

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 3

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 17 October 2007 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Members absent:

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>				<u>L.N. No.</u>
Bankruptcy (Commencement)	(Amendment) Notice (gazetted on 12.10.2007)	Ordinance	2005	185/2007

Other Papers

- No.2 - Occupational Safety and Health Council
Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 10.10.2007)
- No.3 - Report by the Trustee of the Customs and Excise
Service Children's Education Trust Fund for the
year ending 31 March 2007, together with the
Director of Audit's Report and the Audited
Statement of Accounts (published on 10.10.2007)
- No.4 - Hong Kong Deposit Protection Board
Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 10.10.2007)
- No.5 - Urban Renewal Authority
Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 10.10.2007)
- No.6 - Audited Financial Statement of Accounts and
Auditors' Report for the Fish Marketing
Organization for the year ended 31 March 2007
(published on 11.10.2007)
- No.7 - Audited Financial Statement of Accounts and
Auditors' Report for the Vegetable Marketing
Organization for the year ended 31 March 2007
(published on 11.10.2007)
- No.8 - Marine Fish Scholarship Fund Trustee's Report and
Audited Financial Statement of Accounts and
Auditors' Report on the Fund for the year ended
31 March 2007 (published on 11.10.2007)
- No.9 - Agricultural Products Scholarship Fund Trustee's
Report and Audited Financial Statement of Accounts
and Auditors' Report on the Fund for the year
ended 31 March 2007 (published on 11.10.2007)

- No.10 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the first quarter of 2007-2008 (Public Finance Ordinance : Section 8) (published on 11.10.2007)
- No.11 - Companies Registry Trading Fund Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 12.10.2007)
- No.12 - Environment and Conservation Fund Trustee Report 2006-2007 (published on 12.10.2007)
- No.13 - Report by the Trustee of the Prisoners' Education Trust Fund for the period from 1 April 2006 to 31 March 2007 (published on 12.10.2007)
- No.14 - The Land Registry Trading Fund Hong Kong Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 15.10.2007)
- No.15 - Report on the Recommended Delineation of Geographical Constituencies for the 2008 Legislative Council Election (published on 17.10.2007)
- No.16 - The Government Minute in response to the Report No.48 of the Public Accounts Committee dated July 2007 (published on 17.10.2007)

Addresses

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Report No. 48 of the Public Accounts Committee dated July 2007.

Questions

1. Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

2. Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

3. Hon Albert HO asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

4. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

5. Hon CHAN Yuen-han asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon James TIEN asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Security and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Statements

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs made a statement on the Report on Further Development of Political Appointment System.

Seven Members sought elucidation on the statement and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for Justice moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Official Languages (Alteration of Text under Section 4D) (Miscellaneous) Order 2007, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 136 of 2007 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 4 July 2007, be amended by repealing Part 2.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Margaret NG spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Official Languages (Alteration of Text under Section 4D) (Miscellaneous) Order 2007, and then in her personal capacity as a Member.

The Secretary for Justice replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the –

- (a) Building Management (Third Party Risks Insurance) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 146 of 2007; and
- (b) Merchant Shipping (Prevention of Air Pollution) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 149 of 2007,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 11 July 2007, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) and deemed to be extended under section 34(3) of that Ordinance, be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 7 November 2007.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Franchised bus fares

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as a franchised bus operator has recently applied to the Transport Department for a substantial fare increase of 9%, which is far beyond public affordability, this Council urges the Government to reject the application and adopt measures, including:

- (a) in applying the Modified Basket of Factors approach, taking the outcome of the fare adjustment formula and public affordability as primary factors for consideration, while other factors should be supplementary and secondary ones;
- (b) allowing the Legislative Council to activate the fare adjustment mechanism so as to safeguard public interest;
- (c) requesting the franchised bus companies to provide more comprehensive sectional fares and bus-bus interchange concessions;
- (d) discussing with the franchised bus companies the introduction of one-day and monthly ticket schemes for buses;
- (e) designating Sundays and public holidays as free-ride days for the elderly; and
- (f) introducing half-fare concessions for people with disabilities,

with a view to ensuring that franchised bus fares are within public affordability, and promoting the participation of the socially disadvantaged in the community.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Miriam LAU and Hon WONG Kwok-hing, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their amendments.

While Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:32 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, who would move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and his amendment.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Seven Members and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:40 pm, while Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

13 other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the permission of the President, Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG elucidated on a point he had made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon Mrs Selina CHOW.

One more Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion:

To delete "as" after "That,"; to delete "is far beyond public affordability" after "a substantial fare increase of 9%, which" and substitute with "will far exceed the affordability of the public"; to add "therefore" after "this Council"; to delete ", while other factors should be supplementary and secondary ones" after "public affordability as primary factors for consideration"; to delete "allowing the Legislative Council to activate" after "(b)" and substitute with "when activating"; to add ", fully consulting the Legislative Council and considering the views of the community" after "the fare adjustment mechanism"; and to add "discussing with the franchised bus companies" after "(e)".

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed and put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment, five were against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Franchised bus fares" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion:

To add "the Kowloon Motor Bus Company (1933) Limited," after "That, as"; to delete "has recently" after "a franchised bus operator" and substitute with ", has"; to add "the inflation rate and" after "which is far beyond"; to add "arousing strong objection from the community," after "public affordability,"; to add "further" after "to reject the application and adopt"; to add "and, prior to that, consulting the Legislative Council and the Transport Advisory Committee on each occasion before any fare adjustment is implemented," after "to activate the fare adjustment mechanism"; to add "expeditiously" after "requesting the franchised bus companies to"; to add ", including inter-company interchange concessions" after "bus-bus interchange concessions"; to delete "discussing with" after "(d)" and substitute with "urging"; to delete "the introduction of" before "one-day and monthly ticket schemes" and substitute with "to expeditiously introduce"; to add "expeditiously" after "(e)"; to delete "introducing" after "(f)" and substitute with "expeditiously implementing the offer of"; to add ", and drawing up the implementation timetable" after "half-fare concessions for people with disabilities"; to delete ", " after "within public affordability"; to add "conducive to" before "promoting the participation of"; and to add "people living in remote new towns as well as" after "promoting the participation of".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed and put.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 13 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion:

To delete "adopt" after "Government to reject the application and" and substitute with "discuss with the franchised bus companies how the operating costs can be reduced effectively so as to relieve the pressure to increase fare, while the Government should at the same time adopt"; to delete "and" after "free-ride days for the elderly;"; and to add "; and (g) introducing half-fare concessions for all full-time students in Hong Kong" after "introducing half-fare concessions for people with disabilities".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Philip WONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 13 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon LEE Wing-tat replied.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion put.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, nine were in favour of the motion, one against it and 13 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 22 were in favour of the motion and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Development of the convention and exhibition industry

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the convention and exhibition industry brings about enormous direct and indirect economic benefits to Hong Kong every year, and the Mainland, Macao and many Southeast Asian cities have built or expanded their convention and exhibition spaces in recent years and launched measures and promotional activities to attract large-scale international exhibitions; in the face of keen competition from the neighbouring regions, this Council urges the Government to ensure that Hong Kong provides competitive convention and exhibition venues and supporting facilities to maintain its position as the convention and exhibition capital of Asia.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Ting-kwong would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion and addressed the Council:

To add ", which is a new point of growth in the economy of Hong Kong in addition to the four pillar industries," after "convention and exhibition industry"; to add "optimize the use of border areas and vacated factory buildings to" after "urges the Government to"; to add ", thus turning Hong Kong into an all-year-round capital of international exhibitions and sales, so as" after "supporting facilities"; to add "leading" after "to maintain its"; to delete "as" after "position" and substitute with "in"; and to delete "capital of" before "Asia" and substitute with "industry in".

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Five Members and Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:50 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Four other Members and Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 7:24 pm, while Hon CHOY So-yuk was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke again.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's amendment to Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

Next Meeting

As a quorum was not present 15 minutes after Members had been summoned, the President adjourned the Council in accordance with Rule 17(2) of the Rules of Procedure, until 11:00 am on 24 October 2007.

The Council was adjourned at 7:58 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 17/10/2007
時間 TIME: 05:25:05 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 劉健儀議員對李永達議員的「專營巴士票價」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON MIRIAM LAU TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON
"FRANCHISED BUS FARES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	17	9	
反對 No	5	15	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

U. Wan Lam

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 17/10/2007
時間 TIME: 05:28:49 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對李永達議員的「專營巴士票價」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON
"FRANCHISED BUS FARES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	9	23	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	13	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃杏根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

Vivian Chan

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 17/10/2007
 時間 TIME: 05:31:21 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張學明議員對李永達議員的「專營巴士票價」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG HOK-MING TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON
 "FRANCHISED BUS FARES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	25	
投票 Vote	23	24	
贊成 Yes	9	23	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	13	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

Vivian Chan

投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 17/10/2007
 時間 TIME: 05:36:31 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「專營巴士票價」議案
 MOTION ON "FRANCHISED BUS FARES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達 LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	24	
投票 Vote	23	23	
贊成 Yes	9	22	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	13	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

William Chan