

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)2056/06-07
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref: CB1/PS/1/04/1

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

Minutes of meeting on
Friday, 4 May 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** : Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP (Chairman)
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon LEE Wing-tat
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
- Member attending** : Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP
- Public Officers attending** : **Agenda item IV**
Miss Cathy CHU
Deputy Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

Mrs Hedy CHU
Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works

Mr K H LO
Chief Inspecting Officer (Railways)
Environment, Transport and Works Bureau

Agenda item V

Miss Cathy CHU
Deputy Secretary for the Environment, Transport and
Works

Mrs Hedy CHU
Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment,
Transport and Works

Mr K H LO
Chief Inspecting Officer (Railways)
Environment, Transport and Works Bureau

Mr Albert YUEN
Assistant Commissioner for Transport/
Bus and Railway

Mr Y C CHEUNG
Chief Fire Officer (Fire Safety Command)
Fire Services Department

Mr N H HO
Senior Divisional Officer
(Railway Development Strategy)
Fire Services Department

Mr S B MAN
Divisional Commander
(South Division/New Territories Command) (Acting)
Fire Services Department

**Attendance by
invitation**

: Agenda item IV

MTR Corporation

Mr Andrew MCCUSKER
Operations Director

Mr Wilfred LAU
Head of Operations

Ms Maggie SO
External Affairs and Government Relations Manager

Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation

Ir James BLAKE
Chief Executive Officer

Mr Y T LI
Senior Director – Transport

Mr Raymond WONG
Senior Corporate Affairs Manager

Agenda item V

Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation

Ir James BLAKE
Chief Executive Officer

Mr K K LEE
Senior Director – Capital Projects

Mr Y T LI
Senior Director – Transport

Mr Tony LEE
General Manager – Rolling Stock (Acting)

Mr Raymond WONG
Senior Corporate Affairs Manager

Clerk in attendance : Mr Andy LAU
Chief Council Secretary (1)2

Staff in attendance : Mr Noel SUNG
Senior Council Secretary (1)4

Miss Winnie CHENG
Legislative Assistant (1)5

Action

I Confirmation of minutes of meeting and matters arising

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1445/06-07 - Minutes of meeting held on 30 March 2007)

The minutes of the meeting held on 30 March 2007 were confirmed.

II Information papers issued since last meeting

2. Members noted that no information paper had been issued since last meeting.

III Date of next meeting and items for discussion

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/06-07(01) - List of outstanding items for discussion

LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/06-07(02) - List of follow-up actions)

3. Members agreed that the following items should be discussed at the next meeting scheduled for 16 July 2007 –

(a) Shatin to Central Link; and

(b) Provision of lavatories in MTR stations.

IV Retrofitting of automatic platform gates and platform screen doors at railway stations

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/06-07(03) - Information paper provided by the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation

LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/06-07(04) - Information paper provided by the MTR Corporation Limited

LC Paper No. CB(1)1448/06-07 - Background Brief on retrofitting of platform screen doors and automatic platform gates at railway stations prepared by the Secretariat)

4. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

5. Members were concerned about the long time taken by the two railway corporations to study and implement the retrofitting of platform screen doors (PSDs) and/or automatic platform gates (APGs) at railway stations. Members also queried why the feasibility study on retrofitting of PSDs and APGs at above-ground stations could not be started earlier when the retrofitting programme was implemented for MTR underground stations. The Deputy Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (DS/ETW) responded that the MTRCL's priority was to retrofit PSDs at the underground stations first, and had to assess the operation of APGs at the Disneyland Resort Line before considering installing PSDs and/or APGs at at-grade or above

Action

ground stations. There were also technical problems in the installation of PSDs and APGs in the open environment of the at-grade and above-ground stations and a thorough assessment of the operation and safety implications had to be undertaken.

6. Members were of the view that the PSDs or APGs could be installed immediately at the five KCRC stations which did not have a wide gap problem between the platform and the train. Ir James BLAKE, the Chief Executive Officer of KCRC responded that there were other technical problems to be resolved in addition to the wide gaps for installing PSDs or APGs at KCRC stations. KCRC would carry out detailed feasibility study with a view to retrofitting PSDs or APGs at all KCR railway stations.

7. Mr Andrew CHENG moved the following motion, a copy of which was tabled at the meeting –

"本會強烈要求地鐵公司及九廣鐵路公司於2012年之前，完成所有月台幕門之安裝工程。"

(Translation)

"That this Subcommittee strongly requests the MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL) and the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation (KCRC) to complete the installation of platform screen doors at all of their stations by 2012."

8. The Chairman considered that the motion moved by Mr CHENG was directly related to the agenda item under discussion and that it was appropriate for the Subcommittee to deal with it. All members agreed to proceed with the motion.

9. Mr WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment –

To replace "2012" with "2010".

10. After deliberation by members, Mr WONG Kwok-hing agreed to withdraw his proposed amendment to the motion.

11. Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following amendment –

To replace "地鐵公司及九廣鐵路公司於2012年之前" with "地鐵公司於2012年之前，及九廣鐵路公司於2013年之前。"

12. The Chairman moved a technical amendment to the motion by adding "及閘門 (or platform gates)" after "月台幕門(platform screen doors)".

13. Both railway corporations considered, subject to the feasibility study in relation to the proposed retrofitting, i.e. with relevant technical solutions and commercial considerations, the proposed timetable, i.e. a period of 5 years for the retrofitting, set out in Mr CHENG's motion as amended by Mrs Selina CHOW acceptable.

Action

14. Mr CHENG's motion as amended by the Chairman and Mrs Selina CHOW was put to vote. The motion was passed.

V West Rail incident on 14 February 2007

(LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/06-07(05) - Information paper provided by the Administration

LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/06-07(06) Information paper provided by the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation)

15. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

16. Members expressed the following views and concerns regarding the West Rail fire incident on 14 February 2007:

KCRC

(a) Members were concerned that there was a time lapse of about four minutes between the time when the Fires Services Department (FSD) received an automatic fire alarm signal from the West Rail at 9:13 am on the day of the incident, and when a fire notification was made from the West Rail Operations Control Centre (OCC) at 9:17 am. No confirmation of isolation of the high voltage traction current was made until 9:55 am, i.e. about 42 minutes after the outbreak of fire. The KCRC was requested to liaise with the FSD to expedite operational arrangements to deal with incidents of a similar nature in the future, and provide a report to the Subcommittee on the review of the procedures for isolation of the high voltage traction current;

KCRC

(b) Members were concerned that KCRC had to take about 18 months to replace the existing transformers with the new type of oil-free and explosion-proof transformers. KCRC was requested to shorten the replacement period so that the new transformers could be installed on the trains as early as possible;

Admin

(c) Members requested that the Administration should provide information regarding the electricity supply system of MTR trains in order to ensure that similar fire incidents would not occur on the MTR; and

(d) Members were of the view that the ability of the KCRC senior management staff in handling major incidents of the railway system should be included in the performance targets for the variable pay scheme.

VI Any other business

17. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Panel on Transport

Subcommittee on Matters Relating to Railways

**Proceedings of the meeting
on Friday, 4 May 2007, at 10:45 am
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
<i>Agenda Item I – Confirmation of minutes and matters arising</i>			
000000 – 000100	Chairman	Confirmation of minutes of the meeting held on 30 March 2007 (LC Paper No. CB(1)1445/06-07)	
<i>Agenda Item II – Information papers issued since last meeting</i>			
000100 – 000145	Chairman	The Subcommittee noted that no information paper had been issued since last meeting.	
000145 – 000330	Mr WONG Kwok-hing Chairman	Mr WONG Kwok-hing suggested that an item on "Provision of lavatories in MTR stations" should be included in the agenda for the next Subcommittee meeting to be held in July 2007. The Chairman opined that the Subcommittee should focus on policy issues relating to the planning of new railway projects.	
000331 – 000507	Mr LAU Kong-wah	Mr LAU Kong-wah requested that the Subcommittee should discuss about the progress of the Shatin to Central Link at the next meeting.	
000508 – 000537	Chairman	The Chairman remarked that at the next meeting the Subcommittee might first discuss the "Shatin to Central Link" and accord some time for discussion on the "Provision of lavatories in MTR stations".	
000538 – 000600	Mr Ronny TONG	Mr Ronny TONG supported that the items proposed by Mr LAU Kong-wah and Mr WONG Kwok-hing should be included in the agenda for the next Subcommittee meeting.	
000601 – 000648	Mr LEE Wing-tat	Mr LEE Wing-tat opined that matters relating to the operation of the railways should be discussed at the Transport Panel. If the provision of lavatories in MTR stations was included in the agenda for the next Subcommittee meeting, it should take up only a small portion of time of the meeting.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
000649 – 000722	Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing remarked that the provision of passenger facilities in railway stations was related to the operation of the railway corporations, and the Subcommittee discussed the item on provision of lavatories, it would obviate the need for discussing the same item at the rail merger Subcommittee.	
<i>Agenda Item III – Date of next meeting and items for discussion</i>			
		The Subcommittee agreed that the items "Shatin to Central Link" and "Provision of lavatories in MTR stations" should be discussed at the next Subcommittee meeting scheduled for 16 July 2007.	
<i>Agenda Item IV – Retrofitting of automatic platform gates and platform screen doors at railway stations</i>			
000723 – 001219	Chairman Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation (KCRC) MTR Corporation Limited (MTRCL)	Briefing by the two railway corporations on the progress on installation of platform screen doors (PSDs) and automatic platform gates (APGs) at railway stations.	
001220 – 011510	Mr LEE Wing-tat	With reference to paragraphs 13 to 15 of LC Paper No. CB(1)1447/06-07(04), Mr LEE Wing-tat questioned why the experience of installing PSDs and APGs in existing stations could not be applied to the above-ground stations. He was concerned that the installation programme for above-ground stations would take years to complete.	
001511 – 001651	MTRCL	The MTRCL's explanation that the design considerations for installation of PSDs and APGs at above-ground stations were completely different from those of underground stations, given that there was an open environment at the above-ground stations.	
001652 – 001752	Mr LEE Wing-tat	Mr LEE Wing-tat was concerned whether it would take much time to resolve the technical problems for installation of PSDs and APGs at railway stations.	
001753 – 001807	MTRCL	The MTRCL's response that the PSD retrofitting project at underground stations was well underway.	
001808 – 002132	Mr WONG Kwok-hing MTRCL	Mr WONG Kwok-hing requested that the study on resolving the technical problems for installing PSDs and APGs should be expedited to cover all eight at-grade or above ground MTR stations.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>The MTRCL's response that the corporation had to complete the study on the design and standard for installation of PSDs and APGs at the stations first before construction work could start.</p> <p>Mr WONG Kwok-hing requested that the feasibility study for the eight MTR stations should be carried out simultaneously so as to expedite the project.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response that the corporation aimed to complete the PSD and APG study as soon as possible.</p>	
002133 – 002400	Mr WONG Kwok-hing KCRC	<p>Mr WONG asked, in view of the physical constraints of the Light Rail stations, whether the KCRC would consider alternative measures, e.g. laser detection system, to enhance the safety of the stations.</p> <p>The KCRC's response that the speed of light rail trains was extremely slow, i.e. at about 15 km, when approaching the stations. At such a speed, the driver would be able to stop the train in time if any passenger fell into the track from the station. With the open design of the light rail stations, the driver should be able to see clearly the movement of the passengers. Due to the physical constraints of the stations, the use of a laser detection system was unsuitable.</p>	
002401 – 002757	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming KCRC	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming enquired about the number of East Rail stations which had a relatively wide gap between the platform and the train, the timing for completion of the installation and testing of the automatic mechanical gap filler system at Lo Wu station, and the timing for installation of the gap fillers in other East Rail stations.</p> <p>The KCRC's response that there were totally seven East Rail stations which had relatively wide gaps. The installation of the automatic mechanical gap fillers at Lo Wu station was expected to be completed in mid-2008, after which the corporation would assess the trial results and consider installing the system in the other six stations.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
002758 – 003514	Mr Andrew CHENG Administration	<p>With reference to LC Paper No. CB(1)1448/06-07, Mr Andrew CHENG was concerned that after many years of research and discussion, there were still 20 railway stations (twelve at East Rail and eight in the MTR) which were not fitted with PSDs or APGs. Yet the two railway corporations were still conducting feasibility studies on the project and reported that there were technical difficulties in implementing the project at the railway stations. Mr CHENG opined that if more resources could be put into the project, it could have been completed earlier.</p> <p>The Deputy Secretary for the Environment, Transport and Works (DS/ETW) explained that the priority of the MTRCL was to install PSDs or APGs at underground stations. For the sake of passenger safety, the two railway corporations had to conduct feasibility studies and assess the technical and safety implications of the installation project, e.g. the platform edge loading, the earthing protection, the co-ordination of the automatic mechanical gap fillers and signalling system, etc. Not until the corporations were fully satisfied with the testing results would they consider installation of the PSDs and APGs at the at-grade and above-ground stations.</p>	
003515 – 003820	Mr LAU Kong-wah	<p>Mr LAU Kong-wah opined that the feasibility study on the PSD and APG project for the above-ground stations should have been done at the same time of the study for the underground stations. He opined that passengers of the above-ground stations were more vulnerable to inclement weather, e.g. slippery floors, and hence there was an urgent need to install PSDs or APGs at the above-ground stations. Mr LAU queried why installation work could not be carried out immediately in the five KCRC stations which did not have curved platforms.</p>	
003821 – 003854	MTRCL	<p>The MTRCL's response that the corporation had to assess the findings of the feasibility study and results of the tests before considering installing PSDs or APGs at the above-ground stations.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
003855 – 004021	KCRC	<p>The KCRC's response that the corporation had to solve the technical problems and had to be fully satisfied with the test results before it could consider construction of the PSDs and APGs. Apart from the wide platform gaps, there were other technical problems which had to be resolved.</p>	
004022 – 004610	Mr Albert CHAN Administration	<p>Mr Albert CHAN opined that the two railway corporations had ignored public safety and expectations in refusing to put adequate resources to expedite the PSD and APG project. In other railway projects which could bring about fiscal benefits, e.g. renovation of commercial establishments in railway premises, the two corporations were extremely efficient. He enquired as to what measures the Administration would take to press for the early completion of the installation project, and whether a date would be set for completion of the project.</p> <p>DS/ETW responded that the Hong Kong Railway Inspectorate would ensure that the two railway corporations complied with international safety standards in their operation. The two corporations were encouraged to complete the PSD and APG project as soon as possible, but they had to complete the studies first in order to assess feasibility and the steps to be taken for the project. Public safety was the prime concern of the project.</p>	
004611 – 005145	Mr LEE Wing-tat Administration	<p>Mr LEE Wing-tat opined that apart from monitoring the operation of the two railway corporations, the Government should take measures to press for the early completion of projects like the PSD and APG project which affected public safety. He enquired about the technical problems involved in installing the automatic mechanical gap fillers.</p> <p>DS/ETW responded that the MTRCL's priority was to install PSDs at underground stations. The Hong Kong Railway Inspectorate would assess the findings of the feasibility study, including the use of automatic mechanical gap fillers at KCRC stations. The Chief Inspecting Officer (Railways) (CIO/R) supplemented that the technical problems raised by the corporations had to be resolved before the PSD or APG could be installed.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
005146 – 005510	Mr Andrew CHENG	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG moved a motion as follows –</p> <p>"本會強烈要求地鐵公司及九廣鐵路公司於2012年之前，完成所有月台幕門之安裝工程。"</p> <p>(Translation) "That this Subcommittee strongly requests the MTR Corporation Limited and the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation to complete the installation of platform screen doors at all of their stations by 2012."</p>	
005511 – 005532	Chairman	<p>The Chairman considered that the motion was related to the agenda item under discussion and it should be discussed by the Subcommittee.</p>	
005533 – 010119	Mr LAU Kong-wah Administration	<p>Mr LAU Kong-wah was concerned why the MTRCL did not undertake feasibility studies on the installation of PSDs and APGs at underground stations and above-ground stations at the same time. Mr LAU asked why PSDs could not be installed at the five KCRC stations which did not have a curved platform.</p> <p>DS/ETW responded that when the MTRCL started the project in 2000, its priority was to provide PSDs at underground stations, and had committed to start studying the feasibility of such installations at above-ground stations when the underground installations had been completed. In 2005, the MTRCL had for the first time installed APGs at the Disneyland Resort Line and the corporation wanted to take into consideration the operation of the APGs in assessing the feasibility of installing similar facilities at above-ground stations. The KCRC supplemented that apart from the gap problem, there were other technical problems to be resolved for installation of PSDs or APGs at KCRC stations. Trains from the Mainland also used the platforms and careful studies had to be undertaken to solve the platform gap problem.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
010120 – 010226	Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing stated that the motion put forward by Mr Andrew CHENG should be amended to require the two railway corporations to complete the PSD and APG project by 2010, given the experience gained in the installation project for underground stations.	
010227 – 010726	Mr Selina CHOW MTRCL KCRC Chairman	<p>Mrs Selina CHOW remarked that while she appreciated members' and the public's concern about the time taken to install PSDs and APGs at all railway stations, the project had to be implemented professionally in order to achieve its effects. Mrs CHOW asked the two railway corporations to indicate, from a technical and professional point of view, the time required to complete the project.</p> <p>The MTRCL's response that with the feasibility study completed, i.e. with the availability of relevant technical solutions and commercial considerations, five year would be a reasonable period from a retrofitting point of view. KCRC's response that the installation of the gap fillers for Lo Wu Station could not be completed until end of 2008, and another five years would be required to install PSDs and APGs at all KCRC stations if it was found technically feasible.</p>	
010727 – 010748	Mr Tommy CHEUNG	Mr Tommy CHEUNG said that since the KCRC would complete the installation of gap fillers by 2008, the whole project for installation of PSDs and APGs could not be completed until 2013.	
010749 – 010857	Mr Albert CHAN	Mr Albert CHAN remarked that a fixed time-table was important for the two railway corporations to complete the PSD and APG project.	
010858 – 010926	Mr Selina CHOW Chairman	<p>Mrs Selina CHOW moved to amend Mr Andrew CHENG's motion and the Chairman said that the motion should cover platform gates as well. The amended motion was as follows:</p> <p>"本會強烈要求地鐵公司於2012年之前，及九廣鐵路公司於2013年之前，完成所有月台幕門及閘門之安裝工程。"</p>	The Administration was requested to give a written response to the Subcommittee's motion.

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		(Translation) "That this Subcommittee strongly requests the MTR Corporation Limited and the Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation to complete the installation of platform screen doors or platform gates at all of their stations by 2012 and 2013 respectively."	
010927 – 011029	Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing agreed to withdraw his amendment on Mr Andrew CHENG's motion requiring the two railway corporations to complete the PSD and APG installation project by 2010.	
011030 – 011239	Chairman Mr Tommy CHEUNG Mr Selina CHOW	All members supported the motion moved by Mr CHENG as amended by Mrs Selina CHOW and the Chairman.	
<i>Agenda Item V – West Rail incident on 14 February 2007</i>			
011240 – 011327	Chairman	The Chairman invited the KCRC to brief members on the incident.	
011328 – 011728	KCRC	The KCRC's briefing on the causes of the incident and the remedial measures taken, by highlighting the salient points in the paper.	
011729 – 011938	KCRC	The KCRC's report on the incident by highlighting the salient points in the paper.	
011939 – 012135	Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr Wong Kwok-hing was concerned that while the fire alarm signal was received at 9:13 am, a fire notification from the West Rail Operations Control Centre (OCC) was not made to the Fire Services Department (FSD) until 9:17 am. He asked why there was a four-minute delay. Mr WONG was also concerned that despite the many incidents of the KCRC, the senior management staff of the corporation still received bonuses under the variable pay scheme (VPS).	
012136 – 012457	KCRC	The KCRC's explanation that when the fire alarm was received at 9:13 am on 14.2.2007, the controller at the OCC had to confirm with the incident train driver (ITD) about the location of the train, to activate the emergency lighting system, and to decide the direction for evacuation of the passengers, and the wind direction of ventilation system to avoid blowing the smoke towards the evacuating passengers. A report on the situation was then made to	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		the FSD at 9:17 am. The KCRC would review the procedures with a view to shortening the time for handling such situations.	
012458 – 012632	Administration	DS/ETW responded that the VPS issue would be discussed at the Panel on Transport meeting on 5 May 2007. There were performance indicators to assess the reliability and safety of the railways and the Hong Kong Railway Inspectorate constantly monitored the performance of the railway corporation.	
012633 – 012959	Mr LEE Wing-tat	Mr LEE Wing-tat opined that the handling of major railway incidents should be included in the performance targets for the VPS. He queried why it had to take more than a year to replace all the existing transformers given the gravity of the incident.	
013000 – 013052	KCRC	The KCRC's response that it would take time to design, manufacture, test and install the new transformers, and given the large number of transformers involved, replacement of all transformers had to be completed by end of 2008. Before the transformers were all replaced, the corporation had put into place measures to safeguard the safety of the trains.	
013053 – 013139	Administration	The CIO/R supplemented that the remedial measures taken by KCRC should be able to ensure the safety of the trains. As the new transformers were tailor-made, and the KCRC had to maintain its services while replacing the transformers, it was reasonable to expect the whole replacement exercise to be completed by 2008.	
013140 – 013201	Mr LEE Wing-tat	Mr LEE Wing-tat stated that based on safety consideration, he could not accept that the transformer replacement exercise had to take nearly 18 months to be completed.	
013202 – 013650	Mr Andrew CHENG	Mr Andrew CHENG stated that the public would not be satisfied that every incident of KCRC was described as an isolated incident, and despite all the incidents, the senior management officers of KCRC still received bonuses under the VPS. Mr CHENG worried that before the transformers were replaced, there would be	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
		<p>another serious fire incident on a KCRC train. He queried why it had to take nearly 18 months to replace 86 transformers. He requested that the replacement exercise should be finished, say within three to six months. In view of the many incidents of KCR trains, Mr CHENG opined that the Hong Kong Railway Inspectorate should randomly check the components of the KCRC trains as a preventive measure against technical failures. Mr CHENG also queried why it took the KCRC about ten minutes to isolate the high voltage traction current after the FSD officers arrived at the scene</p>	
013651 – 013729	KCRC	<p>The KCRC's explanation that the transformers were tailor-made and the manufacture period took about eight months. The corporation would attempt to complete the replacement exercise as early as possible and hopefully well before the end of 2008.</p>	
013730 – 013809	Administration	<p>CIO/R responded that the KCRC had drawn up a maintenance programme in checking the various components of the trains, based on the manufacturers' recommendations and the operation requirements. The Hong Kong Railway Inspectorate would conduct inspections to ensure that the corporation followed the maintenance programme.</p>	
013810 – 013835	Administration (Fire Services Department)	<p>The Chief Fire Officer (Fire Safety Command) responded that at the material time, KCRC had to move backward another train on the same track and hence it took the KCRC about ten minutes to isolate the high voltage traction current. The FSD was discussing with the KCRC on ways to expedite the operation under such circumstances.</p>	
013836 – 014012	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming	<p>Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming asked whether the new transformers would be checked once every three years or on a monthly basis. Mr CHEUNG further questioned whether KCRC would check that there were sufficient directional signs in the tunnels, and where necessary additional directional signs would be installed in the tunnels, similar to those in Tai Lam Tunnel, for passengers who might experience emergency evacuation.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
014013 – 014105	KCRC	The KCRC's response that the corporation would seek the manufacturer's and experts' advice regarding the frequency for checking the new transformers. The corporation would conduct an overall review on the provision of directional signs in the various tunnels and install additional signs where necessary.	
014106 – 014219	Mr Albert CHAN	Mr Albert CHAN queried why the KCRC did not use the latest type of transformers when the West Rail was built.	
014220 – 014406	KCRC	The KCRC's response that the transformers used was the latest type available when the West Rail was built. A new type of transformers with a greater tolerance against a lightning attack had been developed and proven satisfactory in Europe in the past few years	
014407 – 014500	Mr Albert CHAN	Mr Albert CHAN asked whether the KCRC and the MTRCL had taken measures to prevent similar incidents in the East Rail and MTR railway respectively.	
014501 – 014525	Administration	CIO/R responded that the East Rail used the same type of transformers as those in the West Rail and the transformers would be replaced by 2008. The MTR trains used a different electricity supply system and did not use the same type of transformers.	
014526 – 014541	Mr Albert CHAN	Mr Albert CHAN requested that the Administration should provide information regarding the electricity supply system used by MTRCL.	
014542 – 014550	Administration	DS/ETW reiterated that the MTRCL did not use the transformers concerned.	
014551 – 014623	Mr Albert CHAN	Mr Albert CHAN queried why the KCRC did not use the MTRCL system.	
014624 – 014643	Administration	CIO/R explained that the MTRCL used 1500V direct current electricity supply system while KCRC used 25,000V alternating current electricity supply system, therefore MTR trains did not require the installation of transformers.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
014644 – 014731	Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing asked whether there was a punitive system to impose penalty on the senior management staff of KCRC for any major incidents. He requested that a time limit should be set for the OCC to make a report to FSD any fire incident on KCRC trains.	
014732 – 014906	Administration	DS/ETW explained that the Government had laid down the safety and reliability requirements for the KCRC. The VPS formed part of the employment agreement with the KCRC staff and performance targets were set each year for the staff. If the KCRC staff had attained the performance targets, the corporation had to honour the terms and conditions of the employment agreement and make payment under the VPS. Any change of the VPS had to be agreed with the employees involved. The Government had regularly reminded the KCRC of the public's expectations of their standard of service.	
014907 – 014916	Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing further enquired whether there were any punitive terms under the VPS.	
014917 – 014946	Administration	DS/ETW pointed out that if the Corporation's performance could not meet the performance targets, contributions of the scheme participants would be deducted under the VPS.	
014947 – 015039	KCRC	The KCRC's response that all emergency units, including the KCRC and FSD, would act immediately upon the outbreak of an incident on a train. KCRC would inform FSD forthwith of any such incidents and would keep in contact with FSD to co-ordinate the emergency operation. In the incident on 14 February 2007, the KCRC's first priority was to ensure that the passengers involved would be evacuated to a safe place.	
015040 – 015135	Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Mr WONG Kwok-hing opined that for the sake of passenger safety, the KCRC should make a pledge to inform FSD immediately upon the outbreak of a fire on a train.	
015136 – 015208	KCRC	The KCRC's response that FSD was alerted by the automatic fire alarm immediately upon the outbreak of fire on a KCRC train.	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject(s)	Action required
015209 – 015836	Mr Andrew CHENG KCRC	<p>Mr Andrew CHENG strongly requested that the exercise for replacement of the transformers on KCRC trains should be expedited. The Hong Kong Railway Inspectorate should conduct random checks on the components of the trains and the maintenance procedures of KCRC to ensure that the guidelines were followed. Mr CHENG was concerned that in the February incident, it took ten minutes to isolate the high voltage traction current. He requested that measures should be taken to expedite the operation. The KCRC should liaise with FSD and provide a report on ways to improve the arrangements.</p> <p>The KCRC's explanation that the OCC staff had to confirm that all passengers on the train concerned had already evacuated, and other trains of West Rail had stopped at platforms before isolating the high voltage traction current so as to ensure the safety of the passengers and the FSD officers. A review of the relevant procedures would be undertaken with a view to shortening the time for such operations.</p>	
<i>Agenda Item VI – Any other business</i>			
015837 – 015844	Chairman	There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.	