

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 22

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 April 2008 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

The Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

**Member absent:**

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (SD)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

**Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Merchant Shipping (Limitation of Shipowners Liability) (Rate of Interest) (Amendment) Order 2008 (gazetted on 14.3.2008)	56/2008
2. Electoral Affairs Commission (Electoral Procedure) (Legislative Council) (Amendment) Regulation 2008 (gazetted on 20.3.2008)	66/2008
3. Public Health and Municipal Services (Setting Aside Places for Use as Public Pleasure Grounds and Cessation of Setting Aside Places for Use as Public Pleasure Grounds) Order 2008 (gazetted on 28.3.2008)	67/2008
4. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Amendment of Fourth Schedule) (No. 2) Order 2008 (gazetted on 28.3.2008)	68/2008
5. Food and Drugs (Composition and Labelling) (Amendment: Requirements for Nutrition Labelling and Nutrition Claim) Regulation 2008 (gazetted on 3.4.2008)	69/2008
6. Pilotage (Dues) (Amendment) Order 2008 (gazetted on 3.4.2008)	70/2008
7. Employees Retraining Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) Notice 2008 (gazetted on 3.4.2008)	71/2008
8. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 3) Notice 2008 (gazetted on 3.4.2008)	72/2008

**Other Papers**

No.80 - The Financial Reporting Council  
Annual Report 2007 (published on 19.3.2008)

- No.81 - Audited Statement of Accounts together with the Director of Audit's Report of the Hong Kong Rotary Club Students' Loan Fund for the year ending 31 August 2007 (published on 31.3.2008)
- No.82 - Audited Statement of Accounts together with the Director of Audit's Report of the Sing Tao Foundation Students' Loan Fund for the year ending 31 August 2007 (published on 31.3.2008)
- No.83 - AIDS Trust Fund 2006-2007 Accounts with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 3.4.2008)
- No.84 - Report No. 50 of the Director of Audit on the results of value for money audits - March 2008 (published on 9.4.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Pneumoconiosis (Compensation) (Amendment) Bill 2008 (published on 8.4.2008)

### Questions

1. Hon Howard YOUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

2. Hon Tommy CHEUNG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

3. Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

5. Hon Mrs Anson CHAN asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

6. Hon Margaret NG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Three Members and Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Hon Ronny TONG ka-wah asked a follow-up question and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied. Mr TONG said that the Secretary had not answered his question. The President said that as she had explained before, government officials were accountable to the public in respect of how they answered questions at Council meetings. If they avoided answering Members' questions, the media and the public would criticize them. As the President, she had no authority to impose requirements on how they should answer Members' questions. Where a Member considered that the relevant government official had not answered the Member's question, but the official said he/she had already done so, the President would not be able to rule on that.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **Pneumoconiosis (Compensation) (Amendment) Bill 2008**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 30 January 2008 resumed.

Hon KWONG Chi-kin, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Pneumoconiosis (Compensation) (Amendment) Bill 2008, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

Three Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Pneumoconiosis (Compensation) (Amendment) Bill 2008**.

Question that clauses 1, 5 to 23, 25 to 28, 30, 55, 56 and 57 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 3, 4, 24, 29 and 31 to 54 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

One Member spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 3, 4, 24, 29 and 31 to 54, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the long title stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved an amendment to the long title and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare reported that

the **Pneumoconiosis (Compensation) (Amendment) Bill 2008**



had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Motions**

#### **Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Trade Descriptions (Definition of Diamond) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 43 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 5 March 2008, be amended, in the Schedule -

- (a) in the English text, by repealing "Moh's" and substituting "Mohs";
- (b) in the Chinese text, by repealing "特定".

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

### **Members' Bills**

#### **First Reading**

##### **Alice Ho Miu Ling Nethersole Charity Foundation Bill**

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

#### **Second Reading**

##### **Alice Ho Miu Ling Nethersole Charity Foundation Bill**

Hon Mrs Selina SHOW moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

**Members' Motions**

**Proposed resolutions under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

**1. The Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 6) Order 2008**

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 6) Order 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 49 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 March 2008, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 30 April 2008.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

**2. The Antiquities and Monuments (Withdrawal of Declaration of Proposed Monument) (No. 128 Pok Fu Lam Road) Notice**

Hon Audrey EU moved the following motion and addressed the Council as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Antiquities and Monuments (Withdrawal of Declaration of Proposed Monument) (No. 128 Pok Fu Lam Road) Notice, and then in her personal capacity as a Member:

RESOLVED that the Antiquities and Monuments (Withdrawal of Declaration of Proposed Monument) (No. 128 Pok Fu Lam Road) Notice, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 21 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 20 February 2008, be repealed.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Development and seven Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Development spoke again.

Hon Audrey EU replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Audrey EU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, six were in favour of the motion, 17 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion, nine against it and one abstained. (Voting record in the Appendix.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Elderly housing policy**

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, given that the Chief Executive's Policy Address emphasizes "quality city and quality life", in facing the two challenges of the appalling living conditions of many elderly persons and the known problem of the ageing population, allocating additional resources to promote comfortable living for all the elderly will be an important strategy to achieve quality life for the whole community, this Council urges the Government to make reference to local and overseas experience to expeditiously formulate, through comprehensive planning, a clear policy on elderly housing, including:

- (a) immediately examining the different housing needs of various categories of elderly persons in various districts in the territory, and formulating guidelines for constructing elderly housing;
- (b) formulating land policies that complement elderly housing, including giving consideration to land supply, land grant and land premium, etc, and setting out explicitly in the Outline Zoning Plan the types of land to be used for building elderly housing;
- (c) providing land at a low price or for free to non-profit-making bodies or organizations that have the interest, ability and experience to build elderly housing, and considering converting vacant schools and old industrial buildings into elderly housing;
- (d) comprehensively reviewing the legislation on lands, planning and buildings, so as to integrate elderly housing into various communities, and providing in the vicinity of elderly housing sufficient community and passive recreational facilities which are needed by the elderly; and

- (e) improving the regulation of care and attention homes and serviced housing for the elderly, so as to provide diversified choices for elderly persons with different means,

thereby truly creating a quality living environment for the people in the territory, including the elderly who will account for over a quarter of the population, and developing a harmonious and integrated quality city for the future of Hong Kong.

While Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 3:45 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon CHAN Yuen-han, Hon Albert HO, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon LEE Wing-tat intended to move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon SIN Chung-kai intended to move an amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon CHAN Yuen-han, Hon Albert HO, Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon SIN Chung-kai who intended to move amendments, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Seven Members and Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 5:55 pm while Hon CHIM Pui-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion:

To delete "given that" after "That," and substitute with "although"; to delete "in facing" after "'quality city and quality life'," and substitute with "it has not put forward any long-term policy objective, and in the face of"; to delete "allocating" after "the ageing population," and substitute with "this Council urges the Government to allocate"; to delete "will be an important strategy" after "all the elderly" and substitute with "so as"; to delete "this Council urges the Government to" after "the whole community," and substitute with "and"; to add ", as well as comprehensively consult the elderly," after "overseas experience"; to add "encouraging people to live with their elderly parents through measures such as perfecting the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance system and offering additional tax concessions, etc, as well as enhancing the support for elderly persons living alone or with another elderly person; (c)" after "(b)"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d) expediting the pace of urban renewal and rehabilitation to improve the living environment for the elderly residing in old districts (including Sham Shui Po and Kwun Tong); (e)"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(f)"; to add "as well as the system for long-term care services and the relevant support measures, with a view to reinforcing the policy objective of 'ageing in the community'," after "planning and buildings,"; to add ", medical care and community care services" after "integrate elderly housing"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(g)"; to add "by increasing the subsidized places and nursing manpower as well as enhancing the transparency of residential care homes for the elderly" after "housing for the elderly"; and to add "and a culture of mutual help and care" after "living environment".

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon CHAN Kam-lam had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion if Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment was agreed. Hon CHAN Kam-lam had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon James TO to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon James TO moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG:

To add "; in addition, in view of the cramped living environment in Hong Kong and the appalling living conditions of many elderly persons, quite a number of elderly persons hope to take up residence on the Mainland upon retirement to enjoy a better housing and living environment; the Government,

in formulating the elderly housing policy, should take into consideration this factor and provide more support and flexibility in such areas as medical care, welfare, etc, for the Hong Kong elderly persons who take up residence on the Mainland, so as to enable the elderly to choose the places where they reside and live upon retirement according to their actual situations and wishes" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's and Hon James TO's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Mrs Selina CHOW to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon James TO:

To add "; at the same time, the Government should also raise the dependent parent/grandparent allowance, and relax the requirement of living together for the purpose of claiming tax deduction, so as to encourage the younger generation to live in the same housing estates as their elderly parents, hence facilitating the provision of appropriate care for the elderly" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon James TO proposed.

Hon SIN Chung-kai moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment:

To delete "as to encourage the younger generation to live in the same housing estates as their elderly parents, hence facilitating the provision of appropriate care for the elderly" after "tax deduction, so" and substitute with "that children living in the same housing estates as their elderly parents or grandparents or living in the vicinity within a specified distance can enjoy the tax allowance, so as to encourage children to take care of their elderly parents and grandparents".

Question on Hon SIN Chung-kai's amendment to Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment, as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai, to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion which had been amended by Hon Frederick FUNG and Hon James TO put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's and Hon James TO's amendments and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Yuen-han to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW and Hon SIN Chung-kai:

To add "; in addition, the Government should: (a) construct public housing units and other types of housing for the elderly according to the different housing needs of various categories of elderly persons in various districts in the territory; (b) when considering converting vacant schools and old industrial buildings into elderly housing, also consider converting them into relevant support facilities, such as elderly centres, to be managed and operated by non-profit-making bodies or organizations; (c) lower the income and asset limit requirements for public housing applicants living with their elderly parents, as well as extend and enhance the various measures under the 'schemes to foster harmonious families' in public housing, thereby enabling more elderly persons to live with their children and be taken care of by their family members; and (d) conduct a comprehensive survey on the housing conditions of elderly persons in Hong Kong, actively help elderly persons living in appalling conditions to improve their living environment, and assist elderly persons with housing needs, such as those living in cubicle apartments and cage homes, to apply for public housing" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW and Hon SIN Chung-kai proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's, Hon James TO's and Hon CHAN Yuen-han's amendments and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Albert HO to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Albert HO moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon SIN Chung-kai and Hon CHAN Yuen-han:

To add "; (e) construct more small public housing flats for the elderly and provide supporting social services; and (f) study the provision of 'residential care vouchers' to eligible elderly persons so that holders of such vouchers can freely purchase residential care services of their choice, as well as introduce a grading system for residential care homes for the elderly to strengthen their regulation, while at the same time expeditiously increase the residential care places for the elderly, so as to resolve the current hardship caused by the excessively long waiting time to those on the central waiting list" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon SIN Chung-kai and Hon CHAN Yuen-han proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Frederick FUNG's, Hon James TO's, Hon CHAN Yuen-han's and Hon Albert HO's amendments and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment as amended by Hon SIN Chung-kai had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon LEE Wing-tat to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon SIN Chung-kai, Hon CHAN Yuen-han and Hon Albert HO:

To add "; and (g) review the policy on public housing for the elderly, including providing housing units of elderly-friendly designs and relevant support facilities on a comprehensive basis, as well as assigning more young families to housing estates where many elderly persons live, so as to inject new vitality into the elderly community" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon SIN Chung-kai, Hon CHAN Yuen-han and Hon Albert HO proposed, put and agreed to.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing replied.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing's motion as amended by Hon Frederick FUNG, Hon James TO, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon SIN Chung-kai, Hon CHAN Yuen-han, Hon Albert HO and Hon LEE Wing-tat put and agreed to.

### **Raising the limit of university places for publicly-funded degree programmes**

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the percentage of the people in Hong Kong who attend universities at the appropriate age has all along been lower than those of the neighbouring regions, and there is presently a keen demand for degree holders in the market, this Council urges the Government to gradually raise the annual limit of 14 500 places for publicly-funded first-year first-degree programmes, increase the proportion of local people of the appropriate age group holding first degree or higher academic qualifications, and provide more opportunities for sub-degree holders with outstanding academic results to pursue higher studies, so as to match the development of a knowledge-based economy in Hong Kong.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.



The President stated that Hon Miriam LAU, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon TSANG Yok-sing and Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long intended to move amendments to the motion. Also, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum intended to move an amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Miriam LAU, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong and Hon TSANG Yok-sing, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon TSANG Yok-sing was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:48 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Heung-man spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 8:18 pm while Hon TAM Heung-man was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen declared that he was the Chairman of the Vocation Training Council which was Hong Kong's largest provider of sub-degree programmes. Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eight more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke again.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To delete "as" after "That," and substitute with "talents are the foundation of society, and to keep in tune with the social development, Hong Kong must strive to enhance the integrated competitiveness of its population, but"; to add "other big international cities and" after "lower than those of"; to add "encourage the provision of more private university places," after "first-year first-degree programmes,"; to add "and that the Government should also endeavour to upgrade the quality of university education, correspondingly increase the support facilities such as university hostel places, and provide opportunities for more non-local students to attend universities in Hong Kong," after "higher studies,"; and to add "and its development as an education hub in the region, thereby training more talents in various sectors such as finance, trade, logistics, tourism and culture for Hong Kong" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following further amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU:

To add "; this Council also urges the Government to increase the direct subsidy for sub-degree places" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon TSANG Yok-sing to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing moved the following further amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong:

To add ", and provide more effective subsidy to students taking degree programmes with a view to alleviating their financial burden" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon TSANG Yok-sing's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong proposed.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's amendment:

To add ", such as interest-free loans," after "effective subsidy"; and to add "and sub-degree" after "taking degree".

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon TSANG Yok-sing's amendment, as amended by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, to Hon Fred LI's motion which had been amended by Hon Miriam LAU and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong put and agreed to.

As Hon Miriam LAU's and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendments and Hon TSANG Yok-sing's amendment as amended by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum had been agreed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long moved the following further amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon TSANG Yok-sing and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum:

To add ", and increase the funding for the places for first-year first-degree programmes in nursing to meet the nursing manpower demand of the community, public and private hospitals and residential care homes for the elderly in the future" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon TSANG Yok-sing and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Fred LI replied.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon TSANG Yok-sing, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long put and agreed to.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 16 April 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 10:05 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 09/04/2008  
 時間 TIME: 03:42:29 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 廢除《古物及古蹟（撤回暫定古蹟的宣布）（薄扶林道128號）公告》決議案  
 PROPOSED RESOLUTION TO REPEAL THE ANTIQUITIES AND MONUMENTS (WITHDRAWAL OF DECLARATION OF PROPOSED MONUMENT) (NO. 128 POK FU LAM ROAD) NOTICE

動議人 MOVED BY: 余若薇Audrey EU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	26	
投票 Vote	26	25	
贊成 Yes	6	15	
反對 No	17	9	
棄權 Abstain	3	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

*Winnie Chan*