

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2187/06-07
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/SS/5/06/1

**Subcommittee on
Sewage Services (Sewage Charge) (Amendment) Regulation 2007,
Sewage Services (Trade Effluent Surcharge) (Amendment) Regulation 2007
and Technical Memorandum on Procedures and Methods for Sampling and
Analysis of Trade Effluents**

**Minutes of the fourth meeting
held on Monday, 30 April 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Members present : Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J.,JP
Hon SIN Chung-kai, JP
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent : Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Public officers : Ms Anissa WONG
attending Permanent Secretary for the Environment,
Transport and Works (Environment)/
Director of Environmental Protection

Mr Raymond FAN
Deputy Director of Environmental Protection (2)

Dr Malcolm James BROOM
Assistant Director (Water Policy)
Environmental Protection Department

Dr YEUNG Hung-yiu
Principal Environmental Protection Officer

Mr KO Wing-hon, JP
Assistant Director / Sewage Services
Drainage Services Department

Mr CHUI Wing-wah
Chief Engineer / Harbour Area Treatment Scheme
Drainage Services Department

Ms Camy WAN
Senior Treasury Accountant
Drainage Services Department

Miss Clara LEUNG
Government Counsel
Department of Justice

Attendance by Invitation : Mr Alex KWAN
Project Director
Maunsell Consultants Asia Ltd

Clerk in attendance : Miss Polly YEUNG
Chief Council Secretary (1)5

Staff in attendance : Mr Timothy TSO
Assistant Legal Adviser 2

Ms Rosalind MA
Senior Council Secretary (1)8

Mr Justin TAM
Council Secretary (1)3

Action

I Matters arising

The Subcommittee discussed the way forward for the Amendment Regulations and the Technical Memorandum.

II Meeting with the Administration

Discussion of outstanding items

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1467/06-07(01) — List of follow-up actions to be taken by the Administration for the meeting on 27 April 2007 prepared by the Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1467/06-07(02) — Administration's response to issues raised at the meetings on 19, 24 and 27 April 2007 (Part II)
(tabled at the meeting and issued to members on 2 May 2007)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1488/06-07(03) — Administration's response to issues raised at the meeting on 27 April 2007 – Survey on disinfection practices in other coastal cities
(tabled at the meeting and issued to members on 2 May 2007)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1488/06-07(04) — Administration's response to issues raised at the meeting on 27 April 2007 – Sewage charge increment projection – alternative scenarios (English version only) *(tabled at the meeting and issued to members on 2 May 2007)*
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1449/06-07(02) — List of follow-up actions to be taken by the Administration for the meeting on 24 April 2007 prepared by the Secretariat
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1449/06-07(03) — Administration's response to issues raised at the meetings on 19 and 24 April 2007 (Part I)
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1435/06-07(01) — List of follow-up actions to be taken by the Administration for the meeting on 19 April 2007 prepared by the Secretariat

LC Paper No. CB(1)1435/06-07(02) — Administration's response dated 23 April 2007 to issues raised at the meeting on 19 April 2007)

2. The Subcommittee deliberated (Index of proceedings attached at **Appendix**).

Follow-up actions to be taken by the Administration

3. To address members' concern about the use of chlorination/dechlorination for disinfection, the Administration was requested to provide the following information:

- (a) A comparison of the annual operating costs of using chlorination/dechlorination and UV-radiation for disinfection under Stage 2A and Stage 2B of the Harbour Area Treatment Scheme (HATS), with breakdown by costs under different components (such as staff, light and power, chemical, maintenance and replacement of UV lamps);
- (b) The environmental impact assessment of the chlorination/dechlorination technology; and
- (c) The criteria for selection of the 24 overseas cities in the survey on disinfection practices in other coastal cities, and if practicable, a list of all coastal cities using marine disposal of sewage in the past 10 years and with population of over 100 000.

4. To address members' concern about the propriety and timeliness of the approval sought for the incremental increases in Sewage Charge (SC) fee levels over a 10-year period to recover 80% of the operating costs of a number of sewage services projects yet to be commissioned, the Administration was requested to provide more details on the SC increment projection to illustrate whether the proposed increments in the coming 10 years would result in the recovery of operating costs in excess and/or in advance of the actual increase in SC expenditure.

5. To address members' concern about the efforts made by the Administration in making available the suitable site for construction of the biological treatment plant under HATS Stage 2B, the Administration was requested to provide a chronology on the following:

- (a) The activities/work which had been undertaken since the identification of the land adjacent to the Stonecutters Island Sewage Treatment Works site (in 2004) till present; and

- (b) The activities/work to be done from the present day till the conduct of the review on the timing for implementation of Stage 2B in 2010.

(Post-meeting note : The Administration's response to paragraphs 3 to 5 above was issued to members vide LC Paper No. CB(1)1488/06-07(02) on 4 May 2007).

Other follow-up action

6. Members agreed with Mr LEE Wing-tat's suggestion that the Subcommittee should write to the relevant policy bureaux to seek clarification on the planning, interface and development issues related to the co-use of the site earmarked for the biological treatment plant under HATS Stage 2B.

(Post-meeting note: The letter dated 30 April 2007 from the Subcommittee Chairman to the relevant Director of Bueaux and the consolidated reply of the Administration dated 3 May 2007 were issued to members vide LC Paper Nos. CB(1)1493/06-07(01) and CB(1)1519/06-07(03) on 2 May and 4 May 2007 respectively).

III Any other business

Date of next meeting

7. Members noted that the next meeting would be held on 3 May 2007.
8. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
24 July 2007

**Proceedings of the
Subcommittee on Sewage Services (Sewage Charge) (Amendment) Regulation 2007,
Sewage Services (Trade Effluent Surcharge) (Amendment) Regulation 2007 and
Technical Memorandum on Procedures and Methods for Sampling and Analysis of
Trade Effluents**

**Fourth meeting on Monday, 30 April 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
000000 – 001218	Chairman Clerk ALA2 Ms Emily LAU Administration Ir Dr Raymond HO	<p>(a) Members noted the legislative timetable under which the Subcommittee would have to report to the House Committee on 4 May 2007.</p> <p>(b) Ms Emily LAU's view that adequate time should be allowed for members to scrutinize the Amendment Regulations and the Technical Memorandum.</p> <p>(c) The approach adopted by the former Subcommittee on Air Pollution Control (Volatile Organic Compounds) Regulation.</p> <p>(d) The Administration's explanation that it would seek funding approval for a number of sewage services projects after the proposed Sewage Charge (SC) increments over the coming 10 years under the Amendment Regulation was approved.</p> <p>(e) Ir Dr Raymond HO's view that the way forward for dealing with the Amendment Regulations and Technical Memorandum could be decided after the Administration had responded to all the issues raised by members, in particular its commitment for</p>	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		implementation of Harbour Area Treatment Scheme (HATS) Stage 2B.	
001219 – 002703	Mr Tommy CHEUNG Mr WONG Kwok-hing Administration Chairman	<p>(a) Mr Tommy CHEUNG's query about the rationale for the proposed increase of SC fee levels with effect from 1 July 2007, when the majority of the sewage services projects, including HATS Stage 2A, had yet to be completed.</p> <p>(b) Mr WONG Kwok-hing's strong view on the need for conducting a mid-term review during the 10-year period of SC increments to cater for changes in future circumstances.</p> <p>(c) The Administration's explanation that at all times during the coming 10-year period, the projected SC expenditure would continue to exceed the SC revenue taking into account the proposed SC increases. The Administration would provide information to the Legislative Council (LegCo) upon substantial deviations if any, from the estimations and would seek the views of LegCo on how the polluter pays principle should continue to be manifested in such circumstances.</p> <p>(d) On Mr WONG Kwok-hing's question about utilizing some of the revenue derived from co-use of the site on Stonecutters Island to fund the operating costs for the biological treatment plant under HATS Stage 2B, the</p>	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		Administration's response that there were difficulties in implementing such cross-subsidization between the co-users.	
002704 – 004019	Chairman Administration Maunsell Consultants Asia Ltd (Consultant) Mr Tommy CHEUNG Mr WONG Ting-kwong	<p>(a) The Consultant's briefing on the survey on disinfection practices in other coastal cities (LC Paper No. CB(1)1488/06-07(03) tabled at the meeting).</p> <p>(b) Mr Tommy CHEUNG's enquiry about the differences in operating costs of using chlorination/dechlorination and UV-radiation for disinfection under HATS Stage 2A and Stage 2B.</p> <p>(c) The Consultant's explanation that the difference between the annual operating costs of the two disinfection technologies under Stage 2A and Stage 2B would not be significant.</p> <p>(d) Mr WONG Ting-kwong's enquiry about the disinfection efficacy of chlorination/dechlorination compared with UV-radiation.</p> <p>The Consultant's response that information gathered from pilot studies on the two disinfection technologies showed that UV-radiation was effective for disinfection of secondary/tertiary effluents. However, the cost effectiveness of its application to primary or chemically enhanced primary treated (CEPT) effluent was lower due to low transmittance of the effluent.</p>	The Administration to provide information as requested in paragraph 3(a) of the minutes.

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
004020 – 004704	Miss CHOY So-yuk Consultant Administration	<p>(a) Miss CHOY So-yuk's enquiry about the environmental impact of chlorination/dechlorination, in particular the level of chlorine in effluent after dechlorination.</p> <p>(b) The Consultant's explanation that the environmental assessment of chlorination/dechlorination showed that dechlorination would remove almost all residual chlorine in the effluent. Results of risk assessment on the chlorination by-products in CEPT effluent also showed that the potential risks to human health and ecological resources was low.</p> <p>(c) On Miss CHOY So-yuk's concern about the quantity of <i>E. coli</i> in effluent under HATS Stage 1, Stage 2A and 2B, the Administration's response that the quantity would be substantially reduced under HATS Stage 2A and Stage 2B with a longer period of exposure of bacteria to the chemicals.</p>	
004705 – 011228	Mr LEE Wing-tat Consultant Chairman Administration Ir Dr Raymond HO Ms Emily LAU	<p>(a) Enquiry of Mr LEE Wing-tat and Ir Dr Raymond HO about the selection criteria for the 24 cities in the survey of disinfection practices.</p> <p>(b) The Consultant's response that the 24 selected cities included cities in North America, Asia/Australia/New Zealand and Europe. Criteria for short-listing included: ocean discharge of the treated effluent, significant</p>	The Administration to provide information as requested in paragraph 3(c) of the minutes.

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>population, well-established requirements for wastewater treatment, and well-developed sewage treatment system.</p> <p>(c) In response to Mr LEE Wing-tat's concern about the environmental impact of chlorination/dechlorination, the Administration's advice that the report of the environmental impact assessment (EIA) study would be ready in about June 2007 and would be available for public inspection for 30 days after technical vetting by the Authority in accordance with the relevant requirements under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (Cap. 499).</p> <p>(d) Ir Dr Raymond HO's enquiry on the need for chlorination/dechlorination under HATS Stage 2B and whether UV-radiation could be used instead.</p> <p>(e) Ms Emily LAU's view that the Administration should expedite the implementation of secondary sewage treatment to facilitate the use of UV-radiation for disinfection, which was considered more environmental friendly.</p> <p>(f) The Consultant's response that in examining the disinfection technology to be employed, the performance in pollutant removal efficiency, recurrent costs and environmental impact were all taken into consideration. With higher transmittance of effluent under</p>	<p>The Administration to provide information as requested in paragraph 3(b) of the minutes.</p>

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Stage 2B, the performance of UV-radiation would be enhanced, with about 50% fewer UV lamps required when compared with those required under Stage 2A.</p> <p>(g) The Administration's explanation that various disinfection technologies had been considered but the only one that could be installed reasonably quickly to allow early improvement in water quality under HATS Stage 2A was chlorination followed by dechlorination. All the indications under the on-going EIA study had shown that the impact of chlorination/dechlorination on water quality should be acceptable.</p>	
011229 – 011744	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Chairman Administration	<p>(a) Mr WONG Kwok-hing's concern about the schedule for provision of tertiary sewage treatment to facilitate the use of reclaimed effluents.</p> <p>(b) The Administration's response that there was no schedule for implementing tertiary sewage treatment. The Administration was examining technologies for recycling of effluent through pilot schemes such as the Ngong Ping Sewage Treatment Works and the Demonstration Scheme on Reclaimed Water Uses in the North District.</p>	
011745 – 012053	Miss CHOY So-yuk	Miss CHOY So-yuk's view that the Administration should not adopt a phased-approach for HATS Stage 2 and should proceed to the implementation of secondary	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		sewage treatment without delay, and her grave concern about the use of chlorination/dechlorination for disinfection.	
012054 – 012354	Ir Dr Raymond HO Administration	<p>(a) Ir Dr Raymond HO's concern about the estimated capital and recurrent costs for construction of the biological treatment plant under HATS Stage 2B underground and at-grade.</p> <p>(b) The Administration's response that the capital and recurrent costs would be higher for an underground treatment plant than one constructed at-grade. The site earmarked at the Stonecutters Island for the biological treatment plant, located next to the Stonecutters Island Sewage Treatment Works, would minimize the costs for transportation of sewage for treatment. The site had been identified through a comprehensive site search and selection exercise.</p>	
012555 – 014039	Chairman Administration	Briefing by the Administration on its response to issues raised at meetings on 19 and 24 April 2007 (LC Paper No. CB(1)1467/06-07(02) tabled at the meeting) and SC Increment Projection- Alternative Scenario (LC Paper No. CB(1)1488/06-07(04) tabled at the meeting).	
014040 – 014559	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration Chairman Ms Emily LAU Ir Dr Raymond HO Mr WONG Ting-kwong	(a) Mr LEE Wing-tat's concern that the site earmarked for the biological treatment plant under Stage 2B had been left vacant for years, and queried whether a concrete plan had been drawn up for the development of "Container	

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		<p>Related Uses" on the site.</p> <p>(b) The Administration's response that as there were two other bureaux/departments involved in the process of addressing the issues of planning, interface and development of the site, the Environment, Transport and Works Bureau was liaising with the bureaux concerned to resolve the issues.</p> <p>(c) Mr LEE Wing-tat's suggestion for the Subcommittee to write to the relevant policy bureaux to convey the Subcommittee's concern for early implementation of HATS Stage 2B and to request up-to-date information on how the bureaux were taking forward their respective planned uses of the site.</p>	<p>The Subcommittee to take action as agreed at paragraph 6 of the minutes.</p>
014600 – 015329	Mr Tommy CHEUNG Administration Ir Dr Raymond HO	<p>(a) Mr Tommy CHEUNG's query on the rationale for increasing SC fee levels over a 10-year period before the public could benefit from the improvement to water quality to be achieved through major sewage services projects yet to be completed.</p> <p>(b) The Administration's explanation that the operating costs of sewage services should be shared by households and trades pursuant to the polluter-pays principle but the current SC only recovered about 54% of the operating costs. To strike a balance between applying the polluter-pays principle and avoiding an adverse impact on people's livelihood, the</p>	<p>The Administration to provide information as requested in paragraph 4 of the minutes.</p>

Time Marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action Required
		Administration had proposed to recover about 80% of the projected operating costs through 10 annual increments.	
015330 - 020112	Ir Dr Raymond HO Administration Chairman Ms Emily LAU	<p>(a) Ir Dr Raymond HO's concern about coordination with relevant bureaux and the time required for resolving the planning, interface and development issues involving the HATS Stage 2B site.</p> <p>(b) The Administration's assurance of its commitment to pressing ahead with the discussion with relevant bureaux on the issues concerned with co-use of the site, following which it could proceed with the statutory planning procedure for an amendment of the outline zoning plan, with the target of completing the process in 2010.</p> <p>(c) The Chairman's concern about the efforts made by the Administration in making available the site for construction of the biological treatment plant under HATS Stage 2B.</p>	The Administration to provide information as requested in paragraph 5 of the minutes.
020113 – 020259	Chairman	Legislative timetable and arrangements for the next meeting.	