

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 13

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 7 January 2009 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Member absent:

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Admission and Registration (Amendment) Rules 2008 (gazetted on 19.12.2008)	277/2008
2. Legal Practitioners (Risk Management Education) (Amendment) Rules 2008 (gazetted on 19.12.2008)	278/2008
3. Employees Retraining Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) (No. 3) Notice 2008 (gazetted on 19.12.2008)	279/2008
4. Domicile Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 19.12.2008)	280/2008
5. Pawnbrokers Ordinance (Amendment of Schedules) Order 2009 (gazetted on 2.1.2009)	1/2009
6. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 2.1.2009)	2/2009
7. Fugitive Offenders (Ireland) Order (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 2.1.2009)	3/2009

Other Papers

- No. 53 - The Audited Financial Statements together with the Report of the Director of Audit on the Immigration Service Welfare Fund and the Report by the Director of Immigration Incorporated on the Administration of the Fund (published on 30.12.2008)

Questions

1. Hon IP Kwok-him asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

2. Hon CHAN Hak-kan asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

3. Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

4. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

5. Hon LI Fung-ying asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

6. Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China and the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

RESOLVED that the appointment of –

- (a) Mr Murray Gleeson;
- (b) the Right Honourable The Lord Walker of Gestingthorpe; and
- (c) the Right Honourable The Lord Neuberger of Abbotsbury,

as judges of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal from other common law jurisdictions pursuant to section 9 of the Hong Kong Court of Final Appeal Ordinance (Cap. 484) be endorsed.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Motion for the adjournment of the Council

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the following issue: The Israeli Government's attack on the Gaza Strip.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was addressing the Council, the President left the chair at 1:11 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Eight Members and Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion.

At 2:22 pm, while Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion put and negatived.

Air pollution and public health

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That air pollution in Hong Kong has been worsening in recent years, posing an increasing threat to people's health, but the Government still uses the first stage objectives of the World Health Organization ("WHO") as the goals of the reform in its recent review of Air Quality Objectives, this Council expresses disappointment at this; quite a number of overseas studies nowadays have proved that serious air pollution will increase death rates as well as direct and indirect medical costs, and result in a loss in productivity, in this connection, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) establish a "smog alarm system" and formulate guidelines and corresponding measures for the alarm system, so as to enable the public to know more about the impact of air pollution on health;
- (b) adopt the latest objectives of WHO as the benchmark for formulating measures to improve air pollution, evaluate the effectiveness of each of these measures in improving public health, and set improving public health as the primary policy objective in addressing the problem of air pollution;
- (c) conduct a long-term tracking study to accurately calculate the loss of life expectancy in the territory resulting from air pollution, as well as the impact of air pollution on the health of people of different ages (including the elderly and children) and on those suffering from various forms of respiratory illnesses and cardiovascular diseases in the territory, so as to provide reference data for formulating long-term policies; and provide financial support to those academic institutions and non-profit-making bodies which are interested in conducting the above study;

- (d) in conducting the review of Air Quality Objectives, entrust the Food and Health Bureau with the responsibility of assessing whether the intended benefits to public health as a result of the implementation of new Air Quality Objectives have been achieved and, based on the assessment results, formulate the guiding framework, timetable and corresponding air quality improvement measures for implementing the new Air Quality Objectives;
- (e) continue to implement measures to regulate the emission standards of vehicles in areas with busy traffic, develop footbridge networks and encourage the public to use mass transit systems;
- (f) improve the subsidy scheme for owners of commercial diesel vehicles to replace such vehicles with new ones and attract more owners to participate in the scheme, as well as expand the subsidy scheme to cover franchised buses; and
- (g) gradually implement the mandatory Building Energy Codes and mandatory energy efficiency labelling for electrical appliances, and expeditiously set the caps on the emissions of air pollutants from power companies for the next stage, so as to reduce pollution caused by generation of electricity.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon Audrey EU and Hon LEE Wing-tat who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Thirteen Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon KAM Nai-wai spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai's motion:

To delete "air pollution in Hong Kong has been worsening in recent years" after "That" and substitute with "there is no marked improvement in the air quality in the Pearl River Delta Region"; to add "Hong Kong" after "posing an increasing threat to"; to add "local and" after "quite a number of"; to delete "and" after "franchised buses;"

and to add “; and (h) expeditiously discuss with the Guangdong Provincial Government the post-2010 cross-boundary cooperation plan between Hong Kong and the Mainland for improving air quality” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Audrey EU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Audrey EU moved the following further amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add “, and draw up the post-2010 emission reduction targets to further improve the air quality in the Pearl River Delta Region; (i) implement appropriate policies and measures to encourage owners of private cars to use cleaner cars; and (j) expeditiously formulate a timetable and an action plan for achieving the target of raising the proportion of electricity generated by natural gas to 50%” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Audrey EU’s amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon CHAN Hak-kan’s and Hon Audrey EU’s amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon LEE Wing-tat to revise the terms of his amendment:

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following further amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon Audrey EU:

To add “; (k) relocate the sources of air pollution (e.g. concrete plants) which are adjacent to residential areas, so as to reduce the impact of pollutants on the health of the residents nearby; and (l) step up tree-planting and greening efforts on roads and in high-rise buildings, and introduce more greening concepts into the procedures for renewal of old districts and construction of new roads” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat’s amendment to Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon Audrey EU proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon KAM Nai-wai replied.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai’s motion as amended by Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon Audrey EU and Hon LEE Wing-tat proposed, put and agreed to.

Public consultation on 2012 constitutional development

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the following motion and addressed the Council:

That, this Council demands that when the Chief Executive draws up proposals for reform of the method of election of the Chief Executive and election of the Legislative Council for public consultation early this year as he has pledged in his Policy Address, the Chief Executive will make clear that functional constituencies are to be abolished and he will ensure that such proposals lead:

- (a) for the method of election of the Chief Executive, to a nomination process which is open and in accordance with Article 25 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (“ICCPR”); and
- (b) for election of the Legislative Council, to the abolition of functional constituencies and to election by universal and equal suffrage and in accordance with Article 25 of ICCPR.

Question on Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Abraham SHEK and Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and their own amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, Hon TAM Yiu-chung interrupted to seek elucidation of a point raised by Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung in his speech.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung elucidated and continued to speak.

Another Member and Hon Frederick FUNG spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Frederick FUNG was speaking, the President left the chair at 5:36 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Five other Members and Hon IP Kwok-him spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:15 pm, while Hon IP Kwok-him was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two more Members and Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon WONG Yuk-man was speaking, the President reminded him that, in accordance with the Rules of Procedure, a Member must not use offensive and insulting language about other Members or public officers. The President also reminded Hon WONG Yuk-man to be mindful of his language and face the President while speaking.

Hon WONG Yuk-man responded that he had not used offensive and insulting language and continued to speak.

While Hon WONG Yuk-man was speaking, the President reminded him again to be mindful of his language.

Hon WONG Yuk-man continued to speak.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan raised a point of order on whether the Rules of Procedure only prohibited the use of offensive and insulting language about Members but not public officers.

The President stated that the relevant provisions of the Rules of Procedure were also applicable to public officers attending meetings.

Hon WONG Yuk-man rose and spoke aloud.

The President ordered him to sit down. Ignoring the President's order, Hon WONG Yuk-man remained standing and continued to speak aloud.

The President ordered him to sit down again.

Twelve other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Margaret NG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon WONG Yuk-man rose and spoke aloud.

The President stated that Hon WONG Yuk-man had repeatedly spoken aloud at the meeting when he was not asked to speak. The President ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man to withdraw from the Council immediately. Hon WONG Yuk-man left the Chamber.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon Albert CHAN rose and raised a point of order. The President ruled that it was not a point of order and asked the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs to continue to speak.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon Albert CHAN sought elucidation of a point raised by the Secretary in his speech. The President ordered Hon Albert CHAN to sit down. Hon Albert CHAN remained standing and requested the President to ask the Secretary to elucidate. The President stated that it was up to the Secretary to decide whether to elucidate.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung crossed the floor of the Chamber to approach the Government Despatch Box. The President ordered Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung to return to his seat. As Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung ignored the President's order, the President ordered him to withdraw from the Council immediately. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung continued to speak aloud. The President asked the Clerk to assist Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung in leaving the Chamber. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung then left the Chamber.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs continued to speak.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, Hon Albert CHAN interrupted to seek elucidation of a point raised by the Secretary. While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was elucidating, Hon Albert CHAN spoke aloud. As Hon Albert CHAN ignored the President's warning, the President ordered him to immediately withdraw from the Council. Hon Albert CHAN then left the Chamber.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs continued to speak.

Hon Abraham SHEK moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion:

To add "in 2012" after "and election of the Legislative Council"; to delete "early this year" after "public consultation" and substitute with "during the first half of 2009"; to delete "functional constituencies are to be abolished and" after "clear that"; to delete "lead" after "such proposals" and substitute with "will be conducive to achieving the objective of promoting democracy, and that"; to delete "the method of" after "(a) for" and substitute with "implementing the"; to delete " , to a nomination process which is

open and in accordance with Article 25 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (“ICCPR”)” before “; and” and substitute with “by universal suffrage, a nominating committee has to be formed in 2017 in accordance with Article 45 of the Basic Law to nominate a certain number of candidates according to democratic procedures, and the Chief Executive will be returned by all registered electors on a “one-person-one-vote” basis, so as to comply with the principle of universal and equal suffrage”; to add “implementing the” after “(b) for”; and to delete “, to the abolition of functional constituencies and to election by universal and equal suffrage and in accordance with Article 25 of ICCPR” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “by universal suffrage, gradual and orderly progress should be made in developing democracy in accordance with Article 68 of the Basic Law, and all the members of the Legislative Council will be elected by universal suffrage in 2020, so as to comply with the principle of universal and equal suffrage”.

Question on Hon Abraham SHEK’s amendment to Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Abraham SHEK claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 10 were in favour of the amendment and 16 against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion:

To add “all” after “clear that”; and to add “in one go” after “abolished”.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che’s amendment to Dr Hon Margaret NG’s motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, three were in favour of the amendment and 24 against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Noting that the voting result showed that she had voted against Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che's amendment, Dr Hon Margaret NG said that her vote should be in favour of the amendment. The President said that she should reply first and Secretariat staff would check the voting result in the meantime.

Dr Hon Margaret NG replied.

In response to Dr Hon Margaret NG's earlier query on the voting result, the President said that according to the computer record, Dr Hon Margaret NG had voted against Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che's amendment. Nevertheless, even with her voting in favour of the amendment, it was still not agreed to by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present.

Question on Dr Hon Margaret NG's motion put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 27 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 20 against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 14 January 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 9:42 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
26 February 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 07/01/2009
 時間 TIME: 09:27:47 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 石禮謙議員對吳靄儀議員的「2012年政制發展的公眾諮詢」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ABRAHAM SHEK TO DR HON MARGARET NG'S MOTION ON
 "PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON 2012 CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 石禮謙 Abraham SHEK

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	18	10	
反對 No	5	16	
棄權 Abstain	4	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	贊成 YES	何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	贊成 YES	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	反對 NO	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	贊成 YES	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 07/01/2009
 時間 TIME: 09:32:12 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張國柱議員對吳靄儀議員的「2012年政制發展的公眾諮詢」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG KWOK-CHE TO DR HON MARGARET NG'S MOTION ON
 "PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON 2012 CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張國柱CHEUNG Kwok-che

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	3	16	
反對 No	24	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若蕙 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳淑勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 07/01/2009
 時間 TIME: 09:41:26 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「2012年政制發展的公眾諮詢」議案
 MOTION ON "PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON 2012 CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	27	27	
投票 Vote	27	26	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	20	10	
棄權 Abstain	3	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	反對 NO	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK