

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. FC31/08-09  
(These minutes have been seen  
by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/F/1/2

**Finance Committee of the Legislative Council**

**Minutes of the 20th meeting  
held at the Legislative Council Chamber  
on Friday, 13 June 2008, at 3:30 pm**

**Members present:**

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP (Chairman)  
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP  
Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon Martin LEE Chu-ming, SC, JP  
Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP  
Dr Hon LUI Ming-wah, SBS, JP  
Hon Margaret NG  
Hon Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP  
Hon Bernard CHAN, GBS, JP  
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP  
Hon SIN Chung-kai, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS  
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP  
Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP  
Hon Howard YOUNG, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, JP  
Hon LAU Chin-shek, JP  
Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP  
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP  
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP  
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP  
Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
Dr Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP  
Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP  
Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP  
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS  
Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
Hon CHIM Pui-chung  
Hon KWONG Chi-kin  
Hon TAM Heung-man

**Members absent:**

Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Dr Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP  
Hon James TO Kun-sun  
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP  
Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung  
Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP  
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung  
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP  
Hon Albert Jinghan CHENG, JP  
Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

**Public officers attending:**

Professor K C CHAN, SBS, JP	Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury
Mr Stanley YING, JP	Permanent Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury)
Miss Amy TSE, JP	Deputy Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury (Treasury) 1
Mr Alfred FOK	Principal Executive Officer (General), Financial Services and the Treasury Bureau (The Treasury Branch)

Ms Esther LEUNG Yuet-yin, JP	Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District)
Mr Danny LAU Kam-chuen	Principal Assistant Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District)
Mr Michael WONG, JP	Deputy Secretary for Education (1)
Ms Amy WONG	Principal Assistant Secretary for Education (Higher Education)
Mrs Amy CHAN	Chairperson – Project Yi Jin Programme Management Committee
Miss Rosanna LAW	Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 2
Mr Carey WONG	Principal Transport Officer Transport Department
Mr LAM Yuk-wo	Acting Air and Vehicle Manager Electrical and Mechanical Services Department
Mr LI Ying-ming	Project Manager Electrical and Mechanical Services Department
Mr WONG Wai-man	Acting Electronics and Data Communication Manager Electrical and Mechanical Services Department
Ms Annette LEE	Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport) 3
Mr SO Yam-tat	Acting Assistant Commissioner/Technical Services Transport Department
Mr M R Demaid-GROVES	Chief Superintendent of Police (Traffic) Hong Kong Police Force
Ms Nancy NGAN Suk-fan	Chief Inspector of Police (Law Revision and Projects) (Traffic) Hong Kong Police Force

**Clerk in attendance:**

Mrs Constance LI	Assistant Secretary General 1
------------------	-------------------------------

**Staff in attendance:**

Miss Becky YU	Chief Council Secretary (1)1
Mrs Mary TANG	Senior Council Secretary (1)2
Ms Alice CHEUNG	Senior Legislative Assistant (1)1
Mr Frankie WOO	Legislative Assistant (1)2

---

**Item No. 1 - FCR(2008-09)25**

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE ESTABLISHMENT SUBCOMMITTEE  
MADE ON 28 MAY 2008**

The Chairman put FCR(2008-09)25, except EC(2008-09)6, to the vote. The Committee approved the proposal.

**EC(2008-09)6 Proposed creation of three supernumerary posts of one Administrative Officer Staff Grade B (D3), one Administrative Officer Staff Grade C (D2) and one Chief Treasury Accountant (D1) in Home Affairs Bureau of Government Secretariat for a period of two years with effect from 1 July 2008 to co-ordinate efforts to implement the West Kowloon Cultural District project**

2. Dr KWOK Ka-ki asked how the proposed creation of the three supernumerary posts would help enhance the viability and smooth implementation of the project, given members' grave concerns about the feasibility and financial viability of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) project.

3. The Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (West Kowloon Cultural District) (DSHA(WKCD)) responded that the proposed supernumerary posts were required for providing administrative and accounting support for the implementation of the WKCD project, especially during the initial stage of the establishment of the WKCD Authority (WKCDA). These would include setting up the accounting system and the financial management and reporting framework, undertaking public consultation on various projects, and other administrative matters. The funding arrangements for WKCD had been thoroughly discussed at the Legislative Council (LegCo) Subcommittee on West Kowloon Cultural District. The relevant funding proposal for the WKCD project would be submitted to the Public Works Subcommittee on 18 June 2008 and then to the Finance Committee for consideration. The examination by LegCo of the Bill on the WKCDA, which included provisions for submission of annual statement of accounts and report to the LegCo, was also at an advance stage. Resumption of the second reading debate on the Bill would likely take place in early July 2008. DSHA(WKCD) said that there was substantial preparation work for the establishment of the WKCDA, and the three posts were necessary for undertaking the co-ordinating and monitoring work.

4. Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that members had strong reservation on the financial arrangements for the WKCD project. For example, members had doubts about the projected annual inflation rate of 2% and whether it was possible to make M+ an internationally renowned project with a provision of only \$1 billion for procurement of artefacts. He questioned how the proposed dedicated team of officers could assist in re-assessing and improving the financial arrangements for and monitoring of the WKCD project.

5. DSHA(WKCD) responded that the financial report for the WKCD project had been prepared in a professional and prudent manner. The proposed dedicated team of officers was responsible for, among other things, providing support on matters relating to the co-ordination, administrative, accounting and monitoring work for the WKCD project, and assisting the Financial Secretary in exercising his statutory powers under the WKCD Ordinance.

6. Notwithstanding the Administration's explanation on the justification for the creation of the posts, Dr KWOK Ka-ki remained dissatisfied that given the grave concern expressed by members regarding the feasibility of the WKCD projects, the Administration had not assured members that the officers filling the proposed posts would re-assess the financial arrangements of the WKCD project, and would take measures to ensure that the project would be viable. Dr KWOK asked whether the three officers concerned would be held accountable if the WKCD project turned out to be a failure.

7. DSHA(WKCD) responded that with the enactment of the WKCD Ordinance, the proposed dedicated team of officers would monitor the management, financial and accounting arrangements of the WKCD so as to ensure that the Authority would comply with the statutory requirements in the Ordinance, e.g. preparation of annual statement of accounts, and submission of annual reports to the LegCo. The dedicated team would also co-ordinate with other relevant government departments in arranging public consultation for the WKCD project, and monitoring the expenditure of the WKCD. The Government and the WKCD would make every effort to ensure that the WKCD project would be successful.

8. Ms Margaret NG remarked that while she supported the staffing proposal at the Establishment Subcommittee, she was concerned that the financial consultant for the WKCD project had previously undertaken construction projects for cultural facilities as reported in a newspaper, and this might give rise to a potential conflict of interest. Ms NG asked whether the financial consultant had declared its previous involvement in building cultural projects. Ms NG requested the Administration to provide a written response to her concern.

9. DSHA(WKCD) explained that the financial consultant concerned had clarified that it had not directly been involved in building any cultural projects, but had only provided consultancy service on cultural facilities. The Government did not consider it necessary to take any action in this matter. DSHA(WKCD) undertook to provide a written response.

10. Ms Emily LAU said that she could not support the staffing proposal as she still had reservation about the feasibility, management and financial arrangements of the M+ proposal. She was concerned that WKCD might not be capable of providing the best standard of management which was necessary for making M+ an internationally renowned museum. Ms LAU enquired about the main duties and responsibilities of the proposed post of Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs as listed in item (c) of Enclosure 7 relating to taking follow-up actions on policy regarding

museums.

11. DSHA(WKCD) responded that the proposed Deputy Secretary would oversee the implementation of the M+ project, and the recommendations of an independent consultant regarding the setting up of a statutory body to oversee the operation of existing public museums managed by the Leisure and Cultural Services Department.

12. Ir Dr Raymond HO opined that apart from the proposed administrative and accounting posts, consideration should also be given to creating professional posts in the relevant government works bureaux/departments to enable better co-ordination of those works requiring professional and monitoring in the implementation of the WKCD project.

13. The Chairman put FCR(2008-09)6 to the vote. 32 members voted for the proposal, two members voted against and two members abstained. The individual results were as follows:

*For :*

Ir Dr Raymond HO Chung-tai	Mr Martin LEE Chu-ming
Dr LUI Ming-wah	Ms Margaret NG
Mrs Selina CHOW LIANG Shuk-ye	Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong
Miss CHAN Yuen-han	Mr Bernard CHAN
Mr CHAN Kam-lam	Mr SIN Chung-kai
Dr Philip WONG Yu-hong	Mr WONG Yung-kan
Mr Jasper TSANG Yok-sing	Mr Howard YOUNG
Dr YEUNG Sum	Mr LAU Kong-wah
Mr LAU Wong-fat	Ms Miriam LAU Kin-yee
Mr Abraham SHEK Lai-him	Ms LI Fung-ying
Mr Frederick FUNG Kin-kee	Ms Audrey EU Yuet-mee
Mr WONG Kwok-hing	Dr Joseph LEE Kok-long
Mr Daniel LAM Wai-keung	Mr Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung
Mr Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen	Mr CHEUNG Hok-ming
Mr WONG Ting-kwong	Mr Ronny TONG Ka-wah
Mr KWONG Chi-kin	Miss TAM Heung-man

(32 members)

*Against :*

Mr Albert CHAN Wai-yip	Dr KWOK Ka-ki
------------------------	---------------

(2 members)

*Abstention :*

Mr LEE Cheuk-yan	Ms Emily LAU Wai-hing
------------------	-----------------------

(2 members)

14. The Committee approved the proposal.

**Item No. 2 - FCR(2008-09)26**

**RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE PUBLIC WORKS SUBCOMMITTEE  
MADE ON 2 JUNE 2008**

15. The Chairman put the item to vote. The Committee approved the proposal.

**Item No. 3 - FCR(2008-09)27**

**HEAD 156 - GOVERNMENT SECRETARIAT : EDUCATION BUREAU**

♦ **Subhead 700 General non-recurrent**

**Item 027 Project Yi Jin**

16. The Chairman advised that the Education Panel had discussed the proposal at its meeting on 8 May 2008. While the Panel supported the funding proposal, members requested the Administration to expedite the review on Project Yi Jin vis-à-vis the introduction of the new "3+3" education system (i.e. three years each for lower form and upper form classes) in secondary schools with the first cohort entering the senior secondary school starting from the 2009/2010 school year.

17. Dr YEUNG Sum noted that students who had satisfactorily completed the Project Yi Jin programme were recognised as having obtained five passes in the Hong Kong Certificate of Education Examination (HKCEE) for continuing education and employment purposes. The certificate issued under Project Yi Jin was accepted by the Government as meeting the entry requirement of more than 30 civil service grades which required five passes (including English Language and Chinese Language ) in the HKCEE. Dr YEUNG enquired the number of students who had completed the Project Yi Jin programme and selected for appointment in the civil service.

18. The Deputy Secretary for Education (1) replied that in 2007/2008, 384 students who had completed the Project Yi Jin programme joined the civil service, with 262 of them working in the Hong Kong Police Force.

19. The Chairman put the item to vote. The Committee approved the proposal.

**Item No. 4 - FCR(2008-09)28**

**HEAD 186 – TRANSPORT DEPARTMENT**

♦ **Subhead 603 Plant, vehicles and equipment**

**New Item “Replacement of Specialised Vehicles for the Tsing Ma Control Area, Lion Rock Tunnel, Aberdeen Tunnel and Kai Tak Tunnel”**

20. The Chairman informed members that the Administration had provided an information paper on the proposal to the Transport Panel on 15 May 2008.

21. Regarding the procurement of five medium recovery vehicles, Mr WONG Kwok-hing said that some staff unions preferred heavy recovery vehicles

to medium recovery vehicles as the latter's usage was limited resulting in a low utilisation rate.

22. The Principal Transport Officer (PTO), Transport Department responded that the current proposal was only part of the overall plan to replace the specialised vehicles which would run out of their life span for the Tsing Ma Control Area, Lion Rock Tunnel, Aberdeen Tunnel and Kai Tak Tunnel. The usage rate of the recovery vehicles was a factor to be considered in determining the number of recovery vehicles required. It was also necessary to deploy adequate recovery vehicles of different types at all strategic points. Where appropriate, some of the medium recovery vehicles would be replaced by heavy vehicles in the future. The Transport Department had not received comments on this matter from the relevant staff unions in the past. The Transport Department would liaise with the staff unions regarding the future vehicle replacement arrangements for the tunnels/control areas.

23. Mr WONG Kwok-hing said that since the Administration agreed to consult the relevant staff unions regarding the vehicle replacement arrangements, he would support the funding proposal.

24. The Chairman put the item to vote. The Committee approved the proposal.

#### **Item No. 5 - FCR(2008-09)29**

#### **CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND**

#### **HEAD 708 – CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND EQUIPMENT**

#### **Transport Department**

#### **♦ New Subhead “Replacement of High Voltage Switchboards and Power Transformers of the Power Supply System in the Cross-Harbour Tunnel”**

25. The Chairman advised that an information paper on the proposal had been provided to the Transport Panel on 15 May 2008.

26. Ms Emily LAU expressed support for the proposal. She expressed concern that if part of the replacement work was to be carried out in the day time, it would adversely affect the traffic of the tunnel area. She also enquired about the life span of the new high voltage switchboards and power transformers.

27. The Project Manager (PM), Electrical and Mechanical Services Department responded that measures would be taken to ensure that the traffic would not be affected. The replacement work would be carried out by phases, and would not affect the tunnel operation. The new switchboards and power transformers would be more durable and could be used for 25 to 30 years or even longer, provided that they were properly used and maintained.

28. The Chairman put the item to vote. The Committee approved the proposal.



**Item No. 6 - FCR(2008-09)30**

**CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND**

**HEAD 708 – CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND EQUIPMENT**

**Transport Department**

- ♦ **New Subhead “Replacement of the Traffic Control and Surveillance System in the Shing Mun Tunnels”**

29. The Chairman advised that an information paper on the proposal had been provided to the Transport Panel on 15 May 2008.

30. Ms Emily LAU asked how the automatic incident detection system (AIDS) could automatically identify the location of traffic incidents, and how the colour CCTV system would help improve traffic monitoring efficiency. Ms LAU further enquired as to under what circumstances, the tapes of the traffic control and surveillance system (TCSS) would be provided to government departments.

31. The Acting Electronics and Data Communication Manager, Electrical and Mechanical Services Department explained that there were about 30 cameras covering different locations in Shing Mun Tunnel area. The AIDS would analyze the images captured by the cameras, and whenever there was any disruption to the traffic flow, e.g. slow traffic flow or a standstill of traffic, the CCTV system would automatically trace and target at the location of the traffic incident. This would facilitate the tunnel staff to detect traffic incidents in the tunnel area. The Principal Assistant Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)<sup>2</sup> supplemented that the colour CCTV would provide clearer images to assist the tunnel staff to monitor the traffic of the tunnel and identify the vehicle involved in traffic incidents. The tapes of TCSS would only be provided to government departments on justifiable grounds.

32. The Chairman put the item to vote. The Committee approved the proposal.

**Item No. 7 - FCR(2008-09)31**

**CAPITAL WORKS RESERVE FUND**

**HEAD 708 – CAPITAL SUBVENTIONS AND MAJOR SYSTEMS AND EQUIPMENT**

**Transport Department**

- ♦ **New Subhead “Expansion of Speed Enforcement Camera System, Phase 2”**

33. The Chairman advised that the Administration had provided an information paper regarding the proposal to the Transport Panel on 23 April 2008.

34. Mr WONG Kwok-hing expressed concern that the current proposal would only increase the camera-to-housing ratio from 1:8.5 to 1:5. He opined that in order to deter speeding and protect pedestrian safety, more cameras should be installed.

Mr WONG expressed disappointment that despite the occurrence of some very serious fatal accidents in recent years caused by speeding of vehicles, the Government was reluctant to increase the camera-to-housing ratio to lower than 1:5.

35. The Deputy Secretary for Transport and Housing (Transport)<sup>3</sup> responded that the current proposal was made after taking into consideration the cost-effectiveness of the speed enforcement camera system, the deterrent effect of the system on drivers, the prosecution results, and the need to avoid repeated prosecutions of the same driver due to the short distance between the locations of the cameras. The 1:5 ratio was reasonable in comparison with the arrangements in other countries. The Transport Department and the Police Force would continue to monitor the effectiveness of the speed enforcement camera system, and would put up proposals for installation of more cameras/camera housings based on the following criteria:

- (a) accident records with particular emphasis on accidents caused by vehicle speeding;
- (b) prevalence of speeding activities observed by the Police;
- (c) the need for an even distribution of speeding enforcement camera housing locations to provide an area-wide deterrent effect;
- (d) strategic or trunk roads with higher traffic speed and traffic flow; and
- (e) geological and environmental factors surrounding the sites.

36. The Chairman put the item to vote. The Committee approved the proposal.

37. The meeting was adjourned at 4:34 pm.

Legislative Council Secretariat

18 November 2008