

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 14

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 16 January 2008 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

The Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
Road Traffic (Driving Licences) (Amendment) Regulation 2008 (gazetted on 11.1.2008)	3/2008

### **Other Papers**

No.57 - Legal Aid Services Council  
Annual Report 2006-2007 (published on 10.1.2008)

### **Questions**

1. Hon LAU Kong-wah asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Hon LAU Kong-wah raised a point of order on why the Secretary for Civil Services was not present at the meeting to reply to this question, which he considered was related to civil service matters. The President stated that it was up to the Government to designate which public officer(s) to reply to questions. During the Question Time of a Council meeting, Members might not request the Government to explain why it did not designate a certain public officer to reply to a certain question. However, Hon LAU Kong-wah might, through other channels, request the Government to explain why it did not make the arrangements which he considered appropriate.

Four other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon CHAN Yuen-han asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

3. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

4. Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

5. Hon James TIEN asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

6. Hon TAM Heung-man asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## Bills

### First Reading

#### **Munsang College and Heep Yunn School (Change of Corporate Names and General Amendments) Bill 2008**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

#### **Munsang College and Heep Yunn School (Change of Corporate Names and General Amendments) Bill 2008**

The Secretary for Education moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

While the Secretary for Education was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 12:59 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President's Deputy stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## Members' Motions

### Coping with inflation

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the inflation cycle has returned recently, quite a number of public transport operators and public utilities have applied for increase in fares or charges, and the prices for food and oil supplies continue to rise, thus aggravating the burden on the public, this Council urges the Government to adopt measures to cope with inflation so as to alleviate the pressure of livelihood on the public; such measures should include:

- (a) assessing the public's affordability when considering applications for fare increase by public transport operators;
- (b) lowering the rates of permitted return of the two power companies to single digit so as to reduce electricity charges when formulating the new Scheme of Control Agreements;

- (c) discussing with the Mainland authorities to further open up the livestock market in order to protect the interests of Hong Kong consumers, and requesting the major food suppliers to ensure the supply of major food items and foodstuffs from the Mainland so as to prevent the prices of food items from increasing heftily due to insufficient supply; and
- (d) increasing the amount of Old Age Allowance to prevent the quality of life of the elderly from declining.

At 1:02 pm, while Dr Hon YEUNG Sum was addressing the Council, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion proposed.

The President stated that six Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the six amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon CHAN Yuen-han, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon CHAN Yuen-han was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:48 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Emily LAU and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Thirteen Members and Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:48 pm while Hon CHIM Pui-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Six other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke again.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion:



To delete "as" after "That," and substitute with "the problem of disparity between the rich and the poor in Hong Kong continues to worsen, wages of the grassroots have not increased and"; to add "waiving the rates and Government rent for the whole of the next financial year, subject to a ceiling of \$5,000 per quarter per household; (b) waiving the rent of public rental housing for one to two months; (c)" after "(a)"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(e)"; and to delete "and (d)" after "from increasing heftily due to insufficient supply;" and substitute with "(f) adopting the method whereby the rates of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance payments are determined on the basis of the inflation forecast, and shortening the adjustment cycle; and (g)".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion proposed and put.

Hon James TIEN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and two abstained. (Voting record in the Appendix.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Coping with inflation" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Tommy CHEUNG to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "reviewing the weightings of individual consumption items in the Social Security Assistance Index of Prices, so as to assist families on Comprehensive Social Security Assistance in coping with the impact brought about by inflation; and (h)" after "(g)".

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's and Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Kam-lam to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon Tommy CHEUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; (i) reducing the electricity charges chargeable by the two power companies immediately after the new Scheme of Control Agreements take effect; (j) freezing various Government fees and charges which affect people's livelihood; (k) actively studying various measures to reduce the tolls of the Eastern Harbour Crossing, Western Harbour Crossing and Route 3 (Country Park Section), including buying them out or extending their franchise periods; and (l) providing two additional months of Social Security Allowance and Comprehensive Social Security Assistance payments" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon Tommy CHEUNG proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's, Hon Tommy CHEUNG's and Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Yuen-han to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon CHAN Kam-lam, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; (m) using the fiscal surplus to waive the fees and charges for public facilities and services provided by the Government; (n) drawing up a new water supply agreement with the Guangdong Province with payment based on the supply quantity, so as to lower the water charges payable by the public; (o) enhancing competition among oil companies in Hong Kong, and waiving the levy on processed oil when oil prices are persistently high so as to stabilize oil prices; (p) discussing with the Mainland authorities not to impose export quotas on food and foodstuffs exported to Hong Kong; and (q) providing living supplement to the poor elders not on Comprehensive Social Security Assistance" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon CHAN Kam-lam proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's, Hon Tommy CHEUNG's, Hon CHAN Kam-lam's and Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Emily LAU to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Emily LAU moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon CHAN Yuen-han, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; (r) in respect of the Old Age Allowance (OAA), increasing the amount of Normal OAA and Higher OAA to \$1,000 per month, and relaxing the asset limit of OAA recipients aged 65 to 69 to \$200,000, so as to improve the livelihood of the poor elders; (s) providing transport subsidy for the working poor living in remote areas with a view to improving the livelihood of the working poor and people with low income; and (t) offering public transport half-fare concessions to people with disabilities, or providing them with transport subsidy, and improving facilities in order to reduce the barriers to the disabled" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon CHAN Yuen-han proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's, Hon Tommy CHEUNG's, Hon CHAN Kam-lam's, Hon CHAN Yuen-han's and Hon Emily LAU's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon LEE Cheuk-yan to revise the terms of his amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon CHAN Yuen-han and Hon Emily LAU, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; and (u) discussing with the MTR Corporation to offer fare concessions for rides on all its lines to full-time students aged above 12" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon CHAN Yuen-han and Hon Emily LAU proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum replied.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon CHAN Yuen-han, Hon Emily LAU and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan put and agreed to.

**Protecting the rights and interests of animals**

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals (Amendment) Bill 2006 was passed by this Council last year to increase the penalty for cruelty to animals, yet incidents of animal cruelty still continue to occur; in order to protect the rights and interests of animals, this Council urges the Government to adopt various measures to ensure that animals are protected under the law; the relevant measures should include:

- (a) comprehensively reviewing and amending the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals Ordinance, including reviewing the definition of cruelty to animals and making abandonment of animals an offence of animal cruelty;
- (b) improving the licensing and regulatory system for the sale and breeding of pets and consulting the public before amending the Public Health (Animals and Birds) Ordinance and the relevant regulations, extending the animal registration system to cover cats and other kinds of animals that are commonly kept as pets, improving the licensing and regulatory system for pet shops and breeding farms, introducing legislation to regulate the sources of animals for sale in pet shops, requiring that all such animals should come from licensed breeding farms, and stepping up enforcement actions against unlicensed breeding, so as to stop the entry of animals from unknown sources into the pet market;
- (c) enhancing the transparency of the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department in its handling of stray dogs and cats, treating the animals kindly, abandoning the "Trap-and-Kill" method, cooperating with community organizations in jointly promoting the "Trap-Neuter-Return" programme, and using humane means to deal with the problem of stray dogs and cats, with a view to reducing their number in the community;

- (d) requiring law enforcement officers to actively handle the reports on cruelty to animals from the public, considering drawing on overseas experience to set up "animal police" teams specially tasked to investigate cases of animal cruelty and abandonment, and rigorously enforcing the law to curb the situation of animal cruelty and abandonment from becoming prevalent; and
- (e) studying the provision of places at suitable locations for animals to move around, including providing more parks and leisure venues which are accessible to dogs and cats.

Question on Hon Albert HO's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Audrey EU, Hon CHOY So-yuk and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Four Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert HO spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion:

To add "although" after "That,"; to delete "yet" after "to increase the penalty for cruelty to animals,"; to delete "and" after "becoming prevalent,"; and to add "; (f) actively identifying suitable locations for the provision of public toilets for dogs, so as to make available suitable places for dogs to toilet and improve the environmental hygiene of streets; and (g) actively identifying suitable locations for placing dog excreta collection bins in areas or streets where public toilets for dogs cannot be provided, and increasing the frequency of cleaning and washing to improve environmental hygiene" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; (h) regulating by licensing hospice service for animals; and (i) improving the situation of fragmentation of responsibilities in dealing with the rights and interests of animals, and clearly designating a responsible department to avoid confusion over the implementation of policies" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing proposed, put and agrees to.

The President stated that Hon Mrs Selina CHOW had indicated that she would withdraw her amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion if Hon Audrey EU's amendment was agreed. Hon Mrs Selina CHOW had therefore withdrawn her amendment.

As Hon Audrey EU's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon CHOY So-yuk to revise the terms of her amendment and explain them to the Council.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following further amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Audrey EU, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add "; (j) advising pet shops and private/domestic pet breeders that when selling pets to prospective pet keepers, the former should follow the practice of animal groups in dog adoption by confirming that the deeds of mutual covenant of the buildings where the dog keepers live state that the keeping of dogs is not objected to, so as to reduce the chance of the dogs concerned being abandoned in the future; (k) further educating the public on the concept of animal care and responsible pet ownership, and providing incentives to encourage people to arrange their pets to undergo sterilization and regular physical examinations; (l) ensuring that all dogs are implanted with microchips to fully implement the existing statutory requirements, thereby enabling the relevant authorities to track down the owners of the abandoned dogs according to the stored information and enforcing the penalties; and (m) further educating the public to, before proceeding to keep dogs, carefully consider and ascertain that the deeds of mutual covenant of the buildings where they live state that the keeping of dogs is not objected to and to truly behave as responsible pet owners, so as to reduce the chance of the dogs concerned being abandoned in the future" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Audrey EU proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Audrey EU and Hon CHOY So-yuk put and agreed to.

**Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 17 January 2008 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 6:55 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 16/01/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:44:01 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 馮檢基議員對楊森議員的「應付通脹」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON FREDERICK FUNG TO DR HON YEUNG SUM'S MOTION ON  
 "COPING WITH INFLATION"

動議人 MOVED BY: 馮檢基 Frederick FUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	23	
投票 Vote	23	22	
贊成 Yes	13	20	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	2	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES