

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(2)2569/07-08  
(These minutes have been  
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB2/PL/WS

**Panel on Welfare Services**

**Minutes of meeting**  
**held on Friday, 16 May 2008, at 10:45 am**  
**in Conference Room A of the Legislative Council Building**

**Members present** : Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung (Chairman)  
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP (Deputy Chairman)  
Hon LEE Cheuk-yan  
Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP  
Dr Hon YEUNG Sum, JP  
Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki  
Hon Mrs Anson CHAN, GBM, JP

**Members absent** : Hon Albert HO Chun-yan  
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

**Public Officers attending** : Item IV  
  
Mr Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
  
Ms Irene YOUNG  
Principal Assistant Secretary for Labour and Welfare  
(Welfare) 1  
  
Mr Stephen Fisher, JP  
Director of Social Welfare

Miss Ann HON  
Assistant Director of Social Welfare (Subventions)

Lump Sum Grant Independent Review Committee

Mr LEE Wing-wai  
Secretary

**Deputations  
by invitation**

: Item IV

Chung Shak-hei (Cheung Chau) Home for the Aged, Ltd.  
Employees General Union

---

Mr LEUNG King-chuen  
Chairman

Union of Hong Kong Rehabilitation Agencies Workshop  
Instructor

---

Mr YU Chi-ming  
Chairman

Stewards Staff Union (Social Service Branch)

Mr HUNG King-lun  
Vice President

Frontline Welfare Employees' Union

Mr TAM Leung-ying

Staff Union of Mental Health Association of Hong Kong

Mr CHEUNG Chor-kin  
Member

The Hong Kong Council of Social Service

Mr Joseph WONG Kam-man  
Business Director (Corporate Management)

機構管治關注小組

Mr TIK Chi-yuen

Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union

Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che  
Chairman

Community Care and Nursing Home Workers General Union

---

Mr CHENG Ching-fat  
Exco Member

Staff Association of Hong Kong Young Women Christian Association

---

Mr TSE Sai-kit  
Director of Rights and Complaints Division

Staff Club of The Boys' and Girls' Clubs Association

Miss TAN Yin-ping  
Chairperson

Hong Kong Social Workers Association

Mr CHUA Hoi-wai  
Board Member

Staff Association of The Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups

---

Mr CHEUNG Chi-wai  
Chairman

Department of Social Sciences in Caritas Francis Hsu College (Match)

---

Mr KWOK Chung-yin  
President

Hong Kong Federation of Social Work Students

Miss LO Ka-ki  
External Vice President

Social Welfare Organizations Employees Union

Mr LIU Wai-ying  
Vice Chairman

Caring NGOs Group

Mr Hendrick LUI  
Member

Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions Social Service  
Unions Committee

---

Mr TANG Wai-wah  
Chairman

**Clerk in attendance** : Miss Betty MA  
Chief Council Secretary (2) 4

**Staff in attendance** : Ms Elyssa WONG  
Deputy Head (Research and Library Services)

Ms Ivy CHENG  
Research Officer 6

Mr Chris LAI  
Senior Council Secretary (2) 7

Miss Maggie CHIU  
Legislative Assistant (2) 4

Action

---

**I. Confirmation of minutes**  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)1874/07-08]

The minutes of the meeting held on 14 April 2008 were confirmed.

**II. Information paper(s) issued since the last meeting**

2. Members noted that no information paper had been issued since the last meeting.

Action

**III. Items for discussion at the next meeting**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1875/07-08(01) and (02)]

3. Members agreed to discuss the following items at the next meeting to be held on 12 June 2008 at 4:30 pm –

(a) Partnership Fund for the Disadvantaged proposed by the Administration; and

(b) Support measures for low-income group in face of rising food prices proposed by Hon CHAN Yuen-han.

4. For item (b) above, Dr KWOK Ka-ki said that the Administration should be requested to provide the relevant statistics on the subject in its discussion paper, such as the inflation rates and movement of food prices in the past few years. He also suggested that academics should be invited to give views at the meeting.

5. Miss CHAN Yuen-han took the view that the Administration should brief the Panel on measures which had been or would be put in place to assist the low-income group to alleviate the pressure arising from inflation, especially the sharp rise in food prices. The Chairman invited members to notify the Clerk of any further information required of the Administration.

**IV. Implementation of the Lump Sum Grant subvention system**

[LC Paper Nos. CB(2)1875/07-08(03) to (05), CB(2)1923/07-08(01) and (02), CB(2)1955/07-08(01) and (02), CB(2)1956/07-08(01) and IN14/07-08]

6. Secretary for Labour and Welfare (SLW) said that the Administration attached great importance to the partnership with the subvented welfare sector and fully understood the financial difficulties faced by some non-governmental organizations (NGOs) subvented on Lump Sum Grant (LSG). To further enhance the LSG subvention system and assist NGOs in its implementation, the Director of Social Welfare (DSW) had re-convened the LSG Steering Committee (LSGSC) in August 2007. Comprising representatives of the Social Welfare Department (SWD), NGO management, staff unions and service users, LSGSC would continue to provide a platform for engagement with the welfare sector.

7. SLW further said that since the implementation of the LSG subvention system, the Administration had provided a Tide-over Grant and a Special One-off Grant of about \$2.4 billion to help NGOs meet their financial and staff

Action

commitments. Apart from the \$330 million additional recurrent resources provided to NGOs since 2007-2008 in line with the 2007-2008 Civil Service Pay Adjustment and 2007 Starting Salaries Adjustments, the Administration decided to provide an additional \$200 million recurrent funding to NGOs on LSG from 2008-2009 onwards to help them strengthen their administrative capacity. The Administration had also announced four interim facilitating measures on 31 December 2007 to enhance the quality of welfare services, as detailed in its paper.

8. SLW added that the Administration announced on 18 January 2008 the establishment of the LSG Independent Review Committee (LSGIRC) to review the implementation of the LSG subvention system. He said that depending on progress, the Committee was expected to complete the review by the end of the third quarter of 2008, and would report its findings and make recommendations to him.

Meeting with deputations

*Union of Hong Kong Rehabilitation Agencies Workshop Instructor*

9. Mr YU Chi-ming said that following the implementation of the LSG subvention system, some NGOs providing rehabilitation services had reduced the number of staff and hired less experienced ones on less favourable employment terms in order to save costs. As a result, the quality of rehabilitation services had been affected seriously. Mr YU welcomed the proposal to organize in-service training for rehabilitation personnel providing services for people with psychiatric disability. He urged the Administration to enhance monitoring of the corporate governance of NGOs and their use of the LSG subventions.

*Staff Union of Mental Health Association of Hong Kong  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)1923/07-08(01)]*

10. Mr CHEUNG Chor-kin expressed concern about the lack of transparency and consultation with the frontline staff and service users during the review process of the LSG subvention system. Mr CHEUNG suggested that an academic institution should be commissioned to conduct a comprehensive and objective study on the LSG subvention system. In addition, SWD should issue specific guidelines to NGO management on good corporate governance.

*Community Care and Nursing Home Workers General Union  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)1923/07-08(02)]*

11. Referring to its submission, Mr CHENG Ching-fat highlighted the observation of the Union in respect of the deteriorated quality of residential care and home-based services for the elderly after the introduction of the LSG

Action

subvention system. Mr CHENG urged the Administration to study critically the problem and take immediate measures to enhance the residential care services for the elderly.

*Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union*  
*[LC Paper No. CB(2)1955/07-08(01)]*

12. Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che said that as shown from the findings of a survey conducted by the Union, a majority of the respondents had indicated that they planned to quit the field. To boost the low staff morale in the sector, the Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union had put forward some proposals for the Administration's consideration. Mr CHEUNG highlighted that –

- (a) the Administration should ensure equal pay for equal work in the subvented welfare sector and require NGOs to remunerate their staff according to their length of service;
- (b) a manning ratio for each type of welfare services should be formulated in consultation with the sector;
- (c) an actuary should be commissioned to work out a reasonable subvention level for individual NGOs taking into account their staffing establishment and future development needs in the next five to 10 years;
- (d) an academic institution should be commissioned to conduct a comprehensive and objective study on the implementation of LSG subvention system and the problems faced by the welfare sector;
- (e) LSGIRC should consult the welfare sector on its recommendations before submission to the Administration;
- (f) legislation should be put in place to require NGOs to include staff representatives in their board of directors; and
- (g) an independent committee should be set up to handle staff complaints.

*The Hong Kong Council of Social Service*  
*[LC Paper No. CB(2)1875/07-08(05)]*

13. Mr Joseph WONG briefed members on the suggestions made by the Hong Kong Council of Social Services (HKCSS) which urged the Administration to –

Action

- (a) streamline the accounting and auditing requirements under the Funding and Service Agreement, so as to bring them in line with the spirit of the LSG subvention system in providing greater flexibility for NGOs in resource deployment;
- (b) enhance the transparency of the basis for determining the LSG subvention to NGOs;
- (c) provide the recurrent subvention baseline allocation at the "True Benchmark" (i.e. the level prior to the adjustments as a result of the Enhanced Productivity Programme (EPP) and Efficiency Savings (ES)), and adjust upwards the baseline allocation in the light of increasing service demand;
- (d) provide additional resources for NGOs to enhance administrative support and increase the number of supervisory posts; and
- (e) formulate a long-term social welfare planning.

*機構管治關注小組*

14. Mr TIK Chi-yuen said that under the LSG subvention system, NGOs were provided with greater autonomy and flexibility in deployment of resources and formulation of personnel policies. This had given rise to allegations about malpractice and "rule of man" of some NGO management. To his knowledge, the staff turnover rates at the supervisory level in a few NGOs were as high as 70% because of dissatisfaction with the management style. Mr TIK strongly urged the Administration to introduce a system of check and balance to ensure the accountability, corporate governance and quality of welfare services of NGOs on LSG.

*Department of Social Sciences in Caritas Francis Hsu College (Match)*

15. Mr KWOK Chung-yin said that the introduction of the LSG subvention system had led to high staff turnover in NGOs. This had affected adversely the continuity of welfare services and discouraged social work students from joining the welfare sector after graduation. Mr KWOK considered that the Administration should provide sufficient resources for NGOs subvented on LSG to recruit and remunerate staff. Expressing concern about the lack of representation of frontline social workers in LSGIRC, Mr KWOK raised doubt about the impartiality of findings of the LSG Review.



Action

*Caring NGOs Group*  
*[LC Paper No. CB(2)1955/07-08(02)]*

16. The Chairman declared that he had taken part in the Caring NGOs Group's work on the subject matter.

17. Mr Hendrick LUI considered that apart from examining the implementation of the LSG subvention system, LSGIRC should also study the governance of and the use of LSG Reserve by NGOs. Mr LUI urged the Administration to formulate a long-term social welfare planning and a partnership with the welfare sector.

*Hong Kong Social Workers Association*

18. Mr CHUA Hoi-wai raised concern about the high staff turnover in the welfare sector after the introduction of the LSG subvention system. He said that the staff turnover rates in some NGOs were as high as 100%. Mr CHUA suggested that the Personal Emolument (PE) subvention should be adjusted upwards from "mid-point" salaries to 60% or 70% of the pay scales of the recognized staffing establishment so that NGOs on LSG could be in a better financial position to retain experienced staff. Mr CHUA said that additional resources should be provided to those NGOs employing a large proportion of Snapshot Staff whose salaries had well exceeded the "mid-point".

*Other deputations attending the meeting*

19. Representatives of the following deputations did not add further views –

- (a) Chung Shak-hei (Cheung Chau) Home for the Aged, Ltd. Employees General Union;
- (b) Stewards Staff Union (Social Service Branch);
- (c) Frontline Welfare Employees' Union  
[LC Paper No. CB(2)1956/07-08(01)];
- (d) Staff Association of Hong Kong Young Women Christian Association;
- (e) Staff Club of The Boys' and Girls' Clubs Association;
- (f) Staff Association of The Hong Kong Federation of Youth Groups;
- (g) Hong Kong Federation of Social Work Students;

Action

- (h) Social Welfare Organizations Employees Union; and
- (i) Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions Social Service Unions Committee.

The Administration's response

20. SLW responded that the Administration was aware that corporate governance of NGOs on LSG and the long-term social welfare planning were two major issues of concern of the welfare sector. He said that the independent review of the LSG subvention system covered a wide range of areas including corporate governance of subvented NGOs. LSGIRC would invite views from the stakeholders, and then identify areas for improvement and make recommendations in this respect. SLW said that the Social Welfare Advisory Committee (SWAC) was studying the long-term social welfare planning. Invitation for written submissions had been issued to different stakeholders. SWAC would continue with its consultation on the subject. As regards the allegations of malpractice of some NGO management, SLW invited deputations to provide further information to SWD after the meeting to facilitate follow-up on individual cases.

Discussion

21. Dr YEUNG Sum welcomed the setting up of LSGIRC to review the LSG subvention system. Referring to the research report prepared by the Research and Library Services Division of the Legislative Council (LegCo) Secretariat, he was concerned about the high turnover rates of social workers following the implementation of the system. To address the problem of low staff morale, Dr YEUNG considered that the Administration should ensure equal pay for equal work in the welfare sector, and encourage NGO operators to remunerate their staff according to their years of service. The calculation of PE subvention should be based on 60% or 70% of the pay scales of the recognized staffing establishment, instead of the "mid-point" salaries. Dr YEUNG said that NGOs should be required to appoint staff representatives to the boards of directors. He urged the Administration to formulate long-term social welfare planning and partnership with the welfare sector.

22. Mr LEE Cheuk-yan considered that the governance problem of some NGOs was rooted in the LSG subvention system. He said that following the reduction in subvention as a result of EPP and ES adjustments, some NGO management had to reduce staff salaries to save costs and accumulate savings for the LSG Reserve. Having regard to the strong opposing views from the welfare sector, Mr LEE considered that the LSG subvention system was a failure and should be scrapped.

Action

23. SLW responded that the LSG subvention system was introduced as an alternative to the conventional subvention system which was considered to be inflexible, complex and bureaucratic. He said that the LSG subvention system had brought about significant benefits and enhancements to the welfare sector, albeit there being room for improvement. SLW explained that the purpose of having a LSG Reserve was to allow individual NGOs to meet their commitments in salary payments for the Snapshot Staff.

24. Ms LI Fung-ying expressed regret at the Administration's failure to make improvement to the LSG subvention system, despite deputations having repeatedly pointed out the problems generated by the system. She was gravely concerned that after the introduction of the LSG subvention system, some NGO operators were forced to become unscrupulous employers and had to reduce the number of staff in order to save costs. As a result, the quality of welfare services had been seriously affected. Ms LI considered that the review of the LSG subvention system should be transparent and give due regard to the views of different stakeholders, especially the frontline social workers. She hoped that the review would come up with concrete improvement measures.

25. SLW responded that the Administration was committed to helping NGOs to cope with the financial problems, and SWD had provided additional recurrent resources to NGOs. As a special measure, the Administration had decided to provide an additional \$200 million recurrent funding to NGOs on LSG from 2008-2009 onwards, which represented about 3% of the baseline allocation. SLW stressed that the Administration had responded positively to the requests of the frontline staff in the welfare sector by launching a series of interim facilitating measures. It had also set up LSGIRC to review the effectiveness of the LSG subvention system to identify room for improvement. SLW assured members that the review of the system was open and transparent, and concrete recommendations would be made to improve the system.

26. Ms LI Fung-ying and the Chairman took the view that LSGIRC should solicit directly the views of frontline social workers and service users. SLW said that LSGIRC had openly invited stakeholders, including NGO management, staff associations and service users, and members of the public to give views on the LSG subvention system. The Committee would also conduct visits to NGOs and groups to collect their views. SLW said that the LSGIRC's work was reported at its website, and interested parties were welcome to approach the Committee for a meeting. He was confident that LSGIRC would take into account the views of the stakeholders and make impartial recommendations.

27. Secretary/LSGIRC (Secy/LSGIRC) supplemented that LSGIRC had so far met 69 NGOs and groups to collect their views and attended seminars and hearings organized by stakeholders on the subject. He said that further meetings with 13 NGOs and groups were being scheduled. LSGIRC would also

Action

gauge views from service users through SWD and HKCSS in the coming months. He added that appointments with LSGIRC could be made through its website or by phone.

28. Dr KWOK Ka-ki considered that the problems of low staff morale and high staff turnover in the welfare sector were caused by the poor corporate governance of some NGO management. While raising no objection to setting up LSGIRC, Dr KWOK pointed out that the Committee was tasked to make recommendations instead of making policy decision. He saw no reason why the Administration needed to wait for the review outcome to take actions against malpractice of NGO management and enhance NGOs' corporate governance. He urged the Administration to provide a concrete timetable for taking such actions. Mr Alan LEONG expressed similar views.

29. SLW responded that the LSG subvention system had its merits, notably the provision of greater flexibility in deployment of resources, although there was still room for improvement. He considered that the grievances of NGO staff were not targeted at the LSG subvention system itself, but issues concerning the employment relationship. SLW said that the review of the LSG subvention system would help the Administration identify areas for improvement. LSGIRC would undertake its task thoroughly and make impartial and useful recommendations for the Administration's consideration by the end of the third quarter of 2008.

30. Miss CHAN Yuen-han expressed grave concern about the staff grievances in the welfare sector following the implementation of the LSG subvention system, especially the alleged malpractices of some NGO management. Given the severity of the problem, Miss CHAN said that the Administration should address them without further delay. She took the view that subvented NGOs should model on the school management and include staff representatives in the boards of directors. Moreover, LSGIRC should include a representative from the frontline social workers. Miss CHAN further said that the Administration should also follow up on complaints about the deterioration in service quality of rehabilitation services and meal services for the elderly as pointed out by some deputations.

31. SLW responded that the Administration would follow up the allegations concerning the malpractice of some NGO management, if substantiated. He added that the Administration had put in place an effective monitoring mechanism to ensure the proper use of the LSG subvention.

32. DSW advised that SWD had followed up on a recent complaint about the quality of meal services provided by a residential care home for the elderly. SWD staff had made a visit to the elderly home concerned, and found that the menus for the elderly residents were approved by a qualified dietitian, although

Action

there were some changes in the food items. During the visit, the elderly residents did not make any complaints to SWD staff about the quality of meal services. DSW said that the Administration would follow up on each and every complaint case according to the existing complaint handling mechanism.

33. Mrs Anson CHAN said that following the implementation of the LSG subvention system, the partnership between the Administration and the welfare sector and the quality of welfare services were deteriorating. While recognizing the underpinning philosophy of the LSG subvention system, Mrs CHAN expressed concern about the implementation problem. However, she disagreed with scrapping the entire LSG subvention system. Mrs CHAN urged the Administration to take immediate actions to address the problems while awaiting the outcome of the review of the LSG subvention system. For instance, detailed guidelines should be issued to NGO management on the deployment of resources.

34. DSW responded that the Administration had launched a series of interim facilitating measures to address the difficulties faced by NGOs in response to the welfare sector's requests. With the additional recurrent funding, NGOs would be in a better position to retain and employ suitable staff. DSW added that the Administration would continue to monitor the use of the LSG subvention by NGOs. It would also consider ways to facilitate more flexible deployment of resources by NGOs through streamlining the accounting and auditing requirements under the LSG subvention system.

35. Mr LEUNG Kwok-hung pointed out that the annual recurrent provisions to NGOs were capped under the LSG subvention system. Given the limited resources, NGOs on LSG were unable to enhance their services to meet the rising service demand and public expectation. Mr LEUNG raised doubt about the usefulness of conducting a review of the system. Instead, the Administration should introduce immediate remedial measures to address the difficulties faced by the subvented welfare sector.

36. SLW said that LSGIRC was established in response to the request from the welfare sector for an independent review of the LSG subvention system. The setting up of LSGIRC was also supported by the LSG Steering Committee. DSW reiterated that pending the outcome of the review, the Administration had already launched a series of interim facilitating measures and provided additional recurrent subvention to assist NGOs to cope with their financial difficulties.

37. The Chairman said that it would be difficult, if not impossible, for the Administration to monitor whether the NGO management had used the additional recurrent funding for adjusting the salaries of their staff, given that NGOs on LSG were free to formulate their own human resource policies.

Action

38. Mr Alan LEONG considered that the operation of the LSG subvention system relied largely on good corporate governance. However, the NGO operators were forced to become unscrupulous employers in order to attain financial viability. While welcoming the introduction of interim facilitating measures to address the financial problems faced by NGOs, Mr LEONG expressed concern on whether the NGO management would use the additional resources to make salary adjustments for their staff. With reference to the terms of reference, Mr LEONG asked whether LSGIRC could recommend aborting the LSG subvention system. He further sought information on the appointment criteria, work progress and action plan of LSGIRC.

39. SLW responded that LSGIRC comprised five non-official members of different professional background and who had profound knowledge of and experience in public services. They were appointed on a personal basis. The Committee Chairman was also the Chairman of SWAC. SLW said that to ensure impartiality of the review, no representative of the welfare sector was appointed. As regards the terms of reference of LSGIRC, SLW said that the Committee was tasked to assess the overall effectiveness of the system and identify areas and scope for improvement. The Administration would consider carefully its report.

40. Secy/LSGIRC added that an account of work undertaken by LSGIRC and its work plan were detailed in paragraphs 7 to 9 of the Administration's paper. He said that LSGIRC had received about 20 written submissions so far. In the coming months, LSGIRC would continue with its consultation work and study of the subject, and would make visits to NGOs to solicit views from the frontline staff and service users.

41. Recognizing the merits of the LSG subvention system, Mrs Sophie LEUNG considered that the Administration should improve, instead of abort the system. She appreciated that LSGIRC had made extensive consultation with the welfare sector on the subject. Mrs LEUNG said that good corporate governance of NGO management was crucial to the implementation of the system. According to her observations, the staff morale of some NGOs had improved after the NGO management concerned had enhanced their corporate governance. Mrs LEUNG agreed that paying visits to NGOs would enable LSGIRC to better understand the problem and to identify ways to strengthen corporate governance.

42. The following supplementary points were made by deputations –

- (a) Mr CHENG Ching-fat of the Community Care and Nursing Home Workers General Union reiterated that the quality of welfare services had deteriorated following the introduction of the LSG subvention system;

Action

- (b) Mr LIU Wai-ying of the Social Welfare Organizations Employees Union expressed concern that in order to save costs, the quality of meal services in residential care services for the elderly had been compromised as a result of rising food costs;
- (c) Miss TANG Yin-ping of the Staff Club of The Boys' and Girls' Clubs Association strongly urged the Administration to adjust upwards the baseline subvention allocation, and enhance monitoring of corporate governance;
- (d) Mr CHEUNG Chor-kin of the Staff Union of Mental Health Association of Hong Kong said that reference should be made to the system of school-based management in the education sector by requiring subvented NGOs to include staff representatives in the board of directors;
- (e) Mr YU Chi-ming of the Union of the Hong Kong Rehabilitation Agencies Workshop Instructor considered that the Administration should make clear to NGOs whether they could use the LSG Reserve to make salary adjustments to staff; and
- (f) Mr CHEUNG Kwok-che of the Hong Kong Social Workers' General Union said that in anticipation of the impending 2008-2009 Civil Service Pay Adjustment, the Administration should take concrete actions to ensure that the NGO management would make corresponding salary adjustment for their staff, including those on contract terms and those who had left the organizations before the announcement of the pay adjustment.

43. Responding to the deputations, SLW said that since the review of the LSG subvention system was still underway, in order not to pre-empt the findings of LSGIRC, he was unable to make any commitment at the meeting. With reference to the specific concerns raised, SLW said that the purpose of having a LSG Reserve was to allow individual NGOs to meet their commitment for making salary payments to the Snapshot Staff. As regards the proposal to encourage NGO management to enhance staff participation in the decision-making process, the Administration would convey the views to LSGIRC for consideration. SLW said that although the outcome of 2008-2009 Civil Service Pay Adjustment was not yet available, SWD would stress to the NGO management that they were encouraged to use the additional recurrent resources for the purpose of adjusting the pay of their staff.

44. In closing, the Chairman said that members and deputations expressed grave concern about the implementation of the LSG subvention system. He

Action

Clerk

said that the LegCo Secretariat had prepared a summary of views made by organizations/individuals on the implementation of the system, as set out in Appendix I to LC Paper No. CB(2)1875/07-08(04). The Chairman said that the summary of views and those made by deputations and members at the meeting would be forwarded to LSGIRC for consideration. The Chairman further said that the Panel would follow up the matter in the next session.

**V. Any other business**

45. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 1:00 pm.

Council Business Division 2  
Legislative Council Secretariat  
9 July 2008