

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 10

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 3 December 2008 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP
The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo
The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP
The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP
The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP
The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP
The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip
The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP
The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP
The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
The Hon LEE Wing-tat
Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP
The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP
The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP
The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP
The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS
The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC
The Hon CHIM Pui-chung
Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP
The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH
The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king
Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Member absent:

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Electronic Transactions Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) Order 2008 (gazetted on 28.11.2008)	249/2008
2. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 4) Notice 2008 (gazetted on 28.11.2008)	250/2008
3. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) (Amendment) Regulation 2006 (Commencement) Notice 2008 (gazetted on 28.11.2008)	251/2008
4. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2006 (Amendment) Order 2007 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 28.11.2008)	252/2008

Other Papers

No. 32 - Audited Financial Statements of the Customs and Excise Service Welfare Fund for the year ended 31 March 2008 and its Summary, together with the Director of Audit's Report (published on 27.11.2008)

No. 33 - Ocean Park Corporation Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 3.12.2008)

Addresses

Prof Hon Patrick LAU, a Board Member of the Ocean Park Corporation, addressed the Council on the Ocean Park Corporation Annual Report 2007-2008.

Questions

1. Hon CHAN Kam-lam asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

2. Hon Audrey EU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

3. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

4. Hon Emily LAU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

The President called upon Hon WONG Yuk-man to ask a supplementary question. Instead of doing so, Hon WONG Yuk-man kept on making arguments despite the President's repeated warnings. The President ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man to take his seat. Hon WONG Yuk-man then asked a supplementary question which was ruled out of order by the President.

Two other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

5. Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon Paul TSE asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development and the Secretary for Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Criminal Procedure Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Criminal Procedure (Witnesses' Allowances) (Amendment) Rules 2008, made by the Criminal Procedure Rules Committee on 27 October 2008, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Coroners Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Coroners (Witnesses' Allowances) (Amendment) Rules 2008, made by the Chief Justice on 22 October 2008, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor and assisting the grassroots in facing up to economic adversities

Hon Frederick FUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the growth in Gross Domestic Product for the third quarter has slackened to 1.7%, the effects of the financial tsunami have gradually surfaced, the risk of the economy entering into recession has substantially increased, layoffs and pay cuts take place one after another, the unemployment rate has rebounded but there is no notable downward adjustment in the prices of goods, causing people's livelihood to become more difficult; moreover, a latest report of the United Nations points out that Hong Kong ranks first among all Asian cities in the disparity between the rich and the poor, with the Gini Coefficient which reflects the inequality of income distribution rising to a record high of 0.533, indicating that the disparity between the rich and the poor is increasingly serious, this Council therefore urges the Government to re-establish the Commission on Poverty to explore and recommend focused measures to assist the grassroots in facing up to economic adversities and to formulate comprehensive and long-term policies to effectively allocate community resources and narrow the gap between the rich and the poor, thereby protecting the basic livelihood of the grassroots and promoting harmonious social development.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:08 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung, Hon WONG Sing-chi, Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG and Hon LI Fung-ying, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:00 pm, while the Secretary was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Twenty Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion:

To delete “, as the growth in Gross Domestic Product for the third quarter has slackened to 1.7%,” after “That”; to add “on the world” after “the effects of the financial tsunami”; to add “Hong Kong's” after “the risk of”; to delete “but there is no notable downward adjustment in the prices of goods” after “the unemployment rate has rebounded”; to delete “Hong Kong ranks first among all Asian cities in the disparity between the rich and the poor, with” after “a latest report of the United Nations points out that”; to delete “which reflects the inequality of income distribution rising” after “the Gini Coefficient” and substitute with “of Hong Kong has risen”; to add “take proactive actions to fully implement the recommendations in the Report of the Commission on Poverty released by the Financial Secretary on 14 June 2007, and when necessary,” after “this Council therefore urges the Government to”; and to add “further” after “re-establish the Commission on Poverty to”.

Question on Hon TAM Yiu-chung's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon Frederick FUNG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment, three against it and one abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 13 were in favour of the amendment and 14 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Alleviating the disparity between the rich and the poor and assisting the grassroots in facing up to economic adversities” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG’s motion:

To delete “as the” after “That,” and substitute with “being struck by the financial tsunami, Hong Kong’s”; and to delete “re-establish” after “this Council therefore urges the Government to” and substitute with “adopt the following measures to alleviate the problem of disparity between the rich and the poor: (a) the Government should create new positions at the middle and low ranking levels to absorb those groups which have a more serious employment problem, such as young people and middle-aged low-skilled workers, etc; (b) expanding the Transport Support Scheme to cover the 18 districts in the territory to benefit people with low income and job-seekers; (c) encouraging Comprehensive Social Security Assistance (CSSA) recipients to increase their income through employment, and assisting low-income or unemployed CSSA recipients who are employable to engage in employment and upgrade their skills in order to help them leave the CSSA net; (d) allocating funds to set up district poverty funds, and formulating focused proposals to alleviate poverty having regard to the poverty situation in various districts; and (e) expeditiously implementing all the recommendations in the Report of the Commission on Poverty, and re-establishing”.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG to revise the terms of her amendment.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG moved the following further amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi:

To add “; (f) focusing on the persistently high food prices, the Government should expeditiously implement short-term food assistance projects and study the further extension of their scope of implementation; and (g) taking into account the fact that the unemployed population in Hong Kong may increase substantially, the Government should take precautionary measures to organize more training courses in collaboration with local tertiary institutions or training bodies and subsidize the unemployed to pursue continuing education to help them add value to and transform themselves, so as to soothe their emotions and restore their confidence in the future” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon WONG Sing-chi's and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon LI Fung-ying to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon LI Fung-ying moved the following further amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG:

To add “; (h) establishing an unemployment loan fund to assist those employees who have been laid off; and (i) suspending the collection of provisional tax” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LI Fung-ying's amendment to Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG proposed and put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, two against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and 11 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Frederick FUNG replied.

Question on Hon Frederick FUNG's motion as amended by Hon WONG Sing-chi and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG put and agreed to.

Formulating new policies on public and public housing estate markets

Hon Tommy CHEUNG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, as the Administration's approach in planning and managing public and public housing estate markets is very outdated, hence all along it is unable to boost customer flows effectively, and has even resulted in serious vacancy situation in some public and public housing estate markets, this Council urges the Administration to immediately formulate policies on public and public housing estate markets which meet the needs of a modern society, and particularly in view of the recent economic downturn and the worsening trend of the unemployment rate, it is necessary for the Administration to expeditiously enhance the competitiveness of public and public housing estate markets, and assist small traders in these markets in countering monopolization by supermarkets, so as to benefit the grassroots; the measures include:

- (a) actively allocating resources to improve the business environment of markets, such as installing additional air-conditioning systems and escalators, thereby boosting customer flows to bring about long-term return;
- (b) analyzing in depth, from a market perspective, the needs of the districts to which the markets belong, and planning afresh the sizes, types of commodities sold, layout of stalls and ancillary measures of individual markets;
- (c) adopting proactive letting policies, such as offering short-term rent concessions to improve the situation of low occupancy and striving to assist traders in the markets in introducing new types of commodities or services, so as to inject new elements into the markets and bring into play their characteristics of trade mix; and
- (d) appropriately relaxing the tenancy conditions of market stalls so as to facilitate business operations as far as possible and enable traders to provide unique value-added services, thereby enhancing the attractiveness of the markets.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Yung-kan, Hon Alan LEONG and Hon WONG Kwok-hing, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Twelve Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Hon Fred LI moved the following amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion:

To delete “, as” after “That” and substitute with “public markets perform the major function of supplying daily necessities to the public, yet”; to add “prior to the building of new public markets in the future, having to take into account the factor of whether the lack of public markets in the districts concerned may lead to monopolization by supermarkets; (b)” after “(a)”; to delete “thereby” after “escalators,” and substitute with “improving the drainage design, etc, thereby facilitating the business operation of stall tenants and”; to delete the original “(b)” and substitute with “(c)”; to delete “,” after “the sizes” and substitute with “of individual markets and installs, and”; to delete the original “(c)” and substitute with “(d)”; and to delete the original “(d)” and substitute with “(e)”.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Fred LI's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon WONG Yung-kan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following further amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI:

To add “; and (f) during times of economic downturn, reducing the rents of public and public housing estate markets by half for a period of one year, so as to relieve the operating difficulties of small traders” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion if Hon WONG Yung-kan's amendment was passed. Hon WONG Kwok-hing had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon Fred LI's and Hon WONG Yung-kan's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Alan LEONG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following further amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI and Hon WONG Yung-kan, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; (g) according priority to small shop operators who are affected by the rent increases of The Link Management Limited and are unable to continue their business to rent public and public housing estate markets at concessionary rent; and (h) developing public and public housing estate markets into markets for organic agricultural produce, thereby providing room for the marketing of organic farm products” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's amendment to Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI and Hon WONG Yung-kan proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Tommy CHEUNG replied.

Question on Hon Tommy CHEUNG's motion as amended by Hon Fred LI, Hon WONG Yung-kan and Hon Alan LEONG put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 December 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:35 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
3 February 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
日期 DATE: 03/12/2008
時間 TIME: 04:45:43 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 譚耀宗議員對馮檢基議員的「紓緩貧富懸殊、協助基層市民面對經濟逆境」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON TAM YIU-CHUNG TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH AND THE POOR AND ASSISTING THE GRASSROOTS IN FACING UP TO ECONOMIC ADVERSITIES"

動議人 MOVED BY: 譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	28	
投票 Vote	23	27	
贊成 Yes	19	13	
反對 No	3	14	
棄權 Abstain	1	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璿 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

W. S. Chan

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 03/12/2008
時間 TIME: 04:53:53 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 李鳳英議員對馮檢基議員就「紓緩貧富懸殊、協助基層市民面對經濟逆境」所提，經譚耀宗議員及黃成智議員及梁美芬議員修正的議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON LI FUNG-YING TO HON FREDERICK FUNG'S MOTION ON "ALLEVIATING THE DISPARITY BETWEEN THE RICH & THE POOR & ASSISTING THE GRASSROOTS IN FACING UP TO ECONOMIC ADVERSITIES" AS AMENDED BY HON TAM YIU-CHUNG & HON WONG SING-CHI & DR HON P LEUNG

動議人 MOVED BY: 李鳳英 Li Fung-ying

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	28	
投票 Vote	23	27	
贊成 Yes	15	12	
反對 No	2	4	
棄權 Abstain	6	11	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	CHAN Tanya	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK