

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)1112/07-08
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PS/2/06

Panel on Home Affairs

Subcommittee on Heritage Conservation

Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 13 November 2007, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building

- Members present** : Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP (Chairman)
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Members attending** : Hon Albert HO Chun-yuan
Hon Miriam LAU Kin-ye, GBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Vincent FANG Kang, JP
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
- Members absent** : Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon TAM Heung-man
- Public Officers attending** : Agenda Item II

Development Bureau

Mrs Carrie LAM, JP
Secretary for Development

Ms Olivia NIP
Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and
Lands)2

Food and Health Bureau

Mr Francis HO
Principal Assistant Secretary (Food) 2

Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr LO Fu-wai
Assistant Director (Operations) 1

Transport Department

Mr LAU Ka-keung
Deputy Commissioner/Planning and Technical Services

Mr CHENG Hung-leung
Chief Engineer/Traffic Engineering (Hong Kong)

Urban Renewal Authority

Ms Iris TAM
Executive Director (Planning and Development)

Mr Eric POON
General Manager, Standards and Contract Management

Agenda Item III

Development Bureau

Mrs Carrie LAM, JP
Secretary for Development

Miss Janet WONG
Deputy Secretary (Works)1

The Hong Kong Jockey Club

Mr William Y YIU
Executive Director of Charities

Clerk in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Senior Council Secretary (2)2

Staff in attendance : Miss Vivien POON
Council Secretary (2)3

Ms Anna CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Action

I. Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required)

Miss CHOY So-yuk was elected Chairman of the Subcommittee for the 2007-2008 session.

2. The Chairman sought members' views on whether election of a Deputy Chairman was necessary. Members agreed that there was no need to elect a Deputy Chairman for the Subcommittee.

II. Further discussion on the preservation of the open-air bazaar at Tai Yuen Street and Cross Street

[LC Paper No. CB(2)290/07-08(01)]

3. The Subcommittee deliberated (index of proceedings attached at **Annex**).

4. The Secretary for Development (SDEV) briefed members on the Administration's proposal for the preservation of the entire open-air bazaar at Tai Yuen Street and Cross Street [LC Paper No. CB(2)290/07-08(01)]. She informed members that, after the assumption of duty of the new-term Wan Chai District Council (WCDC) in January 2008, the Administration would seek DC's endorsement of the proposal. Once endorsed by WCDC, the Administration, together with the Urban Renewal Authority (URA) and the stakeholders, would work on the beautification of the bazaar. Members requested the Administration to consult the hawkers concerned and local residents as soon as possible and take into account their views in working out options for beautifying the bazaar. They also requested the Administration to implement measures to improve support facilities (e.g. electricity supply) for the hawkers to facilitate their stall operation.

5. Some members took the view that the sustainable development of open-air bazaars hinged on the Administration's policy on hawker licensing which, however, had imposed various stringent requirements and did not allow the transfer and succession of existing licences. They considered that the policy should be reviewed to tie in with the objective of facilitating bazaar economic activities. The Administration informed members that the Food and Health

Action

Bureau was conducting a review on hawker licensing policy which was expected to be completed by mid-2008. Hawkers associations and various stakeholders would be fully consulted in the course of review.

Another heritage conservation project in Wan Chai - Wan Chai Market

6. SDEV took the opportunity to brief members that, to follow up on the motion passed by the Subcommittee on 11 July 2007 urging the Administration to conserve the Wan Chai Market, the Administration and URA were exploring various options. She undertook to report to the Subcommittee once any significant progress was made in the negotiation with the developer concerned.

III. Proposal of Hong Kong Jockey Club for developing the Central Police Station Compound

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)290/07-08(02) and CB(2)350/07-08(01)]

7. SDEV briefed members on the paper entitled "Adaptive Re-use of the Central Police Station (CPS) Compound: The Hong Kong Jockey Club's (HKJC's) Proposal" [LC Paper No. CB(2)290/07-08(02)]. She informed members that HKJC would continue with the six-month public engagement exercise until April 2008 to invite views from various stakeholders and the public for the CPS Compound project. HKJC would suitably adjust its design taking into account views collected, and the Administration would then take a final view on the proposal. With the aid of PowerPoint, the Executive Director of Charities of HKJC gave a presentation on HKJC's proposal.

8. The Chairman declared interests as a member of HKJC. Members discussed HKJC's proposal and expressed appreciation of the efforts made by HKJC. The Chairman and some members, however, expressed the following concerns -

- (a) a member considered that, instead of adopting a single, uncontested design, the Administration and HKJC should select a design through an open competition in order to gain public acceptance;
- (b) the proposed new iconic structure was too tall and whether there was a genuine need to provide a view tower. A member expressed concern about whether the tall iconic structure would pose the problem of neon pollution and whether public attention would focus entirely on the iconic structure rather than the historical value of the Compound;
- (c) the history of the CPS Compound should be featured under the development plan for the Compound;

Action

- (d) sufficient public facilities should be provided in the redeveloped CPS Compound for the enjoyment of the community, and uses of such facilities should be affordable by the general public;
- (e) the financial arrangements proposed for the project should seek to ensure the long-term viability of the developed CPS Compound;
- (f) facilities in the redeveloped Compound should be made available for staging Cantonese opera and xi qu as well as western cultural performances and such performances should be staged all-year-round; and
- (g) HKJC should consult widely on the proposal and the conceptual design and particular attention should be paid to local residents' views. Professional groups including local architects and artists should be actively involved in the public engagement exercise.

The Chairman concluded that members were generally supportive of the proposal but requested the Administration to take into consideration the views and suggestions raised by members in taking the project forward.

IV. Any other business

[LC Paper No. CB(2)327/07-08(01)]

Projects for follow-up by the Subcommittee

9. Members agreed to discuss the Former Central School Site earlier proposed by Professor Patrick LAU at the next meeting tentatively scheduled for 6 December 2007 at 4:30 pm.

10. Mr Albert CHAN suggested the following for members' consideration -

- (a) preservation of the district characteristics in Sai Yee Street (URA's Project K28);
- (b) preservation of Cheung Po Tsai Cave, Cheung Chau;
- (c) preservation of Silver Mine Cave, Mui Wo;
- (d) construction of a "Hakka Village" in the New Territories (Mr CHAN advised that this had been proposed by Mr LAU Wong-fat at other committee meetings before); and
- (e) preservation of newspaper stalls in the street to save them from fading out.

Action

Mr CHAN suggested that there was urgency for the Subcommittee to discuss URA's Project K28 Sai Yee Street.

11. As Project K28 would be covered in the discussion on URA's acquisition policy by the Panel on Development at its next meeting, the Chairman said that she would liaise with the Panel Chairman on the appropriate arrangements to be made to facilitate discussion on the project.

(Post-meeting note: with the concurrence of the respective Chairmen of the Panel on Development and the Subcommittee, members were subsequently invited to attend the meeting of the Panel on 27 November 2007 to join the discussion on the item "Property acquisition policy of URA and related issues".)

12. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:50 pm.

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
21 February 2008

**Proceedings of the meeting of the
Subcommittee on Heritage Conservation
on Tuesday, 13 November 2007, at 4:30 pm
in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
000000 - 000441	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN Miss CHAN Yuen-han Mr LI Kwok-ying	Election of Chairman and Deputy Chairman (if required) Election of Chairman	
000442 - 000923	Chairman Mr Albert CHAN Miss CHAN Yuen-han	<u>Projects for follow-up by the Subcommittee</u> Mr Albert CHAN's suggested items for discussion at future meetings.	
000924 - 001825	Chairman Admin	Further discussion on the preservation of the open-air bazaar at Tai Yuen Street and Cross Street Briefing by the Secretary for Development (SDEV) on the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)290/07-08(01)]. Briefing by the Administration on the new traffic management measures for implementation at Tai Yuen Street (South).	
001826 - 002407	Ms Miriam LAU Admin Chairman	Ms Miriam LAU's enquiry of the Administration's plan of consultation with stakeholders including the affected hawkers on the necessary improvement work for enhancing the support facilities and environment of the bazaar. SDEV's response that, after the assumption of duty of the new-term Wan Chai District Council (WCDC) in January 2008, the Administration would seek WCDC's endorsement of the current proposal and consult it on the improvement work plan. Ms Miriam LAU's view that the Administration should commence preparation work as early as possible to facilitate working out feasible options for endorsement by WCDC.	
002408 - 003000	Mr Vincent FANG Admin Chairman	Mr Vincent FANG's questions on - - whether longer-term licenses could be granted to affected hawkers so that they would not need to renew licenses on a monthly basis;	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the number of pitches in the bazaar required to be moved; and - measures to promote various open bazaars in Hong Kong to visitors. <p>The Administration's response that, upon endorsement of the proposal by WCDC, the licensing authority would resume issuance of hawker licenses on an annual basis to the hawkers.</p> <p>The Administration's confirmation that only two pitches at Tai Yuen Street (South) would need to be moved to make way for the new traffic arrangements. The Hong Kong Tourism Board would continue to publicise open-air bazaars in Hong Kong.</p>	
003001 - 003634	Mr Albert CHAN Admin Chairman	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's concern about the compatibility of the bazaar and the surrounding environment which might undergo changes under the redevelopment plan for Wan Chai district.</p> <p>Mr Albert CHAN's concern about the various stringent requirements under existing policies for hawker licensing which, in his view, would not be conducive to the objective of fostering the long-term sustainable development of bazaars.</p> <p>SDEV's response that the Development Bureau and URA would adopt a district-based approach, instead of a piecemeal approach, for the preservation and revitalisation of the old Wan Chai area with a view to preserving local characteristics.</p> <p>Briefing on the review on hawker licensing policy (the Review) which was expected to be completed by mid-2008.</p>	
003635 - 004506	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Admin Chairman	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's suggestion that, in taking forward the beautification of the bazaar, the Administration should put in place standing arrangements (e.g. setting up a working group comprising hawker representatives) to channel hawkers' views to the Administration.</p> <p>SDEV's response that the Administration would actively listen to the views and suggestions of the hawkers and residents and would welcome any suggestions put forward by WCDC on the mode of public consultation exercise.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's enquiry of the extent of public participation (including hawkers) allowed in the Review. The Administration's response that it would consult various hawker associations, LegCo and DCs concerned in the course of the Review. The Review would include studying arrangements for the transfer and succession of existing licences.</p>	
004507 - 005627	Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin Chairman	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's view that the Administration should come up with a policy to revitalise open-air bazaars for preservation of their native characteristics and for their economic value. The Chairman's suggestion that the Administration should also explore preservation of a dozen of other existing open-air bazaars in Hong Kong.</p> <p>SDEV's response that the Administration's consideration of the suggestions should be subject to the outcome of the Review.</p>	
005628 - 011940	Chairman Admin Representative of HKJC	<p>Proposal of Hong Kong Jockey Club for developing the Central Police Station (CPS) Compound</p> <p>Briefing by SDEV on the Administration's paper [LC Paper No. CB(2)290/07-08(02)].</p> <p>SDEV's response to concerns raised in a joint submission from concern groups/individuals [LC Paper No. CB(2) 350/07-08(01)] on the HKJC's proposal. SDEV's explanation of the background to the briefing referred to in the joint submission. The briefing, which was organised by Central and Western District Office (DO), had been arranged in accordance with the usual practices adopted by DOs. SDEV's re-affirmation that the views expressed by attendees at the briefing had been accurately reflected in the paragraph 8 of the Administration's paper.</p> <p>PowerPoint presentation on the HKJC's proposal.</p>	
011941 - 012640	Mr Albert HO Admin Representative of HKJC Chairman	<p>Mr Albert HO's view that, instead of adopting a single, uncontested design for the project, the Administration and HKJC should select a design through an open competition.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
		<p>Emphases of SDEV and HKJC's representative that, as the current proposal was only a conceptual design, HKJC was ready to engage the public in the next six months in developing a detailed design for the project.</p>	
012641 - 013335	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han Admin Representative of HKJC Chairman</p>	<p>Miss CHAN Yuen-han's expression of concurrence with the idea that, in order to revitalise the site, it would be important to increase its accessibility and pedestrian flow as well as its green space. She agreed that the redeveloped CPS Compound should integrate with the neighbouring tourist attractions.</p> <p>Miss CHAN's concern about the height of the proposed new structure. Her suggestion that HKJC should listen widely to public views. SDEV's assurance that the Administration would listen to public views, particularly those given by local residents, with regard to the design and the operational mode of the redeveloped CPS Compound.</p>	
013336 - 013859	<p>Mr Albert CHAN Admin Representative of HKJC Chairman</p>	<p>Mr Albert CHAN's concern that the proposed new structure would unnecessarily increase the development density of the area. His view that any construction which unnecessarily occupied public space should be avoided.</p> <p>Mr CHAN's view that the CPS Compound's heritage value should be respected in deciding on its future use. His suggestion that part of the redeveloped CPS Compound should be devoted for community uses. Response of HKJC's representative that the project would not be over-commercialised under the currently proposed financial arrangements.</p>	
013900 - 014354	<p>Prof Patrick LAU Representative of HKJC Chairman</p>	<p>Professor Patrick LAU's indication of his support for the HKJC's proposal and his comments on the conceptual design. His view that HKJC should engage the public extensively (including cultural and arts groups and local architects) in the upcoming engagement exercise.</p> <p>HKJC representative's response that a number of public engagement events had been scheduled, including the introduction of the site's model at a public exhibition in December 2007.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
014355 - 015042	Dr Fernando CHEUNG Representative of HKJC Chairman	<p>Dr Fernando CHEUNG's question of whether the history of the CPS Compound would be featured under the current proposal and whether the facilities in the Compound would be devoted for featuring programmes of "high culture" only. He also expressed concern about the proposed new structure as the surrounding area was already "over-built".</p> <p>The HKJC's response that the redeveloped CPS Compound and its facilities were intended for the use by the general public. One-third of the Compound would be designated for non-profit-making activities, e.g. constructing a history museum on the development of the rule of law in Hong Kong.</p>	
015043 - 015636	Dr KWOK Ka-ki Representative of HKJC Chairman	<p>Dr KWOK Ka-ki's expression of the following concerns -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the proposed new structure, which was reportedly 50-storey high, could create neon pollution to nearby residents and become an "eyesore" to them. Moreover, public attention would focus on the proposed iconic structure rather than the historical values of the Compound; and - whether the poor and vulnerable groups could afford to use the facilities in the redeveloped CPS Compound. <p>HKJC representative's response that ample space in the Compound would be used for development of public facilities, e.g. the aforementioned museum, for the enjoyment of the general public. The proposed height of the structure would allow the public to enjoy a "bird's eye view" from a unique vantage point.</p>	
015637 - 020025	Mr Timothy FOK Admin Chairman	<p>Mr Timothy FOK's appreciation of HKJC's efforts in working out the proposal and his view that the arts and cultural facilities planned for the CPS Compound would help alleviate the acute shortage of such facilities in Hong Kong. Mr FOK's enquiry and SDEV's reply that the project was aimed to be completed by 2012.</p>	

Time marker	Speaker	Subject	Action required
020026 - 020550	Mr Abraham SHEK Representative of HKJC Chairman	Mr Abraham SHEK's appreciation of HKJC's efforts and his suggestion that the public should be presented with models of the design or/and videos for illustration of the changes envisaged to be brought about by revitalisation of the CPS Compound. HKJC representative's response that the suggested arrangements would be made during the public engagement exercise.	
020551 - 021035	Chairman	The Chairman's comments on the proposed design and the new iconic structure. She shared concern about its height and questioned whether there was a genuine need to provide a view tower there. Her view that particular attention should be paid to the long-term viability of the developed CPS Compound in working out the financial arrangements. The Chairman's suggestion that facilities in the redeveloped Compound should be made available for staging Cantonese opera and xi qu as well as western cultural performances all-year-round targeting at tourists and Mainland visitors. <u>Date of next meeting</u>	

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
21 February 2008