

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 31

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 4 June 2008 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung
The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP
The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP
Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP
The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP
The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP
The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

The Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

Member absent:

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
The Financial Secretary and
Secretary for Development

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

Clerks in attendance:

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (SD)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Shipping and Port Control (Amendment) Regulation 2008 (gazetted on 30.5.2008)	148/2008
2. Road Traffic (Public Service Vehicles) (Amendment of Schedule 5) (No. 2) Regulation 2008 (gazetted on 30.5.2008)	149/2008
3. Merchant Shipping (Local Vessels) (General) (Amendment) Regulation 2008 (gazetted on 30.5.2008)	150/2008
4. Merchant Shipping (Limitation of Shipowners Liability) (Rate of Interest) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2008 (gazetted on 30.5.2008)	151/2008

Questions

1. Hon Albert CHAN asked Question 1.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

2. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

3. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

4. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 4.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Financial Secretary replied.

5. Hon Martin LEE asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

6. Hon LAU Wong-fat asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance

Hon James TO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Fugitive Offenders (Ireland) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 96 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 7 May 2008, the period for repealing an order referred to in section 3(3) of the Fugitive Offenders Ordinance (Cap. 503) be extended under section 3(5) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 25 June 2008.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

**Proposed resolutions under the Interpretation and General
Clauses Ordinance**

**1. Pension Benefits Ordinance (Established Offices)
(Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2008**

Hon KWONG Chi-kin moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Pension Benefits Ordinance (Established Offices) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 104 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 7 May 2008, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 25 June 2008.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

**2. Sewage Services (Trade Effluent Surcharge) (Amendment)
Regulation 2008**

Hon Audrey EU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Sewage Services (Trade Effluent Surcharge) (Amendment) Regulation 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 106 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 14 May 2008, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 2 July 2008.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

**Proposed resolution under Article 75 of the Basic Law of the
Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's
Republic of China**

Hon TSANG Yok-sing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that Rule 16 of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region be amended –

- (a) in subrule (6), by repealing "45 minutes" and substituting "75 minutes";

- (b) in subrule (7), by repealing "one hour" and substituting "one and a half hours".

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Promoting the development of local football

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as football, being a very popular sport in Hong Kong, is well liked and widely supported by the community, the Government should capitalise on this favourable condition to promote the development of local football and establish team brands, which will not only raise the standards of sports activities, but can also promote social integration and enhance social cohesion; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) immediately conduct a detailed study to position the development of local football, formulate an overall development plan, set long-term and short-term goals, and implement the relevant initiatives, etc;
- (b) develop football training schemes for local youngsters and enhance the training for young football players with potential, so as to lay a good foundation for the development of local football;
- (c) provide support to promote the professionalization of local football, such as assisting the football sector in drawing up a clear framework and targets for the development of professional football players as well as career paths for coaches and managers, etc to be promoted to the management of football teams, thereby encouraging more football players to take up the sport as their career and facilitating the enhancement of the professional standards of the sport;
- (d) provide support for football teams to conduct overseas training and participate in overseas matches, so as to encourage exchange of experience and learning, and become stronger teams; and
- (e) draw reference from successful examples in Europe and America to create a favourable environment for establishing local football team brands.

While Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:15 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHOY So-yuk and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Seven Members and Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:30 pm, while Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke again.

Hon CHOY So-yuk moved the following amendment to Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's motion:

To delete ", as football, being" after "That" and substitute with "football sport in Hong Kong has developed for a period of time and is"; to delete "Hong Kong," after "popular sport in" and substitute with "the territory, which"; to add ", encourage renowned overseas football clubs to establish football academies in Hong Kong," after "local youngsters"; to add "(c) apart from supporting the Football District League and the Young Athlete Training Scheme, consider giving more funding support to football teams with outstanding performance, and formulate a long-term funding policy;" after "good foundation for the development of local football;"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to delete "and facilitating" after "their career" and substitute with ", and strengthen the training of referees, so as to facilitate"; to add "overall" after "the enhancement of the"; to add "football" after "professional standards of the"; to add "(e) in order to meet their education needs, recommend young football players with outstanding performance in football matches for admission to universities and tertiary institutions so as to broaden the prospects of retired football players;" after "sport;"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(f)"; to delete "and" after "stronger teams;"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(g)"; and to add "; (h) build more football pitches across the territory and upgrade the facilities of existing football pitches, including converting the existing concrete pitches into natural turf, plastic or artificial turf pitches,

so as to reduce the chances of football players sustaining injuries; and (i) encourage local radio and television stations to conduct live broadcast of football matches to cultivate the community's interest in watching local and overseas football matches" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment to Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHOY So-yuk's amendment had been agreed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon YEUNG Sum to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the following further amendment to Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk:

To add "; (j) deploy resources to support the future day-to-day operation of the Football Academy to be built in Tseung Kwan O; and (k) include football as an elite sport to attract more talents" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG replied.

Question on Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG's motion as amended by Hon CHOY So-yuk and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put and agreed to.

Opportunities to Hong Kong brought about by the thawing cross-strait relations

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the new political situation in Taiwan presents major opportunities for the peaceful development of cross-strait relations and the "Three Direct Links" across the Taiwan Strait may hopefully be established earlier, this Council urges the SAR Government to expeditiously strengthen, through various channels, the close ties between Hong Kong and Taiwan, as well as study and implement various proactive measures in respect of finance, economic and trade, aviation and transportation, tourism, technology and immigration arrangements, etc, thereby enhancing Hong Kong's competitiveness and facilitating the four places on both sides of the Strait to achieve a win-win situation.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Albert HO, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon Howard YOUNG intended to move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon Miriam LAU intended to move an amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Albert HO, Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, Hon Howard YOUNG and Hon Miriam LAU, who intended to move the amendments, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

Seven Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion:

To add "recently the peaceful handover of government administration and the change in the ruling party for the second time in Taiwan have given impetus to its democratic development, and" after "That,"; to delete "in Taiwan" after "political situation"; to delete "as well as study and implement various proactive measures in respect of" after "between Hong Kong and Taiwan," and substitute with "enhance exchanges at various levels between the two places in respect of politics, culture,"; to add "and their sharing of experience on civil society and democratic development, as well as study and implement various proactive measures, including arranging more mutual visits for politicians and the cultural sectors in Hong Kong and Taiwan," after "immigration arrangements, etc,"; to delete "facilitating" after "Hong Kong's competitiveness and" and substitute with "enabling"; and to add "strive for building a democratic China and" after "both sides of the Strait to".

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed and put.

Hon SIN Chung-kai claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Opportunities to Hong Kong brought about by the thawing cross-strait relations" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion:

To add "and the role played by Hong Kong in the past as an intermediary among the three places on both sides of the Strait will also change as a result," after "established earlier,"; and to add "including setting up a cross-strait economic and trade exchanges department in the Commerce and Economic Development Bureau to handle economic issues arising from the 'Three Direct Links' across the Taiwan Strait in future," after "between Hong Kong and Taiwan,".

Question on Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed and put.

Hon TAM yiu-chung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, four against it and 15 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and 10 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung moved the following amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion:

To add "under the framework of the Basic Law, promote exchanges between the two places" after "between Hong Kong and Taiwan"; to add "including signing an Avoidance of Double Taxation Agreement with Taiwan, etc," after "immigration arrangements, etc,"; and to add "to enable it to become a business platform in the Greater China region," after "Hong Kong's competitiveness".

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion proposed.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment:

To delete "signing an Avoidance of Double Taxation Agreement with Taiwan" after "including" and substitute with "promoting with Taiwan arrangements for the avoidance of double taxation".

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment, as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion put and agreed to.

As Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung's amendment as amended by Hon Miriam LAU had been agreed, the President granted leave for Hon Howard YOUNG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Howard YOUNG moved the following further amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon Miriam LAU:

To add "; this Council also urges the SAR Government to implement the granting of visa-on-arrival to Taiwan travellers visiting Hong Kong" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Howard YOUNG's amendment to Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung and Hon Miriam LAU proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung replied.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's motion as amended by Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, Hon Miriam LAU and Hon Howard YOUNG put and agreed to.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 11 June 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 5:47 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)
President

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 04/06/2008
 時間 TIME: 05:38:14 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員對譚耀宗議員的「香港在兩岸關係解凍下的機遇」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT HO TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON
 "OPPORTUNITIES TO HONG KONG BROUGHT ABOUT BY THE THAWING CROSS-STRAIT
 RELATIONS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	6	13	
反對 No	18	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 04/06/2008
 時間 TIME: 05:41:35 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁家傑議員對譚耀宗議員的「香港在兩岸關係解凍下的機遇」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALAN LEONG TO HON TAM YIU-CHUNG'S MOTION ON
 "OPPORTUNITIES TO HONG KONG BROUGHT ABOUT BY THE THAWING CROSS-STRAIT
 RELATIONS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁家傑 Alan LEONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	6	14	
反對 No	4	0	
棄權 Abstain	15	10	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	棄權 ABSTAIN
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	棄權 ABSTAIN
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK