

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)678/07-08
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/CA

Panel on Constitutional Affairs

Minutes of meeting
held on Monday, 21 May 2007, at 2:30 pm
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building

Members present :

- Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP (Chairman)
- Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)
- Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
- Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
- Hon LEE Cheuk-yan
- Hon Margaret NG
- Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP
- Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
- Hon CHAN Yuen-han, JP
- Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP
- Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, SBS, JP
- Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
- Hon WONG Yung-kan, JP
- Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
- Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
- Dr Hon YEUNG Sum
- Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
- Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
- Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
- Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
- Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
- Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, JP
- Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
- Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
- Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
- Hon LEE Wing-tat
- Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP
- Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
- Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
- Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
- Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
Hon KWONG Chi-kin

Member attending : Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

Members absent : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan
Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP
Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
Hon MA Lik, GBS, JP

Public Officers attending : Item IV

Mr Stephen LAM Sui-lung
Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Mrs Cherry TSE LING Kit-ching
Permanent Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Mr Arthur HO Kin-wah
Deputy Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Ms Joyce HO Kwok-shan
Principal Assistant Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Item V

Professor LAU Siu-kai
Head
Central Policy Unit

Mr Arthur HO Kin-wah
Deputy Secretary for Constitutional Affairs

Mr Raymond TAM
Secretary to the Commission on Strategic Development
Central Policy Unit

Attendance by invitation : Savants Policy Institute Limited
Mr Ronald CHAN Ngok-pang
Director of Policy Development

Kowloon Federation of Associations
Mr CHIU Kwok-wai
Secretary (Policy Studies)

Member, Sha Tin District Council
Mr LAW Kwong-keung

Member, Island District Council
Miss Amy YUNG Wing-sheung

Member, Yau Tsim Mong District Council
Mr LAI Chi-lap

Member, Eastern District Council
Dr WONG Kam-din

Neighbour and Workers Service Centre
Mr Ivan WONG
Community Affairs Organizer

Student Union of Chu Hai College of Higher Education
Mr CHAI Yu-hon
Secretary

Power for Democracy
林咏然

The Frontier
Mr Wilson LEE
Secretary General

Member, Island District Council

Ms LEE Kwai-chun

Civil Human Rights Front

Ms Jackie HUNG
Convener

The Democratic Party

Mr NG Wing-fai

關心香港前途小組

Mr LAM Tze-kin
Convenor

The Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong

Dr LAM Tai-fai
General Committee Member

New Century Forum

Mr CHAN Tak-ming
Deputy Secretary

Hong Kong Christian Institute

Mr FAN-Lap-hin
Project Secretary

League of Social Democrats

Mr LO Wing-lok
Vice-Chairman

Hong Kong Civic Association

Mr Edwin K W YUN

Anson Chan and Her Core Group

Mrs Anson CHAN

Clerk in attendance : Mrs Percy MA
Chief Council Secretary (2)3

Staff in attendance : Mr Arthur CHEUNG
Senior Assistant Legal Adviser 2

Mrs Eleanor CHOW
Senior Council Secretary (2)4

Mrs Fony TSANG
Legislative Assistant (2)3

Action

I. Confirmation of minutes of meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(2)1871/06-07 - Minutes of meeting on 26 March 2007)

The minutes of the meeting held on 26 March 2007 were confirmed.

II. Information papers issued since the last meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(2)1709/06-07 - Electoral boundary maps in respect of the 2007 District Council Election)

2. Members noted that the above paper had been issued to the Panel.

III. Items for discussion at the next meeting

(LC Paper No. CB(2)1874/06-07(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion)

3. Members agreed that the following items proposed by the Administration would be discussed at the next meeting on 21 June 2007 -

- (a) Proposed guidelines issued by the Electoral Affairs Commission on election-related activities in respect of the District Council election; and
- (b) Models, roadmap and timetable for selecting the Chief Executive and for forming the Legislative Council by universal suffrage.

Action

IV. Models, roadmap and timetable for selecting the Chief Executive and for forming the Legislative Council by universal suffrage

(LC Paper No. CB(2)1858/06-07(01) - Administration's paper on "Models, roadmap and timetable for electing the Chief Executive and for forming the Legislative Council by universal suffrage" and the submissions put forth to the workshop organised by the Commission on Strategic Development on 10 May 2007

LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1873/06-07(01)-(13), 1910/06-07(01)-(02) and 2063/06-07(01)-(07) – submissions from deputations))

Presentation of views

4. The Chairman welcomed the deputations and individuals for attending the meeting to give views on the models, roadmap and timetable for selecting the Chief Executive (CE) and for forming the Legislative Council (LegCo) by universal suffrage. The views of deputations/individuals are summarised in the **Appendix**.

Discussion

Nomination committee and nomination procedure

5. Mr Howard YOUNG asked Dr WONG Kam-din why he had suggested that the nomination threshold should be high rather than low and the eligibility criteria for a candidate should be stringent rather than loose. He also sought views from Dr WONG on the proposal of the New Century Forum (NCF) that a person should be required to obtain not less than 20% and not more than 25% nominations from each of the four sectors of the NC (which were converted from the Election Committee) in order to be eligible for the CE candidacy.

6. Dr WONG Kam-din said that according to Article 45 of the Basic Law (BL 45), the selection and appointment of the CE involved three steps when universal suffrage was attained -

- (a) nomination by a broadly representative nominating committee (NC) in accordance with democratic procedures;
- (b) selection by universal suffrage following nomination; and
- (c) appointment by the Central People's Government (CPG).

He pointed out that given the power of the CPG to appoint a CE was substantive, a high nomination threshold and stringent eligibility criteria would ensure that the CE-elect would be acceptable to the CPG. He said that the NCF's proposal could be considered.

Action

7. Mr CHAN Tak-ming, Deputy Secretary of the NCF, explained that the rationale of the NCF's proposal to require candidates to obtain a certain number of nominations in each sector of the NC was to ensure that the candidates had a certain level of support from different sectors and strata in the community. When the principle of meeting the interests of different sectors was complied with, there would be fewer disputes in the community over the CE candidacy and the CE-elect. He further said that the percentage proposed for the nomination threshold was open for discussion.

8. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan said that the nomination mechanism proposed by the NCF required candidates to pass two thresholds, i.e. an overall nomination threshold and a nomination threshold by sector. In addition, the aim of the proposed mechanism was to allow only three to four candidates to run in the election. Mr LEE pointed out that a high nomination threshold would deprive people's right to choose and could not be construed as true universal suffrage.

9. Mr Ronny TONG sought views from the deputations on their understanding of "nomination by a broadly representative nominating committee in accordance with democratic procedures". He said that some people had suggested that in order to ensure that the candidates would be accepted by the CPG, the nomination procedure should include a screening process.

10. Mrs Anson CHAN said that according to the principle of universal suffrage, the nomination threshold should not be high and should not be used to screen or exclude certain contenders for the CE election.

11. Dr WONG Kam-din reiterated that the power of the CPG to appoint a CE was substantive. The nomination mechanism provided in the Basic Law sought to ensure that the candidates were of high calibre and were widely accepted by the community, and to minimise the possibility that the CPG would refuse to appoint the CE-elect.

Functional constituencies (FCs)

12. Mr Howard YOUNG asked Mr LAW Kwong-keung, a member of the Sha Tin District Council, about his proposal to abolish FC seats by phases. Mr LAW responded that corporate voting could be abolished first. Initially, FCs which were allocated two seats in the LegCo, such as the Industrial FC, could have their seats reduced to one.

13. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan asked when the Chinese Manufacturer's Association of Hong Kong (CMAHK) would be willing to give up the special rights conferred on FCs to nominate candidates and to vote in an election. Referring to the comments made by the CMAHK that the FC system had contributed to the smooth implementation of government policies and initiatives, Mr LEE pointed

Action

out that the CMAHK had misunderstood the functions of the LegCo. It was the responsibility of the LegCo to monitor the work of the Government and not to implement its policies, not to mention that not all the proposals put forth by the Government were supported by the LegCo.

14. Dr LAM Tai-fai, General Committee Member of the CMAHK, disagreed that Members returned by FCs had any special rights or power. He said that they represented the interests of the different sectors in the community. They had the responsibility to support the policies of the Government which were supported by the sectors they represented.

15. Ms Emily LAU sought views from Mrs Anson CHAN and Her Core Group on ways to convince the business sector to give up the special rights conferred on FCs. Ms Margaret NG sought views from the deputations on the circumstances under which they would agree to abolish the FC system.

16. Mrs Anson CHAN said that the FC system did not comply with the concept of universal suffrage as provided in the Basic Law and should be abolished over time. The Government should take the lead in deciding how FCs should be abolished.

17. Dr WONG Kam-din said that the composition of the LegCo reflected the composition of society. He held the view that the FC system had its merits and a committee should be set up to review its formation and functions as well as the performance of Members returned by FCs. Dr WONG believed that universal suffrage could be achieved by changing the electoral method for FCs such as replacing corporate voting with individual voting.

18. Dr YEUNG Sum said that FCs allowed certain people to have two votes and were inconsistent with the concept of universal suffrage. He sought views from the Hong Kong Civic Association (HKCA) on the future of FCs and whether it was aware that a bicameral system was inconsistent with the Basic Law.

19. Mr Edwin YUN of the HKCA said that it was not easy to abolish FCs in one go, given the divergent views held by Members. With a view to taking forward constitutional development in a harmonious manner, the HKCA proposed a bicameral system to address the interests of GC and FC Members and to facilitate a consensus to be reached in the community. The HKCA noted that it was necessary to amend the Basic Law in order to implement a bicameral system.

Models, roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage and consultation

20. Ms Emily LAU asked why Mrs Anson CHAN did not support the conduct of a referendum to let people decide on the models, roadmap and timetable for

Action

universal suffrage. Mrs Anson CHAN responded that a referendum was not the solution to the problem. Universal suffrage did not come by all of a sudden. The Government should be the one to take the lead to explore how universal suffrage should be implemented in accordance with the Basic Law. It should ensure that the models for universal suffrage would reflect the principle of "one person, one vote". In addition, members of the public should have universal and equal right to participate in an election, i.e. to be nominated, to vote and to be voted. For constitutional development to move forward, it was necessary to reach consensus in the community. She hoped that the Green Paper would include specific proposals for universal suffrage for the public to choose and the consultation conducted by the Administration could truly bring about a mainstream proposal for a consensus to be reached.

21. Dr YEUNG Sum said that in her speech, Mrs Anson CHAN was concerned that the consultation on the Green Paper could not achieve the intended purpose. He sought views from Mrs CHAN on how public opinion on the proposed models for universal suffrage could be collected in an objective and fair manner.

22. Mrs CHAN explained that SCA had expressed at a meeting of the Committee on Governance and Political Development of the Commission on Strategic Development (CSD) that the Administration would present three types of options for implementing universal suffrage for the CE and the LegCo in the Green Paper. Her concerns were mainly two-fold. First, how the proposals would be categorised and whether it would be in the public interest to choose a hybrid model which contained elements from different models instead of a specified model. Second, she was uncertain whether the Green Paper would set out the roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage. She further said that the consultation on the Green Paper should be conducted in an open and transparent manner. The Administration had the experience and the knowledge to distinguish a genuine consultation from a sham one. Since the CE had undertaken to consult the public on the issue, he should be given the opportunity to honour his promise.

23. Dr KWOK Ka-ki doubted whether the Administration was sincere about implementing dual universal suffrage. The Administration had initially informed the public that the Green Paper would present three specific models, and not three types of options based on specific issues, for implementing universal suffrage. He sought views from Mrs Anson CHAN on the steps to be taken by the Administration in order to achieve universal suffrage as soon as practicable.

24. Mrs Anson CHAN reiterated that the responsibility and determination to lead the society towards the aim of universal suffrage rested with the Government and no one else. One should not doubt the sincerity of the Administration to implement universal suffrage before the publication of the Green Paper.

Action

25. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan expressed disappointment that Savants Policy Institute Limited had no conclusive views on the timetable for universal suffrage. He pointed out that any delay in implementing universal suffrage would deprive people's right to vote in an election.

26. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung held the view that universal suffrage could not be implemented unless the Basic Law was amended. Unfortunately, the Administration had already set out the condition that any proposed model for universal suffrage should not necessitate amendments to the main provisions of the Basic Law. He asked Mrs Anson CHAN how universal suffrage could be implemented under the circumstances.

27. Mrs Anson CHAN said that the question should be answered by the Administration. She pointed out that it was a political reality that any proposal relating to constitutional development required the approval of the CPG. The CPG probably had doubts on the readiness and ability of the people of Hong Kong to choose a CE who could be widely accepted by the community and who could work with the CPG. It was the responsibility of the Government to remove the CPG's doubt and to instil confidence in the CPG that the people of Hong Kong had the wisdom to choose their CE.

28. Mr Albert CHAN said that while he did not agree to Mrs Anson CHAN's proposed model as set out in her submission, he respected her views. Pointing out that the Government had on a number of occasions used consultation as an excuse to hinder the implementation of universal suffrage, he asked why Mrs CHAN had the expectation that the CE and his Government would really address public aspirations this time.

29. Ms Margaret NG asked why Mrs Anson CHAN had the confidence that the Government was able to lead the society towards the aim of universal suffrage, given that the CE was not sure that his proposal could obtain the support from a two-thirds majority of LegCo Members.

30. Mrs Anson CHAN said that universal suffrage was an important milestone for the democratic development of Hong Kong and she had the patience to wait for its attainment. The road to universal suffrage could only be led by the CE himself and he would have made great contributions to the people of Hong Kong if a consensus could be reached on the issue. While she did not have the full confidence in the CE or place high hope on the CSD, she would like to give the CE the benefit of doubt before the publication of the Green Paper.

Response of the Administration

31. SCA thanked the views of the deputations and individuals. He explained the position of the Administration on universal suffrage as follows -

Action

- (a) the third term CE and his Government was more determined than previous terms of Government to take forward universal suffrage. During election, the CE had already pledged to make the best endeavour to resolve the issue of universal suffrage within his next term of office;
- (b) the Administration had actively explored the models, roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage through discussions held by the CSD since November 2005. Apart from this, the Administration was aware of the importance of participation from the community. The CE had already indicated that the models for universal suffrage that might be proposed by the Government should receive support from not less than 60% of the public;
- (c) there remained divergent views on the future of FCs. In October 2005, the Administration introduced a package of proposals for amending the electoral methods for the 2007 CE election and the 2008 LegCo election (the 2007/2008 electoral package). The 2007/2008 electoral package would have broadened the electoral base of FCs and enhanced the democratic elements in the two electoral methods through including DC members in the Election Committee and increasing the number of DC FC seats in the LegCo. Although the 2007/2008 electoral package had received the support from 60% of the public, it was not endorsed by a two-thirds majority of all LegCo Members as required by the Basic Law;
- (d) the Administration had received proposals to reduce the number of FC seats and to replace corporate voting by individual voting in order to implement universal suffrage. Mrs Anson Chan and Her Core Group, for example, had proposed to consolidate 30 FCs into 10 large FCs. The concept was technically not viable because the relevant FCs might not be willing to merge with each other. On the proposal to replace corporate voting with individual voting, it was not easy to reach an agreement with the large number of the EC electorates on the voting system of FC;
- (e) the Administration had not formed any view on which universal suffrage models would be adopted at this stage. The Administration would include all the proposals received, including the one submitted by the 22 pan-democratic Members, in the Green Paper. The Green Paper would cover options on the models, roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage. The purpose of categorising the proposals received and presenting them as three types of options in the Green Paper was to ensure a broad coverage of the proposals received and to facilitate public discussions in a

Action

focused manner. It was hoped that a mainstream view would emerge to facilitate the Administration to finalise a package of proposals. The Administration would not reject any proposal by means of categorisation, unless the proposals concerned were inconsistent with the Basic Law;

- (f) on the issue of universal suffrage and its relationship with the International Covenant of Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and Hong Kong, SCA explained that in 1976, a reservation was made not to apply Article 25(b) of the ICCPR to Hong Kong. This reservation continued to apply. The basis for Hong Kong to implement universal suffrage came from the Basic Law, and not the ICCPR;
- (g) as universal suffrage was stipulated in BL 45 and BL 68 as the ultimate aim for selecting the CE and forming the LegCo, the CSD had discussed the principles of universal and equal suffrage since November 2005. Over the past 18 months, discussions were held on the details of the two electoral methods such as the composition of a NC, nomination threshold, composition of LegCo, etc. Through these discussions, differences in opinion were narrowed and hopefully, there stood a better chance to reach consensus; and
- (h) politics was about the art of compromise. It was a reality that any model for universal suffrage would require the support of a two-thirds majority of LegCo Members. Take the abolition of FCs for example, it would require at least the support from 10 FC Members if such proposal was to be passed in LegCo. For the sake of constitutional development in Hong Kong, Members should refrain from being too self-centred and should be accommodating.

32. In response to the views of deputations and individuals, SCA made the following points -

- (a) some deputations and individuals had proposed to conduct a referendum on models for universal suffrage. The Basic Law had not provided a mechanism for referendum. According to the Basic Law, any change to the electoral methods for the CE and LegCo elections would require the support from a two-thirds majority of all LegCo Members, the consent of CE and the CPG. The Administration also attached importance to public opinion and would monitor closely the opinion polls conducted by universities and think tanks etc;
- (b) some deputations and individuals had questioned the need for a NC. One had to bear in mind that the Basic Law, which stipulated

Action

the election of the CE by universal suffrage upon nomination by a NC, was promulgated after in-depth and wide discussions. A person who could pass the three steps required in BL 45 (as set out in paragraph 6 above) would have the constitutional status to serve the people of Hong Kong;

- (c) the comment of Mr LAM Tse-kin of 關心香港前途小組 that the 2007/2008 electoral package was poison in disguise was unfounded. The electoral package had received the support of around 60% of the public. SCA said that in a visit to a DC a year before, a pan-democratic DC member suggested the Administration to re-introduce the proposal of expanding the LegCo membership by increasing the number of DC FC seats; and
- (d) the view of the Savantas Policy Institute that favourable conditions should be created to groom political talents was in line with that of the Administration. The Administration intended to create within the Government a small number of positions dedicated to political affairs under the further development of the political appointment system, so as to tie in with the constitutional development of Hong Kong. SCA envisaged that by the time a CE was elected by universal suffrage, the constitutional system in Hong Kong would become mature and by then the CE could form his own political team to promote his policy agenda and to assist in electioneering activities. SCA urged Members to work together with the Administration to bring forward constitutional development, with a view to providing more opportunities for young people to participate in political affairs.

33. The Chairman thanked the deputations for their views.

V. Role of the Commission on Strategic Development

LC Paper No. CB(2)1874/06-07(02) - Administration's paper on "Role of the Commission on Strategic Development")

34. The Chairman said that at the last meeting, arising from the Administration's proposal to extend one supernumerary post of Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (D2) as Assistant Secretary to the CSD for two years with effect from 2 July 2007 which had been considered by the Panel on Public Service, members had proposed to discuss the role of CSD and the justifications for its continued operation at this meeting.

35. Professor LAU Siu-kai, Head of the Central Policy Unit (HCPU), briefed members on the role of the CSD as set out in the paper.

Action

36. Ms Emily LAU said that it was acceptable to her if the CSD was merely playing the role of an advisory body. However, the CSD was positioned as the main platform to discuss important policy issues. In her view, the LegCo was the only appropriate platform to discuss issues as important as constitutional development. She said that recently, representatives of the Central Authorities had met with influential Hong Kong businessmen in Shenzhen and sought their views on constitutional development. Many of these participants were CSD members. The Frontier had staged a protest against the black box operation and urged the CSD to cease its operation. She pointed out that meetings of the CSD were held behind closed door, CSD members were confined mainly to the business sector and the rich, the views of CSD did not represent the general interests of the people, and the work of CSD did not have any credibility or public acceptance. In the circumstances, she had reservations on the proposals to be presented in the Green Paper which were based on the discussions of the CSD.

37. HCPU said that in an effort to demonstrate the commitment of the Government to promote democratic development in Hong Kong, the Administration announced in November 2005 that irrespective of whether the 2007/2008 electoral package was supported by the LegCo, it would continue pursuing the subject by entrusting the CSD to study how universal suffrage could be implemented. The role of the CSD was to provide a platform for discussion on the models, roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage. Members of the CSD were drawn from a wide spectrum of community leaders and experts, including professionals, academics, businessmen, politicians and prominent labour and media personalities. The CSD also organised workshops to receive views from non-CSD members. As an advisory body, the CSD would not propose any political reform package or draw any conclusion from the views received. Through the CSD, the Government collected views from different sectors of the community. Based on these views and other considerations, the Administration would prepare the Green Paper.

38. Ms Margaret NG expressed disappointment that the paper provided by the CSD did not provide justifications for its continued operation. She pointed out that as compared with the CSD, the LegCo provided a more formal platform for discussing constitutional issues. The LegCo also collected views from different sectors of the society, and the spectrum it covered could only be wider than that of the CSD. The LegCo as an entity would not propose package for political reform, although individual Member or political party and group could do so. Ms NG further said that there were hundreds of advisory bodies which collected information on behalf of the Government. She said that the paper provided by the CSD indicated that the CSD did not have the value to exist as an independent body. There was nothing worth discussing by the Panel.

39. HCPU said that the CSD had been established since 1998. Last year, the CSD had substantially expanded its membership by recruiting talents from

Action

different fields, in view of the need to study long-term development issues of strategic importance to Hong Kong. The operation of the CSD reflected a change in the mindset of the Government in the policy making process. The Government, before formulating policy proposals, would canvass views from the community and the LegCo so as to help the Government ascertain the broad policy direction and the policy that would be acceptable to the public at large. Although there were hundreds of advisory bodies, the role of CSD was unique. The CSD looked at issues in a macroscopic manner. It provided a platform to stimulate discussions on strategic issues pertaining to Hong Kong's long-term development. It was able to gauge a wide range of community views, thereby laying the foundation for formulating specific policies. The more views being collected on strategic issues, the more reference could be made by the Administration. In this connection, the CE had regarded the CSD as the most important advisory body on long-term development issues of strategic importance to Hong Kong. HCPU further said that the operation of the CSD was highly transparent. All the documents issued for discussion, the outcome of the discussions, submissions by CSD members and to the CSD were all available on its website.

40. Mr LEUNG Yiu-chung questioned the appropriateness of entrusting the CSD with the role of a standing advisory body to deal with issues relating to political reform. He said that the Administration had on various occasions refused to state its position on certain issues on the ground that it was in the process of collecting public views through advisory bodies such as the CSD. Such excuse had prevented discussions of these issues in a focused and in-depth manner. In his view, entrusting the CSD with the function to study how certain issues should be implemented was sidelining the functions of the LegCo, was a duplication of effort, and was impeding the pace of discussion.

41. HCPU responded that the CSD had an important role to play. Depending on the evolution of Hong Kong's political development, the role and functions of the CSD would be reviewed. He said that members of the CSD came from different backgrounds who could offer a wide spectrum of views on issues relating to the economical, social and political development of Hong Kong. The views collected would facilitate the Government to formulate the broad policy direction. HCPU further said that the aim of the CSD was to stimulate, rather than impeding, discussions on strategic issues. The CE in the past had mentioned that government officials, through participation in activities organised by the CSD, should look at policy issues from a longer term perspective. To this end, relevant government officials were invited to sit at meetings of the CSD to broaden their perspective and thinking. The relevant documents and outcome of discussions by the CSD were passed to the relevant Government bureaux and departments for reference.

42. Mr TAM Yiu-chung said that having explored the issue of universal suffrage for more than a year, the CSD had performed its functions. He said that

Action

the CSD had provided a proper platform for people with professional background and expertise to give views to the Government and thereby enabled the Government to formulate policies in an in-depth manner. He did not think that the CSD could jeopardise the status of the LegCo, as the LegCo had a constitutional role which the CSD could not replace. In addition, the membership of the CSD included representatives of political parties/groups and LegCo Members who had taken a keen interest in the discussions held by the CSD. The Democratic Alliance for the Betterment and Progress of Hong Kong supported the operation of the CSD and its request to extend the supernumerary post of a D2 staff.

43. In response to members, HCPU explained the role of the CSD in enhancing the relationship between the executive and the legislature. The Administration had made use of the CSD to collect views from the public prior to policy formulation to make sure that the proposals put forth to the LegCo would be acceptable. This was a way to show its respect to the LegCo.

44. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 5:55 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
20 December 2007

**Panel on Constitutional Affairs
Meeting on 21 May 2007**

**Summary of deputations' views on
Models, roadmap and timetable for selecting the Chief Executive and for
forming the Legislative Council by universal suffrage**

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
1	Savantas Policy Institute [CB(2)2063/ 06-07(01)]	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Institute supports the selection of the Chief Executive (CE) and formation of the Legislative Council (LegCo) (dual elections) by universal suffrage, which should be pursued within the context of "one country, two systems". ● The Institute has no conclusive views on the models, roadmap and timetable for dual elections by universal suffrage. It will give its views on constitutional reform after studying the green paper on constitutional development (the Green Paper) to be published by the Administration in mid-2007. 		<p><i>Constitutional development</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● To transform the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region (HKSAR) into a functional and high quality democratic polity, favourable conditions including development of political parties, measures to groom political talents, improved relationship between the executive and the legislature, etc. should be created.
2	Kowloon Federation of Associations [CB(2)1873/ 06-07(01)]	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The selection of the CE by universal suffrage should precede the formation of the LegCo by universal suffrage. ● The roadmap for universal suffrage should be drawn up first. Proposals on the timetable could then follow the direction of the planned roadmap. 	<p><i>Composition</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The number of LegCo seats should maintain at 60. 	
		<p><i>Nominating committee (NC) and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Election Committee (EC) should 		

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p>become the NC. Membership of the NC should be expanded from 800 to 1600.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The nomination threshold should be not less than 100 subscribers. Nominations so secured should include at least 10 nominations from each of the four sectors within the NC. In addition, it should include nominations from at least five LegCo Members and five Hong Kong deputies to the National People's Congress. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Eligible voters should elect the CE on a "one person, one vote" basis. ● The winning candidate should secure at least 50% of the valid votes cast; otherwise, another round of voting should be conducted. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies (FCs)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● FCs should be reorganised into a total of 10 large FCs. ● Individual voting should replace corporate voting. ● The proportional representation system should be adopted for FC elections. 	
3	Mr LAW Kwong-keung	<p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012 and 2017</u> : The EC should become the NC, comprising 800 members from the existing four sectors of the EC and 400 elected District Council (DC) members. ● <u>2012 and 2017</u> : The nomination threshold should be not less than 200 subscribers. 	<p><i>Composition</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The number of LegCo seats should maintain at 60. ● <u>2012</u> : geographical constituency (GC) - 30 Members; FC - 25 Members; DC - 5 Members to be elected from among members of the 18 DCs on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<p><i>DC elections</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The number of appointed seats should be cut by half. ● <u>2016</u> : Appointed seats should be abolished.

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The CE would be elected by the NC. The winning candidate should secure at least 50% of the valid votes cast; otherwise, another round of voting should be conducted. ● <u>2017</u> : The CE would be elected on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2016</u> : GC - 30 Members; FC - 12 Members; DC - 18 Members. ● <u>2020</u> : GC - 42 Members; DC - 18 Members. All FC seats to be abolished. 	
4	Miss Amy YUNG Wing-sheung [CB(2)1873/06-07(02)]	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented in 2012. <p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The EC should become the NC with a membership of 1,200, comprising 400 elected DC members and the 800 members from the existing four sectors of the EC. The electorate base of the four sectors should be widened. ● The existing nomination threshold of 12.5% should be lowered so as to encourage participation by potential candidates from different strata of the community and give more choices to voters. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2008</u> : The electorate base should be widened and corporate voting should be abolished. ● <u>2012</u> : Abolition of FCs in one go. 	<p><i>DC elections</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2011</u> : Appointed and ex-officio membership should be abolished.

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
5	Mr LAI Chi-lap [CB(2)1873/ 06-07(03)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented as soon as possible. 	<p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● FCs should be abolished. 	<p>DC elections</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Appointed membership should be abolished.
6	Dr WONG Kam-din [CB(2)1873/ 06-07(04)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Before determining on the roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage, consensus should be reached on the model for selecting CE and forming LegCo by universal suffrage. ● The models for the two electoral methods may differ to allow for flexibility. 	<p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The existing FCs should be retained but from 2012, company votes and corporate votes should be replaced by director's individual votes and executive's individual votes. Those entitled to the individual votes of FCs may choose to vote in either the FC or GC elections, but not both. ● There should be a regular review of the FC's formation, functions and performance of its Members. 	
		<p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A broadly representative NC should be established in 2012 with active participation from the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference so as to ensure that the CE-elect would be accepted by the Central Authorities. ● The nomination threshold should be set at a high level (i.e. above the current 12.5% of EC membership). ● The eligibility criteria for a candidate should be stringent rather than loose. 		

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 2012 is not the right time to select the CE by universal suffrage, i.e. direct election on the basis of "one person, one vote". ● The timetable for universal suffrage would depend on the situation after the NC and democratic procedures have been established. 		
7	Neighbour- hood and Workers' Service Centre	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented as soon as possible. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● FCs should be abolished. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Every eligible voter should have the right to vote by way of a "single seat, single vote" system, or a proportional representation system, or a mixture of the above two systems. 	<p><i>DC elections</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Appointed and ex-officio membership should be abolished. <p><i>Constitutional development</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Commission on Strategic Development (CSD) lacks representativeness to deal with issues relating to constitutional development. The Administration should collect views from different sectors of the community with a view to formulating a blueprint for constitutional development. Public acceptance of the blueprint should ultimately be determined by a referendum.

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
8	Student Union of Chu Hai College of Higher Education [CB(2)1873/ 06-07(05)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented in 2012. <p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The existing CE election is a "small circle" election. Most of the students in Hong Kong do not have any opportunity to participate and to vote in a CE election. The Student Union proposes to abolish the NC. ● Those who secure nominations from 30 000 eligible electors will become CE candidates. Residents of Hong Kong will cast their votes to return a CE by universal suffrage. 	<p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2008</u> : The electorate base of FCs should be broadened. Some people, such as students and housewives, do not have the right to vote in a FC election. <p>Electoral method</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The LegCo should be formed by universal suffrage in order to plug the loopholes of the bicameral voting system and to address people's request. 	<p>Constitutional development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The pace of constitutional development in HKSAR lacks progress.
9	Power for Democracy (PD) [CB(2)2063/ 06-07(02)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented in 2012. <p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● PD proposes to abolish the NC. All eligible voters should have the right to nominate candidates for the CE election. <p>Electoral method</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The CE should be elected on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● FCs should be abolished. <p>Electoral method</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Every eligible voter should have the right to vote by way of "single seat, single vote" system, or a proportional representation system, or a mixture of the above two systems. 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
10	Civic Party [CB(2)2063/ 06-07(03)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented in 2012. <p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Before the NC is abolished by amending the Basic Law, the NC should comprise 800 members from the four sectors of the existing EC, and 400 elected DC members, to enhance its representativeness. ● The nomination threshold should be reduced to 4% of NC membership (i.e. 50). <p>Electoral method</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The CE should be elected on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● FCs should be abolished as soon as possible. <p>Electoral method</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Every eligible voter is allowed to cast two votes. A mixed electoral method would be adopted. ● 50% of all seats returned by a "one person, one vote" system on district basis; and the candidate with a simple majority of votes wins in an election. ● The remaining 50% of seats will be returned by a proportional representation system on a territory-wide basis. 	
11	The Frontier [CB(2)2063/ 06-07(04)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 2008 and 2012 should be set as the target dates for forming LegCo and selecting the CE by universal suffrage respectively. ● The Frontier supports the proposal on universal suffrage submitted by the 21 pan-democratic LegCo Members in March 2007 [attached to the Annex of CB(2)1858/06-07(01)]. 	<p>Constitutional development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Frontier objects entrusting the CSD to deal with issues relating to constitutional development, given its limited representativeness. ● So far, public consultation on 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Frontier proposes to abolish the NC by amending the Basic Law. ● Before the Basic Law can be amended, the "broadly representative" NC should be formed by election on the basis of "one person, one vote". ● The nomination threshold should not be too high; otherwise, it would discourage participation from potential candidates holding views dissenting from those of the Central Authorities. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● FCs should be abolished as soon as possible. ● If FCs could not be abolished at this juncture, corporate voting should be replaced by individual voting and the electorate base for FCs should be widened. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Hong Kong people to elect all LegCo Members on the basis of "one person, one vote" by adopting a "single seat, single vote" system or proportional representation system. 	<p>constitutional development had been inadequate and deceitful; the Frontier doubts whether the upcoming green paper on constitutional development would serve any meaningful purpose.</p>
12	<p>Islands District Council (IsDC), represented by Ms LEE Kwai-chun</p> <p>[CB(2)1873/06-07(07)]</p>	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The majority of IsDC members support the principles of "orderly and gradual progress" and compliance with the Basic Law in achieving dual elections by universal suffrage. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The FC system reflects the principles of balanced participation. ● <u>2008</u> : The number of seats returned by the DC FC should be increased and its members to be elected from among DC members. 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
13	Civil Human Rights Front [CB(2)2063/ 06-07(05)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● 2008 and 2012 should be set as the target dates for forming the LegCo and selecting the CE by universal suffrage respectively. 		
		<p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The EC should be abolished as soon as possible. <p>Electoral arrangement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● To reinforce the accountability of the CE, he should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<p>Electoral method</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● All seats should be returned by direct elections on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	
14	Democratic Party (DP) [CB(2)1873/ 06-07(08)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● DP supports the proposal on universal suffrage submitted by the 21 pan-democratic LegCo Members in March 2007 [attached to the Annex of CB(2)1858/06-07(01)]. ● The proposal should be included as one of the three mainstream proposals for public consultation in the Green Paper. 		
		<p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Before the Basic Law amendment on abolishing the NC can be made, the NC should be formed by 1 200 members, comprising 800 EC members and 400 elected DC members. 	<p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● FCs should be abolished as soon as possible. <p>Electoral method</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Every eligible voter is allowed to cast 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The nomination threshold should be reduced to about 4% of the NC membership (i.e. 50 out of 1 200 members from any sector). <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The CE should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<p>two votes. A mixed electoral method would be adopted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 50% of all seats returned by a "one person, one vote" system on district basis; and the candidate with a simple majority of votes wins in an election. The remaining 50% of seats will be returned by a proportional representation system on a territory-wide basis. 	
15	<p>關心香港前途小組</p> <p>[CB(2)2063/06-07(06)]</p>	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented in 2012. Support the proposal on universal suffrage submitted by the 21 pan-democratic LegCo Members in March 2007 [attached to the Annex of CB(2)1858/06-07(01)]. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> FCs should be abolished as soon as possible. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Every eligible voter is allowed to cast two votes. A mixed electoral method would be adopted. 50% of all seats returned by a "one person, one vote" system on district 	<p><i>Constitutional development</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Criticise the Government for stalling the implementation of universal suffrage by imposing a high nomination threshold and using excuses such as "the lack of a broad consensus" and "the need to preserve the stability of HKSAR".
		<p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Before the Basic Law amendment on abolishing the NC can be made, the NC should be formed by 1 200 members, comprising 800 EC members and 400 elected DC members. The nomination threshold should be reduced to about 4% of the NC membership (i.e. 50 out of 1 200 members from any sector). 		

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <p>The CE should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis.</p>	<p>basis; and the candidate with a simple majority of votes wins in an election.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The remaining 50% of seats will be returned by a proportional representation system on a territory-wide basis. 	
16	<p>Chinese Manufacturers' Association of Hong Kong</p> <p>[CB(2)1910/06-07(01)]</p>	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The selection of the CE by universal suffrage should precede the formation of the LegCo by universal suffrage. <p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The composition of NC should be modelled on that of the existing EC. Membership of 800 should remain unchanged. Members of the NC should select, by election on a "one person, one vote" basis, not more than three candidates from those who have obtained nominations from 100 subscribers or more. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The electoral method should be modelled on that adopted by the EC, to ensure smooth transition from the old to the new election system. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The FC system allows balanced participation and has contributed to the smooth implementation of government policies and initiatives. Unless favourable conditions exist in the HKSAR for changes to be made to the system of FCs, the Association does not recommend any changes that would upset the operation of the system. 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The method for selecting the CE should be based on "one person, one vote". Among the CE candidates (maximum of three), the one who obtains the highest number of valid votes cast would then be returned as the CE-elect, to be considered for appointment by CPG. 		
17	New Century Forum (NCF) [CB(2)2063/06-07(07)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> NCF suggests that the models for dual elections by universal suffrage should be in line with the principles of balanced participation and "orderly and gradual progress". The proposals should have due regard to the Central Authorities' role in the constitutional development of Hong Kong, and should contain democratic element with a view to providing opportunity to groom political talents and improving governance. Members of the Executive Council, LegCo and NC should be Hong Kong permanent residents of Chinese nationality. 	<p>Composition</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>2008</u> : A total of 70 Members. GC - 35 Members; FCs - 35 Members, all the five new FC seats are added to the DC FC. <u>2012</u> : A total of 80 Members. GC - 40 Members; FC - 40 Members, all the five new FC seats are added to the DC FC. The bicameral voting arrangement should be abolished. <u>2016</u> : A total of 80 Members to be 	
		<p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>2012</u> : The nomination mechanism should be modest to allow three to four candidates to run in the election. The EC should become the NC. The electoral method, composition and number of sectors of the NC should be the same as that of the existing EC. Candidates must secure nominations from not less than 160 members of the EC. 		

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p>They have to obtain not less than 20% (i.e. 40) and not more than 25% (i.e. 50) nominations from each of the four sectors.</p> <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The CE should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. The winning candidate should secure at least 50% of the votes cast; otherwise, another round of voting should be conducted. ● If there is only one candidate, a vote of confidence will be conducted. If he cannot secure more than half of the valid votes, it is necessary to re-activate the nomination procedure until a candidate is able to get more than half of the valid votes. 	<p>returned by direct election through GCs.</p> <p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The FC system should be gradually abolished within eight years. 	
18	Hong Kong Christian Institute	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented as soon as possible. <p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The NC, if to be formed at all, should compose of elected members from LegCo and DCs. ● The nomination threshold should not impose unnecessary restrictions. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The FC system is inconsistent with the principle of balanced participation. 	<p><i>Constitutional development</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Institute urges the Government to actively consult the public on the Green Paper, as progress would not be made on constitutional development if the public did not support the proposals therein.

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The CE should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. 		
19	<p>League of Social Democrats (LSD)</p> <p>[CB(2)1873/06-07(09)]</p>	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dual elections by universal suffrage should be implemented as soon as possible. <p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing EC should be abolished. LSD does not support the formation of a NC. Any eligible resident, who can secure a specified number of nominations, say 50,000, from eligible electors is qualified for CE candidacy. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The CE should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. The winning candidate should secure at least 50% of the votes cast; otherwise, another round of voting between two candidates with the highest number of votes in the first round should be conducted. 	<p><i>Composition</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A total of 70 Members. <p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The FC system should be abolished. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> All Members to be returned by direct election through a "single seat, single vote" system, or a proportional representation system, or a mixed electoral system. If a mixed system is adopted, half of the seats will be returned by a "single seat, single vote" system, under which the whole of Hong Kong would be divided into 35 small GCs, and the other half allocated in proportion to the population of five large GCs and its Members to be returned by a proportional representation system. 	<p><i>DC elections</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Appointed membership should be abolished.

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
20	<p>Hong Kong Civic Association</p> <p>[CB(2)1910/06-07(02)] and Annex to CB(2)1858/06-07(01)]</p>	<p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The NC should consist of 800 members. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : If a consensus cannot be reached to return a CE by universal suffrage, the 800-member NC will elect a CE on the basis of "one person, one vote". ● <u>2017</u> : The 800-member NC will nominate a list of candidates. A CE will be elected by eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<p><i>Composition</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The introduction of a bicameral system. A total number of 70 Members. GCs - 35 Members, five seats added to each of the five GCs; FCs - 35 Members, all five new FC seats added to the DC FC. <p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2008</u> - Corporate voting should be redefined to encompass all members of the Boards of Directors, Executive and/or Management Committees of those companies. ● <u>2012</u> : FCs with a small electorate base should merge with compatible FCs to form a larger electorate base. The number of FCs should not exceed 15. The FCs would set up a representative nominating committee (with membership not exceeding 100) to compile a list of candidates for election. ● <u>2016</u> : A review should be conducted to see whether FCs should be retained, replaced or gradually abolished. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : Each voter will have two votes, 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
			<p>one vote for a representative in his GC and the other vote for another representative in his FC.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2016</u> : If consensus could not be reached on forming of LegCo by universal suffrage, favourable environment should be created to prepare for implementing universal suffrage in 2020. 	
21	<p>Anson Chan and Her Core Group</p> <p>[Annex to CB(2)1858/06-07(01)]</p>	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Group proposes 2012 as the target date for selecting the CE and forming the LegCo by universal suffrage. ● If it is decided that universal suffrage would not be introduced into the LegCo election in 2012, then an assurance should be given to the people of Hong Kong that universal suffrage will be achieved no later than the 2016. 	<p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2008</u> : To broaden the electoral base, corporate voting should be redefined to encompass all members of the Boards of Directors, Executive and/or Management Committees of those companies, associations and organisations which currently exercise a single corporate vote. The existing FCs should be organized into 10 groups in order to strengthen the mandate and representativeness of those elected. 	<p>Constitutional development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The Green Paper should include specific proposals on the roadmap and timetable for universal suffrage. It is not in the public interest to ask the people of Hong Kong to choose one out of three categories of models.
		<p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The NC must not be used as a mechanism for collective screening and possible exclusion of prospective candidates. ● If the option of converting the present EC into the NC is to be selected, then it will be necessary to take steps to add more sub-sectors and to broaden their electorate base for the purpose of enhancing representativeness. 		

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The nomination threshold is proposed to be 10% of the NC membership. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>2012</u> : If universal suffrage is not introduced in 2012, the 10 electoral groups should be further combined to form no more than three large groups for voting purpose, and that the number of FC seats be reduced by 50% to 15. The balance of 15 FC seats would be replaced by GC seats to pave way for the complete phasing out of FCs in 2016. 	
Written submissions only for Items A to E				
A.	Hong Kong Federation of Fujian Associations [CB(2)1873/06-07(06)]	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> It would not be necessary to set a timetable for dual elections by universal suffrage. Any model which involves amendment to the Basic Law should not be considered. The electoral system in Hong Kong should facilitate participation of patriots in politics. The priorities of the HKSAR at this juncture is to strengthen Hong Kong's economy and its partnership with the Mainland. By achieving the above, it will create stability and a solid foundation for the pursuit of universal suffrage. 		
		<p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing composition of the EC fulfills the "broadly representative" criterion required in the Basic Law and comply with the principle of balanced participation. The delineation of sectors should be 		

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments										
		<p>updated from time to time within the parameters of the Basic Law, to reflect the development of subsectors and emergence of new subsectors.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The composition of the NC and the nomination method should be consistent with the Basic Law. The majority of its members should be patriots. This would facilitate their acceptance by the Central Authorities. 												
B.	<p>Mr LEUNG Siu-tong, [CB(2)1873/ 06-07(10)]</p>	<p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>2012</u> : The EC would elect candidates to the CE election. Some new subsectors should be added to the EC. The membership of the EC should be expanded from 800 to 1 800 as follows - <table data-bbox="418 1002 1012 1390"> <thead> <tr> <th style="text-align: left;"><u>Sector</u></th> <th style="text-align: right;"><u>No. of members</u></th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Industrial, commercial, financial and professional</td> <td style="text-align: right;">600</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Labour, social services, religious and others</td> <td style="text-align: right;">600</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Members of LegCo, representatives of district-based organisations, Hong Kong deputies to NPC, and representatives of Hong Kong members of the National Committee of CPPCC</td> <td style="text-align: right;">600</td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td style="text-align: right; border-top: 1px solid black;">1800</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	<u>Sector</u>	<u>No. of members</u>	Industrial, commercial, financial and professional	600	Labour, social services, religious and others	600	Members of LegCo, representatives of district-based organisations, Hong Kong deputies to NPC, and representatives of Hong Kong members of the National Committee of CPPCC	600		1800	<p><i>Composition</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>2012</u> : A total of 72 Members. GCs - 36 Members; FCs - 36 Members. Some new FCs should be created. <u>2016</u> : A total of 72 Members. GCs- 54 Members; FCs - 18 Members. 	
<u>Sector</u>	<u>No. of members</u>													
Industrial, commercial, financial and professional	600													
Labour, social services, religious and others	600													
Members of LegCo, representatives of district-based organisations, Hong Kong deputies to NPC, and representatives of Hong Kong members of the National Committee of CPPCC	600													
	1800													

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The nomination threshold should be set at 20% of the EC membership (i.e. 360). If a candidate could not meet the nomination threshold, he must secure nominations from at least 10% (i.e. 180) of the members from each of the proposed three sectors of the EC. ● <u>2017</u> : Same as those proposed for 2012, subject to further review as necessary. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The CE should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. If there is only one candidate, consideration should be given to requiring him to obtain 40% of the votes cast to get elected. ● <u>2017</u> : Same as those proposed for 2012, subject to further review as necessary. 		
C.	Chinese General Chamber of Commerce [CB(2)1873/06-07(11)]	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Any model which involves amendment to the Basic Law should not be considered. 		
		<p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Existing arrangements of the EC fulfills the "broadly representative" criterion set out in the Basic Law and the principle of balanced 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The existing FC system enables balanced participation. 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p>participation. Representatives from its four sectors are able to meet the interests of the various subsectors of HKSAR.</p>		
D.	<p>Asia-Pacific Institute of International Relations</p> <p>[CB(2)1873/06-07(12)]</p>	<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The models for selecting the CE and forming the LegCo by universal suffrage should be simple and maintain the status quo where possible. ● There should be a roadmap before consideration of the timetable for universal suffrage. <p>NC and its nomination procedure</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The NC should be formed by the 800 members of the EC. The nomination threshold should be maintained at the existing level of 12.5% of the NC membership (i.e. 100). ● <u>2017</u> : The NC should be expanded to 1600 members (by adding 800 members elected from the eight GCs on a "one person, one vote" basis). The nomination threshold should be maintained at 12.5% of the NC membership (i.e. 200). ● <u>2022</u> : All 1600 members of the NC should be elected from the eight GCs on a "one person, one vote" basis. The nomination threshold should be maintained at 12.5% of NC membership (i.e. 200). 	<p>Geographical constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012</u> : The number of GCs should be increased from five to eight and 40 seats should be returned using the proportional representation system. ● <u>2016</u> : 50 seats to be returned by the eight GCs. ● <u>2020</u> : 60 seats to be returned by the eight GCs. <p>Functional constituencies</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Seats returned by FCs should be abolished in three stages - <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u>2012</u> - reduce 10 FC seats by merging professional-related FCs; 	

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012, 2017 and 2022</u> : The CE should be elected by all eligible voters on a "one person, one vote" basis. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u>2016</u> - reduce 10 more FC seats by merging FCs which are related in broad term; and - <u>2020</u> : abolish all FCs. <p><i>Electoral method</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <u>2012, 2016 and 2020</u> : A proportional representation system to be adopted throughout. 	
E.	<p>Liberal Party</p> <p>[CB(2)1873/ 06-07(13)]</p>	<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The selection of the CE by universal suffrage should precede the formation of the LegCo by universal suffrage, given the divergent views on the future of FCs. ● If the relevant conditions have ripened, the election of the CE by universal suffrage could be implemented in 2012. 	<p><i>Functional constituencies</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● In the event that CE election by universal suffrage can be implemented in 2012, LegCo should work towards implementing universal suffrage in 2016 at the earliest. A consensus should be reached within the community on the pace of implementing universal suffrage. ● FCs can be phased out in stages. The number of FC seats can be reduced from 	
		<p><i>NC and its nomination procedure</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The existing EC may be converted into a NC. Its members could be increased from 800 to 1200-1600 while maintaining the ratio of the current four sectors of the EC. ● A high nomination threshold should be set for the initial CE selection exercise. The threshold can be gradually lowered in subsequent exercises, depending on the actual situation of Hong Kong. 		

I T E M	Deputation/ Individual [LC Paper No.]	Proposal for electing the Chief Executive	Proposal for forming the Legislative Council	Other comments
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● A candidate needs to secure nominations from members across all four sectors of the NC, in accordance with the principle of balanced participation. 	<p>30 to 20 in the first phase, and further reduced to 10 in the second phase, and finally all the seats will be returned by universal suffrage in 2024.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Since traditional FCs which have expertise in economic polices such as the commercial and industrial and professional FCs need more time to adapt to such a change, it is proposed that they can be abolished in the last phase. ● During the transitional period, the electorate base of FCs can be expanded, e.g. corporate voting should be modified to include votes from directors and senior executives. 	