

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 7

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 14 November 2007 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon Ceajer CHAN Ka-keung, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

No.27 - Report on the Administration of the Immigration Service Welfare Fund prepared by the Director of Immigration Incorporated in accordance with Regulation 12(b) of the Immigration Service (Welfare Fund) Regulation (published on 8.11.2007)

No.28 - Construction Workers Registration Authority Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 8.11.2007)

Report of the Bills Committee on Attachment of Income Order (Application to Government and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2007 (published on 8.11.2007)

Questions

1. Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Labour and Welfare and the Secretary for Education replied.

5. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

6. Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Attachment of Income Order (Application to Government and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2007

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 27 June 2007 resumed.

Hon CHOY So-yuk, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Attachment of Income Order (Application to Government and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2007, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. She then spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Another Member spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Attachment of Income Order (Application to Government and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2007**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 4, 6, 8, 9 and 10 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 5 and 7 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 5 and 7, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Home Affairs reported that

the **Attachment of Income Order (Application to Government and Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2007**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance

The Secretary for the Environment moved the motion in Appendix I and addressed the Council.

Question on the motion proposed.

Two Members and Hon Audrey EU spoke on the motion.

While Hon Audrey EU was speaking, Hon Miriam LAU sought, with the President's permission, elucidation by Hon Audrey EU of a point raised in her speech.

Hon Audrey EU elucidated and continued to speak.

Three other Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Rates relief

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the government revenue of the current year is far better than expected, this Council urges the Government to provide rates relief to return wealth to the people, including waiving the rates for the whole year of 2008-2009 and reducing the rates percentage charge from the existing 5% to 3%.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon SIN Chung-kai, Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah and Hon CHAN Kam-lam would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon Miriam LAU would move an amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon SIN Chung-kai, Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Miriam LAU spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury was speaking, the President left the chair at 3:20 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Eleven Members and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 4:28 pm, while Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW sought, with the President's permission, elucidation by Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung of a point raised in his speech.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung elucidated and continued to speak.

Six more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke again.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion:

To delete "as the government revenue of the current year is far better than expected" after "That," and substitute with "although Hong Kong's economy has recorded continuous growth, the public at large are still unable to share the fruits of economic success, and as the fiscal surplus of the current year is expected to far exceed the Government's original estimates"; to add "and ease the pressure of inflation" after "to return wealth to the people"; to add ", subject to a ceiling of \$5,000 per quarter per household, and introducing a progressive rates system under which different levels of rates percentage charges are set according to the rateable values, with lower percentages for smaller rateable values," after "2008-2009"; to add "of the lowest level" after "reducing the rates percentage charge"; and to delete "3%" after "5% to" and substitute with "2%".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 12 were against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 13 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Rates relief" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion:

To delete ", as the government revenue of the current year is far better than expected" after "That" and substitute with "the Financial Secretary advised in mid-October this year that the fiscal surplus of the current year would amount to \$50 billion, far exceeding the estimate of \$25.4 billion; in view of this"; and to delete "provide rates relief to return wealth to the people, including waiving the rates for the whole year of 2008-2009 and reducing the rates percentage charge from the existing 5% to 3%" after "this Council urges the Government to" and substitute with "introduce three-tier progressive rates under which the rates percentage charge of properties with a monthly rateable value below \$7,500 will be reduced from the existing 5% to 3.5% and the rates percentage charge of properties with a monthly rateable value between \$7,500 and \$30,000 will be reduced from the existing 5% to 4%, while the rates percentage charge of other properties will be reduced from the existing 5% to 4.5%, so as to alleviate the tax burden on the public and return wealth to the people".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and 10 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion:

To add "the rentals of different types of properties have been rising in recent years and" after "That, as"; to add "also" after "the current year is"; to add ", subject to a ceiling of \$5,000 per quarter," after "2008-2009"; and to delete "3%" after "5% to" and substitute with "4.5%, which will not only alleviate the burden on the public and the businesses, but can also avoid creating long-term pressure on government revenue".

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion proposed.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment:

To delete "4.5%" after "5% to" and substitute with "below 5%".

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment, as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon CHAN Kam-lam had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment if Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment was agreed. Hon CHAN Kam-lam had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment as amended by Hon Miriam LAU had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah moved the following further amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon Miriam LAU, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; when providing rates relief, the aspirations of the grassroots community for fair allocation of resources should be taken into account" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon Miriam LAU proposed and put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, one against it and 17 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming replied.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon Miriam LAU put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion as amended and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 18 were in favour of the motion as amended, one against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended was carried.

Developing diversified hawking and bazaar economic activities

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in order to fully utilize human and land resources, develop diversified hawking and bazaar economic activities to enhance the attractiveness of tourism in Hong Kong, as well as to further revitalize on-street economy and diversified economic activities in remote new towns, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) preserve existing bazaars which have local economic, cultural and native characteristics, and assist in the sustainable development of such bazaars;
- (b) establish and develop new marketplaces with various characteristics, such as creativity bazaars and marketplaces for organic fishery and agricultural produce;
- (c) set up designated zones for street art performance, arts fairs and the like in order to encourage and promote the culture of street art performance, preserve collective memories, and maintain, discover and nurture the culture and talents of folk art performance;
- (d) set up various types of dawn markets and night markets at suitable locations so that those running small businesses who are self-reliant and self-supporting can have a way out;
- (e) explore the setting up of on-street cooked food designated zones featuring specialty food and drinks;

- (f) expeditiously conduct a comprehensive review on the policies for hawker licensing and management to tie in with the objective of promoting diversified hawking and bazaar economic activities; and
- (g) proactively explore with various District Councils to implement the above measures and means for revitalizing the diversified economy and culture in the districts,

so as to provide the grass-roots with opportunities for starting up small businesses and employment.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang and Hon Audrey EU, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Five Members and Hon James TO spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon James TO was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:03 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Five other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke again.

At 7:43 pm, while the Secretary for Home Affairs was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To add "as open-air bazaars not only feature local characteristics, which are one of Hong Kong's tourist attractions, their operations are also diversified and have a low threshold of entry, hence conducive to encouraging start-up businesses, and" after "That,"; to add "and revitalize" after "(a) preserve"; to delete "assist in" after "native characteristics, and" and substitute with "launch beautification works, enhance management and promotion, so as to foster the viability and promote"; to add ", and handle licence renewal applications with flexibility" after "licensing and management"; and to delete "objective of" after "to tie in with the" and substitute with "objectives of increasing employment,".

Question on Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Vincent FANG Kang's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion as amended by Hon Vincent FANG Kang, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "assist in the sustainable development of bazaars, particularly those under the threat of urban renewal; (h) commend bazaars and marketplaces with creativity in various districts and promote them to overseas tourists; (i) relax street control and management, remove unnecessary regulations and restrictions, designate permitted areas for street art performance, and reduce intervention by law enforcement officers in street art activities in such areas; (j) designate permitted areas for dawn markets and night markets, and provide regular cleaning service, traffic control, electricity supply and storage space; (k) resume licensing for hawkers; and (l)" after "(g)".

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion as amended by Hon Vincent FANG Kang proposed and put.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, two against it and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing replied.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion as amended by Hon Vincent FANG Kang put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 21 November 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:57 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

DUTIABLE COMMODITIES ORDINANCE

RESOLUTION

(Under section 4(2) of the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance (Cap. 109))

RESOLVED that the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance (Cap. 109) be amended, in Part III of Schedule 1—

- (a) in paragraph 1 —
- (i) by repealing “Subject to paragraph 1A, duty” and substituting “Duty”;
 - (ii) by adding “(other than ultra low sulphur diesel and Euro V diesel)” after “hydrocarbon oil”;
- (b) by adding —
- “1B. Duty shall be payable on Euro V diesel at the following rates —
- (a) from 1 December 2007 to 30 November 2009 (both dates inclusive), at \$0.56 per litre; and
 - (b) from 1 December 2009, at \$2.89 per litre.”;
- (c) by repealing —
- “**Note:** In this Part, “ISO” followed by a numerical symbol (“ISO number”) means the test procedures of the International Organization for Standardization commonly known by that ISO number.”;

(d) by adding –

“6. For the purposes of paragraph 1B, “Euro V diesel” (歐盟 V 期柴油) means a light diesel oil which –

- (a) contains not more than 10.0 mg/kg of sulphur as determined by ISO 20884;
- (b) has a cetane number of not less than 51.0 as determined by ISO 5165;
- (c) has a cetane index of not lower than 46.0 as determined by ISO 4264;
- (d) has a viscosity at 40°C of not lower than 2.00 mm²/s and not higher than 4.50 mm²/s as determined by ISO 3104;
- (e) contains not more than 11% by mass of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons as determined by IP 391;
- (f) has a 95% distillation temperature of not higher than 360°C as determined by ISO 3405;
- (g) has a distillation percentage recovered at 250°C of lower than 65% by volume as determined by ISO 3405;
- (h) has a distillation percentage recovered at 350°C of not lower

- than 85% by volume as determined by ISO 3405;
- (i) has a density at 15°C of not lower than 0.820 kg/L and not higher than 0.845 kg/L as determined by ISO 3675;
 - (j) has a flash point of above 55°C as determined by ISO 2719;
 - (k) contains not more than 0.30% by mass of carbon residue (on 10% distillation residue) as determined by ISO 10370;
 - (l) contains not more than 0.01% by mass of ash as determined by ISO 6245;
 - (m) contains not more than 200 mg/kg of water as determined by ISO 12937;
 - (n) contains total contamination of not more than 24 mg/kg as determined by ISO 12662;
 - (o) has a copper strip corrosion (3h at 50°C) rating of Class 1 as determined by ISO 2160;
 - (p) has an oxidation stability of not higher than 25 g/m³ as determined by ISO 12205; and
 - (q) has a lubricity, corrected wear scar diameter (wsd 1.4) at 60°C,

of not higher than 460 μm as determined by ISO 12156-1.

Note: In this Part –

“IP” followed by a numerical symbol (“IP number”) means the test procedures of the Institute of Petroleum commonly known by that IP number;

“ISO” followed by a numerical symbol (“ISO number”) means the test procedures of the International Organization for Standardization commonly known by that ISO number;

“viscosity” (黏度) means the viscosity of diesel as determined by ISO 3104.”.

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 14/11/2007
時間 TIME: 05:28:58 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對張學明議員的「減免差餉」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S MOTION ON
"RATES RELIEF"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	26	
投票 Vote	24	25	
贊成 Yes	5	11	
反對 No	12	1	
棄權 Abstain	7	13	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 14/11/2007
 時間 TIME: 05:32:25 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 單仲偕議員對張學明議員的「減免差餉」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON SIN CHUNG-KAI TO HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S MOTION ON
 "RATES RELIEF"

動議人 MOVED BY: 單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	3	7	
反對 No	15	8	
棄權 Abstain	7	10	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN		

秘書 CLERK

Yvonne Chan

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 14/11/2007
時間 TIME: 05:38:43 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對張學明議員就「減免差餉」所提，經林健鋒議員及劉健儀議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S MOTION ON "RATES RELIEF" AS AMENDED BY HON JEFFREY LAM AND HON MIRIAM LAU

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	7	15	
反對 No	1	0	
棄權 Abstain	17	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂護申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES		

Winnie Chan

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4
日期 DATE: 14/11/2007
時間 TIME: 05:42:31 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由張學明議員動議，經馮檢基議員／單仲偕議員／林健鋒議員 及劉健儀議員／及湯家驊議員／陳鑑林議員修正的「減免差餉」議案
MOTION MOVED BY HON CHEUNG HOK-MING ON "RATES RELIEF" AS AMENDED BY HON FREDERICK FUNG / HON SIN CHUNG-KAI / HON JEFFREY LAM, AND HON MIRIAM LAU AND / HON RONNY TONG / HON CHAN KAM-LAM

動議人 MOVED BY: 張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	26	
投票 Vote	25	25	
贊成 Yes	20	18	
反對 No	0	1	
棄權 Abstain	5	6	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	棄權 ABSTAIN		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
日期 DATE: 14/11/2007
時間 TIME: 07:53:29 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 余若薇議員對王國興議員就「發展多元化販商和市集經濟活動」所提，經方剛議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON AUDREY EU TO HON WONG KWOK-HING'S MOTION ON "DEVELOPING DIVERSIFIED HAWKING AND BAZAAR ECONOMIC ACTIVITIES" AS AMENDED BY HON VINCENT FANG

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	19	
投票 Vote	23	18	
贊成 Yes	7	7	
反對 No	11	2	
棄權 Abstain	5	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	棄權	ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			何俊仁	Albert HO	棄權	ABSTAIN
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權	ABSTAIN	李柱銘	Martin LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	棄權	ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	棄權	ABSTAIN	涂謹申	James TO	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	棄權	ABSTAIN
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG			梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權	ABSTAIN
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	棄權	ABSTAIN	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	棄權	ABSTAIN
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU		
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	棄權	ABSTAIN
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying		
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man						

秘書 CLERK