

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 5

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 31 October 2007 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

**Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) (Amendment) Regulation 2007 (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	193/2007
2. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) (Amendment) Regulation 2006 (Amendment) Regulation 2007 (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	194/2007
3. Air Navigation (Hong Kong) Order 1995 (Amendment of Schedule 16) Order 2007 (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	195/2007
4. Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 1) Order 2007 (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	196/2007
5. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2006 (Amendment) Order 2007 (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	197/2007
6. Securities and Futures (Contracts Limits and Reportable Positions) (Amendment) (No. 2) Rules 2007 (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	198/2007
7. Fugitive Offenders (Corruption) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	199/2007
8. Rail Merger Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	200/2007
9. Unsolicited Electronic Messages Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	201/2007
10. Unsolicited Electronic Messages Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 26.10.2007)	202/2007

**Other Papers**

- No.19 - Electrical and Mechanical Services Trading Fund Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 24.10.2007)
- No.20 - Consumer Council Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 26.10.2007)
- No.21 - Office of the Telecommunications Authority Trading Fund Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 29.10.2007)
- No.22 - Annual Report 2006 to the Chief Executive by the Commissioner on Interception of Communications and Surveillance (together with a statement under section 49(4) of the Interception of Communications and Surveillance Ordinance) (published on 29.10.2007)
- No.23 - Post Office Trading Fund Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 30.10.2007)
- No.24 - Hong Kong Council on Smoking and Health Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 30.10.2007)

**Questions**

1. Hon TAM Heung-man asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Nine Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

2. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

4. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

5. Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

6. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Motions**

#### **Proposed resolution under the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters Ordinance**

The Secretary for Security moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Malaysia) Order, made by the Chief Executive in Council on 8 May 2007, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon James TO spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Malaysia) Order.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Members' Motions**

**Facing up to the needs of people with disabilities in using transport**

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council passed motions in the 2002-2003, 2003-2004, 2005-2006 and 2006-2007 sessions calling for improvement to transport facilities for people with disabilities and offer of concessionary fares to them, but the government departments concerned, some statutory transport corporations and other public transport operators have failed to take corresponding measures and face up to the requests; this Council considers that for many years there is a general consensus in the community that there is a need to offer transport concessions to help people with disabilities to integrate into society and the Government is duty-bound to take the matter forward, this Council is greatly dissatisfied and expresses deep regret that the Government has been procrastinating for years and has not achieved any results so far; moreover, some transport operators have recently proposed that the Government should bear all the deficits or keep all the surpluses arising from the introduction of half-fare concession for people with disabilities, but the Government has been procrastinating on the matter on the ground of financial commitments, which calls into question the Government's sincerity in taking the matter forward; in this connection, this Council reiterates that the Government:

- (a) must put forth, in the near future, specific proposals and timeframe for introducing half-fare concession for people with disabilities, so as to expeditiously facilitate their integration into society and improve their life;
- (b) should allocate additional resources to improve the Rehabus service; and
- (c) should strictly regulate the public transport operators in providing barrier-free facilities, so as to enable more people with disabilities to use transport and integrate into society.

While Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:11 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's motion proposed.



The President's Deputy stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "this Council passed" after "That" and substitute with ", although the Chief Executive, in response to Members' questions during the Legislative Council's Question and Answer Session on the Policy Address on the 11th of this month, said that he would give a response, in one or two months' time, on how the provision of transport half-fare concessions for people with disabilities would be addressed, in view of the past records that despite this Council's passage of"; to delete "but" after "offer of concessionary fares to them,"; to add "all" after "other public transport operators have"; to add ", there are worries about further procrastination by the government departments" after "take corresponding measures and face up to the requests"; to add "after a relevant subcommittee was formed by the Legislative Council and meetings held over the past year or so, coupled with the fact that the Chairman of the Equal Opportunities Commission has written to the Chief Executive relaying the demands and justifications in this regard, the solution to this problem has dawned;" after "has not achieved any results so far,"; to delete "Government has been procrastinating on the matter on the ground of financial commitments, which" after "keep all the surpluses arising from the introduction of half-fare concession for people with disabilities, but the" and substitute with "government officials in charge have been procrastinating on putting forward a timetable and roadmap for implementation on the pretext that they have not yet assessed the various options and worked out precisely the financial commitments involved if the relevant option is chosen, which very much"; to add "determination and" after "calls into question the Government's"; to delete "reiterates" after "in this connection, this Council" and substitute with "urges"; to add "(a) must relentlessly shoulder the responsibility to provide financial assistance, regardless of which option of transport half-fare concession it eventually decides to adopt for people with disabilities;" after "that the Government:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(b)"; to add "expeditiously" before "put forth"; to delete "timeframe" after "in the near future, specific proposals and" and substitute with "timetable"; to delete "expeditiously facilitate their integration" after "introducing half-fare concession for people with disabilities, so as to" and substitute with "help them integrate"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to add "comprehensively" after "should allocate additional resources to"; to add "and, in particular, must extend such service to remote areas and new towns" after "improve the Rehabus service"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; and to add "public" after "providing barrier-free facilities, so as to enable more people with disabilities to use".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Six Members and Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 2:17 pm, while Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eleven other Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's motion put and agreed to.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung replied.

Question on Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing put and agreed to.

**Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor and re-establishing the Commission on Poverty**

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the disparity between the rich and the poor is becoming more serious in Hong Kong, this Council urges the Government to re-establish the Commission on Poverty and formulate a more comprehensive policy on combating poverty so as to narrow the gap between the rich and the poor, thereby improving the life of the poor, reducing social conflicts and promoting harmonious social development.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LI Kwok-ying, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon SIN Chung-kai would move an amendment to Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LI Kwok-ying, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG and Hon SIN Chung-kai spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Six Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 5:23 pm, the President left the chair temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two other Members and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 5:40 pm, while Dr Hon YEUNG Sum was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the President's permission, Hon CHAN Kam-lam elucidated on a point he had made earlier, which had been misunderstood by Hon Albert HO.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon LI Kwok-ying moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To add "the Chief Executive has advocated 'investing for a caring society' in this year's Policy Address and has correspondingly put forward improvement measures, but" after "That,"; to add "the relevant measures are inadequate to resolve the problems," after "more serious in Hong Kong,"; to add "take positive actions and, when necessary," after "urges the Government to"; to delete "and" after "the Commission on Poverty" and substitute with ", so as to"; to delete "so as to" after "policy on combating poverty" and substitute with ","; to delete "thereby improving" after "the rich and the poor," and substitute with "improve"; to delete "reducing" after "the life of the poor," and substitute with "reduce"; to delete "promoting" after "social conflicts and" and substitute with "promote"; and to add "; meanwhile, this Council also urges the Government to implement the following measures: (a) abolishing the restrictions on the permitted period of absence from Hong Kong for applicants of the Old Age Allowance; (b) extending the period during which the On-the-job Training Allowance is payable under the Employment Programme for the Middle-aged; (c) providing concessionary transport fares for persons with disabilities; (d) allocating additional resources to assist poor children so that they can enjoy more opportunities for proper development; (e) formulating measures to facilitate the integration of the socially disadvantaged (such as the new arrivals and ethnic minorities, etc) into the community; and (f) further improving the quality of public medical services, and alleviating the medical burden on the socially disadvantaged" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LI Kwok-ying's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, three against it and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor and re-establishing the Commission on Poverty" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To delete "re-establish the" after "urges the Government to" and substitute with "establish a"; to delete "and formulate" after "Commission on Poverty" and substitute with "with substantive powers so that"; and to add "can be formulated, including introducing a progressive tax system for wealth redistribution," after "policy on combating poverty".

Question on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment:

To delete "including introducing a progressive tax system for wealth redistribution" after "can be formulated," and substitute with "and the Government should also introduce progressive rates of profits tax and rates charges, and abolish the standard rate for salaries tax".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 13 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To add "and targeted" after "more comprehensive"; to delete "so as to narrow the gap between the rich and the poor" after "policy on combating poverty" and substitute with ", particularly in remote areas where a large number of low-income and socially disadvantaged families live, but the leisure and cultural facilities, medical and social services fall far short of the actual needs of the residents; as such, the Government must take into full account the characteristics of the population structures in these areas when allocating community facilities and services, appropriately relax the ratio of population to such facilities and services, and providing strategic and more specialized support services

targeted at socially disadvantaged families such as those which are single-parent, poor, under the potential threat of domestic violence, or having family members who are mentally or chronically ill or disabled, including the reopening of Single Parent Centres and Post Migration Centres in the districts concerned"; to delete ", reducing" after "the life of the poor" and substitute with "; at the same time, the Government should strive to create more employment opportunities in these areas, and relax the eligibility criteria for applying for the pilot Transport Support Scheme, so as to alleviate the burden of travelling expenses on the residents concerned, narrow the gap between the rich and the poor, reduce"; and to delete "promoting" after "social conflicts and" and substitute with "promote".

Question on Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 24 were in favour of the amendment and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 23 were in favour of the amendment and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG put.

Hon Miriam LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 23 were in favour of the motion as amended and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 22 were in favour of the motion as amended and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended was carried.

**Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 7 November 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:55 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 31/10/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:39:25 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李國英議員對馮檢基議員的「改善貧富懸殊，重設扶貧委員會」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON LI KWOK-YING TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON  
"ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR AND RE-  
ESTABLISHING THE COMMISSION ON POVERTY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李國英 LI Kwok-ying

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	24	
投票 Vote	25	23	
贊成 Yes	20	9	
反對 No	0	3	
棄權 Abstain	5	11	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 31/10/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:43:15 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 單仲偕議員就梁國雄議員對馮檢基議員的「改善貧富懸殊，重設扶貧委員會」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON SIN CHUNG-KAI'S AMENDMENT TO HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR AND RE-ESTABLISHING THE COMMISSION ON POVERTY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	8	16	
反對 No	13	1	
棄權 Abstain	4	7	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 31/10/2007  
 時間 TIME: 06:45:26 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁國雄議員對馮檢基議員的「改善貧富懸殊，重設扶貧委員會」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON  
 "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR AND RE-  
 ESTABLISHING THE COMMISSION ON POVERTY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	6	10	
反對 No	13	1	
棄權 Abstain	6	13	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 31/10/2007  
 時間 TIME: 06:47:53 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張超雄議員對馮檢基議員的「改善貧富懸殊，重設扶貧委員會」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION  
 ON "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR AND RE-  
 ESTABLISHING THE COMMISSION ON POVERTY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	24	23	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	1	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉石石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 31/10/2007  
時間 TIME: 06:54:59 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由馮檢基議員動議，經李國英議員、~~梁國雄議員~~及單仲偕議員及張超雄議員修正的「改善貧富懸殊，重設扶貧委員會」議案  
MOTION MOVED BY HON FREDERICK FUNG ON "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR AND RE-ESTABLISHING THE COMMISSION ON POVERTY" AS AMENDED BY HON LI KWOK-YING, ~~HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG~~, AND ~~HON SIN CHUNG KAI~~ AND DR HON FERNANDO CHEUNG

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	23	22	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	2	2	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

秘書 CLERK