

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 25

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 30 April 2008 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP  
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP  
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP  
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

The Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

**Member absent:**

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (SD)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Clubs (Safety of Premises) (Exclusion) (Amendment: Club-Houses in Government Premises) Order 2008 (gazetted on 25.4.2008)	91/2008
2. Securities and Futures (Financial Resources) (Amendment) Rules 2008 (gazetted on 25.4.2008)	92/2008
3. Fugitive Offenders (Australia) (Amendment) Order 2007 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 25.4.2008)	93/2008
4. Merchant Shipping (Prevention of Air Pollution) Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 25.4.2008)	94/2008
5. Merchant Shipping (Prevention and Control of Pollution) (Fees) (Amendment) Regulation 2007 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 25.4.2008)	95/2008

### Other Papers

No.90 - Audited Statement of Accounts together with the Director of Audit's Report of the Language Fund for the year ended 31 August 2007 (published on 24.4.2008)

No.91 - Supplemental Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report No. 49 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits (April 2008 - P.A.C. Report No. 49A) (published on 30.4.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2007 (published on 28.4.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Bill (published on 28.4.2008)

### Address

Dr Hon Philip WONG, Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report No. 49A.

**Questions**

1. Hon KWONG Chi-kin asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

2. Hon LAU Chin-shek asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon Howard YOUNG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Ten Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

5. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

6. Hon Vincent FANG Kang asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## Bills

### **Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2007**

#### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 25 April 2007 resumed.

Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2007, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon Margaret NG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:03 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Eight Members and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the Bill.

At 2:12 pm, while Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Justice replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

#### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2007**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 15 to 20, 23 to 61, 63, 65 to 77 and 79 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Part 2, clauses 21, 22, 62 and 64, cross-heading immediately before clause 78 and clause 78 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Justice moved the deletion of Part 2 and the amendments to other aforesaid clauses and cross-heading and addressed the Committee.

One Member spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Justice spoke again.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the amendment to Part 2, which dealt with deletion, had been agreed, Part 2 was therefore deleted from the Bill.

Question that clauses 21, 22, 62 and 64, cross-heading immediately before clause 78 and clause 78, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that Part 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved the deletion of Part 3 and addressed the Committee.

Three Members and the Secretary for Justice spoke on the amendment.

Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the Chairman to the absence of a quorum. The Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that Part 3 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Justice reported that

**the Statute Law (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill 2007**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.



## **Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Bill**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 18 April 2007 resumed.

Hon Audrey EU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Five Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Bill**.

Question that clauses 1, 7, 8, 11, 17, 19, 20, 22, 23, 25, 26, 27, 29, 31 to 36, 39, 42, 45, 47, 48, 50 and 53 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2 to 6, 9, 10, 12 to 16, 18, 21, 24, 28, 30, 37, 38, 40, 41, 43, 44, 46, 49, 51, 52 and 54 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the deletion of clause 44 and the amendments to other aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the amendment to clause 44, which dealt with deletion, had been agreed, clause 44 was therefore deleted from the Bill.

Question that clauses 2 to 6, 9, 10, 12 to 16, 18, 21, 24, 28, 30, 37, 38, 40, 41, 43, 46, 49, 51, 52 and 54, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 11A, 38A and 47A read the first time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 11A, 38A and 47A read the second time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the aforesaid schedules and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 and 2, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New schedule 3 read the first time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading of new schedule 3 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of new schedule 3 proposed, put and agreed to.

New schedule 3 read the second time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the addition of new schedule 3 to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for the Environment reported that

the **Energy Efficiency (Labelling of Products) Bill**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 6) Order 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 49 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 March 2008, be repealed.

While Hon Albert HO was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 5:40 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion.

Dr Hon Philip WONG spoke on the motion as Chairman of the Subcommittee on Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 6) Order 2008, and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

Five Members and Hon TAM yiu-chung spoke on the motion.

At 6:57 pm, while Hon TAM yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

With the President's permission, Hon Frederick FUNG explained a point in his speech which had been misunderstood by the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs.

Hon Albert HO replied.

With the President's permission, Hon TAM yiu-chung explained a point in his speech which had been misunderstood by Hon Albert HO. He also sought elucidation by Hon Albert HO of a point raised in his speech.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, five were in favour of the motion and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

**Ceasing the imposition of the levy on employers of foreign domestic helpers**

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Government to immediately cease the imposition of the levy on employers of foreign domestic helpers.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon LEE Cheuk-yan intended to move an amendment to the motion and that Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen intended to move an amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion and addressed the Council:

To delete "immediately" after "the Government to"; and to add "and, before doing so, make a one-off injection of not less than \$20 billion into the Employees Retraining Fund so that the investment returns of the Fund can make up for the loss in revenue which will be suffered by the Employees Retraining Board as a result of the cessation of the imposition of the levy" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion proposed.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment:

To delete "before" after "domestic helpers and," and substitute with "after"; to delete "make a one-off injection of not less than \$20 billion into the" after "doing so," and substitute with "effectively utilize the existing"; and to delete "so that the investment returns of the Fund can make up for the loss in revenue which will be suffered by the Employees Retraining Board as a result of the cessation of the imposition of the levy" immediately before the full stop.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen declared that he was the Chairman of both the Vocational Training Council and the Hong Kong Productivity Council, which provided retraining programmes funded by the Employees Retraining Board.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

One Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LAU Chin-shek declared that he was a member of the Employees Retraining Board. Hon LAU Chin-shek then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Four Members and Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG was speaking, Hon Albert HO drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present and Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG continued to speak.

With the President's permission, Hon Frederick FUNG explained a point in his speech which had been misunderstood by Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG.

Eleven other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen's amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment put.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed to.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment, as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 20 were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed to.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG replied.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion as amended by Hon LEE Cheuk-yan and Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen put.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion as amended, four against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 22 were in favour of the motion as amended, four against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion as amended was carried.

#### **Human rights and the right to return to one's hometown**

Hon Emily LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges the Central Government to honour the commitment it made when bidding to host the Olympic Games seven years ago that it would enhance human rights and develop democracy; moreover, as a number of Hong Kong people have been barred by the Central Government from returning to the Mainland for almost 20 years, this Council calls on the Central Government to respect the right of the Chinese nationals in Hong Kong to freely travel to and from the Mainland, and urges the Executive Authorities to assist these people to have their right to return to their hometown reinstated.

While Hon Emily LAU was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 10:44 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon TAM Yiu-chung intended to move an amendment to the motion and that Hon LEE Cheuk-yan intended to move an amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion, the amendment, and the amendment to the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon Emily LAU's motion and addressed the Council:

To add "supports the hosting of the Olympic Games by Beijing and now" before "urges the Central Government"; to delete "that it would" after "seven years ago" and substitute with ", so as to effectively promote the State's development on the fronts of environmental protection, education, sports, technology, economy and culture, etc, and help"; to add "in order to enable the Central Government to successfully honour its commitment, this Council opposes all acts to boycott the Olympic Games, and to disrupt and sabotage the transmission of the Olympic flame, and condemns all remarks which are false and insulting to China;" after "develop democracy;"; to delete "as a number of Hong Kong people have been barred by the Central Government from returning to the Mainland for almost 20 years, this Council calls on the Central Government to respect the right of the" after "moreover," and substitute with "this Council urges the SAR Government to assist those"; to delete "to freely travel to and from the Mainland, and urges the Executive Authorities to assist these people to have their right" after "Chinese nationals in Hong Kong" and substitute with "who are in need"; and to delete "reinstated" immediately before the full stop and substitute with "on the premise that the provisions of the Basic Law and the principle of 'one country, two systems' are complied with, and the system of exit and entry administration in the Mainland is respected, so as to enhance the exchange between the people in both places".

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Emily LAU's motion proposed.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment and addressed the Council:

To delete "urges the SAR Government to assist those" before "Chinese nationals in Hong Kong" and substitute with "calls on the Central Government to respect the right of the"; to delete "who are in need" after "Chinese nationals in Hong Kong" and substitute with "to freely travel to and from the Mainland, and urges the Executive Authorities to assist these people to have their right"; and to delete "on the premise that the provisions of the Basic Law and the principle of 'one country, two systems' are complied with, and the system of exit and entry administration in the Mainland is respected, so as to enhance the exchange between the people in both places" immediately before the full stop and substitute with "reinstated".

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 11:13 pm, while Hon CHIM Pui-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Nineteen Members and Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the President's permission, Hon TSANG Yok-sing explained some points in his speech which had been misunderstood by Hon LEE Wing-tat.

Hon Emily LAU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Emily LAU's motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Emily LAU replied.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion put.



Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the motion, 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 17 were in favour of the motion and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix VIII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 7 May 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 2:04 am on 1 May 2008.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 30/04/2008  
時間 TIME: 03:53:08 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2007年成文法（雜項規定）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 刪去第3部  
STATUTE LAW (MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS) BILL 2007 - COMMITTEE STAGE -  
DELETION OF PART 3

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	22	
投票 Vote	23	21	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	16	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr Lui Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	

秘書 CLERK

*W. Anson Chan*

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 30/04/2008  
 時間 TIME: 07:38:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 廢除《2008年釋義及通則條例（修訂附表6）令》決議案  
 PROPOSED RESOLUTION TO REPEAL THE INTERPRETATION AND GENERAL CLAUSES  
 ORDINANCE (AMENDMENT OF SCHEDULE 6) ORDER 2008

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	24	
投票 Vote	25	23	
贊成 Yes	5	15	
反對 No	20	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 30/04/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:29:29 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁君彥議員就李卓人議員對張宇人議員的「停收外傭徵費」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
 HON ANDREW LEUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S AMENDMENT TO HON TOMMY CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "CEASING THE IMPOSITION OF THE LEVY ON EMPLOYERS OF FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	27	
投票 Vote	25	26	
贊成 Yes	18	20	
反對 No	5	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 30/04/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:34:15 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員對張宇人議員的「停收外傭徵費」議案，提出經梁君彥議員修正的修正案  
 HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S AMENDMENT AS AMENDED BY HON ANDREW LEUNG TO HON TOMMY CHEUNG'S MOTION ON "CEASING THE IMPOSITION OF THE LEVY ON EMPLOYERS OF FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	27	
投票 Vote	25	26	
贊成 Yes	19	20	
反對 No	4	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	徐謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tai	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 30/04/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:41:39 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由張宇人議員動議，經李卓人議員及梁君彥議員修正的「停收外傭徵費」議案  
 MOTION MOVED BY HON TOMMY CHEUNG ON "CEASING THE IMPOSITION OF THE LEVY ON EMPLOYERS OF FOREIGN DOMESTIC HELPERS" AS AMENDED BY HON LEE CHEUK-YAN AND HON ANDREW LEUNG

動議人 MOVED BY: 張宇人Tommy CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	28	
投票 Vote	25	27	
贊成 Yes	19	22	
反對 No	4	4	
棄權 Abstain	2	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	贊成 YES
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	棄權 ABSTAIN	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 01/05/2008  
時間 TIME: 01:51:36 上午am

動議 MOTION: 李卓人議員就譚耀宗議員對劉慧卿議員的「人權和回鄉權」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S AMENDMENT TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON EMILY LAU'S MOTION ON "HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE RIGHT TO RETURN TO ONE'S HOMETOWN"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	26	
投票 Vote	24	25	
贊成 Yes	8	17	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7  
 日期 DATE: 01/05/2008  
 時間 TIME: 01:56:00 上午 am

動議 MOTION: 譚耀宗議員對劉慧卿議員的「人權和回鄉權」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY HON TAM YIU-CHUNG TO HON EMILY LAU'S MOTION ON "HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE RIGHT TO RETURN TO ONE'S HOMETOWN"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	26	
投票 Vote	24	25	
贊成 Yes	17	8	
反對 No	7	15	
棄權 Abstain	0	2	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李柱銘 Martin LEE	反對 NO
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成 YES
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	贊成 YES	LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	Albert CHAN	反對 NO
林偉強 Daniel LAM	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	余若薇 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對 NO	李永達 LI Kwok-ying	贊成 YES
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 8  
 日期 DATE: 01/05/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:03:41 上午am

動議 MOTION: 「人權和回鄉權」議案  
 MOTION ON "HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE RIGHT TO RETURN TO ONE'S HOMETOWN"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	26	
投票 Vote	24	25	
贊成 Yes	8	17	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK