

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)1445/06-07
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/04/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Minutes of meeting on
Friday, 30 March 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
- Members absent** : Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
- Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item V**
Mr Philip YUNG
Deputy Secretary for the Environment, Transport and
Works (Transport) 1

Mr Henry CHAN
Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment,
Transport and Works (Transport) 7

Mr WAN Man-lung
Principal Government Engineer/Railway Development
Highways Department

Agenda item VI

Miss Cathy CHU
Deputy Secretary for the Environment, Transport and
Works (Transport) 2

Mrs Hedy CHU
Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment,
Transport and Works (Transport) 4

Mr K H LO
Chief Inspecting Officer (Railways)
Environment, Transport and Works Bureau

Mr Albert YUEN
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/Bus and Railway

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item V

MTR Corporation

Mr Malcolm GIBSON
Chief Design Manager

Ms Maggie SO
External Affairs and Government Relations Manager

Agenda item VI

Mr Wilfred LAU
Head of Operations

Ms Maggie SO
External Affairs and Government Relations Manager

Clerk in attendance :

Mr Andy LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mrs Mary TANG
Senior Council Secretary (1)2

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I Confirmation of minutes of meeting and matters arising

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1206/06-07 - Minutes of meeting held on
5 January 2007)

The minutes of the meeting held on 5 January 2007 were confirmed.

II Information papers issued since last meeting

2. Members noted that no information paper had been issued since last meeting.

III Proposed work plan of the Subcommittee

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1208/06-07 - Paper on proposed work plan for the
Subcommittee on Matters Relating
to Railways prepared by the
Secretariat)

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).
4. Members generally agreed that the Subcommittee should continue to work, based on the work plan set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)1208/06-07, until the end of the current term in June 2008. Any review of the need and functions of the Subcommittee should be conducted during the next term of office. Mr LEE Wing-tat however held the view that the Subcommittee should aim at completing its work within a certain timeframe and focus its work on the policy issues arising from the overall planning of railway projects. Matters relating to railway operations and monitoring of railway services should be taken up by the Transport Panel.

IV Items for discussion at the next meeting scheduled for 4 May 2007

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1209/06-07(01) - List of outstanding items for
discussion

LC Paper No. CB(1)1209/06-07(02) - List of follow-up actions)

5. Members agreed that the following items should be discussed at the next meeting scheduled for 4 May 2007 –

Action

- (a) Retrofitting of automatic platform gates and platform screen doors at railway stations; and
- (b) West Rail incident on 14 February 2007.

V West Island Line

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1209/06-07(03) - Information paper provided by the Administration)

6. Members expressed the following concerns about the construction of the West Island Line (WIL) –

- (a) the potential hazard and risks arising from the storage, handling and use of explosives on nearby residents;
- (b) the impacts of blasting operations on nearby buildings and residents;
- (c) the locations of the vent shafts of the WIL, and the associated noise and environmental impacts on nearby residents; and
- (d) the financial arrangements, in particular the amount of Government funding support, for building the WIL.

7. Members requested that –

- (a) consideration should be given to carrying out a comprehensive survey on the buildings in the vicinity before the commencement of the construction works, and appointing an independent surveyor to assess any claims for damages arising from blasting operations and construction of the WIL from nearby residents; public consultation should be made regarding the storage, handling and use of explosives for the construction of the WIL;
- (b) details about the funding arrangements for the WIL project before the project proposal was gazetted;
- (c) consideration should be given to providing more entrances at the Kennedy Town station;
- (d) in view of the relatively small population of Western District, justifications should be given for providing three railway stations for the WIL, vis-a-vis other districts like Tin Sui Wai and Tung Chung;
- (e) the WIL project should be expedited in order to improve the traffic condition in Western District; and
- (f) detailed information on the criteria for provision of railway lines and stations in a district should be provided.

Action

VI Review of the incident of a Tung Chung Line train using Airport Express platform on 13 March 2007

- (LC Paper No. CB(1)1209/06-07(04) - Information paper on "MTR Tung Chung Line Train that entered the Airport Express track by mistake" provided by the Administration
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1209/06-07(05) - Information paper on "Incident on Tung Chung Line on 13 March 2007" provided by MTR Corporation Limited
- LC Paper No. CB(1)1151/06-07(01) - A letter on the incident of a Tung Chung Line train using Airport Express platform from MTR Corporation Limited)

8. Members noted the papers and agreed that in order to ensure the safety of train operation, the MTR Corporation Limited should consider enhancing its Automatic Train Protection (ATP) System to require the operation staff to double confirm on the system if he had to manually set the routes for specific trains. The Administration was requested to provide information on the percentage of trains running on the Tung Chung Line and the Airport Express Line which required resetting of routes.

Admin

VII Any other business

9. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
3 May 2007

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 30 March 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes and matters arising</i>			
000000 – 000204	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 5 January 2007. (LC Paper No. CB(1)1206/06-07)	
<i>Agenda Item II – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000205 – 000210	Chairman	Members noted that no information paper had been issued since last meeting.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Proposed work plan of the Subcommittee</i>			
000211 – 001741	Chairman Mr LEE Wing-tat Mr WONG Kwok-hing Mr LAU Kong-wah Mr Tommy CHEUNG Mr Jeffrey LAM	Members present, except Mr LEE Wing-tat, agreed that the Subcommittee should continue to work, based on the work plan set out in LC Paper No. CB(1)1208/06-07, until the end of the current term, i.e. June 2008. Mr LEE Wing-tat opined that the Subcommittee should work within a fixed time schedule, e.g. the Subcommittee should confine its work to the planning of railway lines, and matters relating to the operation of railway lines and monitoring of railway services should be deliberated at the Transport Panel.	
<i>Agenda Item IV – Items for discussion at the next meeting scheduled for 4 May 2007</i>			
001742 – 002033	Chairman Mr Andrew CHENG Mr WONG Kwok-hing	As proposed by Mr WONG Kwok-hing and Mr Andrew CHENG, members agreed to discuss the following items at the next meeting – (a) Retrofitting of automatic platform gates and platform screen doors at railway stations; and (b) West Rail incident on 14 February 2007.	
<i>Agenda Item V – West Island Line</i>			
002034 – 002124	Chairman	The Chairman welcomed representatives of the Administration and the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) to the meeting.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
002125 – 003239	MTRCL	Briefing by MTRCL on the design and time-table for the construction of the West Island Line (WIL).	
003240 – 004129	Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's concern about –</p> <p>(a) the impact of the use and storage of explosives on the nearby residents and buildings during the construction of the WIL; and</p> <p>(b) the noise and environmental impact of the vent shafts to the residents in the vicinity.</p> <p>MTRCL's explanation that –</p> <p>(a) the use and storage of explosives would comply with the relevant legislation and the guidelines of the Mines Division;</p> <p>(b) since the MTR was an electric powered railway, the ventilation system would not cause significant air pollution problems to the nearby residents. The opening of the vent shafts would not face the residential buildings; and</p> <p>(c) inspection of the nearby buildings would be undertaken subject to the consent of the occupants.</p>	
004130 – 005133	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's concern about the financial arrangements for the construction of the WIL, in particular whether Government funding support for the railway line was required.</p> <p>The Deputy Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (Transport)1 (DS/T1)'s response that the funding arrangements for the WIL were being finalized and would be submitted to the Public Works Subcommittee and Finance Committee for approval in the third quarter of 2007.</p>	
005134 – 005814	Mr LEE Wing-tat MTRCL	Mr LEE Wing-tat's remark that a comprehensive survey on the physical conditions of the nearby buildings should be conducted before commencement of the construction of the WIL so that the information could be used for assessment	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>of any claims for damages from the residents during or after the construction of the WIL. An independent surveyor should be appointed to assess any claims of damages from residents.</p> <p>MTRCL's response that consideration would be given to commissioning an independent surveyor for handling claims for damages. However, the extent of initial survey would depend on the willingness of the occupants of flats to allow the work of survey.</p>	
005815 – 010229	Ir Dr Raymond HO Administration	Ir Dr Raymond HO's view that the WIL project should be expedited in order to solve the traffic congestion problem in Western District. DS/T1's response that every effort would be made to complete the WIL project on schedule.	
010230 – 011505	Mr Albert CHAN MTRCL	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's query about the justifications for building three railway stations under the WIL for residents in Western District, whereas in the Tin Shui Wai and Tung Chung districts, only one railway station was provided in the respective district under the West Rail project and the Tung Chung Line project.</p> <p>The Administration's explanation that given the special topographic conditions and dense population in Western District, three stations had to be provided for the WIL. The population in Tin Sui Wai and Tung Chung was rather sporadic and had to be served by feeder services linking with the railway stations.</p>	
011506 – 011854	Mr LEE Wing-tat MTRCL	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's concern that there were few entrances at the Kennedy Town station and users would take time to access the station at the street level.</p> <p>MTRCL's response that there were cost implications in providing additional entrances to a station, but consideration would be made to providing more entrances to the Kennedy Town station.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
011855 – 012352	Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing's concern about the location of the explosive storage which might cause unease among the nearby residents. MTRCL's explanation that the explosive storage was located in an underground tunnel far away from any residence. The relevant District Council and local residents had been consulted on the issue who did not raise any objection.	
012353 – 012804	Mr Albert CHAN Administration	Mr Albert CHAN's enquiry as to the criteria for provision of a railway line for a particular district. DS/T1 said that the Administration would provide the relevant information to the Subcommittee.	
<i>Agenda Item VI – Review of the incident of a Tung Chung Line train using Airport Express platform on 13 March 2007</i>			
012805 – 012912	Chairman	Opening remarks (LC Paper No. CB(1)1209/06-07(04))	
012913 – 013746	MTRCL	Through a Powerpoint presentation, MTRCL briefed members on the Tung Chung Line incident on 13 March 2007 and the operation of the Tung Chung Line (TCL) and the Airport Express Line (AEL). (LC Paper No. CB(1)1209/06-07(05))	
013747 – 014327	Mr Andrew CHENG MTRCL	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG's concern that the operation staff might not have sufficient rest which might lead to errors in operating the trains. He opined that the trains should be fully controlled by the automated system to reduce the risk of routing errors.</p> <p>MTRCL's explanation that sufficient rest period was provided for between two work shifts of the operation staff. A recess period was also provided to the staff once every four hours. It was necessary to manually reset the routes of the trains running on the TCL and the AEL because the lines sometimes used shared railways. Operating procedures in the Operations Control Centre (OCC) had been strengthened and enhanced to enable the Traffic Controllers to help and remind each other of strenuous activities. Also an additional process safeguard had been introduced in which for every manual train route setting, Traffic Controllers had to apply a physical finger-pointing process</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		before executing the command at their workstations.	
014328 – 014900	Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	<p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing's suggestion that for safety sake, the operation staff should be required to double confirm on the automated system in resetting the routing of a specific train.</p> <p>MTRCL's response that the existing Automatic Train Protection (ATP) system provided safeguards in governing railway safety and any modifications to the system would have implications on the overall safety arrangements for the railway lines. Meanwhile, operating procedures in the OCC had been strengthened and enhanced to enable the Traffic Controllers to help and remind each other of strenuous activities, including manual train route setting.</p>	
014901 – 015508	Mr LEE Wing-tat MTRCL	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat's view that it should be feasible for all setting of routes being operated through an automated system. He requested that the MTRCL should provide information about the percentage of trains running on the TCL and AEL which required resetting of routes. MTRCL undertook to provide the information.</p>	
015509 – 020019	Mr Albert CHAN MTRCL	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's view that the operation staff should be given a rest, say a break of 15 minutes, after working for two hours. He said that double confirmation on resetting of routes on the automated system should help enhance the safety of the trains.</p> <p>MTRCL's response that the Traffic Controllers took a recess every four hours, and the supervisor of the OCC would check that the Traffic Controllers were physically fit while on duty.</p>	
020020 - 020744	Mr LAU Kong-wah MTRCL Administration Mr Albert CHAN Administration	<p>While noting that the TCL incident occurred when the staff concerned was in a physically fit condition and the automated system was in order, Mr LAU Kong-wah's concern whether, if the ATP system was out of order, the incident would lead to serious consequence. In reply to Mr LAU's enquiry, the MTRCL's response that the MTRCL had reported to the Transport</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>Department and the Hong Kong Railway Inspectorate immediately after the incident.</p> <p>The Chief Inspecting Officer (Railways) of Environment, Transport and Works Bureau (CIO/R)'s response that working of trains was under the control and monitoring of the ATP system which was an independent system performing various safety functions such as limiting the speed of trains, keeping trains at a safe distance apart, ensuring that only safe routes would be assigned for trains to go and giving permission for trains to proceed forward when it was safe to do so. Moreover, ATP would also self-check regularly. In case of anomaly, it would shut down itself and stop all train movements. Therefore, ATP would ensure safe train movement.</p> <p>Mr Albert CHAN's concern that the ATP system only controlled the operation of trains, but not human beings entering the tracks. The CIO/R's response that all railroads were prohibited areas and any person entering the tracks should first obtain permission from the OCC.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item VII – Any other business</i>			
020745 - 020807	Chairman	Date of next meeting.	