided in WKCD and the relevant financing arrangements, whether, at what junctures and in what ways the public would have the opportunities to give views on the arts and cultural facilities and the financing arrangements proposed by the Advisory Groups and/or those proposed by the Consultative Committee;
- (b) whether the Administration would consult the public on the planning parameters for WKR and provide outline concept plans for public discussion before consolidating its proposals on the arts and cultural facilities in WKR and their financial arrangements;
- (c) whether the Administration would study and consult the public on the integration of WKCD with the overall planning objectives for the city in social, economic and environmental terms, and with other spheres of cultural planning for the long-term development of art and culture in Hong Kong; and
- (d) at which stage the Administration would put up the proposal for the establishment of the statutory body for WKCD, and before then, whether and when a provisional overseeing authority would be established.

Views of interested groups and individuals received by the Subcommittee

16. The Subcommittee urges the Administration and the Consultative Committee to take heed of, in their studies and planning work, the views and concerns of various interested groups and individuals received by the Subcommittee. For easy reference by the Administration, those views are summarized in **Annexes I and II**.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
8 March 2007

Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development

Summary of views of various organizations and individuals on the way forward for the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project

(Views received from May 2006 to January 2007)

1. The planning for WKCD and the relationship of WKCD with other spheres of planning for the city	
<i>Hong Kong Alternatives</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The organization has been consistently advocating an integrated cultural green park for the West Kowloon site without any speculative development for the following reasons: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - high density living in Hong Kong; - lack of urban parkland/open green space; - environmental enhancement; - community/public health interest; and - tourism benefits. • A public opinion survey co-sponsored by the Hong Kong Alternatives and the University of Hong Kong in early January 2006 revealed that over 81% of the respondents preferred a green park with cultural facilities for WKCD while only 11% preferred cultural facilities with residential and commercial developments. • The world-class park should provide: open green areas, recreation and nature trails, water features, public spaces such as a speaker's forum, amphitheatres and venues for performances, park side cafes/restaurants, and other unique cultural arts features directed at both locals and tourists.
<i>Planet Time</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The organization has submitted a conceptual plan entitled "First Principles" that examines the fundamental planning principles that should guide the site's development. The conceptual plan has been drawn up on the premise that the site can and should represent a new vision for an urban oasis and new district that seamlessly integrates: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - open space with buildings; - cultural facilities with creative industries; - leisure and entertainment with education and employment; - the site itself with the vicinity districts and the harbour; and

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - a new district of the city with the long-term needs of the public.
<i>Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There should be diversity in WKCD, which should include recreational activities, business elements, arts and cultural activities and entertainment elements with focus on the young people. Different performing companies should be able to achieve art synergy at WKCD.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Flexibility should be allowed in the planning for WKCD, such as relaxing the plot ratio to allow more space for arts and cultural facilities. • The Government should give due consideration to the overall city planning and transport system of Hong Kong to provide necessary supporting facilities for WKCD.
<i>Hong Kong Society For Education In Art</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The development of WKCD should start from education; we should nurture or cultivate a group of administrators, producers and practitioners for this world class cultural centre. WKCD development also provides a good opportunity to promote public arts education and review the existing supporting facilities/ programmes for arts education.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Since the Handover, the Government has no specific idea on how to reform the economy by phased conversion from a labour-based economy to a creative economy. • The Government has never published a policy blueprint for developing "Cultural Industry". • There should be a Policy for Cultural Industry to review and study Hong Kong' economic competitiveness in cultural industry and overall economy. • Correlated Policy on professional development, land and property development, heritage and cultural tourism and regional art and cultural policies should be worked out. • An Economic and Urban Policy must be launched to nurture individual and collective sustainability and to ensure social cohesion, cross-sector cultural advancement on an equitable basis should be worked out. • The Government should clarify its objective of developing the West Kowloon Reclamation (WKR) into an integrated arts, cultural, entertainment and tourism district; whether it was the architectural design, the facilities or the programmes that are to be integrated, as this would have important implications on the development of WKCD. • A balance should be struck between integration and

	preserving unique characters of individual facilities and programmes.
<i>Designing Hong Kong Harbour Districts</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The agglomeration of performing venues had started in 1990's with the existing venues already clustered around the Victoria Harbour. The problem at present is how to improve the accessibility to these venues from the central districts. As such, Hong Kong does not need a separate cluster of arts and cultural facilities at WKR.
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Institute supports that environmental-friendly measures should be incorporated into the buildings in WKCD.
2. Co-ordination within the Government in planning for WKCD	
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Though the current advisory committees on arts and culture are team-players in formation of Hong Kong culture, they fail to take a macro-view in the formulation of a holistic and integrative public policy for the development of art and culture. There is no mechanism authorized to oversee i) the correlation of various advisory committees, ii) the interaction of the WKCD facilities and LCSD's facilities at Tsim Sha Tsui, and iii) the smooth transfer of cultural provisions from the Tsim Sha Tsui facilities to the WKCD facilities, when and where necessary, etc. A new statutory body, namely the Culture and Heritage Council, should be set up to oversee the mega-policy, the future WKCD statutory body, Hong Kong Arts Development Council, as well as other relevant statutory bodies could be better coordinated.
<i>Government Cultural Services Grades' Alliance</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regardless of the implementation approach the Government will adopt in future, there should be in place an integrated and co-ordinated development plan, a well-planned time-table to co-ordinate the completion of various facilities, and a management body responsible for the holistic development and management of the facilities in WKCD.
3. WKCD in achieving the long-term cultural vision for Hong Kong	
<i>The Hong Kong Academy For Performing Arts</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The first priority of WKCD should be to further arts and cultural engagement among Hong Kong people, both as arts consumers and arts practitioners of the future.
<i>Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The organization supports the vision of the Cultural and Heritage Committee (CHC) that "West Kowloon Cultural

	<p>District should aim to enliven the city’s cultural life and animate the people’s participation. It should reflect the ideals of equality and public participation in its physical, emotional and intellectual accessibility for both locals and visitors to the city. It should also embrace the richness of both the Chinese civilization and its historical past. It should be a place that grows with time, is able to meet the challenges, encourages exchange and cultural development in the long run, and places emphasis on values beyond the purely commercial and utilitarian".</p>
<p><i>Hong Kong Dance Company</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should formulate a clear, comprehensive and long-term cultural policy, covering the positioning of WKCD, the management mode, establishment of a trust fund, the monitoring system, and support for the sustainable development of local arts groups. • Arts and cultural facilities in WKCD should complement other related facilities in Hong Kong.
<p><i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WKCD development should be based on a comprehensive and forward-looking cultural policy and complement the blueprint for arts and cultural development. • WKCD should follow the principles proposed by CHC in its Policy Recommendation Report: people-oriented, community driven, partnership, development in software, integration of facilities within WKCD and complementarity with other cultural facilities. • The Government should make concrete planning on how the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD could complement other facilities in Hong Kong.
<p><i>Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Ltd.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WKCD has the potential not only to influence the future of Hong Kong’s cultural life, but to shape it forever. The plans that are laid now will determine the scope and vibrancy of Hong Kong’s cultural life for the next 30 years.
<p><i>Government Cultural Services Grades’ Alliance</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WKCD would pose keen competition to the existing cultural and recreational facilities. We hope that the operating agency of WKCD will complement the Government’s policy on Hong Kong’s cultural development in the long term. To avoid under-utilization of performance venues and wastage of public resources, the operating agency of WKCD and the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) should co-ordinate in setting the priority order for different categories of programmes to hire their respective venues.

<p><i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Association agrees very much with the cultural vision of CHC, only that it believes the co-existence of commercial interests and arts is one way for arts and culture to ensure long-term development, as well as to gain popularity and public support.
<p><i>Museum of Site, Ltd</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should review its art policy and the need for museums law.
<p><i>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should formulate a cultural masterplan, which should be thoroughly discussed by the general public.
<p>4. Cultural software development</p>	
<p><i>Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The organization considers that apart from world class cultural facilities, emphasis should also be placed on the development of software contents in WKCD. Indigenous arts is an important part of the cultural software. • The Government should accord priority to the development of local arts groups and arts talent, integrating arts and culture with the long-term development of Hong Kong.
<p><i>The Hong Kong Academy For Performing Arts</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arts education is important for the future success of WKCD in developing cultural software • The Academy proposes the inclusion at WKCD of a dual-role educational facility that would operate in daytime as a specialist performing arts secondary school and in the evenings and other non-school hours as a centre for community arts education. • The specialist performing arts high school will prepare gifted young performers in dance, drama and music for careers in the performing arts and develop creative talents in theatre technical arts as well. A total population of 450 students is envisaged.
<p><i>Hong Kong Society For Education In Art</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WKCD should include arts education facilities, such as a visual arts academy with faculties for fine art, design, arts education and arts administration, and an arts education centre open for use by schools for arts exhibitions and performance. • Consideration should also be given to making arts education a compulsory subject in the curriculum of senior secondary schools.
<p><i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WKCD development should provide sufficient facilities to train artists and management professionals for the arts and

	<p>cultural sector.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should have comprehensive planning for developing the software in line with the WKCD project.
<i>Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The necessary components for a true cultural hub would include an integrated Academy for Performing Arts, designed to provide all facilities for the training of young musicians, singers, dancers and actors for the next 30 years. • The organization recommends that the Government revise the basic brief for WKCD to reflect a profound study of the future needs of Hong Kong's major resident performing arts companies and that it place music at the heart of this new cultural hub.
<i>Government Cultural Services Grades' Alliance</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Consideration should be given to whether Hong Kong's management professionals are adequately equipped to cope with the development of the numerous new facilities. Long-term strategies should also be formulated for training up professionals responsible for managing world-class museums and performance venues and for the passage/succession of expertise.
5. Provision of arts and cultural facilities in WKCD	
<i>Hong Kong Chinese Orchestra</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WKCD should address the shortfalls in rehearsal places and provide "home facilities" to flagship performing groups to facilitate their medium-term and long-term development. • There should be a world-class concert hall. Consideration could be given to installing Chinese traditional serial bells musical instrument in the concert hall to show Hong Kong's special status as a place where East meets West.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Society welcomes the increase in the inventory of arts facilities through the WKCD development. • Provision for commercial theatre, cabaret, comedy jazz and small scale pop/rock venues would add to the diversity and dynamism of theatre complex. • Since technical provisions for acoustic concerts and other stage performances are significantly different, if large scale concerts and stage performances are intended, two different venues of significant seating capacity should be considered. • Provision for full size rehearsal facilities, catering, corporate entertainment and other activities related to sponsorship and community support should be considered.

<p><i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Council requests early implementation of WKCD to address the shortage in performing venues. • Apart from the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities, there should be a 1 200-seat theatre for xiqu, an Arts Education Development Centre and a Literary Centre, mega bookstores, and a concert hall.
<p><i>Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Ltd.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WKCD must have, at its heart, first class performance, rehearsal, educational and administrative facilities for Hong Kong's major musical companies. • The ideal concert hall would include first class performance, rehearsal and educational facilities for a full-size symphony orchestra (with a large-scale education programme) complete with rehearsal rooms, choir facilities, dressing rooms, administration offices, the full range of audience facilities front of house and catering facilities for corporate guests and VIPs. • If it is an intention to house a resident opera company in WKCD, the full rehearsal, production and administration facilities need to be incorporated and a long-term plan for the evolution of a full-time opera company needs to be instigated.
<p><i>Hong Kong Repertory Theatre</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In determining the need for arts and cultural facilities, efforts must be made to cater for the requests of the local arts and cultural community on the one hand and attract tourists on the other. Given that artistic programmes and tourist-oriented programmes are distinctively different in nature, striking a balance between the two and providing complementing facilities would be a positioning issue of the cultural programmes to be provided in WKCD which should be examined in great detail.
<p><i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hong Kong has actually become the world's major performance centre for xiqu. • The Core Arts and Cultural Facilities in WKCD should include a theatre with 1 200-1 400 seats for Chinese xiqu and Cantonese opera performances, training and rehearsal venues for such performances, and a xiqu information centre.
<p><i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • During the planning and the preparation for the construction of facilities in WKCD, important planning parameters such as plot ratio and the respective proportions of commercial/residential/cultural elements should be formulated in accordance with the Government's usual town

	<p>planning procedures. The WKCD Authority could be responsible for the planning and design work (e.g. by way of open competitions or by commissioning renowned architects).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Under the Invitation for Proposals (IFP), four museums of differing themes with total Net Operating Floor Area of at least 75 000 square metres are proposed to be provided in WKCD. Having regard to the scale and mode of operation of overseas museums of similar types and taking into account the fact that a museum cluster must be of a certain scale to become attractive, we consider the proposed provision appropriate. • The Association suggests that in addition to providing three major museums, namely, Museum of Modern Art, Museum of the Moving Image and Museum of Transportation, small-scale themed museums, including Museum of Design, Children Museum, Museum of Sports and Museum of Local Food and Drink Culture should also be provided in WKCD. • The Government may extensively invite suggestions on museum themes which are then to be assessed and evaluated by an advisory committee comprising museum specialists on the basis of certain established and objective criteria. The advisory committee will then compile a list of museum themes and submit the list together with a proposal to the Government for consideration. Where necessary, the final decision may be made by the Legislative Council or the public by way of a referendum.
<p><i>Government Cultural Services Grades' Alliance</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rather than placing too much emphasis on visual arts, the four suggested themed museums in the IFP should each be of a distinctive theme conducive to the building of a long-term audience base, so as to complement the existing museums thereby achieving the purpose of diversified development.
<p>6. Financial arrangements</p>	
<p><i>The Hong Kong Academy For Performing Arts</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For the proposed performing arts high school, funding would be required for the design and construction of the school and the costs for the maintenance of the school fabric, operation and maintenance of E&M plant, security, cleaning and landscaping services. • The cost of providing tuition will be met primarily from student fees, with assistance from privately sponsored bursaries.

<i>Hong Kong Society For Education In Art</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Part of the funding for WKCD should be earmarked for arts education and training of arts talents.
<i>Hong Kong Alternatives</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Funding for the proposed West Kowloon Cultural Green Park could come from: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - public appeal; - private donations; - sale of sites vacated by the Museums of Science, History, Arts, Space Museum and the Cultural Centre; and - appropriation from the Government's General Revenue.
<i>Hong Kong Dance Company</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Any decision on the financial arrangement for WKCD should be transparent and made after wide public consultation.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The transitional/provisional WKCD Council should work out the enabling legislation for a "Percentage Art Policy" in Hong Kong such that the project of the WKCD can be supported by the community.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A dedicated fund should be established to provide a stable funding source for the operation of arts and cultural facilities in WKCD. ● The Council supports the use of PPP in developing WKCD to allow more participation and contribution of the community. ● The Government should explore different means, such as tax concession, to encourage more active participation of the community and the private sector in arts and cultural programmes.
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Taking the construction and operation of museums as an example, there are actually many options available. With reference to overseas examples, feasible approaches include: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Developing and operating the museums by the Government using proceeds from the sale of land in WKCD; - Developing the museums using proceeds from the sale of land in WKCD and establishing statutory trustees to operate the museums. The recurrent expenditure could be provided by a fund set up by the Government or through annual appropriation; and - Granting the sites to interested parties to develop and operate the museums. The sites may be granted

	<p>together with other assets to help support the museums' future operation.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All contracts relating to land sale, land grant, construction works and other important matters should be awarded through the established and proven effective procedures, such as open tender and auction.
<i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Association considers the establishment of a \$30 billion trust fund a desirable measure, as this could provide arts and culture with sustainable support and relieve the long-term financial burden on the Government. However, the impact of inflation on the trust fund must be kept under close watch.
<i>Planet Time</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Active consideration should be given to the inclusion of a government-owned casino, for tourists only, in WKCD. Parts of the revenues from the casino could be used to fund arts, culture and education facilities in WKCD. • In the long-term, WKCD will enable Hong Kong to recreate itself as the world's premiere "One-stop shop" for tourists , thus generating multi-billion dollar sustainable revenue streams.
<i>Designing Hong Kong Harbour District</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government has not clarified why public-private partnership (PPP) should be the right approach for the venues in WKCD and the organization considers that the venues, being cultural infrastructure, should be public works funded by the Government's Capital Works Reserve Fund. • The Government should also differentiate various types of venues in considering the financing issues.
7. Management of arts and cultural facilities	
7.1 <u>Management of facilities in WKCD</u>	
<i>Hong Kong Society For Education In Art</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effective operation and management of the cultural facilities and programmes should be an important factor in WKCD development. Private sector, including arts education bodies, should be invited to be a partner in operation and management of the cultural facilities and programmes.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Each arts and cultural venue in WKCD may have one or more resident companies. These companies should be involved in the operation and management of the venues in order to develop "characteristics" for the venues. The

	<p>artistic director of a resident company could take up the position of the artistic director of the venue concerned and representatives from different venues could form a committee to coordinate among different performance venues.</p>
<p><i>Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A flexible, responsive and widely accessible box office system is critical. • The interests of the entertainment and tourism sectors do not necessarily coincide with those of the arts community. The shared agendas are likely to be in publicity, communications and brand building, rather than in product development.
<p>7.2 <u>Management of the existing facilities</u></p>	
<p><i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The transitional/provisional WKCD Council should conduct a comprehensive review of the facilities currently managed by the LCSD including the management style of LCSD.
<p><i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While the representatives of certain arts community believe that cultural development should be community-led, the Association stresses that the LCSD is in a better position to co-ordinate performance venues and cultural programmes, especially Cantonese opera performances the audience base of which is still rather substantial. • The Association considers that the direction for cultural development should be separated into two aspects, namely, community-led and government-led. Exclusive reliance on either aspect may lead to unhealthy consequences. Preserving government leadership for certain forms of performance arts is of help to Hong Kong in inviting successfully quality arts groups from allover the world to perform in Hong Kong, thereby enhancing cultural exchange. Allowing the community enough space for development is conducive to the development and maturity of local arts and cultural group, with a view to attaining international recognition.
<p>8. Statutory body to oversee the development of WKCD</p>	
<p>8.1 <u>Status, scope of responsibilities and powers</u></p>	
<p><i>Hong Kong Alternatives</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The public opinion survey co-sponsored by the organization reveals that the majority of respondents support for an independent Cultural Authority Board to supervise the planning, development and management of the cultural

	<p>green park at West Kowloon.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The West Kowloon Cultural Authority Board will be charged with the master planning, financial planning, execution, and management of the Cultural Green Park.
<i>Hong Kong Dance Company</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Subcommittee should monitor the early set up of the statutory body for WKCD to be responsible for the construction, operation and development of WKCD
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should expedite the establishment of the statutory body. The statutory body should preferably be involved in the planning for WKCD. • The body should be tasked to manage WKCD and be responsible for more macro issues, such as how WKCD could realize the policy objectives of the arts and cultural policy in Hong Kong.
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Many people suggest that a WKCD Authority should be set up to co-ordinate the overall planning of WKCD, plan and construct the arts and cultural facilities, and take charge of the future operation of the cultural facilities in WKCD. The Association considers the suggestion feasible. • The WKCD Authority should be a statutory body, with its mission, powers and functions, composition, membership appointment mechanism, source of funding, mode of operation, etc, clearly specified by legislative provisions. The Government should also introduce relevant codes of practice (e.g. the Code of Professional Ethics of the International Council of Museums) by means of legislation for strict adherence by members of the Authority and the staff concerned.
<i>Hong Kong Repertory Theatre</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is desirable for the Government to establish a statutory body to plan and steer the future development direction of WKCD. This statutory body should be equipped with the necessary powers to take over the relevant responsibilities of the Government and operate on an independent basis.
<i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In view of time and other considerations, the independent body may take the form of an independent agency playing a consultative role at first and taking up the management responsibilities later on. • The Government should monitor and co-ordinate all the construction works of WKCD. Upon the completion of WKCD or before it commences operation, the independent body should then become the management and operating

	agency with actual powers, responsible solely for the development and promotion of arts and culture.
<i>Planet Time</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A WKCD Development Authority should be created to raise the initial capital to fund construction (possibly through government-guaranteed bonds) and managing revenue sources to ensure the long-term sustainability of the arts, cultural and educational facilities.
<i>The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Institution does not consider it an absolute necessity for the establishment of a statutory body to spearhead the WKCD project and in particular, does not consider that such a statutory body must be established before proceeding with the tendering and construction of the facilities in WKCD as it may take years to establish the statutory body.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Legislative Council (LegCo) should have a say on the composition of the future statutory body for WKCD as the body would take up part of LegCo's role on the monitoring of WKCD.
8.2 <u>Corporate structure and funding arrangement</u>	
<i>Hong Kong Alternatives</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government may appoint a selection committee with the mandate to appoint and recommend the Chairman of the statutory body, who will then together with the selection committee appoint the other 10 to 15 members of the statutory body. • The selection committee should have no more than seven members, being distinguished community leaders of highest integrity, politically non-controversial, and patrons of arts and cultural organizations who are committed to making Hong Kong Asia's World City.
<i>Hong Kong Society For Education In Art</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The statutory body should include representatives from arts education bodies.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The statutory body should be well-represented from the arts and cultural sector, the public and the Government. • Proceeds from the business operation in WKCD should be placed in a designated fund for the recurrent expenditure of the statutory body and other core arts and cultural facilities.
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Association suggests that about one-third of the WKCD Authority's members may be specialist advisors with no vested interests and with high social standing, another

	<p>one-third representatives returned by election, and the remaining one-third representatives from relevant bureaux and government departments.</p>
<p><i>Government Cultural Services Grades' Alliance</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Association does not object to setting up an independent authority to manage and operate WKCD, but is seriously concerned about the composition of the authority and its membership appointment mechanism and stresses that the museum profession and performance venue management profession must be represented in the authority.
<p><i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On the composition of the independent body, while the early stage work would require the participation of more members from the engineering and financial sectors, more representatives from the arts and cultural sector should be invited to participate in the management and operation of WKCD.
<p>8.3 <u>Corporate governance and accountability</u></p>	
<p><i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Council suggests separating the monitoring role from the operation role of the statutory body to avoid a possible conflict of interests. Operation should be delegated to the committees formed under the statutory body. The committees should comprise government officials, representatives from the arts and cultural sector, management experts and international professionals to realize the "community driven" principle.
<p><i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Authority and the agencies under it should be subject to the Prevention of Bribery Ordinance as in the case of civil servants. • The Authority should not be involved in too many commercial activities or real estate property projects, so as to avoid giving rise to criticisms that the Authority is competing with the people for profits or suspicions of secret deals with the business sector. • The enactment of a set of museum legislation is urgently required to clearly establish the definition and operating requirements of museums and is the only way to ensure the provision of genuine museums in WKCD regardless of the development approach to be adopted in future; • A comprehensive set of museum legislation should provide for the following aspects of museums: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - definition and types;

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - purposes and functions; - establishment, categorization and status; - installation standards, organization structure and staff qualification; - operating management and accounts system; and - government funding support (awards), as well as sponsorship from the community.
<i>Government Cultural Services Grades' Alliance</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The authority should formulate a highly transparent assessment and accountability mechanism to assess the performance of all its members on a regular basis.
<i>Hong Kong Repertory Theatre</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The statutory body responsible for planning and guiding the development of WKCD should be monitored by the Legislative Council.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should solicit public views on the enabling legislation for the statutory body.
8.4 <u>Provisional arrangements pending establishment of statutory body</u>	
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The organization suggests that a transitional/provisional WKCD Council should be set up immediately after the core arts and cultural facilities have been confirmed. The Council should be tasked to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - work out the enabling legislation of the statutory body for WKCD; - decide on the schedule and the suitable juncture for the statutory to take over the WKCD project; - determine the extent to which the statutory body would be involved in the planning and design of the WKCD; - determine whether the statutory body can have the legal position to plan development parameters of the WKCD such as development mix, plot ratio etc.; - work out strategic plans for smooth transfer of the cultural provisions from Tsim Sha Tsui to the WKCD; - decide whether a canopy is appropriate for an overall image of the WKCD; and - seek international advice and support from time to time to gain project support.
9. Public engagement	
<i>Dr Robert CHUNG</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In conducting future public consultation, the following points should be noted: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Follow international standards as promulgated by the

	<p>World Association for Public Opinion Research when conducting and publishing opinion surveys;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Government and Legislative Council Members should have a duty to deliberate on the proper development of WKCD and to convince the public that their general direction is correct. Should there be significant disparities between experts and general public opinions, the Government should take the issue to the general public and resolve it by democratic means. Among all possible mechanisms, civil referendums should be considered as an option, in addition to public hearings, but never biased surveys initiated and directed by the Administration or parties with vested interests; and - If the Administration or any stakeholder has to conduct public opinion surveys, it should employ independent consultants who have the freedom to conduct such surveys independently and professionally. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public consultation should be started at an early stage of a public project. Public consultation of varying scales, which should be determined according to the circumstances, could be conducted at various strategic stages of a major project. Options may be formulated to invite the public to indicate preference and give comments. To forge a consensus among the public, it is important to give the public a sense of ownership and show that their views are genuinely respected.
<p><i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The organization suggests that the transitional/provisional WKCD Council should be responsible for providing a consultative mechanism. The Council should be an advisory body under the administration of the Commission on Strategic Development. In respect of consultation, its power and work should be: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - to create a formal channel/space for continued public dialogue and to liaise with all relevant stakeholders; - to involve the business sector to propose the non-cultural components, which are not under the purview of the Consultative Committee and the Advisory Groups; and - to establish a standing international mechanism to reflect fleeting changes in the competitive global situation and for ideas and interface. • The current public fanaticism and temper should be kept 'high' and the discourse of art should be carried forward until the WKCD facility is opened for public use.

	<p>Discussion on the subject can be generated in the Internet, public forums, international conferences and through the education system.</p>
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Association hopes that the Government could allow the discussions and studies relating to the development of WKCD to be conducted in a more open manner to enable Hong Kong people to make a fair and objective comparison. Consensus on a proposal most conducive to the long-term development of WKCD can be reached from open and professional discussions.
<i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In addition to conducting another exercise to solicit views, efforts should also be made to consolidate the views collected during the early stages, especially the views on the need for Core Arts and Cultural Facilities. This is the only way to gain a more comprehensive perspective.
<i>Hong Kong Dance Company</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Consultative Committee and the Advisory Groups should consult both the public as well as listening to the views of practitioners from different fields of the arts and cultural sector to understand their circumstances and demands.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Under the provisional Council, a new structure of consultation such as one with a Museum Committee, Performing Arts Committee, Library Committee, Ancillary Facility Committee, Financial Matters Committee and the like can be formed to carry out their specific work.
10. Implementation issues	
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Planners</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To overcome the problem that the training of management professionals and art talents would not be in time for the planning and operation for the arts and cultural facilities in WKCD, WKCD could be developed in phases with regular reviews.
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Government should set a timetable for the WKCD project. Instead of a rigid blueprint, the Government should lay down guidelines for the development of WKCD. • Implementation of WKCD should be undertaken in stages and each stage should be reviewed in light of public feedback. The next stage could be modified to meet the changing needs and circumstances of the community. • The Institute welcomes the recommendation of Museum

	Advisory Group to hold an open competition for the proposed M+.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• More open competitions could be held in respect of the facilities in WKCD to enhance public participation and awareness.
<i>The Hong Kong Institution of Engineers</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• To accelerate the implementation process in an efficient and coordinated manner, the Government should proceed with the drafting of the master layout plan in collaboration with other Government departments. The relevant government departments should start the basic infrastructure works for the site.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
8 March 2007

Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development

Summary of views of various organizations and individuals on the work of the Consultative Committee on the Core Arts and Cultural Facilities in West Kowloon Cultural District (CC) and its three Advisory Groups (AGs)

(Views received from October 2006 to January 2007)

1. General comments	
<i>People's Panel on West Kowloon</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The three AGs work independently without coordination with one another. • The three AGs have not sufficiently engaged the public in drawing up their recommendations. Though the Performing Arts and Tourism Advisory Group (PATAG) and Museums Advisory Group (MAG) have received and listed out public views, there is not a systematic consolidation and analysis of the views.
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proceedings of CC and AGs are not transparent. After AGs have made recommendations, it is not known whether alternative views have been considered. Even if they have considered such views, they have not explained the reasons for not accepting them.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Council urges CC to give consideration to the promotion of cultural and creative industries, the training for the arts and cultural sector, the governance mode and the future development of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) and how WKCD could catalyze the realization of a long term arts and cultural vision for Hong Kong.
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Planners</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a need for the Government to substantiate its cultural policy in conjunction with the vision for WKCD as it seems that the current cultural policy, in particular the strategies for cultural software development under the policy, may not be able to accommodate and complement the recommendations of PATAG and MAG.
2. Report of PATAG	
<i>People's Panel on West Kowloon</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The PATAG's recommendations have not addressed the fundamental questions of "For whom the facilities are built" and "Why they should be built". In this connection, CC

	<p>should take up a greater responsibility for formulating a policy direction for the WKCD project.</p>
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Council supports PATAG's suggestion of providing more small-scale performing venues with a seating capacity of 200 to 1 000 to facilitate the development of small to medium sized performing groups.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While the Society welcomes PATAG's recommendation on providing more performing venues, the details of these recommended venues would need further study taking into account the projected audience size, the public demand and the attendance rates of existing venues.
<i>Designing Hong Kong Harbour District</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The organization considers that the PATAG's recommended venues could reflect the territorial requirements for performing venues in Hong Kong, but WKCD should not be the necessary location for these venues.
<i>The Chinese Artists Association of Hong Kong</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While the Association supports PATAG's report on setting up a Xiqu Centre, there are concerns that the software development may not keep pace with the hardware development in WKCD and the rentals of the future performing venues in WKCD may not be affordable to Cantonese Opera companies, as the venues may operate on a self-financing basis. The Government could consider setting up a dedicated fund for the development of the arts and cultural sector.
<p>3. Report of MAG</p>	
<p>3.1 <u>General</u></p>	
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Institute agrees that flexibility should be provided for the museums in WKCD. However, the Government should formulate a clear policy on museums. • Given the overlapping of the proposed museum themes with those of existing themes, consideration may be given to converting some existing ones to training facilities for cultural software development.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is perceived conflict of interests in the composition of MAG and as such, there are doubts whether MAG could truly reflect public views. Scientists and historians could have been enlisted into MAG to give views from a wider perspective.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More discussion should be conducted on how to balance the need to encourage creativity and the need to ensure proper monitoring under the future governing structure for the museums. • The future statutory body for WKCD should establish a communication platform to facilitate continuous dialogue with the arts and cultural sector on the development of museums in WKCD.
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The museums in WKCD should be planned in conjunction with the existing public and private museums in Hong Kong. • Enacting a piece of legislation on museums can facilitate the healthy development of museum facilities in Hong Kong. • The planning for the museums in WKCD should be settled as soon as possible so as to enable the commencement of the collection building process and the training of required professionals. Consideration can also be given to tapping the experience of local professionals who have retired or left the field.
3.2 <u>Museum plus (M+)</u>	
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • M+ should have an official Chinese name. • The M+ concept is too broad and MAG has not provided any guidelines on collections development matters. A wide scope of collections would easily lead to mediocrity and the proposed Hong Kong perspective for the collections of M+ may result in the future collections being too local lacking in a global dimension.
<i>Mr Oscar HO</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • M+ concept is innovative, visionary and forward-looking and can embrace a large variety of art forms. The concept is responsive to the latest global critical thinking concerning the future development of museums and has aroused great interest among overseas museums professionals. However, it is necessary to explain details of M+ to the public in easily comprehensible terms. • More in-depth studies and opinion surveys should be conducted for the future museum facilities in WKCD.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The organization has reservation on the "Centre Pompidou" approach of the proposed M+ which seeks to cover collections of various groupings under an umbrella institution. The M+ proposal may be "dangerous" and contrary to the global trend that each museum is devoted to

	<p>one particular theme. The proposal would not be conducive to the development of the museum culture in Hong Kong.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The museum facilities on visual culture under M+ would compete against the existing art museums managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department. • The M+ concept could not reflect the uniqueness of Hong Kong nor embrace the history and identity of the Hong Kong. If the Hong Kong public could not identify with M+, it would become a white elephant.
<i>Asia Art Archive</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The M+ proposal is forward-looking in line with the global trend and is more than a traditional museum. It is meant to engage and respond to the public and to provide a platform for the 20th century and 21st century visual cultures. • M+ can cater for the rapid changes in the roles and functions of museums. As no such institutions exist in Hong Kong and Asia, M+ will provide a good opportunity to put Hong Kong on the world cultural map.
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Institute welcomes MAG's recommendation on holding an open architectural competition for the proposed M+.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Council supports the M+ proposal in view that M+ would be a forward-looking and flexible cultural institution.
3.3 <u>Proposed themes</u>	
<i>Hong Kong Arts Development Council</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Council agrees with MAG that in considering the themes for the new museums in WKCD, the primary consideration should be whether the themes can reflect the cultural characteristics of Hong Kong and how the new museums can complement the existing museums. MAG has addressed the Council's views that WKCD should promote and develop local arts, enhance arts education, and the establishment of other complementary facilities in WKCD.
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Association is concerned that the MAG's proposed themes, namely, visual art, design, film and popular culture are too narrow, skewing towards visual culture. • The Association has reservation on designing a museum for popular culture, as there is no overseas precedence and the idea of accommodating popular culture in a museum is perplexing. There is doubt on whether such a museum has any educational value.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The overlapping of MAG's proposed groupings with the themes of the existing museums may increase the price of the collection items on the market and no full picture on a particular theme could be presented by any one museum.
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Architects.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The four broad groupings recommended by MAG could not cater for certain minority preferences and some small museums could be provided in WKCD on minority themes. Architecture could be one of the themes at the WKCD museums.
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The organization has reservation on subsuming ink art, which is representative of Chinese traditional art, under the broad grouping of visual art. Ink art should form a distinct grouping to show its uniqueness and this would enhance the role of Hong Kong in the collection and development of this art form.
<i>Asia Art Archive</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The relevant minority views on "ink art" have been reflected in MAG's report. While "ink art" is a living art form, the boundary between "ink art" and other art forms has become blurred. Segregating "ink art" from "visual art" would marginalize the former and defeating the vision of M+ to achieve cross-fertilization.
4. Public Engagement	
<i>Museum of Site, Ltd</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The public consultation conducted by MAG is not thorough and the public participation level has been low. The Government should conduct thorough consultation on the M+ proposal.
<i>Dr Robert CHUNG</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Given that the public is the ultimate users of the future museum facilities, it is important that they should develop a sense of ownership and they should be involved and consulted at different stages of planning and development of the proposed M+. The Government could provide the public with viable options at strategic stages for public consultation through public hearings, civil referendum and opinion surveys. However, any opinion surveys should follow the established international standards. In conducting large-scale opinion surveys, the consultant should be given complete autonomy.
<i>Mr Oscar HO</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In the public consultation for the museums facilities, respective views of the general public and professionals

	<p>should be accorded suitable weights and the views of professional should be respected. Sufficient rooms for creativity should be allowed for professionals to design world-class museum facilities in WKCD.</p>
<i>The Hong Kong Institute of Planners</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The Government should consider strengthening publicity on the reports of PATAG and MAG to explain details to the public, preferably with the aid of display models.
<i>Hong Kong Curators Association</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• In view of the technical nature of museum planning and development, the Association suggests that the relevant professionals should be enlisted to select among the suggested themes at the early consultation stage using objective criteria before the general public is further consulted on their preferences and views.
<i>Hong Kong Arts Festival Society Ltd.</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The future financing proposals recommended by FMAG would need consultation with the public.