

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 18

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 18 February 2009 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Members absent:**

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-ye, GBS, JP  
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP  
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

- No. 64 - Hong Kong Arts Development Council  
Annual Report 2007/08 (published on 12.2.2009)
- No. 65 - Li Po Chun Charitable Trust Fund  
Audited Financial Statements together with the Director of Audit's  
Report and Report of the Trustee on the Administration of the Fund  
for the year ended 31 August 2008 (published on 16.2.2009)
- No. 66 - Report of the Public Accounts Committee on the Reports of the  
Director of Audit on the Accounts of the Government of the Hong  
Kong Special Administrative Region for the year ended 31 March  
2008 and the Results of Value for Money Audits (Report No. 51)  
(February 2009 - P.A.C. Report No. 51) (published on 18.2.2009)

### **Addresses**

Dr Hon Philip WONG, Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee, addressed the Council on the Committee's Report No. 51.

### **Questions**

1. Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

2. Hon KAM Nai-wai asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Hon CHAN Kam-lam declared his interest that he held a very small amount of the shares of the PCCW Limited. He then asked his supplementary question.

While Hon CHAN Kam-lam was speaking, Hon James TO rose and declared his interest that he was also a shareholder of the PCCW Limited. Hon CHAN Kam-lam continued to speak.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Two other Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

3. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

4. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

5. Hon LEE Wing-tat asked Question 5.

While Hon LEE Wing-tat was asking his question, a member of the public in the Public Gallery spoke loudly. The President asked that person to keep quiet. Hon LEE Wing-tat continued to ask his question.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Nine Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

Hon Frederick FUNG declared that he was one of the victims in respect of the matter raised in this question. He then asked a supplementary question. The Secretary for Security replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Security replied.

Written replies to Questions 6 to 19 were tabled for Members' information.

## **Bills**

### First Reading

Disciplined Services Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2009

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

### Second Reading

Disciplined Services Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2009

The Secretary for the Civil Service moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

## **Members' Motions**

### Measures for combating drink driving

Hon LEE Wing-tat moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as several serious traffic accidents caused by drink driving have occurred recently, which resulted in a large number of casualties, reflecting that the awareness of the danger of drink driving among motorists is still weak, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) review the penalties for the drink driving offence by increasing the disqualification period to a minimum of 12 months or above upon first conviction of this offence as well as raising the maximum imprisonment term and fine for such an offence;
- (b) consider further tightening the legal limit of blood alcohol concentration;

- (c) lodge appeals to the Court by the Department of Justice against drink driving cases with relatively lenient sentences so as to allow the Judiciary to formulate more stringent sentencing criteria;
- (d) consider raising the maximum imprisonment term for dangerous driving causing death to the same level as that for manslaughter; and
- (e) enhance public education and publicity to enable motorists to understand the perils of drink driving,

so as to safeguard public safety.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung would move amendments to the motion. Also, Hon Miriam LAU would move an amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and Hon Miriam LAU, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Kin-por spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon CHAN Kin-por was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:16 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Thirteen Members and Hon CHIM Pui-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon CHIM Pui-chung was speaking, Dr Hon Margaret NG sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon CHIM Pui-chung in his speech. Hon CHIM Pui-chung elucidated. Dr Hon Margaret NG then rose to seek further elucidation. Hon CHIM Pui-chung did not give way and continued to speak.

Two other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Wing-tat spoke on the amendments.

At 3:59 pm, while Hon LEE Wing-tat was speaking, the President resumed the chair.



The Secretary for Transport and Housing spoke again.

Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion:

To delete "as" after "That," and substitute with "according to government information, the number of prosecutions against drink driving has been on the rise in recent years; furthermore,"; to delete "review the penalties for the drink driving offence by" after "(a)" and substitute with "allocate more resources for conducting random breath tests, and set up permanent breath test checkpoints at cross-boundary control points and the roads nearby, as well as major bar areas and restaurants, etc; (b) expeditiously conduct a comprehensive review on the effectiveness of the newly implemented Road Traffic Legislation (Amendment) Ordinance 2008, including"; to delete "to a minimum of 12 months or above" after "disqualification period"; to add "where necessary" after "such an offence"; to delete the original "(b)" and substitute with "(c)"; to add ", and formulate a set of penalties whereby the greater the extent the alcohol limit is exceeded, the heavier the punishment" after "blood alcohol concentration"; to delete the original "(c)" and substitute with "(d)"; to add "reviews or" after "lodge"; to add "and guidelines" after "sentencing criteria"; to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(e)"; to delete the original "(e)" and substitute with "(f)"; and to add ", and require that cautionary words such as 'don't drink and drive' must be printed on the packages of alcoholic beverages" after "public education and publicity".

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat's motion proposed.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment:

To add "various major speeding blackspots across the territory," after "the roads nearby"; and to add "studying the introduction of a new provision on 'dangerous driving causing grievous bodily harm' in the Ordinance and introducing dangerous driving after drinking as a factor of consideration for meting out heavier penalties, as well as" after "including".

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming's amendment proposed and put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Measures for combating drink driving” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming’s amendment, as amended by Hon Miriam LAU, to Hon LEE Wing-tat’s motion put.

Hon LEE Wing-tat claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and two against it; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 17 were in favour of the amendment and 10 against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was passed.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following further amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming and Hon Miriam LAU:

To add “; this Council also urges the Government to set up medical facilities for treating alcoholics and community counselling centres for such people to receive appropriate treatment and counselling, so as to enable them to understand the perils of drink driving, thereby reducing the occurrence of drink driving accidents” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung’s amendment to Hon LEE Wing-tat’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming and Hon Miriam LAU proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon LEE Wing-tat replied.

Question on Hon LEE Wing-tat’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, Hon Miriam LAU and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung put and agreed to.

Helping young people cope with the financial tsunami

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, being struck by the financial tsunami, Hong Kong's economy will most probably slacken off substantially and young people will definitely face pressure from various fronts, including the financial burden arising from repaying student loans and the employment difficulties caused by reduction in jobs etc; this Council urges the Government to show concern for the needs of young people amid economic adversities and offer suitable support to help them alleviate their pressure, develop their career and contribute to the society, with specific measures which include:

- (a) removing the existing 1.5% risk rate for the "Non-means Tested Loan Scheme" and making changes to the effect that the interest will be calculated after a student has completed the relevant programme;
- (b) suspending the collection of repayments from all borrowers of student loan schemes for one year and waiving the interests on all loans for that year;
- (c) providing young people with more employment counselling and support, especially by increasing the resources allocated to the environmental protection and creative industries, with a view to helping them find suitable jobs;
- (d) creating temporary jobs and placements which are suitable for young people, including those in the fields of environmental conservation, survey studies, community relations, publicity and promotion etc, to give them opportunities to accumulate working experience;
- (e) exploring various forms of support, including appropriate training, counselling services, subsidies or loan arrangements, for young people who aspire to start a business or become self-employed; and
- (f) expeditiously implementing the recommendations of the Task Force on Economic Challenges which target at young people's needs and putting forward specific work plans as well as announcing the details.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's motion proposed.

The President stated that five Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Starry LEE, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Andrew LEUNG, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, declared that he was the Chairman of the Vocational Training Council. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Sing-chi, Hon WONG Kwok-hing and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eleven Members and Hon Paul CHAN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the President's permission, Hon Cyd HO rose to correct a figure mentioned earlier in her speech and also explained a point raised in her speech.

Four other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Tanya CHAN spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon Starry LEE moved the following amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion:

To delete "being" after "That," and substitute with "as the global economy slows down, and Hong Kong is"; to delete "Hong Kong's economy will most probably slacken off substantially and" after "financial tsunami,"; to delete "removing" after "(a)" and substitute with "standardizing"; to delete "1.5% risk rate" after "the existing" and substitute with "interest rate"; to delete "and" after " 'Non-means Tested Loan Scheme' " and substitute with "at a flat rate of 2.5%,"; to add "and secured employment, as well as changing the means-tested loans to interest-free loans" after "programme"; and to add ", introducing an attachment allowance scheme for tertiary graduates whereby the Government will offer allowances to Hong Kong and Mainland enterprises which provide attachment places with a view to helping fresh graduates tackle employment difficulties," after "young people's needs".

Question on Hon Starry LEE's amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon Andrew LEUNG had indicated that he would withdraw his amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion if Hon Starry LEE's amendment was passed. Hon Andrew LEUNG had therefore withdrawn his amendment.

As Hon Starry LEE's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon WONG Sing-chi to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following further amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; (g) reviewing various financial assistance schemes for post-secondary students, relaxing the eligibility criteria, and raising the amount of grants and loans, so as to alleviate the financial burden on tertiary students; and (h) considering giving tertiary graduates more flexibility in repayment, including repaying a smaller amount during the first three years after graduation” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Starry LEE's and Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon WONG Kwok-hing to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following further amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE and Hon WONG Sing-chi:

To add “; (i) raising the subsidy amount of the Continuing Education Fund to \$30,000 to alleviate the financial pressure from further studies on young people and, at the same time, widening the coverage of subsidy and stepping up monitoring of course operations; and (j) increasing the subsidized places for diploma, higher diploma, bachelor degree and master degree programmes, etc of various institutions, so that more young people are able to have the opportunity to receive tertiary education, thereby enhancing their competitiveness” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE and Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed and put.

Hon WONG Sing-chi claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 10 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, two against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 21 were present, eight were in favour of the amendment and 12 against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

As Hon Starry LEE's and Hon WONG Sing-chi's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon LEE Cheuk-yan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following further amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE and Hon WONG Sing-chi, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (i) establishing a training contract system to enable young school leavers to have training opportunities and working experience” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's amendment to Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE and Hon WONG Sing-chi proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Tanya CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE, Hon WONG Sing-chi and Hon LEE Cheuk-yan put.

Hon Tanya CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 10 were present and 10 were in favour of the motion as amended; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 22 were present, 20 were in favour of the motion as amended and one against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion as amended was passed.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 25 February 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:07 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
12 March 2009

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 18/02/2009  
時間 TIME: 04:14:03 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 劉健儀議員就張學明議員對李永達議員的「打擊酒後駕駛措施」議案所提修正案，作出的修正案  
HON MIRIAM LAU'S AMENDMENT TO HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S AMENDMENT TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON "MEASURES FOR COMBATING DRINK DRIVING"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀 Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	28	
投票 Vote	21	27	
贊成 Yes	19	18	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	2	9	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kgwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 CHAN CHAN	贊成 YES	Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 2  
 日期 DATE: 18/02/2009  
 時間 TIME: 04:17:02 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張學明議員對李永達議員的「打擊酒後駕駛措施」議案，提出經劉健儀議員修正的修正案  
 HON CHEUNG HOK-MING'S AMENDMENT AS AMENDED BY HON MIRIAM LAU TO HON LEE WING-TAT'S MOTION ON "MEASURES FOR COMBATING DRINK DRIVING"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張學明CHEUNG Hok-ming

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	28	
投票 Vote	21	27	
贊成 Yes	19	17	
反對 No	2	10	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	贊成 YES	涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	贊成 YES	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	贊成 YES
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	贊成 YES	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	贊成 YES	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	贊成 YES
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	贊成 YES	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	贊成 YES	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM		葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 3  
日期 DATE: 18/02/2009  
時間 TIME: 07:59:41 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 王國興議員對陳淑莊議員就「協助青年人應付金融海嘯」所提，經李慧琼議員／及／黃成智議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG KWOK-HING TO HON TANYA CHAN'S MOTION ON "HELPING YOUNG PEOPLE COPE WITH THE FINANCIAL TSUNAMI" AS AMENDED BY HON STARRY LEE AND HON WONG SING-CHI

動議人 MOVED BY: 王國興 WONG Kwok-hing

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	10	21	
投票 Vote	10	20	
贊成 Yes	4	8	
反對 No	2	12	
棄權 Abstain	4	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	反對 NO	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	反對 NO
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	反對 NO
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	反對 NO
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	反對 NO
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

投票 VOTE: 4  
日期 DATE: 18/02/2009  
時間 TIME: 08:05:54 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 由陳淑莊議員動議，經李慧琼議員、梁君彥議員、及黃成智議員、及王國興議員、及李卓人議員修正的「協助青年人應付金融海嘯」議案  
MOTION MOVED BY HON TANYA CHAN ON "HELPING YOUNG PEOPLE COPE WITH THE FINANCIAL TSUNAMI" AS AMENDED BY HON STARRY LEE /HON ANDREW LEUNG, /AND/ HON WONG SING-CHI, /AND/ HON WONG KWOK HING /AND/ HON LEE CHEUK-YAN

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	10	22	
投票 Vote	10	21	
贊成 Yes	10	20	
反對 No	0	1	
棄權 Abstain	0	0	
結果 Result	通過 Passed	通過 Passed	通過 Passed

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG		涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	贊成 YES	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	贊成 YES	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong		梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	贊成 YES
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por		李慧琼 Starry LEE	贊成 YES
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	贊成 YES
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him		黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK