

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 15

Minutes of the meeting held on Thursday 15 January 2009 at 3:00 pm

Present:

The Hon Donald TSANG Yam-kuen, GBM
The Chief Executive of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Members absent:

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP
Head, Central Policy Unit

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

The Chief Executive's Question and Answer Session

The Chief Executive attended the Council meeting.

When the Chief Executive was about to address the Council, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung crossed the floor of the Council. He attempted to give a piece of cardboard to the Chief Executive and also spoke aloud. The President told Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that the Secretariat staff would collect the cardboard and ordered him to return to his seat and stop speaking. Assisted by the Clerk and security staff, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung returned to his seat but remained standing and continued to speak aloud. After repeated orders by the President, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung sat down and stopped speaking.

The Chief Executive addressed the Council.

After the Chief Executive had addressed the Council, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung stood up again and spoke aloud. The President ordered Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung to sit down but he attempted to leave his seat. The President warned Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung that he would be ordered to withdraw from the Chamber if he did not comply with the Rules of Procedure. As Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung ignored the President's warning and continued to speak aloud, the President ordered him to withdraw immediately from the Chamber. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung ignored the President's order and crossed the floor of the Council to place the cardboard on the Chief Executive's lectern, and also continued to speak aloud. The cardboard was taken away by security staff. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, assisted by the Clerk and security staff, then walked towards the main doors of the Chamber to leave but continued to speak aloud while walking.

The President suspended the meeting at 3:15 pm.

The Council resumed at 3:17 pm.

Seven Members and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked questions and the Chief Executive replied. While the Chief Executive was answering Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's question, Hon WONG Yuk-man interrupted the Chief Executive by speaking aloud. Pursuant to the President's order, Hon WONG Yuk-man stopped speaking and the Chief Executive continued to reply to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's question.

Another Member asked a question and the Chief Executive replied.

Hon Albert CHAN asked a question. While Hon Albert CHAN was asking the question, Hon WONG Yuk-man displayed a banana-shaped balloon. The President ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man to put down the balloon. Hon WONG Yuk-man then handed the balloon over to Hon Albert CHAN who swayed the balloon and continued to ask his question. The Chief Executive then replied to the question.

Hon Albert CHAN asked a supplementary question. While Hon Albert CHAN was asking the supplementary question, some members of the public in the Public Gallery yelled noisily. The President asked them to keep quiet. While the Chief Executive was answering the supplementary question, Hon WONG Yuk-man interrupted the Chief Executive by speaking aloud. The President ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man to stop speaking and warned him that he would be ordered to withdraw from the Chamber if he breached the Rules of Procedure again. Hon WONG Yuk-man stopped speaking and the Chief Executive continued to answer the supplementary question.

While Hon WONG Ting-kwong was called upon by the President to ask his question, Hon Albert CHAN stood up and spoke aloud. The President asked him to be mindful of his language and sit down. The President also reminded him that he would be ordered to withdraw from the Chamber if he breached the Rules of Procedure again. The President repeatedly ordered Hon Albert CHAN to sit down and pointed out that he was hindering other Members from asking questions, but Hon Albert CHAN remained standing and continued to speak aloud.

The President suspended the meeting at 4:02 pm.

The Council resumed at 4:04 pm.

The Chief Executive addressed the Council again.

The President stated that the Council had a set of very clear Rules of Procedure, which were made by Members of this Council pursuant to the Basic Law. He believed that Members were willing to comply with the Rules. He added that it was his duty as President to preside over meetings according to the Rules of Procedure.

Six Members asked questions and the Chief Executive replied.

When the Chief Executive was about to leave the Chamber, Hon WONG Yuk-man left his seat, crossed the floor of the Council to hand a book to the Chief Executive. The President asked Hon WONG Yuk-man not to do so. At this juncture, small pieces of paper were thrown from the Public Gallery over the Government Despatch Box and some members of the public in the Public Gallery also yelled noisily. In accordance with the President's order, security staff removed the people concerned from the Public Gallery.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 4 February 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 4:32 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)

President

26 February 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong