### 政府總部 運輸及房屋局 運輸科 香港 花園 道 美 利 大 廈



本局槽號 OUR REF.: 來函機號YOUR REF.: THB(T) L 4/6/147

CB1/F/2/6(II)

Transport and Housing Bureau Government Secretariat Transport Branch Murray Building, Garden Road, Hong Kong.

> 電話 Tel. No.: 2189 2108 (東点 Fax No 2136 8017

By Fax: 2869 6794

14 April 2008

Clerk to Public Works Subcommittee Legislative Council Building 8 Jackson Road, Central Hong Kong (Attn: Mr Anthony Chu)

Dear Anthony,

# Public Works Subcommittee (PWSC) Follow-up to meeting on 20 February 2008

I am writing to provide supplementary information in response to the questions raised by Members concerning the proposed reconstruction and improvement of Tuen Mun Road (Paper PWSC(2007-08)88) at the Public Works Subcommittee meeting on 20 February 2008. Detailed information on the 5 190 trees to be felled under the proposed works can be found at Enclosure 1 while the information on the number of dwellings benefiting and not benefiting from the proposed works with traffic noise levels lowered to within 70dB(A) can be found at Enclosure 2.

I should be grateful if you would relay the above supplementary information to Members of the Public Works Subcommittee for their reference.

Yours sincerely,

for Secretary for Transport and Housing

SFST c.c.

(Attn : Mr Davey Chung) (Attn : Mr C W Tse) (Attn: Ms Mo Sau) SEN

DHy

#### Tree Felling along Tuen Mun Road (Expressway Section)

1. When planning and implementing public works projects, Government departments and their consultants need to fully comply with the Environment, Transport and Works Bureau Technical Circular (Works) No. 3/2006 – Tree Preservation, which states that (a) no tree should be unnecessarily felled or pruned; (b) trees shall be preserved in the priority of being retained in-situ, transplanted on site or transplanted off site; and (c) tree felling should be the last resort.

Despite that the proposed "Reconstruction and Improvement of Tuen Mun Road" project (the Project) is not a Designated Project under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO), a comprehensive tree survey report based on EIAO requirements was prepared. The report was circulated to the relevant parties, including the Tree Works Vetting Committee of Highways Department, Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD) and Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department (AFCD), for comment. Both the Tuen Mun District Council and Tsuen Wan District Council were also consulted on the recommendations. The current tree felling proposal has taken into account the rareness of the species, conservation and amenity value, chance of surviving or recovering to its normal form after transplanting, cost and programme implications, etc..

2. The Project will involve the removal of about 5 200 trees, including about 5 190 trees to be felled and about 10 trees to be replanted within the project site. The 5 190 trees to be felled include 504 weed trees (*Leucaena leucocephala* 銀合歡) and dead trees, which are located at the 207 slopes requiring cutting back to make space for road improvements or stabilization according to the latest slope safety requirements. These slopes are located at both sides of Tuen Mun Road from Tsuen Wan to Sam Shing Hui. The location and species of the 504 trees are summarized in Table 1.1.

Sections	Size of Tree Girth (perimeter), mm	No. of trees to be felled	Species Name		
Sam Shing Hui	100-150	24	Dead tree, Leucaena leucocephala 銀合歡		
So Kwun Wat	100-150	25	Leucaena leucocephala 銀合歡		
Siu Lam	100-200	137	Dead tree, <i>Leucaena leucocephala</i> 銀合歡		
Tai Lam	100-200	42	Dead tree, <i>Leucaena leucocephala</i> 銀合歡		
Tsing Lung Tau	100-200	2	Leucaena leucocephala 銀合歡		
Sham Tseng	100-150	72	Dead tree, <i>Leucaena leucocephala</i> 銀合歡		
Ting Kau	100-200	52	Leucaena leucocephala 銀合歡		
Yau Kom Tau	100-250	150	Dead tree, <i>Leucaena leucocephala</i> 銀合歡		
	Total	504			

The location and species of the remaining 4686 trees to be felled under the proposed works are summarized in Table 1.2.

Table 1.2 Location and species of the 4 686 trees recommended for felling

Sections	Size of Tree Girth (perimeter), mm	No. of trees to be felled	Species Name
Sam Shing Hui	300 - 942	567	Acacia confusa 台灣相思
			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黃
			Celtis sinensis 朴樹
			Cratoxylum cochinchinense 黃牛木
		ę.	Eucalyptus citriodora 檸檬桉
		,	Eucalyptus torelliana 毛葉桉
			Eurya nitida 細葉齒柃
			Ficus microcarpa 細葉榕
			Ficus microcarpus 細葉榕(榕樹)
			Hibiscus tiliaceus 黃槿
			Litsea glutinosa 潺槁樹
			Litsea rotundifolia 豺皮樟
			Lophostemon confertus 紅膠木

Sections	Size of Tree Girth (perimeter), mm	No. of trees to be felled	Species Name
			Macaranga tanarius 血桐
			Melaleuca quinquenervia 白千層
			Pinus massoniana 馬尾松
			Rhaphiolepis indica 車輪梅
			Rhus hypoleuca 白背漆
			Rhus succedanea 野漆樹
			Sapium sebiferum 烏桕
			Thevetia peruviana 黃花夾竹桃
So Kwun Wat	300 - 628	350	Acacia auriculiformis 耳葉相思
			Acacia confusa 台灣相思
			Acacia mangium 大葉相思
			Adinandra millettii 楊桐
			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黃
		i	Celtis sinensis 朴樹
		:	Clausena lansium 黃皮
			Cratoxylum cochinchinense 黃牛木
	a.		Dimocarpus longan 龍眼
			Eucalyptus citriodora 檸檬桉
			Eucalyptus robusta 大葉桉
			Gordonia axillaris 大頭茶
			Litsea glutinosa 潺槁樹
			Lophostemon confertus 紅膠木
			Rhus succedanea 野漆樹
			Tetradium glabrifolium 楝葉吳茱萸
Siu Lam	300 – 1 256	1 286	Acacia confusa 台灣相思
			Albizia lebbeck 大葉合歡
			Bauhinia variegata 宮粉羊蹄甲
			Bombax ceiba 木棉
			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黃
			Celtis sinensis 朴樹
			Clausena lansium 黃皮
			Dimocarpus longan 龍眼
			Eriobotrya japonica 枇杷
			Eucalyptus camaldulensis 赤桉

Sections	Size of Tree Girth (perimeter), mm	No. of trees to be felled	Species Name	
			Eucalyptus citriodora 檸檬桉	
			Ficus elastica 印度橡樹	
			Ficus hispida 對葉榕	
			Ficus microcarpus 細葉榕	
			Ficus superba 筆管榕	
			Gordonia axillaris 大頭茶	
			Litchi chinensis 荔枝	
			Litsea glutinosa 瀑稿樹	
			Lophostemon confertus 紅膠木	
			Macaranga tanarius [[[]桐	
			Melaleuca quinquenervia 白千層	
			Melia azedarach 苦楝	
			Musa paradisiaca 大蕉	
			Pinus elliottii 愛氏松	
			Psidium guajava 番石榴	
			Rhus succedanea 野漆樹	
			Sapium sebiferum 烏桕	
			Scaevola sericea 草海桐	
:			Schefflera heptaphylla 鴨腳木	
			Syzygium jambos 蒲桃	
Tai Lam	300 - 628	164	Acacia confusa 台灣相思	
			Albizia lebbeck 大葉合歡	
			Bombax ceiba 木棉	
			Bridelia tomentosa 土密樹	
			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黄	
			Celtis sinensis 朴樹	
			Cinnamomum camphora 樟樹	
			Ficus microcarpus 細葉榕	
			Ficus superba 筆管榕	
			Litsea glutinosa 潺槁樹	
			Lophostemon confertus 紅膠木	
			Macaranga tanarius 血桐	
			Melia azedarach 苦楝	
	1		Sapium sebiferum 鳥桕 Scaevola	
			sericea 草海桐	

Sections	Size of Tree Girth (perimeter), mm	No. of trees to be felled	Species Name
Tsing Lung Tau	300 – 1 256	1 070	Acacia confusa 台灣相思
			Albizia lebbeck 大葉合歡
			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黃
			Celtis sinensis 朴樹
			Cleistocalyx operculatus 水翁
			Cratoxylum cochinchinense 黃牛木
			Eucalyptus citriodora 檸檬桉
			Eucalyptus torelliana 毛葉桉
			Gordonia axillaris 大頭茶
			Litsea glutinosa 潺槁樹
			Lophostemon confertus 紅膠木
			Macaranga tanarius 血桐
			Mallotus paniculatus 白楸
			Melaleuca quinquenervia 白千層
			Melia azedarach 苦楝
			Rhus succedanea 野漆樹
			Sapium discolor 山鳥桕
			Schefflera heptaphylla 鴨腳木
			Sterculia lanceolata 假蘋婆
			Tetradium glabrifolium 楝葉吳茱萸
Sham Tseng	300 - 2512	399	Acacia confusa 台灣相思
			Albizia lebbeck 大葉合歡
			Aleurites moluccana 石栗
			Bridelia tomentosa 土密樹
			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黄
		j	Celtis sinensis 朴樹
			Cinnamomum camphora 樟樹
			Clausena lansium 黃皮
			Cratoxylum cochinchinense 黃牛木
			Delonix regia 鳳凰木
			Dimocarpus longan 龍眼
			Eucalyptus torelliana 毛葉桉
			Ficus hispida 對葉榕
			Gordonia axillaris 大頭茶

Sections	Size of Tree Girth (perimeter), mm	No. of trees to be felled	Species Name		
			Litsea glutinosa 潺槁樹		
			Macaranga tanarius 血桐		
			Melaleuca quinquenervia 白千層		
			Melia azedarach 苦楝		
			Pinus massoniana 馬尾松		
			Rhus succedanea 野漆樹		
			Sapium sebiferum 鳥桕		
			Schefflera heptaphylla 鴨腳木		
Ting Kau	300 - 1570	240	Acacia confusa 台灣相思		
:			Bombax ceiba 木棉		
			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黄		
			Celtis sinensis 朴樹		
			Eucalyptus torelliana 毛葉桉		
			Ficus hispida 對葉榕		
			Macaranga tanarius 血桐		
			Melia azedarach 苦楝		
Yau Kom Tau	300 – 1 256	610	Acacia confusa 台灣相思		
			Albizia lebbeck 大葉合歡		
			Bauhinia variegata 宮粉羊蹄甲		
			Bridelia tomentosa 土密樹		
			Cassia surattensis 黃槐		
-			Casuarina equisetifolia 木麻黃		
			Celtis sinensis 朴樹		
			Cinnamomum camphora 樟樹		
			Cleistocalyx operculatus 水翁		
			Dimocarpus longan 龍眼		
			Eucalyptus torelliana 毛葉桉		
			Ficus elastica 印度橡樹		
			Ficus hispida 對葉榕		
			Ficus microcarpa 細葉榕		
			Ficus superba 筆管榕		
!			Gordonia axillaris 大頭茶		
			Hibiscus tiliaceus 黃槿		
		:	Liquidambar formosana 楓香		

Sections Size of Tree Girth (perimeter), mm		No. of trees to be felled	Species Name
			Litsea glutinosa 潺槁樹
			Lophostemon confertus 紅膠木
			Macaranga tanarius 血桐
			Melaleuca quinquenervia 白千層
			Melia azedarach 苦楝
			Musa paradisiaca 大蕉
			Syzygium jambos 蒲桃
	Total	4686	

The number of trees with girth size to be felled are summarized in Table 1.3.

Table 1.3 Girth of trees to be felled

Tree girth (perimeter), mm	Number of trees	
300 – 950 mm	4 572	
950 – 1300 mm	76	
1300 – 1570 mm	37	
> 1570 mm	1	

3. Felling of the remaining 4 686 trees was individually assessed based on the criteria as outlined in para. 1 above. All trees to be removed are not important trees<sup>1</sup>. In addition, transplanting of the trees on slopes would be difficult because their roots are inherently un-balanced, being stronger on the downhill side than on the uphill side. This would mean that their chance of survival will be very low after transplanting. Furthermore, transplanting trees on slopes would jeopardize the stability of the slopes and disrupt seriously the traffic flow of the adjacent running traffic lanes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> "Important trees" refer to trees in the Register of Old and Valuable Trees, or any other trees that meet one or more of the following criteria –

<sup>(</sup>a) trees of 100 years old or above;

<sup>(</sup>b) trees of cultural, historical or memorable significance e.g. Fung Shui trees, trees as landmark of monastery or heritage monument and trees in memory of important persons or events;

<sup>(</sup>c) trees of precious or rare species;

<sup>(</sup>d) trees of outstanding form (taking account of overall tree size, shape and any special features) e.g. trees with curtain like aerial roots, trees growing in unusual habitat; or

<sup>(</sup>e) trees with trunk diameter equal or exceeding 1.0 metre (measured at 1.3 metre above ground level), or with height/canopy spread equal or exceeding 25 metres.

## Noise Barriers along Tuen Mun Road (Expressway Section)

- 1. The Project is not a Designated Project under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO) as it mainly involves improvement of the existing traffic lanes and provision of hardshoulders to enhance its traffic operation to comply with the current expressway standard. The provision of noise barriers at six sections of the road is proposed under the retrofitting programme devised following the policy on mitigating existing road traffic noise endorsed by the ExCo in November 2000. Under the policy, direct engineering measures, by way of retrofitting of noise barriers and enclosures, will be implemented where practicable at existing roads where the noise level exceeds 70dB(A) L<sub>10</sub> (1 hour).
- 2. We have carried out an assessment on traffic noise for dwellings for the Project. Out of the 5 200 dwellings along the road currently exposed to traffic noise level exceeding 70dB(A) L<sub>10</sub> (1 hour)<sup>2</sup>, 2 850 dwellings will be protected by the proposed noise barrier works with mitigated traffic noise levels not exceeding 70dB(A) L<sub>10</sub> (1 hour). Their locations are summarized in Table 2.1.

Table 2.1 No. of dwellings protected

Section	No. of dwellings protected
Tsuen Wan	1551
Sham Tseng	242
Anglers' Beach	36
Tsing Lung Tau	178
Yau Kom Tau	266
Castle Peak Bay	577
Total	2 850

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> L<sub>10</sub>(1 hour) is the noise level exceeded for 10% of a one-hour period, generally used for road noise at peak traffic flow. The noise limit of 70 dB(A) for residential premises as stipulated in the Hong Kong Planning Standards and Guidelines is adopted as the administrative guideline for retrofitting projects identified under the policy introduced in 2000.

The remaining 2 350 dwellings will still be exposed to traffic noise exceeding 70dB(A) L<sub>10</sub> (1 hour) after the completion of the proposed retrofitting works, of which 1 250 dwellings will be benefited due to the proposed works by having their present noise level reduced by 1dB(A) or above. The balance of 1 100 dwellings could not be benefited through the proposed retrofitting works mainly because effective noise mitigation measures could not be implemented due to site constraints including sight distance at road bend, inadequate structural capacity at existing bridges, etc. The breakdown of dwellings exposed to different levels of traffic noise after the provision of the proposed noise barriers, is summarized in Table 2.2.

Table 2.2 - Number of dwellings exposed to noise levels after retrofitting of noise barriers and enclosures (L<sub>10</sub>(1 hour))

		Above 80 dB(A) but not	Above 75 dB(A) but not	Above 70 dB(A) but not		
		exceeding 85	exceeding 80	exceeding 75	Not exceeding	
Location	Above 85dB(A)	dB(A)	dB(A)	dB(A)	70dB(A)	
Tsuen Wan	0	0	117	180	1551	
Sham Tseng	0	0	307	300	242	
Anglers' Beach	0	16	472	943	36	
Tsing Lau Tau	0	0	0	0	178	
Yau Kom Tau	0	0	0	15	266	
Castle Peak Bay	0	0	0	0	577	
<u>Total</u>	0	16	896	1 438	2 850	Total = 5200
	Tot	al for dwellings ab	sove $70 \text{ dB(A)} = 2$	350		

#### Remarks

- 1. The total number of dwellings exposed to traffic noise not exceeding 70 dB(A)  $L_{10}(1 \text{ hour})$  after completion of the proposed retrofitting works = 2 850
- 3. The total number of dwellings exposed to traffic noise exceeding 70 dB(A)  $L_{10}(1 \text{ hour})$  after completion of the proposed retrofitting works = 16+896+1438=2350