

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 27

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 14 May 2008 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

The Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Obituary tribute

The Council observed one minute's silence to mourn the victims of the earthquake which occurred in Sichuan Province on 12 May 2008.

After the one minute's silence, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung stood up to speak without the President's permission. The President stated that he was not allowed to speak and asked him to take his seat. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to say that he had written a letter to the President. The President said that she had acted upon his request made in the letter and ordered him to take his seat. Ignoring the President's order, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak. The President warned him that he must not breach the Council's rules by speaking at any time as he wished, and told him again to take his seat. As Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak in defiance of her repeated orders, the President ordered him to withdraw immediately from the Chamber and not to return for the remainder of the meeting. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak for a short while and then left the Chamber.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Sewage Services (Trade Effluent Surcharge) (Amendment) Regulation 2008 (gazetted on 9.5.2008)	106/2008
2. The English Schools Foundation (General) Regulation (gazetted on 9.5.2008)	107/2008
3. Telecommunications (Determining Spectrum Utilization Fees by Auction) Regulation (gazetted on 9.5.2008)	108/2008
4. Telecommunications (Designation of Frequency Bands subject to Payment of Spectrum Utilization Fee) (Amendment) Order 2008 (gazetted on 9.5.2008)	109/2008
5. Child Abduction and Custody (Parties to Convention) (Amendment) Order 2008 (gazetted on 9.5.2008)	110/2008

Other Papers

No.94 - Kowloon-Canton Railway Corporation
Annual Report 2007 (published on 14.5.2008)

Questions

1. Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing asked Question 1.
The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.
Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.
2. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 2.
The Secretary for Security replied.
Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.
3. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 3.
The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.
Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.
4. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 4.
The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.
Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.
5. Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit asked Question 5.
The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.
Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.
6. Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung asked Question 6.
The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.
Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

Munsang College and Heep Yunn School (Change of Corporate Names and General Amendments) Bill 2008

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 16 January 2008 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Munsang College and Heep Yunn School (Change of Corporate Names and General Amendments) Bill 2008**.

Question that clauses 1 to 5 and 7 to 25 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 6 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Education moved an amendment to clause 6 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 6, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

The Secretary for Education reported that

the Munsang College and Heep Yunn School (Change of Corporate Names and General Amendments) Bill 2008

had passed through the Committee with amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Bills

Alice Ho Miu Ling Nethersole Charity Foundation Bill

Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 9 April 2008 resumed.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Alice Ho Miu Ling Nethersole Charity Foundation Bill**.

Question that clauses 1 to 14 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

Third Reading

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW reported that

the **Alice Ho Miu Ling Nethersole Charity Foundation Bill**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the –

- (a) Trade Descriptions (Provision of Information on Natural Fei Cui) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 79 of 2008;
- (b) Trade Descriptions (Provision of Information on Diamond) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 80 of 2008;
- (c) Trade Descriptions (Provision of Information on Regulated Electronic Products) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 81 of 2008;
- (d) Trade Descriptions (Marking) (Gold and Gold Alloy) (Amendment) Order 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 82 of 2008;
- (e) Trade Descriptions (Marking) (Platinum) (Amendment) Order 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 83 of 2008; and
- (f) Trade Descriptions (Definition of Platinum) (Amendment) Regulation 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 84 of 2008,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 23 April 2008, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 11 June 2008.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Perfecting lawn facilities in parks

Hon Bernard CHAN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council urges that the Government should, in the course of urban planning, including the development of future projects such as the West Kowloon Cultural District and the New Central Harbourfront, study the planting of more lawns in the open spaces planned to be provided, allocate more resources for the maintenance of lawns, make available individual lawns for use by the public and reduce unnecessary regulatory control, so that members of the public, especially small children, can better enjoy these public facilities.

Question on Hon Bernard CHAN's motion proposed.

The President stated that five Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and his own amendment.

While Hon WONG Kwok-hing was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:37 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Audrey EU, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon James TO and Hon CHOY So-yuk, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Bernard CHAN spoke on the amendments.

At 3:19 pm, while Hon Bernard CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke again.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion:

To add ", as there is a serious shortage of lawn resources for public use in Hong Kong," after "That"; to add "along the existing waterfront promenades such as the Tsing Yi and Tsuen Wan sections, and" after "the Government should,"; to delete "and" after "the West Kowloon Cultural District" and substitute with ",,"; to add "and the waterfront from Tsuen Wan to Tuen Mun in New Territories West" after "the New Central Harbourfront"; to delete "planned to be provided" after "in the open spaces"; to delete "individual" after "make available"; to add "which are not closed for maintenance" before "for use by the public"; and to add "greening" after "these public".

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing:

To add "; in addition, in view of the aggravating heat island effect, this Council urges that the Government should, in the course of urban planning, increase greened areas on the ground and provide more open spaces throughout the territory and plant more lawns in those open spaces, so that the greening ratio in urban areas can be increased as a whole" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU's amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's and Hon Audrey EU's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Mrs Selina CHOW to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Mrs Selina CHOW moved the following further amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Audrey EU:

To add ", as well as extend the criteria of planting more lawns, making lawns available for public use and reducing unnecessary regulatory control to the existing lawns managed by the Government" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon Audrey EU proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's, Hon Audrey EU's and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon James TO to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon James TO moved the following further amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Audrey EU and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW:

To add "; and draw up code of practice for management and use of lawns, and increase pedestrian walkways to connect lawns and related facilities in the open spaces, so as to facilitate the access of members of the public to and their enjoyment of these public facilities" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon James TO's amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Audrey EU and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Kwok-hing's, Hon Audrey EU's, Mrs Selina CHOW's and Hon James TO's amendments had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon CHOY So-yuk to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following further amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Audrey EU, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW and Hon James TO:

To add ", fully utilizing the function of parks to relieve people's urban stress; in addition, this Council also urges the Government to study the planting of more lawns as far as possible on the rooftops of buildings located in the open spaces and improve their maintenance work, including utilizing as far as possible solar energy facilities and providing additional rainwater and grey water recycling facilities, and as far as possible using pervious materials for the land formation works of open spaces beside the lawns, etc" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Audrey EU, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW and Hon James TO proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Bernard CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Bernard CHAN's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing, Hon Audrey EU, Hon Mrs Selina CHOW, Hon James TO and Hon CHOY So-yuk put and agreed to.

Legislating to strengthen the protection for the rights and interests of property buyers

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, the Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors (HKIS) issued a Supplement to the Code of Measuring Practice (the Supplement) on 5 February this year to spell out more clearly the way of measuring the saleable area of properties and require that the saleable area and items of ancillary accommodation, such as bay window, garden, flat roof, etc, should be separately measured and stated, but some estate developers have instantly indicated that they have no intention of complying with the Supplement; in order to prevent the public from being confused by the varying definitions of saleable area and suffered losses when buying properties, this Council calls on the Government to require by way of legislation that when uncompleted and completed flats are offered for sale by developers, the saleable area specified in the sales brochures must be measured in the way prescribed in the Supplement issued by HKIS, and the saleable area so measured be used as the basis for calculating the average price per square foot of the properties, so as to protect the rights and interests of consumers.

Question on Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEE Wing-tat and Hon CHAN Kam-lam, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the Present's permission, Hon CHAN Kam-lam explained a point in his speech which had been misunderstood by Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah.

Fourteen Members and Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the Present's permission, Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG explained a point in his speech which had been misunderstood by Hon Abraham SHEK.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG spoke on the amendments.

With the Present's permission, Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing and Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah explained some points in their own speeches which had been misunderstood by Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following amendment to Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG's motion:

To add "the Government proposed to legislate for the regulation of sales descriptions of uncompleted flats in 2000 but so far the proposal has not been implemented;" after "That, "; to add "expeditiously revise the Consent Scheme and legislate to" after "calls on the Government to"; to delete "by way of legislation" before "that when uncompleted"; and to add "and clear price lists be provided," after "the properties,".

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Abraham SHEK claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment, six against it and nine abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following amendment to Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG's motion:

To delete "(HKIS)" after "the Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors"; to delete "require" after "calls on the Government to" and substitute with "adopt appropriate measures, including considering"; to add "to require" after "by way of legislation"; to delete "measured in the way prescribed in the Supplement issued by HKIS" after "the sales brochures must be" and substitute with "calculated in a uniform way"; to delete "measured" after "the saleable area so" and substitute with "computed"; and to add "; and to strengthen publicity and education for consumers to enhance their knowledge in the calculation of property area etc" after "the properties".

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 15 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG replied.

While Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG was speaking, Hon Abraham SHEK raised a point of order on whether his speech was related to the motion. The President suggested to Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG that he should be more careful and avoid touching on other matters and making remarks to other Members which were groundless accusations against them. Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG continued to speak.

Question on Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG's motion put.

Hon Abraham SHEK claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion, five against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 15 May 2008 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 6:38 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 14/05/2008
 時間 TIME: 06:19:27 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李永達議員對鄭經翰議員的「立法加強保障買樓人士消費權益」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEE WING-TAT TO HON ALBERT CHENG'S MOTION ON
 "LEGISLATING TO STRENGTHEN THE PROTECTION FOR THE RIGHTS AND INTERESTS
 OF PROPERTY BUYERS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	22	
投票 Vote	26	21	
贊成 Yes	11	16	
反對 No	6	0	
棄權 Abstain	9	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 14/05/2008
 時間 TIME: 06:23:56 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳鑑林議員對鄭經翰議員的「立法加強保障買樓人士消費權益」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHAN KAM-LAM TO HON ALBERT CHENG'S MOTION ON
 "LEGISLATING TO STRENGTHEN THE PROTECTION FOR THE RIGHTS AND INTERESTS
 OF PROPERTY BUYERS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳鑑林CHAN Kam-lam

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	22	
投票 Vote	26	21	
贊成 Yes	14	5	
反對 No	7	15	
棄權 Abstain	5	1	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	徐謹申	James TO	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan			陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum		
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	反對	NO
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	棄權	ABSTAIN	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	棄權	ABSTAIN	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	棄權	ABSTAIN	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	棄權	ABSTAIN	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

Vivian Chan

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 14/05/2008
 時間 TIME: 06:38:51 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「立法加強保障買樓人士消費權益」議案
 MOTION ON "LEGISLATING TO STRENGTHEN THE PROTECTION FOR THE RIGHTS AND INTERESTS OF PROPERTY BUYERS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭經翰 Albert CHENG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	22	
投票 Vote	26	21	
贊成 Yes	11	16	
反對 No	5	0	
棄權 Abstain	10	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negated	通過 Passed	否決 Negated

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

Victoria Chan