

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 17

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 11 February 2009 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-ye, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Members absent:

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-yee, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Telecommunications (Designation of Frequency Bands subject to Payment of Spectrum Utilization Fee) (Amendment) Order 2009 (gazetted on 6.2.2009)	20/2009
2. Telecommunications (Level of Spectrum Utilization Fees) (Second Generation Mobile Services) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (gazetted on 6.2.2009)	21/2009
3. Telecommunications (Determining Spectrum Utilization Fees by Auction) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (gazetted on 6.2.2009)	22/2009
4. Dangerous Goods (Consignment by Air) (Safety) Regulations (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2006 (Commencement) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 6.2.2009)	23/2009

Other Papers

No. 58	-	Employees' Compensation Insurance Levies Management Board Annual Report 2007/08 (published on 5.2.2009)	Board
No. 59	-	Employees Compensation Assistance Fund Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 5.2.2009)	Board
No. 60	-	Occupational Deafness Compensation Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 5.2.2009)	Board
No. 61	-	Pneumoconiosis Compensation Fund Annual Report 2007 (published on 5.2.2009)	Board
No. 62	-	Report on the Administration of the Fire Services Department Welfare Fund together with the Director of Audit's Report and Audited Statement of Accounts for the year ended 31 March 2008 (published on 9.2.2009)	
No. 63	-	Annual Report 2007 to the Chief Executive by The Commissioner on Interception of Communications and Surveillance (together with a statement under section 49(4) of the Interception of Communications and Surveillance Ordinance) (published on 9.2.2009)	

Questions

1. Hon Audrey EU asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

2. Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau asked Question 2.

The Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Civil Service replied.

3. Hon WONG Yuk-man asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Hon WONG Yuk-man asked a supplementary question.

After Hon WONG Yuk-man had asked his supplementary question, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung clapped his hands. The President asked him to keep quiet. The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

While the Secretary was replying to the supplementary question, Hon WONG Yuk-man stood up to speak. The President asked him to sit down, but Hon WONG Yuk-man did not comply and continued to speak aloud. The President warned him that he had breached the Rules of Procedure and ordered him to sit down. As Hon WONG Yuk-man still did not comply, the President warned him again that he would be ordered to withdraw from the Chamber if he continued to act in breach of the Rules of Procedure. Hon WONG Yuk-man then sat down and stopped speaking. The Secretary continued to reply.

While the Secretary was still replying to the supplementary question, Hon WONG Yuk-man played a recording. The President ordered him to turn off the recording device immediately and warned him that he would be ordered to withdraw from the Chamber if he did not keep quiet immediately. Hon WONG Yuk-man then turned off the recording device. The Secretary continued to reply.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung then asked a follow-up question and played the recording again. The President asked him to turn off the recording device and sit down. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung sat down and turned off the device. The Secretary replied.

Two other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

4. Hon Albert HO asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Hon Paul CHAN asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

6. Hon Starry LEE asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Adaptation of Laws Bill 2009

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Adaptation of Laws Bill 2009

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Hong Kong Export Credit Insurance Corporation Ordinance

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the contingent liability of the Hong Kong Export Credit Insurance Corporation under contracts of insurance shall not at any time exceed the sum of 30,000 million dollars.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong declared that he was a member of the Advisory Board of the Hong Kong Export Credit Insurance Corporation, and then spoke on the motion.

Hon Jeffrey LAM declared that he was the Chairman of the Advisory Board of the Hong Kong Export Credit Insurance Corporation, and then spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under Article 75 of the Basic Law of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China

Hon TAM Yiu-chung moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that Rule 80 of the Rules of Procedure of the Legislative Council of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region be amended —

- (a) in paragraph (a), by adding “and” after the semicolon;

(b) in paragraph (b), by repealing “select committee(s) or investigation committee(s)” and substituting “select committee, investigation committee or any other committee”.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Procrastinating public consultation on constitutional development

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum. The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council strongly condemns the Chief Executive Mr Donald TSANG Yam-kuen for failing to honour his pledge made in the Policy Address by procrastinating public consultation on constitutional development, hence breaking faith with the people.

While Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:25 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Albert HO’s motion proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion.

Seven Members and Hon Tommy CHEUNG spoke on the motion.

While Hon Tommy CHEUNG was speaking, Hon Albert HO raised a point of order on whether Hon Tommy CHEUNG’s speech had deviated from the subject matter of the motion. The President’s Deputy asked Hon Tommy CHEUNG to relate the points he made to the motion. Hon Tommy CHEUNG said that the points he made were related to the motion and continued to speak.

A Member and Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO spoke on the motion.

At 2:44 pm, while Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Seven more Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the motion and played a recording. The President asked him to turn off the recording device. Hon Albert CHAN turned off the device and continued to speak on the motion.

Another Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Hon Albert HO replied.

Question on Hon Albert HO's motion put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 23 were present, four were in favour of the motion, 17 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 26 were present, 16 were in favour of the motion, eight against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Relaxing the eligibility criteria for legal aid

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the high litigation fees in Hong Kong are beyond the means of the middle class in general, in particular cases for which appeals may be lodged to the Court of Final Appeal where the litigation fees incurred are often astronomical, it is not uncommon that middle-class people go bankrupt because of their involvement in legal proceedings, hence the provision of appropriate legal aid services to such middle-class people is very important; however, under section 5 of the existing Legal Aid Ordinance (Cap. 91), the asset limit for legal aid applicants is \$165,700, which is far below the actual need, rendering the majority of the middle class being excluded from the protection net of legal aid; if involved in litigation, the middle-class people are neither able to pay the high lawyer fees on their own nor eligible to apply for legal aid, they are therefore deprived of judiciary justice; on the other hand, the existing legal aid services only cover litigation cases in Hong Kong, and over the past two decades, a large number of Hong Kong permanent residents have been working and living in the Mainland, and it is very likely that they may get involved in legal proceedings in their daily lives, business operation or work, but they have nowhere to turn to for any legal assistance; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) conduct a comprehensive review on the existing legal aid system;
- (b) relax the asset limit for legal aid applicants (including that for the Supplementary Legal Aid Scheme) to a reasonable level so that more people in need are eligible to apply for legal aid; and

- (c) extend the scope of the existing legal aid services to cover litigation cases in the Mainland involving Hong Kong permanent residents who are in the Mainland.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion proposed.

The President stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Margaret NG, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Dr Hon Margaret NG was speaking, the President left the chair at 4:33 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon Albert HO, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 4:42 pm, while Hon Albert HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Home Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Nine Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert CHAN declared that as he was being sued by a consortium. The lawsuit had dragged on for eleven years, and was still in progress. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon LEUNG Ka-lau declared that he was involved in a lawsuit against the Hospital Authority, and then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments

Hon Paul CHAN declared that he was the Chairman of the Legal Aid Services Council, and then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Paul CHAN was speaking, Dr Hon Margaret NG sought, with the President's permission, elucidation by Hon Paul CHAN on whether his remarks on the independence of legal aid were made in his personal capacity or in a capacity as representing the Legal Aid Services Council. Hon Paul CHAN elucidated and continued to speak.

Another Member spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the amendments

The Secretary of Home Affairs spoke again.

Dr Hon Margaret NG moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion:

To add "to uphold the rule of law, it is necessary to ensure that no one is unable to exercise his or her rights under the law for want of financial means, and" after "That,."; to delete "high" after "to pay the"; to add "and extend the scope of assistance" after "a reasonable level"; to delete "and" after "eligible to apply for legal aid,."; and to add " (d) consider implementing the recommendations set out in the Report on Conditional Fees published by the Law Reform Commission in July 2007; (e) review the existing free legal advice service and set up community legal service centres; and (f) formulate principles for determining legal fees for criminal legal aid so as to establish a more professional criminal legal aid system" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon Margaret NG's amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion proposed and put.

Dr Hon Margaret NG claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and eight abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on "Relaxing the eligibility criteria for legal aid" or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Albert Ho moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion:

To add "and establish an independent body for assessing and approving applications for legal aid" after "legal aid system"; to delete "and" after "eligible to apply for legal aid,."; and to add " (d) consider amending the law to enable the Director of Legal Aid to waive the asset limit for application of legal aid in respect of litigation cases involving constitutional issues or significant public interest, in addition to that for litigation cases involving human rights issues" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Albert Ho's amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, 10 against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 23 were present, 15 were in favour of the amendment, one against it and six abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU moved the following amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion:

To delete “; and (c) extend the scope of the existing legal aid services to cover litigation cases in the Mainland involving Hong Kong permanent residents who are in the Mainland” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU's amendment to Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG replied.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG's motion as amended by Prof Hon Patrick LAU put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 18 February 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:08 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
10 March 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 11/02/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:12:43 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「拖延政制發展諮詢」議案
 MOTION ON "PROCRASTINATING PUBLIC CONSULTATION ON CONSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	23	26	
投票 Vote	23	25	
贊成 Yes	4	16	
反對 No	17	8	
棄權 Abstain	2	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	反對 NO	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 11/02/2009
 時間 TIME: 07:00:01 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 吳靄儀議員對梁美芬議員的「放寬法律援助申請資格」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY DR HON MARGARET NG TO DR HON PRISCILLA LEUNG'S MOTION ON
 "RELAXING THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR LEGAL AID"

動議人 MOVED BY: 吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	23	
投票 Vote	22	22	
贊成 Yes	6	15	
反對 No	8	1	
棄權 Abstain	8	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		李慧琼 Starry LEE	
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 11/02/2009
 時間 TIME: 07:03:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員對梁美芬議員的「放寬法律援助申請資格」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT HO TO DR HON PRISCILLA LEUNG'S MOTION ON
 "RELAXING THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR LEGAL AID"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	23	
投票 Vote	22	22	
贊成 Yes	6	15	
反對 No	10	1	
棄權 Abstain	6	6	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	
霍震霆 Timothy FOK	反對 NO	鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	反對 NO	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		李慧琼 Starry LEE	
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO