# 立法會
# *Legislative Council*

LC Paper No. CB(2)687/07-08
(These minutes have been seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/06

**Panel on Home Affairs**

**Subcommittee on Heritage Conservation**

**Minutes of meeting**
**held on Wednesday, 11 July 2007, at 8:30 am**
**in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| **Members present** | : | Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP (Chairman)<br>Hon James TO Kun-sun<br>Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP<br>Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP<br>Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP<br>Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP<br>Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung<br>Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP<br>Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP<br>Hon TAM Heung-man |
| **Members attending** | : | Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP<br>Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, JP<br>Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP<br>Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP<br>Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP |
| **Member absent** | : | Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP |
| **Public Officers attending** | : | Development Bureau<br><br>Mrs Carrie LAM, JP<br>Secretary for Development |

Action

Ms Olivia NIP, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)2

Food and Health Bureau

Miss Wendy AU
Principal Assistant Secretary for Food and Health (Food)2 (Acting)

Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr YEUNG Shun-kui
Assistant Director (Operations)2

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Dr Louis NG
Assistant Director (Heritage and Museums)

Transport Department

Mr Andy YAU
Chief Engineer/Traffic Engineering (HK)

Urban Renewal Authority

Mr Billy LAM, SBS, JP
Managing Director

Mr Michael MA
Director (Planning and Design)

**Clerk in attendance** : Ms Joanne MAK
Senior Council Secretary (2)2

**Staff in attendance** : Miss Vivien POON
Council Secretary (2)3

Ms Anna CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Action

**I. Conservation issues relating to Nga Tsin Wai Village, Wan Chai Market, and the market area at Tai Yuen Street and Cross Street**
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)2417/06-07(01)-(03) and CB(2)2473/06-07(01)]

The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

Wan Chai Market and the market area at Tai Yuen Street and Cross Street

2. Members noted that a written submission made by Wan Chai Street Market Concern Group [LC Paper No. CB(2)2473/06-07(01)] was tabled at the meeting.

3. Members emphasised to the Secretary for Development (SDEV) that relocating 86 licensed fixed pitch hawkers at Tai Yuen Street (south) and Cross Street (east) as currently proposed by the Administration would greatly affect the attractiveness of the open-air bazaar to customers and, therefore, the customer flow, which was tantamount to wiping the bazaar out of existence. Members reminded the Administration that once a bazaar became no longer popular, it would take a long time and require lots of efforts to be made to revitalise it. As regards the justifications put forward by the Transport Department, members in general considered that there should be other feasible options of traffic arrangements which would not require the relocation of the fixed hawker pitches at Tai Yuen Street (South) and Cross Street (East).

4. Members also urged the Administration to take note of the fact that only very few successful bazaars of similar scale as the one in question were now left in Hong Kong, particularly on the Hong Kong island. Members pointed out that unlike the Wan Chai Market, the preservation of the open-air bazaar would not be hindered by any contractual binding requiring the Administration to clear the area concerned for development. Members requested the Administration to make concerted efforts in striving for the preservation of the entire open-air bazaar.

Admin

5. Some members also called on the Administration to preserve the existing Wan Chai Market for its historical and architectural value by exploring all possible options, e.g. by land exchange with the developer concerned to save the Wan Chai Market from demolition.

6. SDEV said that, while the Administration appreciated the prevailing public sentiments towards heritage sites and sites with local characteristics, a number of such sites were tied to on-going developments. For the Wan Chai Market, due consideration had to be given to the contractual arrangements and commitments of the planned development for Site C of the Wan Chai Road/Tai Yuen Street Project (H9). As regards the open-air bazaar in question, SDEV undertook that, subject to members' views, the newly set up Development

Admin

Action

Bureau would take this matter up with relevant bureaux/departments in exploring the feasibility of preservation of the entire bazaar.

7. After discussion, Dr Fernando CHEUNG moved the following motion -

"That this Subcommittee strongly urges the Administration to treasure bazaar culture and retain the Bazaar on Tai Yuen Street and Cross Street in Wan Chai, as well as to preserve Wan Chai Market which has been accorded a Grade III historical building status, by making every endeavour to renegotiate with the developer in order to achieve the objective of in-situ preservation."

The Chairman put the motion to vote. The motion was supported by all members present. Hon Audrey EU and Hon CHAN Yuen-han, who were non-Subcommittee members, also expressed support for the motion. The Chairman declared that the motion was carried.

## II. Any other business

Date of next meeting

8. Due to shortage of time, members agreed to defer the discussion on the conservation of Nga Tsin Wai Village to the next meeting scheduled for 18 July 2007 at 8:30 am.

9. Members also agreed to schedule a meeting for 26 July 2007 at 4:30 pm to receive views from the public on the relocation of licensed hawkers at Tai Yuen Street (South) and Cross Street (East).

10. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 10:28 am.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
24 December 2007

**Annex**

# Proceedings of the meeting of the Subcommittee on Heritage Conservation on Wednesday, 11 July 2007, at 8:30 am in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject | Action required |
|---|---|---|---|
| 000000 - 000444 | Chairman<br>Prof Patrick LAU | Proposed arrangements for the Subcommittee to hold a joint meeting with the Panel on Planning, Lands and Works on 24 July 2007 to discuss the implementation details of the preservation of the Queen's Pier. | |
| 000445 - 001300 | Chairman<br>Admin | Briefing by Secretary for Development (SDEV) on the establishment of the Development Bureau (DEVB) and its policy objective of striking a balance between development and heritage conservation. | |
| 001301 - 001754 | Chairman<br>MD/URA | Briefing by the Managing Director (MD) of the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) on the Wan Chai Road/Tai Yuen Street project (Project H9) and the Nga Tsin Wai Village project (Project K1).<br>[LC Paper No. CB(2)2417/06-07(01)] | |
| 001755 - 002317 | Chairman<br>Admin | Briefing by the Food and Health Bureau (FHB) on the relocation of licensed hawkers at Tai Yuen Street (South) and Cross Street (East).<br>[LC Paper No. CB(2)2417/06-07(02)] | |
| 002318 - 003027 | Dr YEUNG Sum<br>Chairman<br>Admin | Dr YEUNG Sum's remarks that -<br><br>(a) Members belonging to different political parties who had handled relevant complaint case had expressed unanimous support for the preservation of the entire open-air bazaar for its local characteristics and importance to the livelihood of the hawkers concerned;<br><br>(b) The viability of the new Wan Chai Market was doubtful as the Audit Commission had repeatedly expressed concern about the high stall vacancy rates of many public markets; | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject | Action required |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | (c) relocating 86 out of the 158 licensed fixed pitch hawkers in the bazaar could ultimately destroy it; and<br><br>(d) the Administration's relocation plan should be reviewed taking into account the prevailing high sentiments for heritage conservation and collective memory, as well as the tourism and economic value of the bazaar.<br><br>SDEV's response that, while the Administration appreciated the prevailing public sentiments towards heritage sites or those with local characteristics, a number of such sites were tied to on-going developments, as in the case of the bazaar. SDEV's agreement that, subject to members' views, DEVB would take this matter up with other relevant bureaux in striving for the preservation of the bazaar.<br><br>The Chairman's recapitulation of discussion at the case conferences on the case of hawkers in Tai Yuen Street and Cross Street objecting to the relocation to the new market. | |
| 003028 - 003800 | Miss TAM Heung-man<br>Chairman<br>Admin | Miss TAM Heung-man's expression of concurrence with Dr YEUNG Sum's view for the full preservation of the bazaar. Her view that the Wan Chai Market should also be preserved given the collective memory associated with it and its heritage value.<br><br>SDEV's response that, given the current position of Project H9, there were inherent difficulties for the Administration to preserve the Wan Chai Market.<br><br>FHB's briefing of the various options available to the affected hawkers of the bazaar. | |
| 003801 - 004846 | Prof Patrick LAU<br>Chairman<br>Admin<br>URA | Professor Patrick LAU's suggestion that the Administration should conduct a review of the planned developments in Wan Chai to see how far heritage conservation was possible within the district, including the possibility of the full preservation of the bazaar in question and of the Wan Chai Market, in collaboration with Wan Chai District Council (WCDC). | **Admin to explore options to preserve the Wan Chai Market** (para. 5 of minutes) |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject | Action required |
|---|---|---|---|
| | | SDEV's agreement with the general view that a holistic approach should be adopted for heritage conservation and that the scope of protection should not be confined to individual buildings but an area or a street. Practical constraints posed by e.g. contractual agreements of the planned developments, however, had to be considered.<br><br>MD/URA's explanation that URA was obliged to take forward redevelopment projects e.g. Project H9, inherited from the former Land Development Corporation. In 2002, URA had adopted the "4R" concept (i.e. redevelopment, rehabilitation, revitalisation, and preservation) for its urban renewal strategy. His briefing of the heritage conservation work planned for Wan Chai. | |
| 004847 - 010049 | Dr Fernando CHEUNG<br>Chairman<br>Admin | Dr Fernando CHEUNG's views that -<br><br>(a) the Administration should explore all possible options with the developer concerned to preserve the Wan Chai Market for its historical and architectural value;<br><br>(b) the Administration should not be only concerned about the provision of adequate carpark space for the new residential development at Site C and ignore the demands of the affected hawkers whose livelihood would be at stake if forced to relocate;<br><br>(c) the new Wan Chai Market featured a modern "mall-like" design which was totally different from the traditional flavour of the original Wan Chai Market; and<br><br>(d) a meeting should be held to receive views from the public including the affected hawkers on the relocation plan.<br><br>FHB's response that hawker representatives and WCDC had been consulted on the design of the new Wan Chai Market, which aimed at providing a hygienic and better environment. | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject | Action required |
|---|---|---|---|
| 010050 - 010847 | Ms Miriam LAU<br>Chairman<br>Admin | Ms Miriam LAU's view that the Administration should try to accommodate, as far as possible, requests of the affected hawkers of the existing Wan Chai Market reflected through the Hong Kong Vegetable Food and Grocery Hawkers Welfare and Fraternity Association, otherwise these hawkers would have no choice but refuse to remove to the new market.<br><br>FHB's explanation of the practical difficulties involved and the reasons of why the requests of hawkers of the Wan Chai Market could not be acceded to.<br><br>SDEV's undertaking that DEVB would coordinate with relevant departments to re-examine the issue. | **Admin to consider members' views and explore preservation of the entire bazaar** (para. 6 of the minutes) |
| 010848 - 011851 | Mr Vincent FANG<br>Chairman<br>Admin | Mr Vincent FANG's view that the entire open-air bazaar in question should be preserved for its heritage and tourism value, and efforts should be made to enhance the development of the bazaar, such as by improving the hygiene condition of the bazaar.<br><br>FHB's reiteration of the reasons for the Administration to have put up the current relocation plan. | |
| 011852 - 012440 | Ms Audrey EU<br>Chairman | Ms Audrey EU's view that the poor viability of public markets was generally attributed to their poor design which failed to cater for the needs of stall tenants. Ms EU's request for the Administration to enhance its communication with WCDC and the affected hawkers in striving to resolve the current issue satisfactorily. | |
| 012441 - 012949 | Ms Emily LAU<br>Chairman<br>Admin | Ms Emily LAU's expression of concurrence with the views expressed by other members in support of the preservation of entire open-air bazaar. Her view that SDEV should take into serious consideration the unanimous views expressed by members on this issue. | |

| Time marker | Speaker | Subject | Action required |
|---|---|---|---|
| 012950 - 015105 | Miss CHAN Yuen-han<br>Admin<br>Chairman<br>MD/URA<br>Prof Patrick LAU | Miss CHAN Yuen-han's view that the justifications provided by the Administration for the relocation of the open-air bazaar were unconvincing and unacceptable. She did not see any practical difficulties preventing the Administration from scrapping the current relocation plan.<br><br>Administration's response from the perspective of traffic needs which had prompted the current relocation plan.<br><br>The Chairman's summing up members' views expressed at the meeting. | |
| 015106 - 015656 | Chairman<br>Ms Audrey EU<br>Dr Fernando CHEUNG<br>Ms Emily LAU | Voting on a motion moved by Dr Fernando CHEUNG.<br><br>Scheduling a meeting for 26 July 2007 to receive views on the current proposal.<br><br>Date of next meeting | |

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat,
24 December 2007