

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 6

---

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 5 November 2008 at 11:00 am

---

### Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo  
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP  
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP  
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP  
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP  
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP  
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip  
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP  
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP  
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP  
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH  
The Hon LEE Wing-tat  
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP  
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP  
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC  
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung  
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP  
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS  
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC  
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung  
Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP  
The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH  
The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan  
The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king  
Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP  
The Hon CHAN Hak-kan  
The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Members absent:**

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP  
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

- No. 23 - Hong Kong Science and Technology Parks Corporation Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 29.10.2008)
- No. 24 - Hong Kong Productivity Council Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 29.10.2008)
- No. 25 - Report by the Trustee of the Customs and Excise Service Children's Education Trust Fund for the year ending 31 March 2008, together with the Director of Audit's Report and the Audited Statement of Accounts (published on 30.10.2008)

### **Questions**

1. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

2. Hon Frederick FUNG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

3. Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

5. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 19 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### First Reading

Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2008

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

Public Health and Municipal Services (Amendment) Bill 2008

The Secretary for Food and Health moved the Second Reading and addressed the Council.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## **Motions**

### Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

The Secretary for Food and Health moved the following motion and addressed the Council.

Resolved that the Food Business (Amendment) Regulation 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 185 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 2 July 2008, be amended by adding -

**"6. No live poultry at retail premises overnight**

(1) Section 30AA is amended by adding -

"(1A) If a black rainstorm warning or a gale warning is in force at any time between noon and 8:00 p.m. on a day, a permittee is exempt from compliance with subsection (1)(a) on that day and from compliance with subsection (1)(b) between 8:00 p.m. that day and 5:00 a.m. the next day."

(2) Section 30AA(3) is amended by adding -

"black rainstorm warning" (黑色暴雨警告) has the meaning given to it by section 71(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1);

"gale warning" (烈風警告) has the meaning given to it by section 71(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1);".

Question on the motion proposed.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Members' Motions**

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Mrs Regina IP moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Employees Retraining Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) Notice 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 208 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 8 October 2008, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 26 November 2008.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Old age allowance and universal retirement protection system

Hon Fred LI moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council reiterates that the Government should immediately increase the rates of the Old Age Allowance to not less than \$1,000 per month and fully adhere to the original intention of showing respect for the elderly, and should not introduce any new means test mechanism under the Old Age Allowance Scheme; at the same time, this Council urges the Government to commence studying the establishment of a universal retirement protection system to enable all elderly people to have comprehensive retirement protection and enjoy a dignified and comfortable life in their twilight years.

While Hon Fred LI was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:45 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Fred LI's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon TAM Yiu-chung, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Ten Members and Hon Ronny TONG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:48 pm, while Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Ten other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Fred LI spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion:

To delete "reiterates that the Government should immediately increase the rates of the Old Age Allowance to not less than \$1,000 per month and fully adhere to the original intention of showing respect for the elderly, and should not introduce any new means test mechanism under the Old Age Allowance Scheme" after "That this Council" and substitute with "welcomes the Chief Executive's announcement that the rates of the Old Age Allowance will be increased to \$1,000 per month and the Government will study whether the permissible limit of absence from Hong Kong under the Old Age Allowance Scheme can be relaxed"; to delete "commence" after "urges the Government to" and substitute with "comprehensively examine the existing welfare policy for the elderly to ensure that elderly people who have financial difficulties and are not on the Comprehensive Social Security Assistance can also receive certain form of living supplement, and when"; and to delete "to" after "universal retirement protection system" and substitute with ", the Government must ensure that the system will not increase the burden on the next generation and will".

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon WONG Sing-chi to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following further amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; regarding the Chief Executive increasing the rates of the Old Age Allowance to \$1,000 per month, this Council welcomes his acceptance of this Council's view, and also welcomes his withdrawal of the proposal of introducing a means test mechanism under the Old Age Allowance Scheme after listening to the opposing voices of this Council and the public" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Tommy CHEUNG's and Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon TAM Yiu-chung to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following further amendment to Hon Fred LI's motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon WONG Sing-chi, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; in addition, this Council urges the Government to consider implementing an ‘elderly maintenance grant scheme’ in addition to the existing Old Age Allowance and Comprehensive Social Security Assistance system, so that those elderly people who are aged 60 will receive a monthly living supplement from the Government after making a simple asset declaration; further relax the permissible limit of absence from Hong Kong for Old Age Allowance applicants; and increase the value of elderly health care vouchers to \$1,000 and lower the eligibility age for such vouchers to 65” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung’s amendment to Hon Fred LI’s motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Fred LI replied.

Question on Hon Fred LI’s motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon TAM Yiu-chung put and agreed to.

Preventing the lower and middle classes from being trapped in hardship amid the financial tsunami

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the free economy system of Hong Kong has caused the local economy to fluctuate with the external environment, the governance philosophy of a free market economy upheld by the Government also allows the disparity between the rich and the poor to persist for years in Hong Kong; the lower and middle classes are not able to benefit when the economy is growing and cannot save money or capital to fight against adversity, and the social security system is not comprehensive; as a result of the financial tsunami, the Hong Kong economy is now about to enter into recession and many people in the lower and middle classes may fall into hardship, which has become a major challenge to the Government’s governance; while the Government has undertaken to fully support the financial and banking industries and take measures to support the small and medium enterprises, it should at the same time pay more attention to the impact of the financial tsunami on the lower and middle classes; this Council urges the Government to adopt various measures to protect the lower and middle classes from being trapped in hardship, including:

- (a) setting up a special committee chaired by the Chief Secretary for Administration to constantly monitor and assess the impact on the lower and middle classes when the Hong Kong economy is in times of financial crisis and to put forward corresponding measures;
- (b) focusing on the over-reliance of the local economy on the financial and real estate sectors, developing eco-tourism and recycling industries etc, so as to create low-skilled jobs, and reduce the impact of the global financial conditions on the economy system of Hong Kong and its labour market;
- (c) expeditiously implementing the 10 major infrastructure projects undertaken in the Policy Address of last year, accelerating the construction of infrastructures such as public housing estates and hospitals, expediting the redevelopment of old urban areas, repair and renovation of old buildings, inspection of buildings and removal of unauthorized building works, so as to expeditiously create employment opportunities to counteract the impact of the financial tsunami on the employment rate;
- (d) promoting the development of social enterprises, assisting the disadvantaged in making effective use of social capital and creating employment opportunities through the improvement of legislation, funding allocation, training and education, and administrative support, etc, so as to alleviate the difficulties of the disadvantaged in seeking employment in times of economic recession; and
- (e) strengthening the support to low-income families, including assisting the unemployed recipients of Comprehensive Social Security Assistance in securing employment, creating temporary jobs in various sectors of social services, expanding the 'Transport Support Scheme' and extending the duration of subsidy, as well as expeditiously enhancing the food bank services, etc, so as to make up for the inadequacies of the social security and employment protection systems.

Question on Hon Albert HO's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon CHAN Kam-lam would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon Ronny TONG would move an amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG, Hon CHAN Kam-lam and Hon Ronny TONG, who would move the amendments, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Twelve Members and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:20 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two other Members and Hon IP Wai-ming spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:44 pm, while Hon IP Wai-ming was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Nine more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert HO spoke on the amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke again.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion:

To delete "as the free economy system of Hong Kong has" after "That," and substitute with "under economic globalization, Hong Kong's position as an important global financial centre and its free and open economy system have"; to add "more easily" after "fluctuate"; to add ", including introducing further relief measures such as reducing rates, Government rent and salaries tax" after "corresponding measures"; to add "the Task Force on Economic Challenges having to strive to explore specific measures to revitalize the local economy and, in particular," after "(b)"; to add "identifying corresponding strategies and promoting more comprehensive development of the economy, including" after "real estate sectors,"; to delete "and" after "developing eco-tourism" and substitute with ", taking the initiative to bid for the hosting of international activities, polishing the brands of Hong Kong as a 'culinary capital' and an 'events capital', providing more logistics back-up sites and facilities to strengthen the status of Hong Kong as a logistics centre and to support"; to add "and expediting the implementation and commencement of the outstanding projects of the ex-Municipal Councils," after "building works,"; to delete "and" after "economic recession"; and to add "; and (g) assisting as far as possible the families in the lower and middle classes in reducing expenses and lessening their burden, urging the power companies to expeditiously adjust the fuel clause surcharge and basic tariff downwards, and taking effective measures to alleviate the impact of high oil prices on various trades and industries and the public" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion proposed.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment:

To delete "reducing" after "measures such as" and substitute with "waiving"; to delete "," after "rates" and substitute with "and"; to add "(capped at \$5,000 per quarter) for a year," after "Government rent"; to add "holding over provisional" before "salaries tax"; to add "and profits tax" before "; (b)"; to add "local public works and" after "commencement of"; and to add ", including introducing competition," after "effective measures".

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment proposed and put.

Hon Ronny TONG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 14 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, two against it and 13 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Preventing the lower and middle classes from being trapped in hardship amid the financial tsunami" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion put.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 14 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and seven abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

As Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Kam-lam to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam moved the following further amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add "; (h) actively supporting and assisting small and medium enterprises, including formulating preferential policies for trades and industries, and offering concessions to those trades and industries which are conducive to the restructuring of Hong Kong's economy and increasing of employment opportunities; studying splitting major government projects to enable more small and medium enterprises to undertake such projects; promoting the development of new points of growth in the economy, including creative industries and healthcare service industries; fostering at a faster pace cooperation in cross-boundary travels; making effective use of the land in border areas to turn Hong Kong into an all-year-round capital of exhibitions and sales; deepening the Mainland and Hong Kong Closer Economic Partnership Arrangement and expeditiously discussing with the Guangdong Provincial Government more cooperation plans, so as to create low-skilled jobs; and (i) revitalizing the community economy, utilizing vacant land in remote areas, such as Tin Shui Wai and Tung Chung, to develop commercial projects which can increase employment opportunities" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Kam-lam's amendment to Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon Albert HO's motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG and Hon CHAN Kam-lam put and agreed to.

**Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 12 November 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 9:25 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)

President

7 January 2009

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 05/11/2008  
時間 TIME: 09:18:43 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員就張宇人議員對何俊仁議員的「避免中下階層市民因金融海嘯影響而陷於困境」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON RONNY TONG'S AMENDMENT TO HON TOMMY CHEUNG'S AMENDMENT TO HON ALBERT HO'S MOTION ON "PREVENTING THE LOWER AND MIDDLE CLASSES FROM BEING TRAPPED IN HARDSHIP AMID THE FINANCIAL TSUNAMI"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	14	23	
投票 Vote	14	22	
贊成 Yes	7	7	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	7	13	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	棄權 ABSTAIN	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇毅 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩琛 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 05/11/2008  
時間 TIME: 09:22:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張宇人議員對何俊仁議員的「避免中下階層市民因金融海嘯影響而陷於困境」議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON TOMMY CHEUNG TO HON ALBERT HO'S MOTION ON "PREVENTING THE LOWER AND MIDDLE CLASSES FROM BEING TRAPPED IN HARDSHIP AMID THE FINANCIAL TSUNAMI"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	14	22	
投票 Vote	14	21	
贊成 Yes	10	12	
反對 No	0	2	
棄權 Abstain	4	7	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		徐耀申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tai	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	CHAN Tanya	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩琿 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	