

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 11

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 10 December 2008 at 11:00 am  
and Thursday 11 December 2008 at 9:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP (absent on 11.12.2008)

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP (absent on 11.12.2008)

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yea, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung (absent on 11.12.2008)

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

(absent on 11.12.2008)

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

(absent on 11.12.2008)

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

(absent on 11.12.2008)

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Member absent:**

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

On 10.12.2008 and 11.12.2008

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP  
Secretary for Development

On 10.12.2008

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

On 11.12.2008

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Education

**Clerks in attendance:**

On 10.12.2008

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

On 11.12.2008

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

On 10.12.2008 and 11.12.2008

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Import and Export (Strategic Commodities) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule 1) Order 2008 (gazetted on 5.12.2008)	254/2008
2. Road Traffic (Breath Analysing Instruments and Screening Devices) (Amendment) Notice 2008 (gazetted on 5.12.2008)	255/2008
3. Road Traffic Legislation (Amendment) Ordinance 2008 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 5.12.2008)	256/2008

### Other Papers

- No. 34 - Police Welfare Fund Annual Report 2007/2008 (published on 5.12.2008)
- No. 35 - Annual Report on the Police Children's Education Trust and the Police Education and Welfare Trust 2007/2008 (published on 5.12.2008)
- No. 36 - Hong Kong Tourism Board 2007/08 Annual Report (published on 8.12.2008)
- No. 37 - Director of Social Welfare Incorporated Financial statements for the year ended 31 March 2008 (published on 8.12.2008)
- No. 38 - Emergency Relief Fund Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending 31 March 2008 (published on 8.12.2008)
- No. 39 - Social Work Training Fund Forty-seventh Annual Report by the Trustee for the year ending on 31 March 2008 (published on 8.12.2008)

Report of Subcommittee on Technical Memorandum for Allocation of Emission Allowances in Respect of Specified Licences (published on 9.12.2008)

## **Addresses**

Hon Audrey EU, Chairman of the Subcommittee on Technical Memorandum for Allocation of Emission Allowances in Respect of Specified Licences, addressed the Council on the Subcommittee's report.

## **Questions**

1. Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

2. Dr Hon David LI asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon Starry LEE asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Nine Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare and the Secretary for Development replied.

4. Hon IP Wai-ming asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

5. Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

6. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Motions**

#### Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Mrs Regina IP moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the Employees Retraining Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) (No. 2) Notice 2008, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 244 of 2008 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 12 November 2008, be amended by repealing section 2 and substituting –

**“2. Amount of levy specified for the purposes of section 14(2)**

Schedule 3 to the Employees Retraining Ordinance (Cap. 423) is amended by repealing “\$0” and substituting –

“\$0 (in respect of each imported employee to be employed by an employer under the “Scheme for Importation of Foreign Domestic Helpers” approved by the Chief Executive in Council on 25 February 2003 under section 14(3) of the Ordinance)

\$400 (in respect of each imported employee to be employed by an employer under any other labour importation scheme approved by the Chief Executive in Council under section 14(3) of the Ordinance)”.’.

Question on the motion proposed.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion. While he was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:13 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan declared that The Hong Kong Confederation of Trade Unions was an employees retraining body, but it did not receive any funding from the Government. He then spoke on the motion.

At 2:19 pm, while Hon LEE Cheuk-yan was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Seven other Members and Hon IP Wai-ming spoke on the motion.

Hon IP Wai-ming declared that The Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions was one of the 57 employees retraining bodies.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that he had employed a foreign domestic helper and spoke on the motion.

Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the motion and declared that the Hong Kong Association for Democracy and People's Livelihood also ran a retraining centre.

One more Member and Hon Emily LAU spoke on the motion.

Hon Emily LAU declared that she could not apply for funding under the Employees Retraining Fund and did not employ any foreign domestic helper.

Another Member spoke on the motion.

Hon Ronny TONG said that Members who had employed foreign domestic helpers should declare the interest.

The President said that in accordance with Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure, if a Member spoke on a matter in which he had a direct or indirect pecuniary interest, he had to disclose the nature of that interest. Since the subject of the motion was about the imposition of a levy on the employers of foreign domestic helpers, Members who had employed foreign domestic helpers would have a direct or indirect pecuniary interest. According to Rule 83A, they should disclose the nature of that interest when they spoke on the motion.

Hon Ronny TONG declared that he had employed a foreign domestic helper.

Hon CHIM Pui-chung declared that his wife had employed a foreign domestic helper. The foreign domestic helper was paid by his wife and the employment contract was also signed by his wife. He then spoke on the motion.

Hon Paul TSE spoke on the motion and declared that he had employed a foreign domestic helper.

One more Member spoke on the motion.

Hon Miriam LAU declared that she had employed a foreign domestic helper.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin declared that the Hong Kong Federation of Trade Unions was one of the 57 employees retraining bodies. He also declared that he did not employ any foreign domestic helper, but he had employed a local domestic helper.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon Mrs Regina IP declared that she had employed a foreign domestic helper and replied.

The President stated that Rule 83A of the Rules of Procedure stipulated that if a Member spoke on a matter in which he had a direct or indirect pecuniary interest, he had to disclose the nature of that interest. He would not stop any Member who had a pecuniary interest on the matter from speaking, but the Member should disclose the nature of that interest in his speech and should be responsible for the consequences of not disclosing such interest. Since he had already allowed two Members to disclose the nature of their interest after they had delivered their speeches, and another Member had also requested that he be allowed to do so, in order to be fair to all Members, he would now allow Members who had already spoken on the motion to declare their interest.

Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai declared that he had employed a domestic helper.

Hon Abraham SHEK raised a point of order on whether Members who had not spoken should also disclose their interest because they would vote on the motion later. The President said that he would deal with the matter later.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that, apart from employing a foreign domestic helper, he was a Member of the Council of Caritas - Hong Kong and the Chairman of the Friends of Caritas.

Hon CHAN Kin-por declared that he had employed a foreign domestic helper.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung declared that he did not employ any foreign domestic helper, but his organization conducted employees retraining courses and received subsidies from the Employees Retraining Fund.

Hon Frederick FUNG declared that his wife had employed a foreign domestic helper.

Hon LI Fung-ying declared that The Federation of Hong Kong and Kowloon Labour Unions was one of the 57 employees retraining bodies of the Employees Retraining Board.

The President said that Rule 84(1) and (1A) of the Rules of Procedure stipulated that a Member should not vote upon any question in which he had a direct pecuniary interest and should withdraw when a vote was taken on the question. However, the same provisions also stipulated that where the Member's interest was in common with the rest of the population of Hong Kong or a sector thereof or his vote was given on a matter of Government policy, the Member did not need to withdraw and could vote on the question. The President added that in respect of the question to be voted upon, the interest declared earlier had fulfilled the conditions mentioned in Rule 84(1) and (1A). He therefore did not consider that any Member had to withdraw and be disallowed to vote.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou declared that he was the Vice Chairman of the Executive Committee of The Mental Health Association of Hong Kong and a permanent member of the New Life Psychiatric Rehabilitation Association, and these two associations received funding from the Employees Retraining Board.

Question on the motion put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

While the division bell was ringing, Dr Hon LAM Tai-fai declared that he was the Chairman of the Clothing Industry Training Authority.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 28 were present, seven were in favour of the motion and 21 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 21 were in favour of the motion and seven against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

#### Appointment of a select committee

Hon LI Fung-ying moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council appoints a select committee to inquire into the vetting and approval for Mr LEUNG Chin-man, former Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Housing) and Director of Housing, to take up post-service work with New World China Land Limited and other real estate organizations, and whether there was any connection between such work and the major housing or land policies which Mr LEUNG had taken part in their formulation or execution and decisions which he had made pursuant to such policies while serving as Director of Buildings, Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Housing) and Director of Housing, that had given rise to any potential or actual conflict of interest, as well as related matters, and based on the results of the above inquiry, to make recommendations on the policies and arrangements governing post-service work of directorate civil servants and other related matters; and that in the performance of its duties the committee be authorized under section 9(2) of the Legislative Council (Powers and Privileges) Ordinance (Cap. 382) to exercise the powers conferred by section 9(1) of that Ordinance.

Question on Hon LI Fung-ying's motion proposed.

The Secretary for the Civil Service spoke on the motion.

Two Members and Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong spoke on the motion.

While Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Two other Members and Hon Tanya CHAN spoke on the motion.

At 7:10 pm, while Hon Tanya CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three more Members and Hon Paul CHAN spoke on the motion.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that he was a member of the Committee on Review of Post-service Outside Work for Directorate Civil Servants.

Six other Members spoke on the motion.

Hon LI Fung-ying replied.

Question on Hon LI Fung-ying's motion put and agreed to.

As Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO, the Member who was to move the next Member's motion, was not in the Chamber, the President suspended the meeting at 8:43 pm.

The Council resumed at 8:45 pm.

Promoting infrastructure development

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That the international financial tsunami is sweeping across the world, striking the economies of various places including Hong Kong and the situation is very acute, this Council urges the Government to promote infrastructure development with every effort at this critical moment so as to stabilize the economy, increase employment opportunities, enhance the overall competitiveness of Hong Kong and attain sustainable development; to achieve the above objectives, the Government should expeditiously adopt the following measures:

- (a) expeditiously implementing the 10 major infrastructure projects;
- (b) formulating forward-looking plans as early as possible, and planning future works projects following the 10 major infrastructure projects;
- (c) enhancing cooperation between Hong Kong and the Mainland in planning and commencing cross-border infrastructure projects which are beneficial to both places;
- (d) implementing public participation and ensuring the smooth implementation of infrastructure projects to achieve sustainable development for Hong Kong;
- (e) enhancing coordination among departments to expedite the approval of contracts for small and medium works projects;
- (f) commencing more public works projects through public-private partnership;
- (g) ensuring a stable amount of work through detailed planning, so as to prevent a cyclical imbalance between the supply and demand in the manpower market; and
- (h) strengthening training for young engineers and construction workers.

Question on Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon Audrey EU and Hon LEE Wing-tat, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

One Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The President suspended the meeting at 10:03 pm.

\* \* \* \* \*

The Council resumed at 9:00 am on 11 December 2008.

17 Members and Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG was speaking, Hon LEE Cheuk-yan requested Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG to elucidate a point in her speech. Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG did not accede to the request and continued to speak.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Development spoke again.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO's motion:

To add "in facing" after "That"; to delete "is" after "the international financial tsunami"; to delete "," after "across the world" and substitute with "and"; to add "and employment situations" after "striking the economies"; and to add ", and ensuring that precast concrete units are made locally or drawing on the approach of the Tamar Development Project of not using precast concrete units, so as to absorb more construction workers" after "(a) expeditiously implementing the 10 major infrastructure projects".

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, five were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 19 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Promoting infrastructure development” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO’s motion:

To add “once-in-a-century” after “That the”; to add “, recruiting engineers for District Offices in various districts, and allowing various District Councils to engage their own consultants for the minor works proposed by them, so as” after “(e) enhancing coordination among departments”; and to add “and the progress of such projects” after “small and medium works projects”.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming’s amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add “, including educating them on the latest developments in such fields as energy conservation and green construction, so as to meet the latest needs of the community; and (i) stepping up the work of environmental impact assessment to achieve sustainable development for Hong Kong” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU’s amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's and Hon Audrey EU's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon LEE Wing-tat to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following further amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO's motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming and Hon Audrey EU:

To add “; (j) regarding strengthening training for young engineers and construction workers, also strengthening training for architects, planners, surveyors and landscape architects; (k) regarding expediting the approval of contracts for small and medium works projects, particularly expediting the approval of contracts for those projects for the provision of community facilities such as escalators and lifts for pedestrians, waterfront promenades and cycling tracks; and at the same time, having to streamline the approval procedures of District Councils, so that more community projects can be implemented more expeditiously; (l) before commencing the various infrastructure projects, having to make public all information and conduct extensive public consultation; (m) in planning the various projects, having to ensure that the projects complement the surrounding districts, avoid doing damage to the nearby natural and ecological environment and community culture, and strive with every effort to conserve relics and monuments as well as historical buildings, so as to strike a balance between conservation and development; and (n) subject to not violating the World Trade Organization Agreement on Government Procurement, adjusting upwards the contract caps for small projects and splitting into smaller projects for open tender” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's amendment to Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO's motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming and Hon Audrey EU proposed, put and agreed to.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO replied.

Question on Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO's motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon Audrey EU and Hon LEE Wing-tat put and agreed to.

#### Raising the limit of university places for publicly-funded bachelor's degree programmes

Hon Starry LEE moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, in the face of globalization and being an international city, Hong Kong must enhance the integrated competitiveness of its population and upgrade the academic qualifications of young people, and in order to match the development of a knowledge-based economy, this Council urges the Government to raise the limit of

university places for publicly-funded bachelor's degree programmes to allow more students who meet the university admission requirements to enrol in publicly-funded degree programmes, so as to ease the long-standing shortage of articulation places in bachelor's degree programmes for sub-degree graduates, and at the same time, encourage the provision of more private university places to alleviate problems such as the worsening bottleneck in respect of university places available to secondary school graduates upon the implementation of the "3+3+4" academic structure.

Question on Hon Starry LEE's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon IP Kwok-him and Hon Tanya CHAN, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

While Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President left the chair at 12:19 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

The Secretary for Education spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 12:38 pm, while the Secretary for Education was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Eight Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Starry LEE spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke again.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon Starry LEE's motion:

To add "the university admission rate in Hong Kong has long been lower than the levels of major countries and regions in Europe, America and Asia, and" after "That,."; to add "competition under" after "in the face of"; to add "and education level" after "the academic qualifications"; to add "and increase the corresponding student hostel places" after "publicly-funded bachelor's degree programmes"; to delete "university admission" after "who meet the"; to delete "so as to" after "publicly-funded degree programmes," and substitute with "and"; to delete ", and at the same time, encourage" after "sub-degree graduates" and substitute with "; while encouraging"; to delete "private" after "the provision of more" and substitute with "self-financing"; and to delete "to alleviate problems such as the worsening bottleneck in respect of university places available to secondary school graduates" before "upon" and substitute with ", the Government must at the same time provide reasonable allowances and subsidies to

maintain the quality and quantity of degree programmes and alleviate the financial burden of students, with a view to solving the problem of the bottleneck in further studies arising from the corresponding increase in the number of secondary students promoting to universities”.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s amendment to Hon Starry LEE’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon IP Kwok-him to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon IP Kwok-him moved the following further amendment to Hon Starry LEE’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong:

To add “; to ensure that students have sufficient financial capability to enrol in publicly-funded bachelor’s degree programmes, this Council also urges the Government to provide interest-free or low interest loans to needy students of degree and sub-degree programmes” immediately before the full stop.

Question on IP Kwok-him’s amendment to Hon Starry LEE’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s and Hon IP Kwok-him’s amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Tanya CHAN to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following further amendment to Hon Starry LEE’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong and Hon IP Kwok-him, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add “; and also (a) review the existing target that 18% of the relevant age cohort may enrol in publicly-funded bachelor’s degree programmes; (b) offer additional tax concessions for donations to universities and encourage individuals and enterprises to make donations to enable universities to have sufficient resources to meet the expenses arising from the increase of university places; and (c) review various existing financial assistance and loan schemes for post-secondary students so that more students can afford the expenses for pursuing studies in universities” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN’s amendment to Hon Starry LEE’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong and Hon IP Kwok-him proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Starry LEE replied.

Question on Hon Starry LEE’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon IP Kwok-him and Hon Tanya CHAN put and agreed to.

**Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 17 December 2008 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 1:58 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
26 February 2009

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
 日期 DATE: 10/12/2008  
 時間 TIME: 05:54:33 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 修訂《2008年僱員再培訓條例（修訂附表3）（第2號）公告》決議案  
 PROPOSED RESOLUTION TO AMEND THE EMPLOYEES RETRAINING ORDINANCE (AMENDMENT OF SCHEDULE 3) (NO. 2) NOTICE 2008

動議人 MOVED BY: 葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	28	29	
投票 Vote	28	28	
贊成 Yes	7	21	
反對 No	21	7	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 11/12/2008  
 時間 TIME: 11:40:53 上午am

動議 MOTION: 潘佩璆議員對何鍾泰議員的「推動基建發展」議案，作出的修正案  
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON PAN PEY-CHYOU TO IR DR HON RAYMOND HO'S MOTION ON  
 "PROMOTING INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	19	
投票 Vote	22	18	
贊成 Yes	5	9	
反對 No	13	0	
棄權 Abstain	4	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK

*Wilson Lam*