

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 19

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 25 February 2009 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Member absent:

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Denise YUE Chung-ye, GBS, JP
Secretary for the Civil Service

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Prof LAU Siu-kai, JP
Head, Central Policy Unit

Clerk in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

- No. 67 - Education Scholarships Fund
Audited Statement of Accounts together with the Auditor's Report and Trustee's Report on Administration of the Fund for the year ended 31 August 2008 (published on 23.2.2009)
- No. 68 - Estimates
for the year ending 31 March 2010
Volume IA - General Revenue Account
Volume IB - General Revenue Account
(published on 25.2.2009)
- No. 69 - Estimates
for the year ending 31 March 2010
Volume II - Fund Accounts
(published on 25.2.2009)

Questions

Written replies to Questions 1 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Appropriation Bill 2009

The Bill was read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Appropriation Bill 2009

The Financial Secretary moved the Second Reading and delivered his Budget speech.

Shortly after the Financial Secretary started his speech, Hon WONG Yuk-man held up a piece of cardboard. The President asked Hon WONG Yuk-man to put down the cardboard and he complied. The Financial Secretary continued to deliver his speech.

While the Financial Secretary was delivering his speech, Hon WONG Yuk-man suddenly walked across the floor towards the Financial Secretary. He stood by the side of the table in front of the President's podium, placed a piece of cardboard on the table and spoke aloud. The Financial Secretary stopped his speech as requested by the President. The President repeatedly ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man to return to his seat, while the Clerk, a steward and several security staff tried to guide him back to his seat. Hon WONG Yuk-man walked a few more steps to stand in front of the Financial Secretary, then leaned forward and tried to grab the Financial Secretary's folder containing his speech. He then swiped away the stand and other items on the Financial Secretary's desk. The President ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man to withdraw from the Chamber immediately. Hon WONG Yuk-man did not withdraw and returned to his seat. The President ordered him again to withdraw from the Chamber immediately, but he did not comply.

At this juncture, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung walked across the floor towards the Financial Secretary, stood in front of him and spoke aloud. He then broke a bowl and kept speaking aloud. The President ordered him to stop such acts and withdraw from the Chamber immediately, while the Clerk, two stewards and several security staff tried to guide him away. At the same time, Hon Albert CHAN stood up and spoke aloud.

The President ordered Hon WONG Yuk-man, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and Hon Albert CHAN to withdraw from the Chamber immediately. The Clerk and security staff tried to escort them to leave the Chamber. The three Members did not leave and continued to speak aloud. The President suspended the meeting at 11:50 am.

The Council resumed at 11:55 am.

Before continuing with his speech, the Financial Secretary said that the conduct of Hon WONG Yuk-man and Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung had affected the proceedings of the Legislative Council and were regrettable. He hoped that Members could fully observe the Rules of Procedure and refrain from pointless acts playing to the gallery.

Dr Hon Margaret NG raised a point of order on whether the Financial Secretary might, without raising a point of order, make comments on the incident. The President responded that according to the practice of the Council, the President would not intervene with the content of the speech of a public officer as long as it was not in breach of the Rules of Procedure. The President said that he was of the view that the content of the Financial Secretary's speech was in order.

Hon LAU Kong-wah raised a question on whether Hon WONG Yuk-man, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and Hon Albert Chan were allowed to return to the Chamber. The President responded that in accordance with the Rules of Procedure, he had ordered the three Members to withdraw from the Chamber immediately and not to return for the remainder of the meeting.

The Financial Secretary continued to deliver his speech.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. In accordance with Rules 67 and 71 of the Rules of Procedure, the President adjourned the debate on the second reading of the Bill and referred the Estimates to the Finance Committee for examination.

Next Meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 4 March 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 12:40 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
16 March 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong