

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 9

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 28 November 2007 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

Member absent:

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP

The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP

Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP

Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP

Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP

Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Rating (Exemption) (No.2) Order 2007 (gazetted on 23.11.2007)	221/2007
2. Tsing Sha Control Area (General) Regulation (gazetted on 23.11.2007)	222/2007

Other Papers

- No.30 - Accounts of the Government for the year ended 31 March 2007 (published on 22.11.2007)
- No.31 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the second quarter of 2007-2008 (Public Finance Ordinance : Section 8) (published on 22.11.2007)
- No.32 - Report of the Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March 2007 (published on 28.11.2007)
- No.33 - Report No. 49 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits - October 2007 (published on 28.11.2007)
- No.34 - Ocean Park Corporation Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 28.11.2007)
- No.35 - The Government Minute in response to the Nineteenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2007 (published on 28.11.2007)

Addresses

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, a Board Member of the Ocean Park Corporation, addressed the Council on the Ocean Park Corporation Annual Report 2006-2007.

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Nineteenth Annual Report of the Ombudsman issued in June 2007.

Hon Miriam LAU, Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai, Hon Albert HO, Hon Andrew CHENG, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW consecutively addressed the Council on the Rail Merger Ordinance (Commencement) Notice, which was subsidiary legislation laid on the table of the Council on 31 October 2007.

Questions

1. Hon Albert CHAN asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

2. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

4. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

5. Hon CHAN Kam-lam asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

6. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Maintaining the political neutrality of the civil service

Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to adopt all measures to maintain a quality, professional, politically neutral, clean and public-spirited civil service, and to clearly delineate the division of powers, responsibilities and roles between the civil service and the politically appointed officials.

While Hon Margaret NG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:52 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Margaret NG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit would move an amendment to the motion and that Hon TAM Yiu-chung would move an amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion and addressed the Council:

To add ", as there are still loopholes in the accountability system for principal officials since its implementation, and the Government, before conducting a comprehensive review of the accountability system, has put forward the proposal to further develop the political appointment system," after "That"; to add "clearly delineate the division of powers, responsibilities and roles between the civil service and the politically appointed officials, in order to" after "adopt all measures to"; to delete ", and to clearly delineate the division of powers, responsibilities and roles between the civil service and the politically appointed officials" after "public-spirited civil service" and substitute with "; the relevant measures should include expeditiously commencing a review of the accountability system for principal officials before implementing the further development of the political appointment system".

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion proposed.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment and addressed the Council:

To delete "there are still loopholes in the accountability system for principal officials since its implementation, and" after "That, as"; to delete ", before conducting a comprehensive review of the accountability system," after "the Government"; to delete "in order" after "the politically appointed officials," and substitute with "and"; and to delete "include expeditiously commencing a review of the accountability system for principal officials before implementing the further development of the political appointment system" after "the relevant measures should" and substitute with "ensure that the policies of the SAR Government can be fully implemented to achieve effective governance".

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for the Civil Service stated that contrary to what Hon Margaret NG had said earlier, she had been in the Chamber since the commencement of the motion debate.

Two Members and Hon Andrew CHENG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:43 pm, while Hon Andrew CHENG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The President stated that as Hon Andrew CHENG had mentioned in his speech the name of one of the candidates running for the Legislative Council by-election, for fairness, he should also mention the names of the other seven candidates. Hon Andrew CHENG mentioned the names of such candidates accordingly.

Five other Members and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke on the motion and the amendments.

As Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong had mentioned in his speech the names of two of the candidates running for the Legislative Council by-election, the President requested him to also mention the names of the other six candidates. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong mentioned the names of such candidates accordingly.

Hon Margaret NG spoke on the amendments. She also apologized to the Secretary for the Civil Service because she had mistakenly said at the commencement of the debate that the Secretary was not then in the Chamber.

The Secretary for the Civil Service spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again. As the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs had mentioned in his speech the names of seven candidates running for the Legislative Council by-election, the President asked him to also mention the name of the remaining candidate. The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs mentioned the name of that candidate accordingly.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon Margaret NG's motion put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 18 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and three abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Margaret NG replied.

Question on Hon Margaret NG's motion put and agreed to.

Responding to the problem of climate change

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as climate change has become an important issue in sustainable development worldwide, the United Nations will convene a summit on climate change in Bali in December this year, and many countries and places are working together to formulate effective measures to reduce greenhouse gas emissions; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to lead Hong Kong in shouldering its due responsibilities as an international city and take proactive actions to respond to the crisis of climate warming, which include:

- (a) setting up an inter-departmental working group on climate change under the leadership of the Chief Executive to demonstrate the Government's determination to respond to climate change, as well as to more effectively coordinate the efforts of various departments in formulating emissions reduction and adaptation policies;
- (b) stipulating concrete targets in the reduction of total greenhouse gas emissions;
- (c) including the limits on the amount of greenhouse gas emissions in the terms of the new Scheme of Control Agreement with the two power companies;
- (d) proactively promoting territory-wide greening work, collaborating with District Councils and the private sector in expediting the development of Greening Master Plans, and actively adopting the concepts of vertical greening and rooftop greening etc. to facilitate three-dimensional development of greened areas and make available additional space for greening;
- (e) legislating for mandatory implementation of the Building Energy Codes;
- (f) expediting full implementation of the Mandatory Energy Efficiency Labelling Scheme; and
- (g) optimizing the use of greenhouse gas emitted from landfill sites.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Miriam LAU and Hon Audrey EU, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Audrey EU was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:01 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, who would move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 5:15 pm, while Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon SIN Chung-kai, who would move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Twelve Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion:

To add "climate abnormalities frequently occur in Hong Kong in recent years and" after "That, as"; to add "also" after "climate change has"; to add "(a) strengthening cooperation with the Mainland, particularly Guangdong Province, to work together to respond to the problem of climate warming;" after "which include:"; to delete the original "(a)" and substitute with "(b)"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(e)"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete the original "(f)" and substitute with "(g)"; to delete and "(g)" after "Mandatory Energy Efficiency Labelling Scheme;" and substitute with "(h)"; and to add "; and (i) enhancing publicity and education on energy conservation so that members of the public will start with themselves to reduce greenhouse gas emissions" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; and (j) proactively developing renewable energy for electricity generation, including providing financial incentives and technical support to facilitate grid connection of small-scale renewable energy power systems" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's and Hon Audrey EU's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung moved the following further amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU and Hon Audrey EU, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; and legislating for mandatory implementation of the Building Energy Codes only after extensive consultation" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU and Hon Audrey EU proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's, Hon Audrey EU's and Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon SIN Chung-kai to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following further amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Audrey EU and Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; in addition, the Government should also set targets for local electricity supply to be provided from renewable energy sources, including achieving 5% of total electricity supply to local households from such sources by 2020; establish mandatory minimum energy efficiency standards for products and consider following the example of Australia to mandate the phasing out of tungsten light bulbs in the next five to 10 years; take proactive steps to compensate carbon emissions, including calculating the amount of carbon emissions generated from energy used within government departments in their daily activities and making a corresponding amount of donations for tree planting, with a view to meeting the target of 'zero carbon emissions' in the long run; include carbon dioxide emission project in the emission trading pilot scheme in the Pearl River Delta region; and launch a 'dress casual in summer' campaign within government departments" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Audrey EU and Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHOY So-yuk replied.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon Audrey EU, Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon SIN Chung-kai put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 5 December 2007 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:32 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 28/11/2007
時間 TIME: 04:29:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 譚耀宗議員就梁家傑議員對吳靄儀議員的「維持公務員政治中立」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案
HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON ALAN LEONG'S AMENDMENT TO HON MARGARET NG'S MOTION ON "MAINTAINING THE POLITICAL NEUTRALITY OF THE CIVIL SERVICE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	24	
投票 Vote	27	23	
贊成 Yes	21	10	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	6	11	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

秘書 CLERK

Vivian Chan

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 28/11/2007
 時間 TIME: 04:34:07 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對吳靄儀議員的「維持公務員政治中立」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON MARGARET NG'S MOTION ON
 "MAINTAINING THE POLITICAL NEUTRALITY OF THE CIVIL SERVICE"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	24	
投票 Vote	27	23	
贊成 Yes	5	12	
反對 No	18	8	
棄權 Abstain	4	3	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
譚香文 TAM Heung-man			

秘書 CLERK

W. K. Chan