

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 34

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 25 June 2008 at 2:30 pm,  
Thursday 26 June 2008 at 9:00 am and Friday 27 June 2008 at 9:00 am

---

### Present:

On 26.6.2008

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM  
The Chief Executive of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan (absent on 27.6.2008)

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP (absent on 27.6.2008)

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo (absent on 25.6.2008)

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP (absent on 27.6.2008)

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung (absent on 27.6.2008)

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS (absent on 27.6.2008)

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

The Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

**Members absent:**

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP

**Public officers attending:**

On 25.6.2008, 26.6.2008 and 27.6.2008

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

On 25.6.2008 and 26.6.2008

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

On 26.6.2008 and 27.6.2008

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

On 26.6.2008

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP  
Head, Central Policy Unit

**Clerks in attendance:**

On 25.6.2008, 26.6.2008 and 27.6.2008

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, SBS, JP, Secretary General

On 25.6.2008 and 26.6.2008

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 25.6.2008

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

On 26.6.2008 and 27.6.2008

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (SD)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief on Income from Aircraft Operations) (United Mexican States) Order (gazetted on 20.6.2008)	172/2008
2. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief on Income from Aircraft Operations) (Republic of Finland) Order (gazetted on 20.6.2008)	173/2008
3. Specification of Arrangements (Government of the Republic of Finland) (Avoidance of Double Taxation on Income from Aircraft Operation) (Revocation) Order (gazetted on 20.6.2008)	174/2008

### Other Papers

No.99 - Report by the Trustee of the Correctional Services Children's Education Trust for the period from 1 September 2006 to 31 August 2007 (published on 19.6.2008)

No. 100 - Airport Authority Hong Kong Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 25.6.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Prevention of Bribery (Amendment) Bill 2007 (published on 23.6.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Revenue Bill 2008 (published on 20.6.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Road Traffic Legislation (Amendment) Bill 2008 (published on 20.6.2008)

### Questions

1. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

2. Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

3. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

4. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

5. Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Transport and Housing and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

6. Hon CHOY So-yuk asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **Prevention of Bribery (Amendment) Bill 2007**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 11 July 2007 resumed.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Prevention of Bribery (Amendment) Bill 2007, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon TSANG Yok-sing was addressing the Council, Hon Margaret NG raised a point of order. She said that the President had previously informed Members of her decision that if the tropical cyclone warning signal no. 8 was cancelled before 11:00 am, the Council meeting would be held at 2:30 pm that day; otherwise the Council meeting would be held at 9:00 am the following day. As it turned out to be the latter case, Hon Margaret NG queried if sufficient notice had been given for the Council meeting to be held at 2:30 pm that day, as so decided by the President. She expressed concern that the legal effect of decisions made by the Council meeting might be called into question.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum expressed similar concern.

The President said that she had already considered the questions raised by Hon Margaret NG and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum. The President explained that when she informed Members of her decision on 24 June 2008, it was not sure when the tropical cyclone would move away from Hong Kong. After it was announced that the cyclone had moved away from Hong Kong at around 7:00 am on 25 June 2008, she had been watching closely when the tropical cyclone signal no. 8 would be cancelled. The President added that while it was necessary to give Members sufficient notice of the meeting, she had to reschedule the meeting to be held as soon as practicable because of its long agenda. In the morning of 25 June 2008, Members had called her and staff of the Secretariat, indicating their wish that the Council meeting be held at 2:30 pm that day. The President said that she had sought legal advice, and that it was legally in order to hold the meeting as rescheduled, and that the notice given was sufficient. Moreover, the change of meeting time would not affect the legal effect of the proceedings of the Council.

Hon Martin LEE said that he was the Member who called the President to ask about the Council meeting time. As banks and the Hong Kong Disneyland had announced on 25 June 2008 that they would be open two hours after tropical cyclone warning signal no. 8 was lowered, he therefore considered that given its heavy workload, the Legislative Council should also hold its meeting in that afternoon.

Hon Margaret NG requested the President to set out her explanation in writing. The President acceded to the request.



Hon Miriam LAU said that according to Rule 14(3) of the Rules of Procedure, the President might, at any time after she had determined the day and hour upon which a meeting was to begin, change the day or hour so determined to a later day or hour, or to an earlier day or hour. She asked whether the President had considered that Rule.

The President said that she had considered that Rule when discussing the matter with the Legal Adviser.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing continued to address the Council. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

While Hon TSANG Yok-sing was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 4:43 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Four Members and Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah spoke on the Bill.

At 5:51 pm, while Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two more Members spoke on the Bill.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Prevention of Bribery (Amendment) Bill 2007**.

Question that clauses 1 to 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Two Members spoke on the clauses.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the clauses.

The two Members who had spoken spoke again, and then one of them spoke for the third time.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke again.

Question that clauses 1 to 4 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 5 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Hon Margaret NG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the Committee of the whole Council could consider new clause 4A together with clause 5.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

New clause 4A read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move the deletion of clause 5 and the addition of new clause 4A. Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and the Chief Secretary for Administration had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 5. She ordered that the aforesaid clauses and amendments be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Margaret NG spoke on her amendments.

While Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 7:07 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and the Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on Hon Margaret NG's amendment and their proposed amendments.

Two Members spoke on these amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

At 8:01 pm, while Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the Chairamn resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on these amendments.

A Member and the Chief Secretary for Administration spoke again.

Hon Margaret NG and another Member spoke for the third time.

A Member spoke for the fourth time.

Before putting to Members the question on Hon Margaret NG's amendment to clause 5, the Chairman reminded Members that if Hon Margaret NG's amendment was agreed, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and the Chief Secretary for Administration might not move their amendments to clause 5. If Hon Margaret NG's amendment was negatived, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum might move his amendment to clause 5. Subject to the voting result of Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment, the Committee will then deal with the Chief Secretary for Administration's amendments to clause 5. On the other hand, irrespective of whether the amendments moved to clause 5 were passed or not, Hon Margaret NG might move the second reading of new clause 4A.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon Margaret NG put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in respect of the remaining provisions of the Prevention of Bribery (Amendment) Bill 2007 or amendments thereto, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the amendment to clause 5.

Before putting to Members the question on Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment to clause 5, the Chairman reminded Members that if Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment was agreed, the Chief Secretary for Administration might not move his amendment to the proposed section 31AA in clause 5, but the Secretary may move his remaining amendments to clause 5. If Dr Hon YEUNG Sum's amendment was negatived, the Secretary might move all his amendments to clause 5.

Question on the amendment moved by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the amendments to clause 5.

Question on the amendments moved by the Chief Secretary for Administration put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 51 Members were present, 33 were in favour of the amendments and 17 against them. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

Question that clause 5 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Margaret NG moved the Second Reading of new clause 4A.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 4A proposed and put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, eight were in favour of the motion and 20 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 13 were in favour of the motion and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Question that clause 6 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved an amendment to clause 6 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 6, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Chief Secretary for Administration reported that

the **Prevention of Bribery (Amendment) Bill 2007**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 48 Members were present, 45 were in favour of the motion, one against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

## **Revenue Bill 2008**

### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 7 May 2008 resumed.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Revenue Bill 2008, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Fourteen Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

The President suspended the meeting at 11:49 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 26 June 2008.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Revenue Bill 2008**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9 and 11 to 19 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 7 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Six Members spoke on the clause.

Two of these Members spoke again.

Five more Members and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the clause.

Another Member spoke on the clause.

Question that clause 7 stand part of the Bill put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 52 Members were present, 34 were in favour of the motion, 15 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in respect of the remaining provisions of the Revenue Bill 2008 or amendments thereto, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 10 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved amendments to clause 10 and addressed the Committee as a Member of the Bills Committee on Revenue Bill 2008. After the address, he spoke on the amendments in his personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the amendments.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan and another Member spoke again.

A Member spoke on the amendments.

Before putting to Members the question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendments to clause 10, the Chairman reminded Members that if Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment was negatived, Hon LEE Cheuk-yan might not move his remaining amendments.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon LEE Cheuk-yan put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, eight were in favour of the amendments and 16 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendments, eight against them and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix VII.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendments had been negatived, he might not move his amendment to clause 3, nor the second reading of new clauses 2A, 2B, 2C, 4A and 5A, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 10 stand part of the Bill put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 50 Members were present, 38 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix VIII.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Question that clause 3 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

#### **the Revenue Bill 2008**

had passed through the Committee without amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

Question on the Third Reading put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 50 Members were present, 43 were in favour of the motion. (Voting record in Appendix IX.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

**Road Traffic Legislation (Amendment) Bill 2008**

**Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 20 February 2008 resumed.

Hon Miriam LAU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Road Traffic Legislation (Amendment) Bill 2008, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming spoke on the Bill.

While Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:15 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

**Committee Stage**

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Road Traffic Legislation (Amendment) Bill 2008**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 12 to 19, 21 to 24, 26, 27, 30 to 33, 35, 36, 38 to 49, 51 to 58 and 61 to 70 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 9, 11, 20, 25, 28, 29, 34, 37, 50, 59 and 60 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 3, 11, 20, 25, 28, 29, 34, 37, 50, 59 and 60, as amended, stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 7, 8 and 10 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved amendments to clauses 7, 8 and 10 and further amendments to clause 9, and addressed the Committee.



At 1:13 pm, while Hon Andrew CHENG was addressing the Council, the Chairman resumed the chair.

A Member and the Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the amendments.

Hon Andrew CHENG spoke again.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon Andrew CHENG put.

Hon Andrew CHENG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, five were in favour of the amendments, 15 against them and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendments, six against them and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix X.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clauses 7, 8 and 10 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 9 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 62A and 62B read the first time.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 62A and 62B read the second time.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Transport and Housing reported that

**the Road Traffic Legislation (Amendment) Bill 2008**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. She moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

## Motions

### Proposed resolutions under the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters Ordinance

#### **1. Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Transnational Organized Crime) Order**

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Transnational Organized Crime) Order, made by the Chief Executive in Council on 8 April 2008, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon James TO spoke on the motion as Chairman of the Subcommittee on Subsidiary Legislation to Implement the Obligations under the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

#### **2. Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Finland) Order**

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Finland) Order, made by the Chief Executive in Council on 22 April 2008, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon James TO spoke on the motion as Chairman of the Subcommittee on Mutual Legal Assistance in Criminal Matters (Finland) Order.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

## Members' Bills

### **The Hong Kong University of Science and Technology (Amendment) Bill 2008**

#### Resumption of Second Reading debate

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 11 June 2008 resumed.

Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered **The Hong Kong University of Science and Technology (Amendment) Bill 2008**.

Question that clauses 1 to 8 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### Third Reading

Hon Abraham SHEK reported that

**The Hong Kong University of Science and Technology  
(Amendment) Bill 2008**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### Members' Motions

#### Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Pension Benefits Ordinance (Established Offices) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 104 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 7 May 2008, be repealed.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon LI Fung-ying addressed the Council on the motion as a Member of the Subcommittee on Pension Benefits Ordinance (Established Offices) (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2008. After the address, she spoke on the motion in her personal capacity as a Member.

Three Members and the Secretary for the Civil Service spoke on the motion.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan replied.

Question on the motion put and negatived.

### **Address by the Chief Executive**

The President said that under Rule 8 of the Rules of Procedure, the Chief Executive might at his discretion attend meetings of the Council, or any committee or subcommittee thereof, for the following purpose, as set out in paragraph (a) of that Rule: addressing the Council at any time as he should think fit, including during a special meeting. At around noon on 26 June 2008, the Secretary General of the Legislative Council Secretariat received a letter from the Director of Administration informing him that the Chief Executive would like to address the Council on the further development of the political appointment system before the commencement of the second Members' motion on the Agenda of the Council meeting. The President said that Members had received the revised Agenda and Script as well as a copy of the letter from the Director of Administration.

Hon Martin LEE raised a point of order on whether the Chief Executive had to perform all the duties set out in paragraphs (a), (b) and (c) of Rule 8 of the Rules of Procedure, when the Chief Executive attended a Council meeting under that Rule.

The President replied that it was not the case and pointed out that the Chief Executive attended question and answer sessions under paragraph (b) of that Rule.

The Chief Executive addressed the Council.

Hon James TO said that according to Rule 8 of the Rules of Procedure, Members might be allowed to immediately ask questions on the Chief Executive's address, provided that the Chief Executive was willing to answer them and the President gave permission. Hon James TO asked whether the Chief Executive was willing to do so.

The President said that the Chief Executive had indicated in his address that he would answer Members' questions on 16 July 2008. As paragraph (a) of Rule 8 did not mention whether the Chief Executive could answer Members' questions, she had to respect the Chief Executive's wishes.

The Chief Executive said that he had attended the Council meeting and addressed the Council under paragraph (a) of Rule 8 of the Rules of Procedure, which did not include the arrangement of answering Members' questions. The asking and answering of questions should follow the procedure laid down in paragraph (b) of that Rule. If Members had questions on his address, his colleagues would answer them at the debate of the Member's motion to be held immediately after his address. He would also answer Members' questions at the Council meeting on 16 July 2008.

**Seeking papers, books, records and documents regarding the salary and fringe benefits of Under Secretaries and Political Assistants**

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, pursuant to section 9(1) of the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382), this Council orders the Director of Chief Executive's Office of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to attend before the Council on 2 July 2008 to produce any papers, books, records or documents in relation to matters regarding the salary and fringe benefits of Under Secretaries and Political Assistants.

While Hon LEE Wing-tat was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 3:58 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration spoke on the motion.

At 4:11 pm, while the Chief Secretary for Administration was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for Justice spoke on the motion.

While the Secretary for Justice was speaking, Hon Albert HO requested the Secretary to elucidate a point raised by him in his speech. The Secretary continued to speak and elucidated after he had finished his speech.

Nine Members and Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion.

While Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:25 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Five other Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the motion.

At 7:58 pm, while Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Emily LAU spoke on the motion.

While Hon Emily LAU was speaking, Hon CHIM Pui-chung drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting.

Nine more Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Education, the Secretary for the Civil Service and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion.

Hon LEE Wing-tat replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, seven were in favour of the motion, 20 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix XI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

The President suspended the meeting at 10:57 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 27 June 2008.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

**Report of the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development**

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council notes the Phase III Study Report of the Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District Development.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion.

Eighteen Members and Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG spoke on the motion.

While Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 11:20 am temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke again.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit replied.

At 11:37 am, while Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

### **Enhancing co-operation between Hong Kong and Macao**

Hon TSANG Yok-sing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in view of Macao's close proximity to Hong Kong and its remarkable development in recent years, there is much room for co-operation between the two places to achieve synergy through complementing and reinforcing each other, this Council urges the Government to enhance the co-operation between Hong Kong and Macao on all fronts, set up a permanent and high-level co-operation mechanism, and formulate overall plans and policy measures, so as to promote joint development of Hong Kong and Macao.

While Hon TSANG Yok-sing was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 11:39 am temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong intended to move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion and addressed the Council:

To add ", both being Special Administrative Regions of our country," after "Macao's close proximity to Hong Kong"; and to add "safeguard the freedom of lawful border-crossing between and human rights of the two places, strengthen anti-corruption and judicial co-operation between the two places," after "on all fronts,".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Five Members and Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:44 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Three other Members and Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 1:05 pm, while Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's amendment to Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion put and negatived.

Hon TSANG Yok-sing replied.

Question on Hon TSANG Yok-sing's motion put and agreed to.

### **Next Meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 2 July 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 1:30 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President  
30 September 2008

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong



投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 25/06/2008  
時間 TIME: 08:44:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2007年防止賄賂（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 刪去第5條  
PREVENTION OF BRIBERY (AMENDMENT) BILL 2007 - COMMITTEE STAGE - DELETION OF CLAUSE 5

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	23	
投票 Vote	28	22	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	21	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI	反對	NO	田北俊	James TIEN		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK	反對	NO	劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	Albert CHAN			
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成	YES
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 25/06/2008  
時間 TIME: 08:47:39 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2007年防止賄賂（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第5條  
PREVENTION OF BRIBERY (AMENDMENT) BILL 2007 - COMMITTEE STAGE -  
AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 5

動議人 MOVED BY: 楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	23	
投票 Vote	28	22	
贊成 Yes	7	14	
反對 No	21	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 WONG YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 25/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 08:49:54 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2007年防止賄賂（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第5條  
 PREVENTION OF BRIBERY (AMENDMENT) BILL 2007 - COMMITTEE STAGE -  
 AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 5

動議人 MOVED BY: 政務司司長 Chief Secretary for Administration

出席 Present :51  
 投票 Vote :50  
     贊成 Yes :33  
     反對 No :17  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO			李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 25/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 08:52:40 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2007年防止賄賂（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第4A條，予以二讀  
 PREVENTION OF BRIBERY (AMENDMENT) BILL 2007 - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW  
 CLAUSE 4A BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	23	
投票 Vote	28	22	
贊成 Yes	8	13	
反對 No	20	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 25/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 08:59:42 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2007年防止賄賂（修訂）條例草案》- 三讀  
 PREVENTION OF BRIBERY (AMENDMENT) BILL 2007 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政務司司長Chief Secretary for Administration

出席 Present :48  
 投票 Vote :47  
     贊成 Yes :45  
     反對 No :1  
     棄權 Abstain :1  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO			李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6  
 日期 DATE: 26/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 11:14:24 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《2008年收入條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 第7條納入條例草案  
 REVENUE BILL 2008 - COMMITTEE STAGE - CLAUSE 7 STAND PART OF THE BILL

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present :52  
 投票 Vote :50  
     贊成 Yes :34  
     反對 No :15  
     棄權 Abstain :1  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	棄權	ABSTAIN
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	李國英	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	出席	PRESENT
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	贊成	YES
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7  
 日期 DATE: 26/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 11:42:00 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《2008年收入條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第10條  
 REVENUE BILL 2008 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 10

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	8	14	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8  
 日期 DATE: 26/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 11:44:48 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《2008年收入條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 第10條納入條例草案  
 REVENUE BILL 2008 - COMMITTEE STAGE - CLAUSE 10 STAND PART OF THE BILL

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present :50  
 投票 Vote :48  
     贊成 Yes :38  
     反對 No :10  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	出席	PRESENT
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 9  
 日期 DATE: 26/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 11:50:49 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《2008年收入條例草案》- 三讀  
 REVENUE BILL 2008 - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 財經事務及庫務局局長 Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

出席 Present :50  
 投票 Vote :43  
     贊成 Yes :43  
     反對 No :0  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	贊成	YES
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	出席	PRESENT	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	出席	PRESENT
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	JAMES TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	出席	PRESENT	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	出席	PRESENT
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	出席	PRESENT
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	出席	PRESENT	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 10  
 日期 DATE: 26/06/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:00:50 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2008年道路交通法例（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第7、8及10條，  
 以及進一步修正第9條  
 ROAD TRAFFIC LEGISLATION (AMENDMENT) BILL 2008 - COMMITTEE STAGE -  
 AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSES 7, 8 AND 10, AND FURTHER AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 9

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	21	
投票 Vote	22	20	
贊成 Yes	5	13	
反對 No	15	6	
棄權 Abstain	2	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 11  
日期 DATE: 26/06/2008  
時間 TIME: 10:56:59 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「索取有關副局長及政治助理的薪酬及附帶福利的文據、簿冊、紀錄及文件」議案  
MOTION ON "SEEKING PAPERS, BOOKS, RECORDS AND DOCUMENTS REGARDING THE SALARY AND FRINGE BENEFITS OF UNDER SECRETARIES AND POLITICAL ASSISTANTS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李永達LEE Wing-tat

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	25	
投票 Vote	28	24	
贊成 Yes	7	15	
反對 No	20	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	反對 NO
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK