

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 36

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 9 July 2008 at 11:00 am  
Thursday 10 July 2008 at 9:00 am, Friday 11 July 2008 at 9:00 am,  
Saturday 12 July 2008 at 9:00 am and Sunday 13 July 2008 at 9:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

The Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP

The Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong (absent on 11.7.2008,  
12.7.2008 & 13.7.2008)

The Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

The Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP (absent on 13.7.2008)

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

The Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon YEUNG Sum, JP

The Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 13.7.2008)

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP (absent on 9.7.2008 & 11.7.2008)

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP (absent on 12.7.2008 & 13.7.2008)

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP (absent on 13.7.2008)

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

Dr the Hon KWOK Ka-ki (absent on 12.7.2008 &  
13.7.2008)

Dr the Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP (absent on 13.7.2008)

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung (absent on 10.7.2008)

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP (absent on 11.7.2008)

The Hon KWONG Chi-kin

The Hon TAM Heung-man

The Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

**Public officers attending:**

On 9.7.2008, 10.7.2008, 11.7.2008, 12.7.2008 & 13.7.2008

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

On 9.7.2008, 12.7.2008 & 13.7.2008

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

On 9.7.2008 & 13.7.2008

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

On 9.7.2008

The Hon Frederick MA Si-hang, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

On 10.7.2008, 11.7.2008 & 12.7.2008

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

On 10.7.2008, 12.7.2008 & 13.7.2008

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

On 10.7.2008

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

On 12.7.2008 & 13.7.2008

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

On 13.7.2008

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

**Clerks in attendance:**

Mr Ricky FUNG Choi-cheung, SBS, JP, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Assistant Secretary General (SD)

The President stated that under Item III on the Agenda, Members had to consider altogether five bills. The second bill was the Independent Police Complaints Council Bill, to which Members had proposed about 100 amendments. She said that she had to study the amendments very carefully because the Government had put forward different views on most of the amendments. The President further stated that as she wished to make a ruling that was in compliance with the Rules of Procedure, and would not give rise to any ambiguities, she had decided to change the order of the bills to be considered at the meeting by deferring the above Bill, which was originally the second bill, to the last one.

The President said that she had informed the Government of the arrangement. The Government initially responded that it might have some difficulties but had not yet given her a formal reply. If there were really insurmountable difficulties on the part of the Government, she would not rule out suspending the meeting if necessary, so that she could finish her ruling. The meeting would continue after the ruling was made.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<b><u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u></b>	<b><u>L.N. No.</u></b>
1. Country Parks (Lantau North (Extension) Country Park Designation) Order 2008 (gazetted on 4.7.2008)	190/2008
2. Public Health and Municipal Services (Designation of Public Markets) Order 2008 (gazetted on 4.7.2008)	191/2008
3. Public Health and Municipal Services (Designation of Public Markets) (No. 2) Order 2008 (gazetted on 4.7.2008)	192/2008
4. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance (Amendment of Tenth Schedule) (No. 2) Order 2008 (gazetted on 4.7.2008)	193/2008

5. Public Health and Municipal Services Ordinance 194/2008  
(Amendment of Tenth Schedule) (No. 3) Order  
2008 (gazetted on 4.7.2008)
6. Mainland Judgments (Reciprocal Enforcement) 195/2008  
Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on  
4.7.2008)

**Other Papers**

- No. 107 - Sir Robert Black Trust Fund  
Signed and Audited Financial Statements together  
with the Auditor's Report and Report by the  
Trustee on the Administration of the Fund for the  
year ended 31 March 2008 (published on 7.7.2008)
- No. 108 - Construction Industry Training Authority  
Annual Report 2007 (published on 7.7.2008)
- No. 109 - Construction Industry Council  
Annual Report 2007 (published on 7.7.2008)
- No. 110 - Report by the Commissioner of Correctional  
Services on the administration of the Prisoners'  
Welfare Fund for the year ended 31 March 2008  
(published on 7.7.2008)
- No. 111 - Sir David Trench Fund for Recreation  
Trustee's Report 2007-2008 (published on 8.7.2008)
- No. 112 - The Twentieth Annual Report of The Ombudsman,  
Hong Kong (June 2008) (published on 8.7.2008)
- No. 113 - Report of the Public Accounts Committee on Report  
No. 50 of the Director of Audit on the Results of  
Value for Money Audits  
(July 2008 - P.A.C. Report No. 50) (published on  
9.7.2008)
- No. 114 - The Government Minute in response to the Report  
No. 49A of the Public Accounts Committee dated  
April 2008 (published on 9.7.2008)

Report of the Committee on Members' Interests of the Third  
Legislative Council (published on 7.7.2008)

Committee on Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of  
the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region — Progress  
Report for the 2007-2008 session (12 July 2007 to 9 July 2008)  
(published on 7.7.2008)

Report of the Panel on Manpower 2007-2008 (published on 4.7.2008)

Report of the Panel on Public Service 2007-2008 (published on 8.7.2008)

Report of the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services 2007-2008 (published on 7.7.2008)

Report of the Panel on Home Affairs 2007-2008 (published on 8.7.2008)

Report of the Panel on Transport 2007-2008 (published on 7.7.2008)

Report of the Panel on Development 2007-2008 (published on 7.7.2008)

Report of the Panel on Information Technology and Broadcasting 2007-2008 (published on 8.7.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Race Discrimination Bill (published on 3.7.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Independent Police Complaints Council Bill (published on 4.7.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2008 (published on 8.7.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Air Pollution Control (Amendment) Bill 2008 (published on 7.7.2008)

Report of the Bills Committee on Product Eco-responsibility Bill (published on 7.7.2008)

### **Addresses**

Dr Hon Philip WONG, Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report on Report No. 50 of the Director of Audit on the Results of Value for Money Audits.

While Dr Hon Philip WONG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 11:03 am temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the Report No. 49A of the Public Accounts Committee dated April 2008.

Hon LAU Chin-shek, Chairman of the Panel on Manpower, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2007-2008.



Hon Howard YOUNG, Chairman of the Panel on Public Service, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2007-2008.

Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Panel on Administration of Justice and Legal Services, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2007-2008.

Hon CHOY So-yuk, Chairman of the Panel on Home Affairs, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2007-2008.

Hon Andrew CHENG, Chairman of the Panel on Transport, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2007-2008.

Hon LAU Wong-fat, Chairman of the Panel on Development, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2007-2008.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, Chairman of the Panel on Information Technology and Broadcasting, addressed the Council on the Panel's report 2007-2008.

At 11:57 am, while Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG was addressing the Council, the President resumed the chair.

### Questions

1. Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

2. Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

4. Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

5. Hon Vincent FANG Kang asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

6. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### **Race Discrimination Bill**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 13 December 2006 resumed.

Hon Margaret NG, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Race Discrimination Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon Margaret NG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 2:00 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Eight Members and Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the Bill.

At 3:51 pm, while Hon CHAN Yuen-han was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eleven other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Race Discrimination Bill**.

Question that clauses 5, 6, 9, 11 to 14, 16, 19, 21 to 25, 28 to 33, 35 to 40, 47, 48, 53, 54, 57, 60 to 63, 66 to 70, 73 to 80, 82, 83, 85 to 88, 90, 91 and 92 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 3, 7, 15, 18, 20, 26, 27, 34, 45, 46, 64, 65, 72, 84, 89, 93 and 94, and the cross-headings immediately before clauses 89 and 94 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the deletion of clauses 89 and 94, the cross-headings immediately before the relevant clauses, and the amendments to the aforesaid clauses, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the amendments to clauses 89 and 94, and the cross-headings immediately before the relevant clauses, which dealt with deletions, had been agreed, the clauses and the cross-headings were therefore deleted from the Bill.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 3, 7, 15, 18, 20, 26, 27, 34, 45, 46, 64, 65, 72, 84 and 93 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the heading of Part 6, clauses 41 to 44, 49 to 52, 55, 56, 59, 71 and 81 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Hon Margaret NG to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) and (7) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council could consider new Part 2A, new clauses 9A and 9B and new schedule 6 before considering the aforesaid clauses and heading.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

New Part 2A, new clauses 9A and 9B and new schedule 6 read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Hon Margaret NG had given notice to move the addition of new Part 2A, new clauses 9A and 9B, and new schedule 6 to the Bill. She ordered that new Part 2A, new clauses 9A and 9B and new schedule 6 be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Margaret NG spoke on the aforesaid new clauses and schedule.

While Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 6:45 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two Members spoke on the aforesaid new clauses and schedule.

A Member spoke again and another Member spoke on the aforesaid new clauses and schedule.

Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the aforesaid new clauses and schedule.

Hon Margaret NG spoke for the third time.

At 7:27 pm, while Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the new clauses and schedule.

Hon Margaret NG moved the second reading of new clause 9A.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 9A proposed and put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, eight were in favour of the motion and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 12 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 1.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the other provisions of the Race Discrimination Bill or the amendments thereto, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as Hon Margaret NG's motion had been negatived, she had given permission for Hon Margaret NG to revise the terms of her amendments to clauses 4 and 41 correspondingly.

The Chairman stated that as Hon Margaret NG's motion had been negatived, Hon Margaret NG had withdrawn her amendments to the heading of Part 6, clauses 42, 43, 44, 49 to 52, 55, 56, 59, 71 and 81.

Hon Margaret NG moved the second reading of new clause 9B and new schedule 6.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 9B and new schedule 6 proposed and put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, eight were in favour of the motion and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 11 were in favour of the motion and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 2.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon Margaret NG's motion had been negatived, she might not move her amendment concerning new Part 2A, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that the heading of Part 6, clauses 42, 43, 49, 50, 51, 55, 56 and 59 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the amendments to clauses 44, 52, 71 and 81 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 44, 52, 71 and 81 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved the revised amendment to clause 4 in order to add subclauses (1A), (1B) and (1C) to the clause and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendment.

Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

Question on the amendment put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 3.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon Margaret NG's amendment had been negatived, she might not move her amendment to clause 41, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 41 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved an amendment to clause 4 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 4 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 8 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to clause 8 and addressed the Committee.

A Member spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Three other Members spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, eight were in favour of the amendments and 15 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendments and eight against them. (Voting record in Appendix 4.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clause 8 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 10 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to clause 10 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

Two Members spoke on the amendments.

Hon Margaret NG spoke again.

Question on the amendment to subclause (3) of clause 10 moved by Hon Margaret NG put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 5.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on the amendment to subclause (8) of clause 10 moved by Hon Margaret NG put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 6.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question on the amendment to subclause (10) of clause 10 moved by Hon Margaret NG put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 7.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 10 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 17 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to clause 17 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, nine were in favour of the amendments and 17 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendments and eight against them. (Voting record in Appendix 8.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.



Question that clause 17 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

Question that clause 58 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon Margaret NG moved amendments to clause 58 and addressed the Committee.

A Member and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the amendments.

Hon Margaret NG spoke again and five Members spoke on the amendments.

Hon Margaret NG spoke for the third time.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendments and 15 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendments and nine against them. (Voting record in Appendix 9.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 58 stand part of the Bill put.

Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 51 Members were present, 24 were in favour of the motion and 26 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 10.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

Clause 58 deleted from the Bill.

The President suspended the meeting at 10:19 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Committee resumed at 9:00 am on 10 July 2008.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the Chairman directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

New clauses 93A, 93B, 93C, 93D, 93E, 93F, 93G, 93H, 93I, 93J, 93K, 93L, 93M, 93N, 93O, and the cross-headings immediately before new clauses 93F and 93L read the first time.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and cross-headings, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and cross-headings proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 93A, 93B, 93C, 93D, 93E, 93F, 93G, 93H, 93I, 93J, 93K, 93L, 93M, 93N, 93O, and the cross-headings immediately before new clauses 93F and 93L read the second time.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses and cross-headings to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 3 to 5 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 and 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the amendments to the aforesaid schedules and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 and 2 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the long title stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved an amendment to the long title and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs reported that

#### **the Race Discrimination Bill**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

While the Secretary was speaking, Hon James TO raised a point of order on whether the Council was proceeding to another round of debate during the Third Reading.

The President said that according to the usual practice, no debate would be held during the Third Reading of a bill. However, the Rules of Procedure did not prohibit a public officer from speaking when moving the Third Reading of a bill. The Rules did not prohibit Members from speaking at that stage either. The President asked the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs to continue to speak.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

Eleven Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Question on the Third Reading put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 46 Members were present, 45 were in favour of the motion. (Voting record in Appendix 11.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Several persons in the Public Gallery clapped their hands. The President ordered them to keep quiet.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2008**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 18 June 2008 resumed.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2008, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon CHAN Kam-lam was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 10:00 am temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

After the address, he spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Two Members spoke on the Bill.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong declared that he was a Non-executive Director of the Management Board of the Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes Authority (MPFA) and a Member of the Committee to Oversee MPFA's Implementation of The Government Injection Project. Hon WONG Ting-kwong then spoke on the Bill.

Seven other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

At 11:50 am, while the Secretary was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2008**.

Question that clauses 1, 2, 3, 5, 6, 7 and 9 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han moved an amendment to clause 4 in order to add the proposed section 19AB to clause 4 and addressed the Committee.

Five Members and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the clause and amendment.

Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon CHAN Yuen-han put.

Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, two against it and 15 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix 12.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 8 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved amendments to clauses 4 and 8 and addressed the Committee.

Two Members and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury spoke on the clauses and amendments.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke again.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendments, 14 against them and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendments and 11 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 13.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clauses 4 and 8 stand part of the Bill put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury reported that

the **Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2008**

had passed through the Committee without amendment. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Air Pollution Control (Amendment) Bill 2008**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 20 February 2008 resumed.

Hon Audrey EU, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Air Pollution Control (Amendment) Bill 2008, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon Audrey EU was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:35 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

Several persons in the Public Gallery displayed a yellow banner. The President's Deputy ordered them to fold it up and leave the Public Gallery.

The President's Deputy reminded Members that the props which Members brought into the Chamber were used to assist them in making their speeches. The relevant prop should only be displayed while the Member concerned was speaking.

Four Members and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung spoke on the Bill.

At 2:51 pm, while Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Question on the Second Reading put and agreed to.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Air Pollution Control (Amendment) Bill 2008**.

Question that clauses 1 to 4, 8 to 11 and 14 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 6, 7 and 13 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 6, 7 and 13 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 5 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the proposed sections 26G, 26I, 26K and 26L in clause 5 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 12 and 15 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for the Environment and Hon CHOY So-yuk had separately given notice to move amendments to the proposed section 26M in clause 5, and to clauses 12 and 15. She ordered that the aforesaid clauses and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the clauses and amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke on the clauses and amendments.

Two Members spoke on the clauses and amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke again.

Another Member spoke on the clauses and amendments.

Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke for the third time.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the proposed section 26M in clause 5, and to clauses 12 and 15.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for the Environment put.

Hon CHOY So-yuk claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 42 Members were present, 34 were in favour of the amendments, five against them and two abstained. (Voting record in Appendix 14.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for the Environment's amendments had been passed, Hon CHOY So-yuk might not move her amendments to clauses 5, 12 and 15, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clauses 5, 12 and 15 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 6A read the first time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading of new clause 6A and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 6A proposed.

Three Members spoke on the clause.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 6A put and agreed to.

New clause 6A read the second time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the addition of new clause 6A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for the Environment reported that

the **Air Pollution Control (Amendment) Bill 2008**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed, put and agreed to.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Product Eco-responsibility Bill**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 9 January 2008 resumed.

Hon CHOY So-yuk, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Product Eco-responsibility Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report. After the address, she spoke on the Bill in her personal capacity as a Member.

While Hon CHOY So-yuk was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 4:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Vincent FANG Kang spoke on the Bill.

At 5:07 pm, while Hon Vincent FANG Kang was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eight Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.



Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 34 Members were present, 32 were in favour of the motion and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix 15.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

### Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Product Eco-responsibility Bill**.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 12, 13 and 20 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 4 to 11, 14 to 19 and 21 to 27, and the heading of Division 4 of Part 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and heading and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 2, 4 to 11, 14 to 19 and 21 to 27, and the heading of Division 4 of Part 3 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 20A and 26A read the first time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 20A and 26A read the second time.

The Secretary for the Environment moved the addition of new clauses 20A and 26A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 to 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for the Environment moved amendments to the aforesaid schedules and addressed the Committee.

A Member spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that schedules 1 to 4 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for the Environment reported that

#### **the Product Eco-responsibility Bill**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed and put.

Hon CHOY So-yuk claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 35 Members were present, 33 were in favour of the motion and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix 16.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.

### **Independent Police Complaints Council Bill**

#### **Resumption of Second Reading debate**

The debate on the Second Reading which was moved on 11 July 2007 resumed.

Hon LAU Kong-wah, Chairman of the Bills Committee on Independent Police Complaints Council Bill, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report.

While Hon LAU Kong-wah was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 7:41 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three Members and Hon Emily LAU spoke on the Bill.

At 8:47 pm, while Hon Emily LAU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 9:46 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 11 July 2008.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

A Member spoke on the Bill.

Hon LAU Kong-wah spoke on the Bill in his personal capacity as a Member.

Five other Members spoke on the Bill.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the Second Reading put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 43 Members were present, 29 were in favour of the motion and 13 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 17.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the second time and committed to a committee of the whole Council.

Hon Margaret NG raised a point of order. She stated that she had mistakenly voted in favour of the motion. Her intent was to vote against it. Hon Margaret NG asked if the voting record could be amended. The President stated that as the voting result had already been announced, the voting record could not be amended. However, given Hon Margaret NG's explanation at the meeting, her actual voting intent would be recorded in the verbatim record of the proceedings.

Committee Stage

The Council went into Committee and considered the **Independent Police Complaints Council Bill**.

Question that clauses 33 and 39 stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 44 stand part of the Bill proposed.

A Member and the Secretary for Security spoke on the motion.

Two other Members spoke on the motion.

Two Members and the Secretary for Security spoke again.

Two Members and the Secretary for Security spoke for the third time.

A Member spoke for the fourth time.

Question that clause 44 stand part of the Bill put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 36 Members were present, 23 were in favour of the motion and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 18.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the other provisions of the Independent Police Complaints Council Bill or amendments thereto, the Committee do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed.

Seven Members spoke on the motion.

One of these Members asked if the motion was withdrawn, whether Hon Miriam LAU might propose it again at a later time. The President answered in the affirmative.

Two more Members spoke on the motion.

The President stated that according to Rule 35(2) of the Rule of Procedure, "a motion or an amendment may be withdrawn at the request of the mover by leave of the Council or committee of the whole Council before the question is put thereon, if there is no dissenting voice. A motion or amendment which has been so withdrawn may be proposed again if, in the case of a motion, the notice required by these Rules of Procedure is given." The motion in question could be moved without notice.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to withdraw the motion. As there was no dissenting voice, the motion was withdrawn.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 6, 9, 12, 13, 21, 29, 30, 35, 36, 40 to 43, the headings of Parts 2 and 5, and the headings of Divisions 2, 3 and 4 of Part 3 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the aforesaid clauses and headings, and addressed the Committee.

Two Members spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clauses 1, 3, 6, 9, 12, 13, 21, 29, 30, 35, 36, 40 to 43, the headings of Parts 2 and 5, and the headings of Divisions 2, 3 and 4 of Part 3 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 4 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 4. She ordered that clause 4 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit spoke on the clause and amendments.

While Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 1:00 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two Members spoke on the clause and amendments.

Another Member and Hon James TO spoke again.

Two more Members spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon Emily LAU spoke for the third time.

At 1:57 pm, while Hon Emily LAU was speaking, the Chairman resumed the chair.

A Member spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke for the third time.

Another Member spoke again.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading of clause 4 and subclause (1) thereof in order to delete '警監會' and substitute '監警會'.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of clause 4.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix 19.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (b) of subclause (1) of clause 4, the renumbering of this paragraph to (b)(i) and the addition of paragraph (b)(ii) to the subclause.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix 20.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved amendments to paragraph (c) of subclause (1) of clause 4 and the addition of paragraph (d) to the subclause.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendments and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and eight against them. (Voting record in Appendix 21.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Hon James TO moved the addition of paragraph (e) to subclause (1) of clause 4.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put and negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to subclause (2) of clause 4.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 38 Members were present, 25 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 22.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to subclause (2) of clause 4 and the addition of subclause (3) to the clause, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Hon James TO moved the addition of subclause (4) to clause 4.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 23.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 4 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 5 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading and subclauses (2) and (3) of clause 5, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to subclause (1) of clause 5. She ordered that clause 5 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

Three Members spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO and another Member spoke again.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to subclause (1) of clause 5.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 38 Members were present, 24 were in favour of the amendments and 13 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 24.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.



The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to subclause (1) of clause 5, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 5 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the heading of Part 3 and clause 7 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to the headings of Part 3 and clause 7, and the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1). She ordered that the provisions and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the provisions and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the provisions and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the headings of Part 3 and clause 7, and the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of clause 7.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 38 Members were present, 24 were in favour of the amendments and 13 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 25.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendments to the headings of Part 3 and clause 7, and the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1) and the long title, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the Chinese text of subclause (1) of clause 7, as well as paragraphs (a), (b), (c) and (e) of the subclause, and subclause (2) of that clause, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that the heading of Part 3 and clause 7 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 11 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 11. She ordered that clause 11 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to clause 11.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 36 Members were present, 26 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix 26.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendments to clause 11, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 11 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 8 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Hon James TO and the Secretary for Security had separately given notice to move amendments to the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of clause 8. She ordered that clause 8 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

A Member spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of clause 8.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, two were in favour of the amendment, 16 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 27.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of clause 8.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to paragraphs (a) and (b) of subclause (1) of clause 8, and subclauses (2) and (3) of clause 8, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 8 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 10 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 10. She ordered that clause 10 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

While the Secretary for Security was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 4:32 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading and paragraph (a)(i) of clause 10, and the deletion of '須具報' by substituting '須匯報' in the Chinese text of the clause.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (a)(ii) of clause 10.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 4:52 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 17 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 28.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved the addition of sub-paragraph (iv) to paragraph (a) of clause 10.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 29.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved the addition of sub-paragraph (v) to paragraph (a) of clause 10.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 18 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 30.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to paragraph (b) of clause 10.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 40 Members were present, 27 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 31.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to paragraph (b) of clause 10, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 10 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 14 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 14. She ordered that clause 14 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to clause 14 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendments to clause 14, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 14 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 15 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to subclauses (1) and (2) of clause 15 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that Hon James TO had given notice to move amendments to subclauses (2) and (3) of clause 15, and the Secretary of Security had also given notice to move an amendment to subclause (3) of clause 15. She ordered that clause 15 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Hon James TO moved amendment to subclause (2) of clause 15.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, one was in favour of the amendment and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix 32.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon James TO's amendment had been negatived, she had given permission for him to revise the terms of his amendment to subclause (3) of clause 15 correspondingly.

Hon James TO moved the revised amendment to subclause (3) of clause 15.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, one was in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 33.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to subclause (3) of clause 15.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

Question that clause 15 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 16 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading and subclause (1) of clause 16 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security had given notice to move amendments to subclauses (2) and (3) of clause 16; and Hon James TO had also given notice to move amendments to clause 16, in order to amend subclauses (2) and (3) and to add subclause (4). She ordered that clause 16 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to subclause (2) of clause 16.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 42 Members were present, 27 were in favour of the amendments and 14 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 34.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendments to paragraphs (d) and (e) of subclause (2) of clause 16, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to add paragraph (f) to subclause 2 of clause 16.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix 35.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to subclause (3) of clause 16.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendments to clause 16, in order to amend subclause (3) and to add subclause (4), which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 16 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 17 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading of clause 17, the Chinese text of subclauses (1) and (2), and subclause (4) and addressed the Committee.

Three Members spoke on the amendments.

One of these Members spoke again.

Question on the amendments put.

Hon Howard YOUNG claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 42 Members were present, 28 were in favour of the amendments, three against them and 10 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix 36.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

Hon James TO moved amendment to paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of clause 17 and addressed the Committee.

Two Members spoke on the clause and amendment.

Hon James TO and another Member spoke again.



Hon James To spoke for the third time.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs, who stood in for the Secretary for Security, spoke on the clause and amendment.

Hon James To spoke for the fourth time.

Another Member spoke for the third time.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 37.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon James TO's amendment was negatived, he might not move the amendment to paragraph (b) of subclause (3) of clause 17, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (a) of subclause (2) of clause 17 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs, who stood in for the Secretary for Security, spoke on the clause and amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put and negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to subclause (3) of clause 17 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (b) of subclause (1) of clause 17 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 38.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (b) of subclause (2) of clause 17 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put and negatived.

Question that clause 17 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 18 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 18. She ordered that clause 18 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

While the Secretary for Security was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 7:07 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

Another Member spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading of clause 18, subclauses (1) and (2), and the addition of subclause (1A) to that clause.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved amendments to the heading, paragraph (e) of subclause (1), and subclause (2) of clause 18.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 7:30 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendments and 15 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 15 were present, eight were in favour of the amendments and six against them. (Voting record in Appendix 39.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Hon James TO moved the addition of subclause (3) to clause 18 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 15 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix 40.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 18 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 19 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading of clause 19 and the Chinese text of subclauses (1), (2), (5), (6) and (7) of that clause, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to subclause (1) of clause 19, in order to delete 'information' and substitute it with 'information or material', and addressed the Committee.

While James TO was addressing the Committee, the Chairman left the chair at 7:39 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 13 were present, six were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix 41.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that Hon James TO had given notice to move the deletion of subclause (3) from clause 19; the Secretary for Security had also given notice to move an amendment to that subclause. She ordered that clause 19 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Hon James TO moved the deletion of subclause (3) from clause 19.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put and negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to subclause (3) of clause 19.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

Question that clause 37 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to paragraph (b) of subclause (2) of clause 37 and addressed the Committee.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendment.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (c) of subclause (2) of clause 37 and addressed the Committee.

A Member and the Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendment.

A Member spoke again.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 42.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved amendments to paragraph (d) of subclause (2) of clause 37 and the addition of paragraph (e)(i) to that subclause, and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, two were in favour of the amendments and 17 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, eight were in favour of the amendments and 10 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 43.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Hon James TO moved the addition of paragraph (e)(ii) to subclause (2) of clause 37 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 44.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved the addition of paragraph (e)(iii) to subclause (2) of clause 37 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

Another Member spoke on the amendment.

A Member spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 45.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon James TO's amendment had been negatived, she had given permission for Hon James TO to revise the terms of his amendment to subclause (8) of clause 19 correspondingly, in order to delete the reference to paragraph (e) of subclause (2) of clause 37.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security had given notice to move the addition of clause (2A) to clause 37. Hon James TO had given notice to amend subclause (3) of clause 37 and delete subclause (4) therefrom. The Secretary for Security and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum had also separately given notice to move amendments to subclause (4) of clause 37. The Chairman ordered that the original clause and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO and Dr Hon YEUNG Sum spoke again.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

Hon James TO spoke for the third time.

Three other Members spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 10:03 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 12 July 2008.

Hon James TO who had spoken thrice on the previous day spoke again.

The Secretary for Security moved the addition of subclause (2A) to clause 37.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 33 Members were present, 21 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 46.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to subclause (3) of clause 37 and the deletion of subclause (4) therefrom, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to subclause (4) of clause 37.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, who stood in for Hon LEE Wing-tat, might not move his amendments to paragraphs (d) and (e) of subclause (4) of clause 37, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved the addition of paragraphs (f), (g) and (h) to subclause (4) of clause 37.

Question on the amendments moved by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put and negatived.

Question that clause 37 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for the Secretary for Security to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council could consider new clause 19A together with clause 19.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

New clause 19A read the first time.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security had given notice to move amendments to clause 19 in order to amend subclause (8) and delete subclause (9), and the addition of new clause 19A; Hon James TO had also given notice to amend subclauses (8) and (9) of clause 19. She ordered that clause 19 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to clause 19 in order to amend subclause (8) and delete subclause (9).

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 40 Members were present, 24 were in favour of the amendments and 15 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 47.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendments to subclauses (8) and (9) of clause 19, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 19 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading of new clause 19A.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 19A proposed, put and agreed to.

New clause 19A read the second time.



The Secretary for Security moved the addition of new clause 19A to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 22 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Council resumed by order of the Chairman. The President then granted leave for Hon James TO to move a motion under Rule 91 of the Rules of Procedure to suspend Rule 58(5) of the Rules of Procedure in order that the committee of the whole Council could consider new clause 18A together with clause 22.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The Council went into Committee again.

New clause 18A read the first time.

The Chairman stated that Hon James TO had given notice to move an amendment to clause 22 and the addition of new clause 18A; the Secretary for Security had also given notice to move an amendment to clause 22. She ordered that clause 22 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Two Members spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke again.

Hon James TO spoke for the third time.

Hon James TO moved the Second Reading of new clause 18A.

Question on the Second Reading of new clause 18A proposed and put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, three were in favour of the motion and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, 10 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 48.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

The Chairman stated that as Hon James TO's motion had been negatived, she had given permission for him to revise the terms of his amendment to clause 22 correspondingly, in order to delete the reference of clause 18A.

The Secretary of Security moved amendments to clause 22.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary of Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 35 Members were present, 21 were in favour of the amendments and 13 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 49.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to clause 22, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 22 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 20 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading, subclause (1) in the Chinese text and paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of clause 20, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to paragraph (b) of subclause (1) of clause 20. She ordered that clause 20 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to paragraph (b) of subclause (1) of clause 20.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 30 Members were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 50.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to paragraph (b) of subclause (1) of clause 20, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Hon James TO moved the addition of subclause (3) to clause 20 and addressed the Committee.

A Member spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Two other Members and Hon Mrs Selina CHOW spoke on the amendment.

While Hon Mrs Selina CHOW was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 11:15 am temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon James TO spoke for the third time.

Another Member spoke again.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke for the fourth time.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 11:31 am, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 16 were present, four were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 51.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 20 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 23 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs, who stood in for the Secretary for Security, moved amendments to the heading and subclauses (1) and (2) of clause 23, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved further amendments to subclause (1) of clause 23 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again and one Member spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, three were in favour of the amendments and 15 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and nine against them. (Voting record in Appendix 52.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

Question that clause 23 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 24 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to clause 24 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved a further amendment to clause 24 and addressed the Committee.

While Hon James TO was addressing the Committee, the Chairman left the chair at 12:15 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO and the Secretary for Security spoke again.

Hon James TO and the Secretary for Security spoke for the third time.

Hon James TO spoke for the fourth time.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 12:22 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix 53.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 24 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 25 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading of clause 25 and the Chinese text of that clause, in order to delete " 警監會 " and substitute it with " 監警會 ", and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

The Chairman stated that Hon James TO and the Secretary for Security had separately given notice to move amendments to paragraph (a) of clause 25. She ordered that clause 25 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

While Hon James TO was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 12:27 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to paragraph (a) of clause 25.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon WONG Yung-kan claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 12:41 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 17 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 15 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 54.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to paragraph (a) of clause 25.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

Question that clause 25 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 26 stand part of the Bill.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to the heading of clause 26 and the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of that clause. She ordered that clause 26 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

While the Secretary for Security was speaking, the Chairman left the chair at 12:46 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO stated that the amendments proposed by him and the Secretary for Security were substantially the same. Given that he was prepared to support the Secretary for Security's amendments, Hon James TO asked whether he could withdraw his amendment.

The Chairman's Deputy stated that as Hon James TO had not yet moved his amendment, he could withdraw his amendment. Hon James TO withdrew his amendment.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the heading of clause 26 and the reference before paragraph (a) of subclause (1) of that clause.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the Chinese text of paragraphs (a) and (b) of subclause (1) of clause 26 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 26 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 27 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 27. She ordered that clause 27 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to the Chinese text of the heading of clause 27.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to the numbering and subclause (1) of clause 27, and the addition of subclause (2) to that clause.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 1:16 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that 42 Members were present, 28 were in favour of the amendments and 13 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 55.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendments to the numbering of clause 27, and to subclauses (1) and (2) of that clause, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 27 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 28 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon James TO moved amendments to the numbering of clause 28, and the addition of subclause (2) to that clause, and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, two were in favour of the amendments and 18 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendments and six against them. (Voting record in Appendix 56.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to clause 28 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Question that clause 28 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 31 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that Hon James TO, Hon SIN Chung-kai, who stood in for Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, and Dr Hon YEUNG-Sum had separately given notice to move amendments to subclause (1) of clause 31. She ordered that clause 31 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO, Hon SIN Chung-kai and Dr Hon YEUNG-Sum spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon SIN Chung-kai, Dr Hon YEUNG Sum and Hon James TO spoke again.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to subclause (1) of clause 31.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 20 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 17 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 16 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix 57.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.



Hon SIN Chung-kai moved an amendment to subclause (1) of clause 31.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon SIN Chung-kai put and negatived.

Dr Hon YEUNG Sum moved an amendment to subclause (1) of clause 31.

Question on the amendment moved by Dr Hon YEUNG Sum put and negatived.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security had given notice to move an amendment to subclause (2) of clause 31, and Hon James TO had also given notice to move amendments to subclause (2) of clause 31, and the addition of subclause (3) to that clause. She ordered that clause 31 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

Another Member spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to subclause (2) of clause 31.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 34 Members were present, 22 were in favour of the amendment and 11 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 58.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to subclause (2) of clause 31, nor the addition of subclause (3) to that clause, which were inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 31 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 32 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to clause 32. She ordered that clause 32 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the clause and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the clause and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to clause 32.

Question on the amendment moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 39 Members were present, 26 were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 59.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendment was agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendment had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to clause 32, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that clause 32 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 34 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to clause 34 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved a further amendment to clause 34, in order to amend paragraph (a) of subclause (2), and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 19 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 16 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix 60.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 34 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 38 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to the heading of clause 38 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to subclause (1) of clause 38 and addressed the Committee.

While Hon James TO was addressing the Committee, the Chairman left the chair at 2:34 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 2:49 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, two were in favour of the amendment and 19 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 14 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and six against it. (Voting record in Appendix 61.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Question that clause 38 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to clause 2 and addressed the Committee.

Hon James To spoke on the amendments.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Question that clause 2 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

New clauses 1A, 33A and 40A read the first time.

The Secretary for Security moved the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses and addressed the Committee.

Question on the Second Reading of the aforesaid clauses proposed.

Hon James TO spoke on the new clauses.

Question on the Second Reading of new clauses 1A, 33A and 40A put and agreed to.

New clauses 1A, 33A and 40A read the second time.

The Secretary for Security moved the addition of the aforesaid clauses to the Bill.

Question on the addition proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedule 1 stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to schedule 1 to amend the heading and the cross-heading immediately after the heading, sections 1, 5 to 9, 11, 12, 13, 16, 18 to 22, 24 and 26, to add sections 1A, 11A, 11B, 11C, 11D, 16A, 16B, 16C and 16D to schedule 1, to delete sections 10 and 14, and to amend subsections (3) to (6) of section 25 of schedule 1, and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendments put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved a further amendment to section 1 of schedule 1 and addressed the Committee.

While Hon James TO was addressing the Committee, the Chairman left the chair at 3:32 pm temporarily and the Chairman's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the schedule and amendment.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

At 3:40 pm, while the division bell was ringing, the Chairman resumed the chair.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 15 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix 62.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon James TO moved further amendments to section 11 of schedule 1 and addressed the Committee.

Three Members and the Secretary for Security spoke on the schedule and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke again.

Question on the amendments moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, four were in favour of the amendments and 21 against them; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 20 were present, 11 were in favour of the amendments and eight against them. (Voting record in Appendix 63.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendments were negatived.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move amendments to section 23 of schedule 1. She ordered that section 23 of schedule 1 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the schedule and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the schedule and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to the heading of section 23 of schedule 1, and the Chinese text of subsections (1) and (2) of section 23, in order to delete "警監會" wherever it appears and substitute it with "監警會".

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to subsection (1) of section 23 of schedule 1 in order to delete 'or such further period as the Chief Executive may allow.'

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 17 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 64.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs, who stood in for the Secretary for Security, moved an amendment to subsection (1) of section 23 of schedule 1, in order to add "(as may be reasonable in the circumstances)" after "period".

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to subsection (2) of section 23 of schedule 1.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 17 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 65.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Chairman stated that the Secretary for Security and Hon James TO had separately given notice to move an amendment to subsection (1) of section 25 of schedule 1. She ordered that schedule 1 and the amendments thereto be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the schedule and amendments.

Hon James TO spoke on the schedule and amendments.

The Secretary for Security moved amendments to subsection (1) of section 25 of schedule 1.

Question on the amendments moved by the Secretary for Security put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that 46 Members were present, 31 were in favour of the amendments and 14 against them. (Voting record in Appendix 66.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the amendments were agreed.

The Chairman stated that as the Secretary for Security's amendments had been passed, Hon James TO might not move his amendment to subsection (1) of section 25 of schedule 1, which was inconsistent with the decision already taken.

Question that schedule 1 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that schedule 2 stand part of the Bill proposed.

Hon James TO moved an amendment to section 3 of schedule 2 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the schedule and amendment.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The Chairman announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 22 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix 67.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the amendment was negatived.

The Secretary for Security moved amendment to section 4 of schedule 2 and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

Hon James TO moved a further amendment to section 4 of schedule 2 and addressed the Committee.

The Secretary for Security spoke on the schedule and amendment.

Question on the amendment moved by Hon James TO put and negatived.

Question that schedule 2 as amended stand part of the Bill proposed, put and agreed to.

Question that the long title stand part of the Bill proposed.

The Secretary for Security moved an amendment to the long title and addressed the Committee.

Question on the amendment put and agreed to.

The Council then resumed.

### **Third Reading**

The Secretary for Security reported that

#### **the Independent Police Complaints Council Bill**

had passed through the Committee with amendments. He moved that the Bill be read the third time and do pass.

Question on the Third Reading proposed.

Thirteen Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the Third Reading put.

Hon James TO claimed a division. The Chairman then ordered the Committee to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that 47 Members were present, 30 were in favour of the motion, 15 against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix 68.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of the Members present, she declared that the motion was carried.

Bill read the third time and passed.



Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General  
Clauses Ordinance

1. **Building (Planning) (Amendment) Regulation 2008**

The President stated that the Secretary for Development and Hon Tommy CHEUNG had separately given notice to move a motion under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance to amend the Building (Planning) (Amendment) Regulation 2008. She ordered that the two motions be debated together in a joint debate.

The Secretary for Development moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Building (Planning) (Amendment) Regulation 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 124 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 21 May 2008, be amended, in section 5, in the new Third Schedule -

(a) in Part 2, by repealing section 4(1) and (2) and substituting -

"(1) On any premises with an auditorium with not more than 800 fixed seats at spectator level, not less than 4 wheelchair spaces shall be provided at spectator level.

(2) On any premises with an auditorium with more than 800 fixed seats at spectator level, not less than 2 wheelchair spaces shall be provided at spectator level for every 400 fixed seats or any part thereof.";

(b) in Part 2, by repealing "**Division 12 - Bathrooms and Shower Compartments**" and substituting -

**"Division 12 - Bathrooms and Shower  
Compartments in Accessible  
Guest Rooms**

55A. **Application: Division 12,  
Part 2**

This Division applies to bathrooms and shower compartments in accessible guest rooms required under section 7.";

(c) in Part 2, in section 86, in the Table -

- (i) in the Chinese text, by repealing "觸覺地面平面" wherever it appears and substituting "觸覺平面地圖";
  - (ii) in the English text, in item 6, by repealing "workship" and substituting "workshop";
- (d) in Part 4 -
- (i) in item 1, in the second column, by adding -  
"(d) All guest rooms required under section 7.";
  - (ii) in item 3, in the second column, by adding -  
"(e) All guest rooms required under section 7."

While the Secretary for Development was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 5:56 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion.

Hon Emily LAU spoke on the motion as Chairman of the Subcommittee on Building (Planning) (Amendment) Regulation 2008, and then in her personal capacity as a Member.

At 6:30 pm, while Hon Emily LAU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Nine Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG spoke again.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following motion:

RESOLVED that the Building (Planning) (Amendment) Regulation 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 124 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 21 May 2008, be amended, in section 5, in the new Third Schedule, in Part 2, by repealing section 14 and substituting -

**"14. Ramps to be provided**

(1) Ramps shall be provided at all changes in level other than those served by an accessible lift or accessible lifting mechanism accommodating the specific requirements of persons with a disability.

(2) Without prejudice to the generality of subsection (1), in respect of a restaurant -

(a) ramps shall be provided at all changes in level in the usable floor space only if the total horizontal area of such changes in level exceeds 30% of the usable floor space; or

(b) a removable ramp may be substituted for a ramp to be provided at all changes in level in the usable floor space only if such changes in level do not exceed 300 mm in height.

(3) If a removable ramp is used as a substitute under subsection (2)(b), the requirements under sections 15, 16, 17, 18 and 19 for a ramp shall be applicable to the removable ramp, as if the removable ramp were a ramp."

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion proposed, put and negatived.

**2. Building (Refuse Storage and Material Recovery Chambers and Refuse Chutes) (Amendment) Regulation 2008**

The Secretary for Development moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Building (Refuse Storage and Material Recovery Chambers and Refuse Chutes) (Amendment) Regulation 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 125 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 21 May 2008, be amended, in section 3, in the new regulation 3A(5), by repealing ", boarding house, hostel or dormitory" and substituting "or boarding house".

While the Secretary for Development was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 8:11 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon CHOY So-yuk spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Building (Refuse Storage and Material Recovery Chambers and Refuse Chutes) (Amendment) Regulation 2008. After then, she declared that she was the Chairman of the Waste Recovery Projects Vetting Subcommittee of the Environment and Conservation Fund and spoke in her personal capacity as a Member.

Two Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

#### **Proposed resolution under the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance**

The Secretary for Transport and Housing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Dutiable Commodities Ordinance (Cap. 109) be amended, in Part III of Schedule 1 -

- (a) in paragraph 1B(a), by repealing "30 November 2009" and substituting "13 July 2008";
- (b) by repealing paragraph 1B(b) and substituting -  
    "(b) from 14 July 2008, at \$0 per litre."

At 8:41 pm, while the Secretary for Transport and Housing was addressing the Council, the President resumed the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Six Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

#### **Members' Motions**

##### **Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance**

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Food Business (Amendment) Regulation 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 185 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 2 July 2008, be repealed.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung spoke on the motion.

While Hon TAM Yiu-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 10:29 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Three other Members and Hon Fred LI spoke on the motion.

At 11:13 pm, while Hon Fred LI was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three more Members spoke on the motion.

The Chairman suspended the meeting at 00:01 am on 13 July 2008.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 13 July 2008.

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Seven Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Hon Albert CHAN replied.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, two were in favour of the motion, 16 against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 18 were present, three were in favour of the motion and 14 against it. (Voting record in Appendix 69.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, she declared that the motion was negatived.

**Valedictory Motion**

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council concludes its work and wishes for the smooth formation of the fourth Legislative Council to continue to serve the people of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Chief Secretary for Administration and Hon CHAN Yuen-han spoke on the motion.

While Hon CHAN Yuen-han was speaking, the President left the chair at 11:02 am temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another Member and Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing spoke on the motion.

At 11:32 am, while Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon Martin LEE drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Martin LEE spoke on the motion.

Four other Members and Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai spoke on the motion.

While Ir Dr Hon HO Chung-tai was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:00 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Four more Members and Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long spoke on the motion.

At 1:55 pm, while Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Fourteen other Members and Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit spoke on the motion.

While Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:17 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Abraham SHEK spoke on the motion.

At 5:24 pm, while Hon Abraham SHEK was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG spoke on the motion.

Three more Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Miriam LAU replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Next Meeting**

The President addressed the Council. After the address, she declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 16 July 2008 at 3:00 pm.

The Council was adjourned at 6:54 pm.

(Mrs Rita FAN HSU Lai-tai)  
President  
30 September 2008

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 07:38:40 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第9A條，予以二讀  
 RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSE 9A BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	20	
投票 Vote	22	19	
贊成 Yes	8	12	
反對 No	14	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體	Functional Constituencies			地方選區	Geographical Constituencies		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉懸卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG			蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 07:43:03 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第9B條及新訂的附表6，予以二讀  
 RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - NEW CLAUSE 9B AND NEW SCHEDULE 6 BE READ THE SECOND TIME

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	20	
投票 Vote	23	19	
贊成 Yes	8	11	
反對 No	15	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		馮家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 08:07:33 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 就第4條動議經修改的修正案，以在該條加入第(1A)、(1B)及(1C)款  
 RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - REVISED AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 4 IN ORDER TO ADD SUBCLAUSES (1A), (1B) AND (1C) TO THE CLAUSE

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	22	
投票 Vote	22	21	
贊成 Yes	8	13	
反對 No	14	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
 日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 08:59:57 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第8條  
 RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 8

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	22	
投票 Vote	23	21	
贊成 Yes	8	13	
反對 No	15	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>				<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	反對	NO	范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對	NO	何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	反對	NO	曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	反對	NO	劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO
方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU			湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN		

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6  
日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 09:13:56 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第10條第(3)款  
RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO SUBCLAUSE (3)  
OF CLAUSE 10

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	22	
投票 Vote	24	21	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	15	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7  
日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 09:16:15 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第10條第(8)款  
RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO SUBCLAUSE (8)  
OF CLAUSE 10

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	9	15	
反對 No	15	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 8  
 日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 09:18:26 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第10條第(10)款  
 RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO SUBCLAUSE (10)  
 OF CLAUSE 10

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	23	
投票 Vote	24	22	
贊成 Yes	9	15	
反對 No	15	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9  
日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 09:26:11 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第17條  
RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 17

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	22	
投票 Vote	26	21	
贊成 Yes	9	13	
反對 No	17	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 10  
日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 10:16:24 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第58條  
RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSE 58

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	25	
投票 Vote	26	24	
贊成 Yes	11	15	
反對 No	15	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 11  
 日期 DATE: 09/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:18:27 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 第58條納入條例草案  
 RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - COMMITTEE STAGE - CLAUSE 58 STAND PART OF THE  
 BILL

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制及內地事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

出席 Present :51  
 投票 Vote :50  
     贊成 Yes :24  
     反對 No :26  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO
涂謹申	James TO			李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對	NO	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	反對	NO	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄺志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 10/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 09:57:23 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《種族歧視條例草案》 - 三讀  
 RACE DISCRIMINATION BILL - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 政制及內地事務局局長 Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

出席 Present :46  
 投票 Vote :45  
     贊成 Yes :45  
     反對 No :0  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE			張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG			郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	贊成	YES
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	贊成	YES
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 10/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 12:47:12 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2008年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第4條，以在第4條加入建議的第19AB條  
MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) BILL 2008 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENT TO CLAUSE 4 IN ORDER TO ADD THE PROPOSED PARAGRAPH 19AB TO CLAUSE 4

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	21	
投票 Vote	17	20	
贊成 Yes	2	3	
反對 No	10	2	
棄權 Abstain	5	15	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		楊森 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3  
 日期 DATE: 10/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 01:29:45 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2008年強制性公積金計劃（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第4及8條  
 MANDATORY PROVIDENT FUND SCHEMES (AMENDMENT) BILL 2008 - COMMITTEE  
 STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO CLAUSES 4 AND 8

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	22	
投票 Vote	17	21	
贊成 Yes	2	10	
反對 No	14	11	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yiu-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	贊成 YES	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

*Vicki Chan*

投票 VOTE: 4  
 日期 DATE: 10/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:24:05 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《2008年空氣污染管制（修訂）條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第5條中建議的第26M條，以及第12及15條  
 AIR POLLUTION CONTROL (AMENDMENT) BILL 2008 - COMMITTEE STAGE - AMENDMENTS TO THE PROPOSED SECTION 26M IN CLAUSE 5, AND TO CLAUSES 12 AND 15

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境局局長 Secretary for the Environment

出席 Present :42  
 投票 Vote :41  
     贊成 Yes :34  
     反對 No :5  
     棄權 Abstain :2  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN
李華明	Fred LI	贊成	YES	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing		
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成	YES	李國英	LI Kwok-ying		
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam			林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	棄權	ABSTAIN
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	反對	NO	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5  
日期 DATE: 10/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 07:16:44 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《產品環保責任條例草案》 - 二讀  
PRODUCT ECO-RESPONSIBILITY BILL - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境局局長 Secretary for the Environment

出席 Present :34  
投票 Vote :33  
贊成 Yes :32  
反對 No :1  
棄權 Abstain :0  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying		
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM		
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	贊成	YES	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6  
 日期 DATE: 10/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 07:37:02 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《產品環保責任條例草案》- 三讀  
 PRODUCT ECO-RESPONSIBILITY BILL - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 環境局局長 Secretary for the Environment

出席 Present :35  
 投票 Vote :34  
     贊成 Yes :33  
     反對 No :1  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成	YES	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG	反對	NO
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	贊成	YES
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying		
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 7  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 11:04:44 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 二讀  
 INDEPENDENT POLICE COMPLAINTS COUNCIL BILL - SECOND READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :43  
 投票 Vote :42  
     贊成 Yes :29  
     反對 No :13  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	贊成	YES	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing		
涂謹申	JAMES TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 8  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 11:44:35 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 第 44 條納入條例草案

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :36  
投票 Vote :35  
贊成 Yes :23  
反對 No :12  
棄權 Abstain :0  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing		
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG			梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 9  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:12:41 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第4條第(1)款(a)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	21	
投票 Vote	20	20	
贊成 Yes	3	11	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 10  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 02:17:10 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第4條第(1)款(b)段，並將該段重編為(b)(i)段，以及在該條加入(b)(ii)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	21	
投票 Vote	21	20	
贊成 Yes	4	11	
反對 No	17	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 11  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:21:32 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第4條第(1)款(c)段及在該款加入(d)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	18	
投票 Vote	21	17	
贊成 Yes	4	9	
反對 No	17	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

*Vivian Chan*

投票 VOTE: 12  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:26:51 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第4條第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :38  
 投票 Vote :37  
     贊成 Yes :25  
     反對 No :12  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki	反對	NO
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

*Vivian Lam*

秘書 CLERK \_\_\_\_\_

投票 VOTE: 13  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:31:17 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第4條加入第(4)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	19	
投票 Vote	21	18	
贊成 Yes	4	10	
反對 No	17	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki	贊成 YES	李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 14  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 03:09:19 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第5條第(1)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :38  
 投票 Vote :37  
     贊成 Yes :24  
     反對 No :13  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing		
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai			梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek	反對	NO	詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

*Virginia Lam*

投票 VOTE: 15  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 03:29:42 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第3部的標題，以及第7條的標題及第(1)款(a)段之前的提述

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :38  
 投票 Vote :37  
     贊成 Yes :24  
     反對 No :13  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK		
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO	
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 16  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 03:55:37 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第11條

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :36  
投票 Vote :35  
    贊成 Yes :26  
    反對 No :9  
    棄權 Abstain :0  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE		
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG		
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄺志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

*W. H. Chan*

投票 VOTE: 17  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:26:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第8條第(1)款(a)段之前的提述

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	19	
投票 Vote	19	18	
贊成 Yes	2	10	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 18  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:56:30 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第10條(a)(ii)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	17	
投票 Vote	18	16	
贊成 Yes	3	9	
反對 No	15	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		楊森 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 19  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 05:00:55 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第10條(a)段加入第(iv)節

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	19	
投票 Vote	20	18	
贊成 Yes	2	11	
反對 No	18	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 20  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 05:05:17 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第10條(a)段加入第(v)節

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	20	
投票 Vote	20	19	
贊成 Yes	2	11	
反對 No	18	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 21  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 05:09:42 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第10條(b)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :40  
 投票 Vote :39  
     贊成 Yes :27  
     反對 No :12  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin		
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 22  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 05:39:29 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第15條第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	19	
投票 Vote	17	18	
贊成 Yes	1	9	
反對 No	16	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 23  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 05:44:26 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 就第15條第(3)款動議經修改的修正案

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	22	
投票 Vote	18	21	
贊成 Yes	1	11	
反對 No	17	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin		鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 24  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 06:12:45 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第16條第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :42  
 投票 Vote :41  
     贊成 Yes :27  
     反對 No :14  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 25  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 06:17:15 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第16條第(2)款加入(f)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	22	
投票 Vote	20	21	
贊成 Yes	3	12	
反對 No	17	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何繼泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 26  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 06:37:38 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第17條的標題，第(1)及(2)款的中文文本，以及第(4)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :42  
投票 Vote :41  
    贊成 Yes :28  
    反對 No :3  
    棄權 Abstain :10  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	贊成	YES
李柱銘	Martin LEE	棄權	ABSTAIN	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	棄權	ABSTAIN	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	棄權	ABSTAIN
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	棄權	ABSTAIN	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	棄權	ABSTAIN
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	棄權	ABSTAIN	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	棄權	ABSTAIN
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	棄權	ABSTAIN	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	棄權	ABSTAIN
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	反對	NO
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	棄權	ABSTAIN	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 27  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 06:54:28 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第17條第(1)款(a)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	21	
投票 Vote	17	20	
贊成 Yes	2	10	
反對 No	15	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 28  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 07:05:19 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第17條第(1)款(b)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	19	
投票 Vote	17	18	
贊成 Yes	2	8	
反對 No	15	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 29  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 07:33:58 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第18條的標題，第(1)款(e)段及第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	15	
投票 Vote	17	14	
贊成 Yes	2	8	
反對 No	15	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies				地方選區 Geographical Constituencies			
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT
李國寶	Dr David LI			田北俊	James TIEN	反對	NO
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			何俊仁	Albert HO		
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李柱銘	Martin LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	反對	NO	李華明	Fred LI		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對	NO	周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	贊成	YES	涂謹申	James TO	贊成	YES
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	反對	NO	陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	反對	NO	陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	反對	NO
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	反對	NO	梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	反對	NO	楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成	YES
霍震霆	Timothy FOK			劉千石	LAU Chin-shek		
石禮謙	Abraham SHEK			劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	反對	NO
李鳳英	LI Fung-ying	反對	NO	劉慧卿	Emily LAU	贊成	YES
張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	反對	NO	蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk		
方剛	Vincent FANG			鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	反對	NO
李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	反對	NO	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	贊成	YES
林偉強	Daniel LAM	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	反對	NO	余若薇	Audrey EU	贊成	YES
梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	反對	NO
張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成	YES	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	贊成	YES
黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming		
劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU			湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	反對	NO	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
譚香文	TAM Heung-man			陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成	YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 30  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 07:38:18 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第18條加入第(3)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	15	
投票 Vote	17	14	
贊成 Yes	2	8	
反對 No	15	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

職員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	職員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 31  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 07:50:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第19條第(1)款，以刪去‘資料’而代以‘資料或材料’

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	13	
投票 Vote	17	12	
贊成 Yes	2	6	
反對 No	15	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 32  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 08:31:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第37條第(2)款(c)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	18	
投票 Vote	20	17	
贊成 Yes	3	9	
反對 No	17	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK 

投票 VOTE: 33  
 日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 08:44:59 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第37條第(2)款(d)段及在該款加入(e)段第(i)節

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	19	
投票 Vote	19	18	
贊成 Yes	2	8	
反對 No	17	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 34  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 08:55:03 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第37條第(2)款加入(e)段第(ii)節

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	19	
投票 Vote	19	18	
贊成 Yes	2	8	
反對 No	17	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鑑泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK 

投票 VOTE: 35  
日期 DATE: 11/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 09:16:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第37條第(2)款加入(e)段第(iii)節

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	19	
投票 Vote	18	18	
贊成 Yes	2	8	
反對 No	16	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鑑泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 36  
日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 09:10:16 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第37條，以加入第(2A)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :33  
投票 Vote :32  
贊成 Yes :21  
反對 No :11  
棄權 Abstain :0  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE			張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing		
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG		
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 37  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 09:34:28 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第19條，以修正第(8)款及刪去第(9)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長Secretary for Security

出席 Present :40  
 投票 Vote :39  
     贊成 Yes :24  
     反對 No :15  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI	反對	NO	馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 38  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:22:10 上午 am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 新訂的第18A條，予以二讀

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	18	
投票 Vote	18	17	
贊成 Yes	3	10	
反對 No	15	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

職員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	職員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄺經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 39  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:26:56 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第22條

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :35  
 投票 Vote :34  
     贊成 Yes :21  
     反對 No :13  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	Li Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE			張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂籬申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	Li Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 40  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:40:46 上午am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第20條第(1)款(b)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :30  
 投票 Vote :29  
     贊成 Yes :19  
     反對 No :10  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

職員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	職員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO			石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE			張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG		
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing		
涂蔭申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM		
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG		
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對	NO	梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat			鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 41  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 11:34:56 上午 am

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 在第20條加入第(3)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	16	20	
投票 Vote	16	19	
贊成 Yes	4	9	
反對 No	12	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何耀泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張紹雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		Ronny TONG	
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 42  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 12:14:23 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 進一步修正第23條第(1)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	19	
投票 Vote	18	18	
贊成 Yes	3	9	
反對 No	15	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳鶯儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周潔淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 43  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 12:26:26 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 進一步修正第24條

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	22	
投票 Vote	17	21	
贊成 Yes	3	12	
反對 No	14	9	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鑑泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若蕙 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG K wok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 44  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 12:44:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第25條(a)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	17	23	
投票 Vote	17	22	
贊成 Yes	2	12	
反對 No	15	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鑑泰 Dr Raymond HO		范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	反對 NO
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳維林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 HOWARD YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing		TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		張學明 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	湯家驊 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 45  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 01:19:04 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第27條的條次及第(1)款，以及在該條加入第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :42  
 投票 Vote :41  
     贊成 Yes :28  
     反對 No :13  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN	贊成	YES	霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

*Visian Chan*

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 46  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 01:29:45 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第28條的條次及在該條加入第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	18	
投票 Vote	20	17	
贊成 Yes	2	11	
反對 No	18	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鑑泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳藍林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 47  
日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 01:54:57 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第31條第(1)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	20	16	
投票 Vote	20	15	
贊成 Yes	3	9	
反對 No	17	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN		李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	贊成 YES	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 48  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:09:03 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第31條第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :34  
 投票 Vote :33  
     贊成 Yes :22  
     反對 No :11  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO			譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	Li Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah			余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG		
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong		
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG	反對	NO
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄭志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU			譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

*Wishan Chan*

投票 VOTE: 49  
日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 02:17:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第32條

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :39  
投票 Vote :38  
贊成 Yes :26  
反對 No :12  
棄權 Abstain :0  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家奮	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK		
何俊仁	Albert HO	贊成	YES	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung	贊成	YES
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI			陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG		
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG			方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han			李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN			林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung		
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing			張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung	贊成	YES
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU		
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄧志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk			陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

*Vivian Lam*

投票 VOTE: 50  
日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 02:33:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 進一步修正第34條，以修正第(2)款(a)段

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	16	
投票 Vote	21	15	
贊成 Yes	2	9	
反對 No	19	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	贊成 YES
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

*Vivian Kam*

投票 VOTE: 51  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 02:53:37 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正第38條第(1)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	14	
投票 Vote	21	13	
贊成 Yes	2	7	
反對 No	19	6	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah		何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳藍林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	

秘書 CLERK

*Vivian Chan*

投票 VOTE: 52  
日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 03:44:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 進一步修正附表1第1條

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	15	
投票 Vote	25	14	
贊成 Yes	3	7	
反對 No	22	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 53  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:08:53 下午pm

動議 MOTION: (投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案) - 全體委員會審議階段 - 進一步修正附表1第11條

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	20	
投票 Vote	25	19	
贊成 Yes	4	11	
反對 No	21	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

職員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	職員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 54  
日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 04:25:33 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正附表1第23條第(1)款，以刪去‘，或在行政長官容許的較長限期內，’

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	17	
投票 Vote	25	16	
贊成 Yes	3	8	
反對 No	22	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若蕙 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	Ronny TONG	
鄺志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 55  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:30:36 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正附表1第23條第(2)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	17	
投票 Vote	25	16	
贊成 Yes	3	8	
反對 No	22	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 56  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:46:56 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正附表1第25條第(1)款

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :46  
 投票 Vote :45  
     贊成 Yes :31  
     反對 No :14  
     棄權 Abstain :0  
 結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG		
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan			李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN		
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW	贊成	YES	王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	JAMES TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat	反對	NO
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			Alan LEONG	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG	反對	NO
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	KWONG Chi-kin	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man		
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	反對	NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 57  
 日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 04:56:51 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》- 全體委員會審議階段 - 修正附表2第3條

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	18	
投票 Vote	25	17	
贊成 Yes	3	9	
反對 No	22	8	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	贊成 YES
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	陳藍林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
林偉強 Daniel LAM	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 Li Kwok-ying	反對 NO
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man		陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 58  
日期 DATE: 12/07/2008  
時間 TIME: 05:54:47 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 《投訴警方獨立監察委員會條例草案》 - 三讀  
INDEPENDENT POLICE COMPLAINTS COUNCIL BILL - THIRD READING

動議人 MOVED BY: 保安局局長 Secretary for Security

出席 Present :47  
投票 Vote :46  
    贊成 Yes :30  
    反對 No :15  
    棄權 Abstain :1  
結果 Result :通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE	議員	MEMBER	投票	VOTE
范徐麗泰	Mrs Rita FAN	出席	PRESENT	鄭家富	Andrew CHENG	反對	NO
田北俊	James TIEN			霍震霆	Timothy FOK	贊成	YES
何俊仁	Albert HO	反對	NO	譚耀宗	TAM Yiu-chung		
何鍾泰	Dr Raymond HO	贊成	YES	石禮謙	Abraham SHEK	贊成	YES
李卓人	LEE Cheuk-yan	反對	NO	李鳳英	LI Fung-ying		
李柱銘	Martin LEE	反對	NO	張宇人	Tommy CHEUNG	贊成	YES
李國寶	Dr David LI	贊成	YES	陳偉業	Albert CHAN	反對	NO
李華明	Fred LI			馮檢基	Frederick FUNG	贊成	YES
呂明華	Dr LUI Ming-wah	贊成	YES	余若薇	Audrey EU	反對	NO
吳靄儀	Margaret NG	反對	NO	方剛	Vincent FANG	贊成	YES
周梁淑怡	Mrs Selina CHOW			王國興	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成	YES
涂謹申	James TO	反對	NO	李永達	LEE Wing-tat		
張文光	CHEUNG Man-kwong			李國英	LI Kwok-ying	贊成	YES
陳婉嫻	CHAN Yuen-han	贊成	YES	李國麟	Dr Joseph LEE	贊成	YES
陳智思	Bernard CHAN	贊成	YES	林偉強	Daniel LAM	贊成	YES
陳鑑林	CHAN Kam-lam	贊成	YES	林健鋒	Jeffrey LAM	贊成	YES
梁劉柔芬	Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成	YES	梁君彥	Andrew LEUNG	贊成	YES
梁耀忠	LEUNG Yiu-chung			梁家傑	Alan LEONG	反對	NO
單仲偕	SIN Chung-kai	反對	NO	梁國雄	LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對	NO
黃宜弘	Dr Philip WONG	贊成	YES	郭家麒	Dr KWOK Ka-ki		
黃容根	WONG Yung-kan	贊成	YES	張超雄	Dr Fernando CHEUNG	反對	NO
曾鈺成	TSANG Yok-sing	贊成	YES	張學明	CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成	YES
楊孝華	Howard YOUNG	贊成	YES	黃定光	WONG Ting-kwong	贊成	YES
楊森	Dr YEUNG Sum	反對	NO	湯家驊	Ronny TONG		
劉千石	LAU Chin-shek			詹培忠	CHIM Pui-chung		
劉江華	LAU Kong-wah	贊成	YES	劉秀成	Prof Patrick LAU	贊成	YES
劉皇發	LAU Wong-fat	贊成	YES	鄭經翰	Albert CHENG		
劉健儀	Miriam LAU	贊成	YES	鄺志堅	KWONG Chi-kin	贊成	YES
劉慧卿	Emily LAU	反對	NO	譚香文	TAM Heung-man	反對	NO
蔡素玉	CHOY So-yuk	贊成	YES	陳方安生	Mrs Anson CHAN	棄權	ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 59  
 日期 DATE: 13/07/2008  
 時間 TIME: 10:29:03 上午am

動議 MOTION: 廢除《2008年食物業（修訂）規例》決議案  
 PROPOSED RESOLUTION TO REPEAL THE FOOD BUSINESS (AMENDMENT) REGULATION  
 2008

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	18	
投票 Vote	19	17	
贊成 Yes	2	3	
反對 No	16	14	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	范徐麗泰 Mrs Rita FAN	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		田北俊 James TIEN	
呂明華 Dr LUI Ming-wah	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong		李柱銘 Martin LEE	
陳智思 Bernard CHAN	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		周梁淑怡 Mrs Selina CHOW	反對 NO
單仲偕 SIN Chung-kai	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳婉嫻 CHAN Yuen-han	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
楊孝華 Howard YOUNG		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	楊森 Dr YEUNG Sum	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	劉千石 LAU Chin-shek	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	蔡素玉 CHOY So-yuk	
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
林偉強 Daniel LAM		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
郭家麒 Dr KWOK Ka-ki		李國英 LI Kwok-ying	
張超雄 Dr Fernando CHEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
鄭志堅 KWONG Chi-kin	反對 NO	鄭經翰 Albert CHENG	
譚香文 TAM Heung-man	反對 NO	陳方安生 Mrs Anson CHAN	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK