

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 8

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 19 November 2008 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP
The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP
The Hon CHAN Hak-kan
The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP
The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP
The Hon Tanya CHAN
Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun
Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau
The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che
The Hon WONG Sing-chi
The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS
The Hon WONG Yuk-man
The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH
The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP
Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou
The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun
Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following paper was laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

- No. 28 - The Government Minute in response to the 20th Annual Report of The Ombudsman 2008 (published on 17.11.2008)

Addresses

The Chief Secretary for Administration addressed the Council on the Government Minute in response to the 20th Annual Report of The Ombudsman 2008.

Questions

1. Hon LI Fung-ying asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Before inviting Members to ask supplementary questions, the President reminded Members that at the last meeting, the Council had passed a resolution to authorize, under the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance, a subcommittee to exercise the powers conferred by the Ordinance for the purpose of studying issues arising from Lehman Brothers-related minibonds and structured financial products. In accordance with the Rule 25(3)(c) of the Rules of Procedure, the contents of supplementary questions should not be substantially the same as that of any subject matter of the issues which would be considered by the subcommittee.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

2. Hon Alan LEONG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Nine Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

3. Dr Hon Joseph LEE asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

4. Hon James TO asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

5. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 6 to 19 were tabled for Members' information.

Members' Motions

Comprehensively improving the public dental out-patient services and the dental care scheme

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Government on the one hand promotes oral care among the entire population, but on the other hand the public dental out-patient services and dental care services in Hong Kong are seriously inadequate, resulting in the grassroots who cannot afford the charges of private dental clinics not being able to receive timely dental treatment even when they have dental diseases, and at the same time, the present dental care scheme remains to be available to primary schools only, this Council urges the Government to provide additional resources to improve oral care for the entire population, the public dental out-patient services and the dental care scheme, including:

- (a) providing public dental out-patient services to members of the public at the medical and health organizations run by the Government in various districts;
- (b) public dental out-patient services must include comprehensive dental treatment, such as dental examination, scaling, extraction, filling, endodontic treatment and crowning, etc;

- (c) setting up a dental care scheme for secondary school students;
- (d) setting up a dental care scheme for the poor elderly aged over 60; and
- (e) drawing up an implementation timetable and a detailed plan to comprehensively improve the public dental out-patient services and the dental care scheme.

While Hon WONG Kwok-hing was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:03 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew CHENG and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Five Members and Hon CHAN Hak-kan spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:10 pm, while Hon CHAN Hak-kan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Ten other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion:

To delete “, as” after “That” and substitute with “oral health is an important factor affecting people's health and quality of life, yet many people are not able to receive proper treatment when they have oral health problems;”; to add “, and providing out-reaching dental services for the elderly living in residential care homes” after “crowning, etc”; to delete “and” after “60;”; to add “studying the provision of small dental clinics in elderly health centres; and (f) reviewing the policy and goals in respect of oral health, and” after “(e)”; and to add “; as it takes time to improve public dental out-patient services, the Government should first set up a fund to subsidize the people in need to use the dental services of private or non-profit-making organizations” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG had indicated that she would withdraw her amendment to Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion if Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment was passed. Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG had therefore withdrawn her amendment.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG's put and agreed to.

Concern about the cross harbour tunnels failing to divert traffic flows effectively and their high tolls

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as presently the Eastern Harbour Crossing (EHC) and Western Harbour Crossing (WHC) have failed to achieve the function of diverting cross-harbour traffic flows effectively, and their tolls are on the high side, imposing a heavy burden on vehicle owners and the general public, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) discuss with the management of EHC and WHC for the provision of more toll concessions, such as offering lower tolls during non-peak hours and half tolls for commercial vehicles which do not carry passengers or goods;
- (b) actively discuss with the two tunnel companies and various bus companies to make more room for reduction in cross-harbour bus fares through the offer of toll concessions by the two tunnel companies to the bus companies, thereby bringing down cross-harbour bus fares;
- (c) actively study the buying out of EHC and WHC or the extension of their franchises, so as to lower the tolls of these two tunnels to reasonable levels; and
- (d) improve the connecting road networks for EHC and WHC, including expeditiously constructing the Central-Wan Chai Bypass,

so as to attract more vehicle owners and members of the public to use EHC and WHC, and improve the current traffic congestion at the Cross Harbour Tunnel in Hung Hom, with a view to achieving the objectives of reasonable distribution of traffic among the three tunnels and alleviating the burden of travelling expenses on vehicle owners and the general public.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Ronny TONG and Hon Andrew CHENG, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Seventeen Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion:

To add "the tolls of" after "That, as presently"; to add "are on the high side, they" after "Western Harbour Crossing (WHC)"; to delete "and their tolls are on the high side," after "traffic flows effectively,"; to add "while at the same time incurring heavy economic and social costs; as such" after "a heavy burden on vehicle owners and the general public"; and to delete "the extension of their franchises, so as to lower the tolls of these two tunnels" after "WHC or" and substitute with "the option of 'joint operation of the three tunnels', so as to adjust the tolls and traffic flows of the three tunnels".

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, four against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Andrew CHENG moved the following amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion:

To delete "actively study the buying out of EHC and WHC or the extension of their franchises, so as to" after "(c)"; to delete "these two tunnels" after "lower the tolls of" and substitute with "EHC and WHC"; to add "by way of buying out, 'offering shares in exchange for the tunnel ownership' or extending the franchises of these two tunnels" after "reasonable levels"; and to add ", improving air pollution" after "the three tunnels".

Question on Hon Andrew CHENG's amendment to Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan replied.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's motion as amended by Hon Andrew CHENG put.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion as amended and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion as amended, four against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion as amended was passed.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 26 November 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 6:20 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
2 February 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 19/11/2008
 時間 TIME: 06:08:48 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 湯家驊議員對陳克勤議員的「關注過海隧道未能有效分流及收費偏高問題」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON RONNY TONG TO HON CHAN HAK-KAN'S MOTION ON "CONCERN ABOUT THE CROSS HARBOUR TUNNELS FAILING TO DIVERT TRAFFIC FLOWS EFFECTIVELY AND THEIR HIGH TOLLS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 湯家驊 Ronny TONG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	26	
投票 Vote	21	25	
贊成 Yes	9	14	
反對 No	4	5	
棄權 Abstain	8	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 19/11/2008
 時間 TIME: 06:13:20 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 鄭家富議員對陳克勤議員的「關注過海隧道未能有效分流及收費偏高問題」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ANDREW CHENG TO HON CHAN HAK-KAN'S MOTION ON "CONCERN ABOUT THE CROSS HARBOUR TUNNELS FAILING TO DIVERT TRAFFIC FLOWS EFFECTIVELY AND THEIR HIGH TOLLS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 鄭家富 Andrew CHENG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	26	
投票 Vote	21	25	
贊成 Yes	18	15	
反對 No	0	4	
棄權 Abstain	3	6	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 19/11/2008
 時間 TIME: 06:19:09 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由陳克勤議員動議，經湯家驊議員／鄭家富議員修正的「關注過海隧道未能有效分流及收費偏高問題」議案
 MOTION MOVED BY HON CHAN HAK-KAN ON "CONCERN ABOUT THE CROSS HARBOUR TUNNELS FAILING TO DIVERT TRAFFIC FLOWS EFFECTIVELY AND THEIR HIGH TOLLS" AS AMENDED BY ~~HON RONNY TONG~~ / HON ANDREW CHENG

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳克勤CHAN Hak-kan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	26	
投票 Vote	21	25	
贊成 Yes	20	16	
反對 No	0	4	
棄權 Abstain	1	5	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	徐謙申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	