

Draft
立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(2)2416/07-08(02)
(These minutes have been seen
by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/HA

Panel on Home Affairs

**Minutes of meeting
held on Friday, 9 May 2008, at 10:00 am
in the Chamber of the Legislative Council Building**

- Members present** : Hon CHOY So-yuk, JP (Chairman)
Hon Albert HO Chun-yan (Deputy Chairman)
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS, JP
Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP
Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP
Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
Hon LI Kwok-ying, MH, JP
Hon Daniel LAM Wai-keung, SBS, JP
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
Prof Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
- Member attending** : Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP
- Members absent** : Dr Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS
Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
Hon TAM Heung-man

Public Officers : Item III
attending

Home Affairs Bureau

Mrs Agnes ALLCOCK
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (2)

Miss Janet WONG Chin-kiu
Principal Assistant Secretary (Recreation & Sport)

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Miss Olivia CHAN Yeuk-oi
Assistant Director (Leisure Services)2

Architectural Services Department

Mr CHAN Wing-tak
Chief Technical Advisor/Subvented Projects

Hong Kong Sports Institute

Dr Eric LI Ka-cheung
Chairman, Hong Kong Sports Institute Limited

Mr Tommy YIM
Member, Hong Kong Sports Institute Redevelopment
Project Steering Committee

Dr Trisha LEAHY
Chief Executive, Hong Kong Sports Institute Limited

Mr Kevin YIP
Project Manager (Redevelopment), Hong Kong Sports
Institute Limited

Mr Joel CHAN
Project Director, P&T Architects and Engineers Limited

Mr William SIU
Associate Director, Northcroft Hong Kong Limited

Mr C C LAI
Director, Northcroft Hong Kong Limited

Item IV

Home Affairs Bureau

Mr Raymond TAM Chi-yuen
Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3)

Ms Winnie SO Chui-ying
Principal Assistant Secretary (Culture)1

Labour and Welfare Bureau

Mr Stephen SUI Wai-keung
Commissioner for Rehabilitation

Education Bureau

Dr Catherine CHAN Ka-ki
Principal Assistant Secretary (Curriculum Development)

Commerce and Economic Development Bureau

Miss Ida LEE Bik-sai
Principal Assistant Secretary (Communications &
Technology)B

Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Mr CHUNG Ling-hoi
Deputy Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Culture)

Hong Kong Arts Development Council

Mr Louis YU
Chief Executive

Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts

Professor Kevin THOMPSON
Director

Dr. Herbert HUEY
Associate Director (Administration) and Registrar

Attendance by invitation : Item IV

Museum of Site, Ltd

Mr Andrew LAM Hon-kin
Curator

Spring-Time Stage Productions Ltd

Mr KO Chi-sum
Chief Executive Office & Producer

The Ink Society Ltd

Mrs Nancy LEE
Director

Mr Charles WONG
Administration Officer

Hong Kong Fringe Club

Mr Benny CHIA
Director

Zuni Icosahedron

Mr Mathias WOO Yan-wai
Executive Director

Hong Kong Curators Association

Dr Raymond TANG Man-leung
Vice Chairman

The Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Ltd

Mr Timothy Calnin
Chief Executive

Hong Kong Arts Administrators' Association
and
Hong Kong Arts Festival Society

Ms Tisa HO
Chairman and Executive Director - Hong Kong Arts
Festival Society

The Association of Managers, Cultural Services

Miss Irene LAM Tsz-tsui
Chairlady

The Composers & Authors Society of Hong Kong

Professor CHAN Wing-wah
Chairman

Clerk in attendance : Miss Flora TAI
Chief Council Secretary (2)2

Staff in attendance : Ms Joanne MAK
Senior Council Secretary (2)2

Ms Anna CHEUNG
Legislative Assistant (2)2

Action

IV Strengthening the software and humanware in culture and the arts
[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1805/07-08(03) and (04)]

The Administration's response to the deputations' views expressed at the meeting held on 15 February 2008

The Chairman said that when this issue was last discussed at the meeting held on 15 February 2008, there was inadequate time for the Administration to respond to the views given by the deputations. She invited members to note that the Administration had already provided a paper setting out its response [LC Paper No. CB(2)1805/07-08(03)]. At the invitation of the Chairman, Deputy Secretary for Home Affairs (3) (DSHA(3)) briefed members on the salient points of the Administration's paper.

Views presented by deputations and the Administration's initial response

Museum of Site

2. Mr Andrew LAM Hon-kin suggested that the Administration should put in place a proper mechanism for the allocation of funding to support the promotion of the arts in the 18 districts, including the criteria for determining the funding amounts and the policy direction in this regard. He also suggested that community museums which showcased collections with local characteristics should be set up in each district. He urged the Administration to set up the statutory museums board and to provide funding to support the development of community museums.

Action

Spring-time Stage Productions Ltd

3. Mr KO Chi-sum considered that the current policy of heavily subsidizing the nine major performing arts groups had resulted in resource mismatch and led to unfair competition within the sector, which was not conducive to the development of the arts. He said that the non-subsidized drama groups were at a disadvantage in competing with the established ones which were heavily subsidized by the Government in their administrative overhead and production cost. As a result, these established groups could attract more easily private investors to collaborate with them in expanding overseas market. Mr KO expressed dissatisfaction that it was tantamount to using public money to subsidize entertainment businessmen.

(Post-meeting note: the speaking note of Mr KO Chi-sum was issued vide LC Paper No. CB(2)2055/07-08(02))

Hong Kong Fringe Club

4. Mr Benny CHIA requested the Administration to explain its long-term policy and strategy to develop culture and the arts as well as the creative industry in Hong Kong. He suggested that district councils (DCs) should make use of the additional funding allocated to them for the implementation of community involvement projects to implement more arts education and community arts activities. He also suggested that, in order to promote arts in the community, the Administration should take the lead in including more cultural and arts activities in the programme of major events, e.g. the East Asian Games, and explore the feasibility of covering cultural and arts news in daily news reports on TV. He suggested that the Administration should also encourage arts publication and research work.

The Ink Society Ltd

[LC Paper No. CB(2)1805/07-08(05)]

5. Mrs Nancy LEE said that one of the most effective ways of instilling culture was through education by enhancing the cultural and artistic content of school curricula of subjects such as History, Language, Literature and Drama. She said that the use of Putonghua as the medium of teaching Chinese should be considered. She considered that an emphasis on the creative expression of ideas in visual arts programmes in schools would help students formulate their own views and ideas about the world and express them in individual ways. She stressed that highly trained and qualified teachers were essential to quality arts education and they could be recruited from local and overseas universities.

Zuni Icosahedron

6. Mr Mathias WOO Yan-wai considered that the Administration should

Action

formulate a blueprint for the long-term development of culture and arts which should be able to address the concerns raised by some deputations about the funding policy for arts groups. He agreed that there was a need to strengthen arts education and provide a culture and arts channel. He pointed out that there was no allocation of resources for arts education and also no expertise in arts education in the Education Bureau (EDB). He considered that the positioning and direction of some of the major performing arts organisations were unclear. These organisations should explain such issues to the public since they were heavily subsidized with public money.

Hong Kong Curators Association (HKCA)
[LC Paper No. CB(2)2395/07-08(01)]

7. Dr Raymond TANG Man-leung said that the M+ of the West Kowloon Cultural District (WKCD) would pose a large demand for professionals of museum management. It was estimated that the manpower demand arising from the implementation of the M+ would be about four times of the existing museum staff establishment of the Leisure and Cultural Services Department (LCSD). He urged the Administration to conduct a manpower survey for mapping out a long-term manpower training programme to meet the manpower needs for the implementation of the museum facilities in WKCD.

The Hong Kong Philharmonic Society Ltd (HKPS)

8. Mr Timothy Calnin considered it necessary for the Administration to strengthen the nurturing of Hong Kong's resident performing arts companies in order to realise the vision of WKCD. He briefed members on the role of HKPS and highlighted that, in the past four years, HKPS had achieved tremendous growth in artistic quality and launched an expanded program of education and outreach activities which were offered free of charge to both school students and the general public:

Hong Kong Arts Administrators' Association
and
Hong Kong Arts Festival Society

9. Referring to the Administration's response that the Clore Leadership Programme would be brought in from the United Kingdom in October 2008 to engage arts administration in a four-day symposium, Ms Tisa HO welcomed this programme but added that, even with this, it would still be necessary for the Administration to provide training opportunities for arts administrators, as actual working experience in this field was important training to an art administrator.

10. Ms Tisa HO further said that, before completion of the implementation of WKCD, the Administration should alleviate the venue shortage by allowing arts groups to make use of unconventional performance venues. She quoted

Action

the recent staging of a performance at a vacant government land in Hung Hom Bay as an example. She suggested that the Administration should facilitate the use of such land by arts groups by streamlining the relevant land use application and approval procedures.

The Association of Managers, Cultural Services

11. Miss Irene LAM Tsz-tsui said that the promotion of culture and the arts in the community had been hindered by the manpower shortage of cultural services managers and called on the Administration to strengthen the staff establishment of that staff grade. She said that the existing staff establishment could not meet service demands. She pointed out that, with DCs being allocated additional funding for the implementation of community involvement projects, it was an opportune time for cultural services managers to collaborate more with DCs in promoting cultural and arts activities in the community. She urged the Administration to strengthen the staff establishment of cultural services managers so that they could enhance their collaboration with DCs in the promotion of culture and the arts in the community.

The Composers & Authors Society of HK

12. Professor CHAN Wing-wah considered that creative talents in culture and the arts in Hong Kong lacked social recognition and the monetary rewards to them were also inadequate to support a living. As a result, they only participated in creative work mostly on a part-time basis. He called on the Administration to provide support for creative talents who wished to pursue a career in creative work. Referring to the Administration's response on Continuing Education Fund (CEF), Professor CHAN pointed out that if a learner wished to pursue continuing education solely in arts administration/cultural management without covering administration studies in other fields, he was not eligible to apply for subsidy from CEF. Professor CHAN also suggested that consideration should be given to enhancing the dissemination of information on culture and the arts through the Internet and electronic media and enhancing the provision of audio visual arts promotional/educational materials at public libraries, in order to promote culture and the arts to the public.

Administration's initial response to concerns raised by deputations

13. At the invitation of the Chairman, DSHA(3) made the following initial response to the concerns raised by the deputations -

- (a) the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) had already set up a working group to study the proposal for providing an arts channel with a view to advising the Government on the best way forward; and

Action

- (b) the Administration provided funding to the existing publicly-funded arts groups to meet their needs for long-term development. However, a number of other arts groups were also supported by government funding through HKADC, which supported the diversified development of local artists and arts groups through its various schemes.

Admin

14. To facilitate follow-up on the concerns raised by some deputations, the Chairman requested the Administration to provide further information on the amounts of annual subvention to the 10 major professional performing arts groups, the numbers of performances staged by them annually and their future development for members' reference.

Admin

(*Post-meeting note: the Chairman's subsequent request for additional information on the subsidized items covered by the government funding provided to the 10 major professional performing arts groups was relayed to the Administration on 11 June 2008.*)

Discussion

Cultural policy, resource deployment and manpower requirement

15. Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong said that while the Government's annual recurrent expenditure on culture and the arts was around \$2.5 billion, the amount of funding provision for LCSD was about \$2 billion, i.e. 80% of the Government's annual recurrent expenditure on culture and the arts. He said that of the remaining annual recurrent expenditure, the subvention for the major professional performing arts groups amounted to \$223.7 million, out of which \$180 million were used by five of the major professional performing arts groups. He sought the Administration's response to the following issues -

- (a) while he agreed that Hong Kong should have some high quality professional performing arts groups, the Administration should, in providing funding for them, ensure that there was a reasonable and fair distribution of funding resources amongst arts groups;
- (b) whether the Administration considered it necessary to require the professional performing arts groups not to use the government funding in such a way that it would stifle the development of other non-subsidized commercial arts groups as raised by Mr KO Chi-sum; and
- (c) whether the Administration considered it appropriate that LCSD, being responsible for promotion of culture and the arts, used up a large majority of the resources allocated for this area.

16. DSHA(3) said that, as set out in the Administration's paper, the Home

Action

Affairs Bureau (HAB) was planning to develop a new set of assessment criteria for the major professional performing arts groups and to develop a new funding mechanism for them. The study would also examine the need for support to the non-subsided sector to bring about a sustainable performing arts sector. Mr CHEUNG Man-kwong, however, queried whether the study could address the concern that the existing mode of providing subsidies for the professional performing arts groups had led to stifling the development of other non-subsided commercial arts groups. He further suggested that the Administration should consider making reference to the provision of financial assistance for candidates participating in direct elections and offer subsidy to commercial arts groups based on the number of tickets they sold so that, the more popular an arts group was, the more funding support it would receive.

17. DSHA(3) said that apart from government funding, some local arts groups relied on other sources of income, such as revenue generated from ticket sale and commercial sponsorship. The Administration was exploring ways to encourage more commercial sponsorship for these arts groups and to expand their market by promoting publicity of their performances to tourists and Mainland visitors. He said that Mr CHEUNG's suggestion of offering subsidy based on the number of tickets sold could be considered in the relevant study.

18. The Chairman said that the Administration should address the issue raised by Mr KO Chi-sum that the commercial arts groups were at a disadvantage in competing with the professional performing arts groups in opening up overseas market, as the latter had government funding to cover their various administrative expenses (e.g. hotel expenses).

19. DSHA(3) reiterated that the relevant study would examine the need for support to the non-subsided sector to bring about a sustainable performing arts sector. In addition, local artists and art groups were welcome to apply for funding from the Arts Development Fund for outbound cultural exchange activities, and such applications would be considered on the basis of merits.

20. Dr Fernando CHEUNG expressed concern as to how the existing uneven distribution of resources could achieve the policy goal of encouraging diversified and balanced development. He considered that the amount of funding allocated to HKADC which supported the diversified development of local artists and arts groups and the Administration's support for nurturing talents of creative arts were far from adequate. He asked whether the Administration would consider releasing the bulk of resources for supporting cultural and arts development to be managed by the community in line with the principle of "community-driven". Miss CHAN Yuen-han criticized the Administration for failing to formulate a cultural policy. She said that the Administration should consider increasing its overall allocation of funding for culture and the arts, given the imminent need to materialize the vision of WKCD.

Action

21. Concerning the annual recurrent expenditure on culture and the arts allocated to LCSD, Deputy Director of Leisure and Cultural Services (Culture) explained that the provision of about \$2 billion for LCSD was spent on areas including venue management and programming expenses relating to performing arts venues, public libraries and museums, as well as associated staffing and administrative expenses.

22. Miss CHAN Yuen-han requested the Administration to respond to concerns about manpower training as raised by some deputations. She urged the Administration to enhance the manpower training for culture and the arts such as museum professionals, and to strengthen the staff establishment of cultural services managers in order to meet the manpower demands for materializing the vision of WKCD.

23. Referring to an article on "Nylonkong" in the Time magazine, Ms Emily LAU sought the deputations' views on the standard of the Hong Kong arts and cultural life, and what had, in their view, hindered the development of culture and the arts in Hong Kong. Mr KO Chi-sum considered that the unfair competition within the sector as created by the Administration's outdated funding policy was a problem as it failed to take into account the emergence of new art forms which had also proven to be popular in the market. Mr Benny CHIA considered that there was no level-playing competition in the arts market in Hong Kong as 95% of the resources for development of culture and the arts were controlled by the Government. He said that in the absence of an open market, arts development in Hong Kong could hardly be expected to be balanced and healthy. Professor CHAN Wing-wah and Ms Tisa HO, however, stressed that the discussion at this meeting should not be construed as suggesting the Administration to cut resources for the professional performing arts groups and re-deploy it to others. They said that the Administration should explore enhancing support for arts groups as a whole.

24. Mr Mathias WOO Yan-wai considered that the Administration lacked an arts vision for Hong Kong. He and Professor CHAN Wing-wah both considered that a Cultural Affairs Bureau should be set up to implement active measures to promote culture and the arts as well as creative industries and to oversee implementation of the relevant policies. Dr Raymond TANG Man-leung suggested that the Panel should consider devoting more time to the study of the development of cultural software for Hong Kong. Mrs Nancy LEE said that the only way for culture and the arts in Hong Kong to advance further was through education and the formulation of an arts vision on the part of the Government. Miss Irene LAM Tsz-tsui considered that the cultural policy should be integrated with the policy on the development of creative industries so that the economic benefits generated from such an integrated policy would encourage more government spending on the development of culture and the arts.

Action

Venue shortage

25. Miss CHAN Yuen-han said that there was an inadequate supply of venues for rehearsals and staging performances by small and medium performing arts groups. She urged the Administration to provide more community-based performance venues. She said that the Administration had undertaken to consider opening up facilities in schools on public holidays for use by performing arts groups a few years ago but no progress had been made so far. Pointing out that the additional funding incurred by implementing this new measure would be only a small amount, the Chairman requested the Administration to follow up.

Admin

Development of inclusive arts

26. Dr Fernando CHEUNG asked how much of the \$2.5 billion allocated for the development of culture and the arts was provided for supporting artists with a disability and when the next international festival of inclusive arts would be held.

27. Commissioner for Rehabilitation (C for R) said that under the rehabilitation portfolio, the “Jockey Club Arts for the Disabled Scheme”, which was sponsored by the Hong Kong Jockey Club Charities Trust and administered by the Rehabilitation Team, provided funding to non-governmental organisations and special schools for provision of basic training for persons with disabilities in arts and culture, and there were about 6 000 participants each year. He added that the first International Festival of Inclusive Arts in Hong Kong had been held at the end of 2006 and the Administration did not have specific plan on whether to organize another festival in the near future. The Chairman requested C for R to provide further information about the timing for holding the next Festival in writing.

Admin

Holding a special meeting for further discussion

28. At the suggestion of Miss CHAN Yuen-han, the Panel agreed to hold a special meeting in June 2008 to further discuss funding support for local arts groups and manpower training for culture and the arts. Ms Emily LAU suggested that the major performing arts groups should also be invited to the meeting to provide information on their use of the government funding. The Chairman said that the deputations present were also welcome to attend the special meeting to join the discussion. She requested HAB to provide detailed information on the distribution of resources to address the concerns raised by some deputations and members about the mismatch of resources and unfair competition. She also requested EDB to provide detailed information on the manpower training for culture and the arts for the special meeting.

Admin

Admin

29. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 12:45 pm.

Action

Council Business Division 2
Legislative Council Secretariat
27 June 2008