

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

### No. 20

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 4 March 2009 at 11:00 am**

---

#### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Members absent:**

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

Mr Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP  
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP  
Secretary for Security

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-ye, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

### **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Public Revenue Protection Order 2009 (gazetted on 25.2.2009)	27/2009
2. Rating (Exemption) Order 2009 (gazetted on 25.2.2009)	28/2009
3. Estate Agents (Licensing) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (gazetted on 27.2.2009)	29/2009
4. Independent Police Complaints Council Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (Repeal) Notice (gazetted on 27.2.2009)	30/2009
5. Admission and Registration (Amendment) Rules 2008 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 27.2.2009)	31/2009
6. Legal Practitioners (Risk Management Education) (Amendment) Rules 2008 (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 27.2.2009)	32/2009

### Other Papers

- No. 70 - Hong Kong Council for Accreditation of Academic and Vocational Qualifications 2007-2008 Annual Report (published on 2.3.2009)
- No. 71 - Report by the Controller, Government Flying Service on the Administration of the Government Flying Service Welfare Fund and the Audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31 March 2008 together with the Report of the Director of Audit (published on 2.3.2009)
- No. 72 - The Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts Annual Report 2007-2008, Financial Statements and Auditor's Report for the Year ended 30 June 2008 (published on 2.3.2009)

- No. 73 - Consolidated Summary of Estimates and Revenue Analysis by Head, General Revenue Account, Estimates for the year ending 31 March 2010 (published on 2.3.2009)

### Questions

1. Hon Ronny TONG asked Question 1.

The Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Chief Secretary for Administration replied.

2. Hon CHAN Kin-por asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

3. Hon WONG Yung-kan asked Question 3.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

4. Prof Hon Patrick LAU asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

5. Hon CHAN Hak-kan asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

6. Dr Hon David LI asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Members' Motions**

#### **Actively implementing complementary policies for the Outline of the Plan for the Reform and Development of the Pearl River Delta**

Hon WONG Ting-kwong moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council urges the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to expeditiously formulate corresponding complementary policies for the Outline of the Plan for the Reform and Development of the Pearl River Delta (2008-2020) promulgated earlier by the Central Government, so as to facilitate Hong Kong's closer co-operation with Guangdong Province and the Macao Special Administrative Region and promote Hong Kong's economic and social development; such policies include:

- (a) expediting the planning and construction of the Hong Kong Section of the Hong Kong-Zhuhai-Macao Bridge ("HZMB") as well as the related connecting infrastructure works for HZMB, and at the same time actively studying the development of a bridgehead economy at the landing point of HZMB in Hong Kong and the implementation of "free flow of vehicles" between Guangdong and Hong Kong, so as to fully utilize HZMB;
- (b) expediting transport connection works between the airports in Guangdong and Hong Kong, and expeditiously implementing the proposal to construct a high-speed rail link connecting the airports in Hong Kong and Shenzhen;
- (c) actively discussing with the Government of Guangdong Province to clearly delineate the roles and division of work between the ports and terminals in Guangdong and those in Hong Kong, so that a new setting will be formed in the Pearl River Delta Region ("PRDR") under which there is a clear demarcation of work among the ports, complementarity of edge and co-development;
- (d) strengthening co-operation among the exhibition and convention industries in PRDR, and capitalizing on Hong Kong's edge to turn the territory into a capital of international exhibitions and sales;

- (e) strengthening co-operation between Guangdong and Hong Kong in improving the overall water quality in PRDR and reducing the overall volume of water pollution, and at the same time establishing a sound system for the monitoring and prevention of air pollution, as well as striving to solve the problem of atmospheric haze;
- (f) helping higher education institutions and education providers in Hong Kong to run education institutions independently in PRDR;
- (g) deepening the implementation of the Mainland and Hong Kong Closer Economic Partnership Arrangement by expediting mutual recognition of professional qualifications in Guangdong and Hong Kong as well as lowering the thresholds of practice in PRDR for Hong Kong professionals, so as to foster the expansion of Hong Kong's service industries into PRDR;
- (h) formulating focused facilitating measures to provide convenience for PRDR residents to invest in Hong Kong's stock market, and enhancing efforts in Guangdong Province to provide information on and publicize Hong Kong stocks, so as to prepare for launching the through train scheme for Guangdong's and Hong Kong's stock markets;
- (i) strengthening various services for Hong Kong residents working and residing in PRDR, and actively considering enhancing the functions of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region Government's Economic and Trade Office in Guangdong;
- (j) strengthening tourism co-operation among Guangdong, Hong Kong and Macao, and assisting Hong Kong's tourism enterprises in operating in PRDR; and
- (k) considering setting up a Guangdong/Hong Kong/Macao Leaders' Conference to strengthen co-operation among the three places.

While Hon WONG Ting-kwong was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:06 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Samson TAM, Hon Emily LAU and Hon Mrs Regina IP, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.



The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Two Members and Hon Tanya CHAN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:09 pm, while Hon Tanya CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung said that as Hon Emily LAU's amendment to the motion included a request for reinstating the right of those Hong Kong residents who had been barred from entering the Mainland to return to their hometown, he would like to declare that he was one of them. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

12 more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Dr Hon Samson TAM moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion:

To add “, as Hong Kong is being struck by the financial tsunami, the need for new economic restructuring has become more imminent,” after “That”; to add “redefine the role and positioning of Hong Kong and” after “Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region to expeditiously”; to add “in line with the general requirement for a ‘Digital Pearl River Delta’, facilitating the sharing of online resources and interconnection and mutual access among the networks in Guangdong and Hong Kong, and jointly promoting co-operation of the two places in developing digital creative industries; (e)” after “(d)”; to delete the original “(e)” and substitute with “(f)”; to delete the original “(f)” and substitute with “(g)”; to delete the original “(g)” and substitute with “(h)”; to delete the original “(h)” and substitute with “(i)”; to delete the original “(i)” and substitute with “(j)”; to delete the original “(j)” and substitute with “(k)”; and to delete the original “(k)” and substitute with “(l)”.

Question on Dr Hon Samson TAM's amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon Samson TAM's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Emily LAU to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Emily LAU moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (m) the Central Government and the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region respecting the right of the Chinese nationals in Hong Kong to freely travel to and from the Mainland, reinstating the right of those Hong Kong residents and Members of the Legislative Council of Hong Kong who have been barred from entering the Mainland to return to their hometown, issuing Hong Kong and Macao Residents Entry and Exit Permits to these people to enhance civilian and official exchanges between the Mainland and Hong Kong, so as to further promote the development of economic and social activities in PRDR” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Emily LAU’s amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong’s motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM proposed and put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 18 were present, six were in favour of the amendment, nine against it and three abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 18 were in favour of the amendment, five against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

As Dr Hon Samson TAM’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Mrs Regina IP to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Mrs Regina IP moved the following further amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong’s motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add “; (m) strengthening co-operation between Guangdong and Hong Kong in areas such as water, air and climatic change to improve the overall environmental quality in PRDR, including formulating a set of standardized air quality objectives for both places, setting the emission reduction targets beyond 2010 for PRDR, etc; and (n) taking all effective measures to expeditiously co-operate with Shenzhen to develop the Lok Ma Chau Loop, and strengthening co-operation with Shenzhen in the development of higher education, new and high technology as well as cultural and creative industries, so as to facilitate Hong Kong’s restructuring towards a knowledge-based economy, broaden Hong Kong’s economic structure and complement the North East New Territories New Development Areas” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Mrs Regina IP’s amendment to Hon WONG Ting-kwong’s motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Ting-kwong replied.

Question on Hon WONG Ting-kwong's motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM and Hon Mrs Regina IP put and agreed to.

Comprehensively improving the effectiveness of Integrated Family Service Centres

Hon WONG Sing-chi moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the financial tsunami has brought about a severe economic winter and rapidly deteriorating atmosphere in the community, the situation of the multi-stressed and potentially high-risk families is even more acute; the Integrated Family Service Centres ("IFSCs") are the key players of the front-line social service teams which respond to family crises and prevent family tragedies, whether they can smoothly operate in responding promptly and properly to such social crises is indeed critical to alleviating people's hardship and fostering an overall harmonious atmosphere in the community; recently there have been ample evidence and voices indicating that if IFSCs are to achieve their functions under the current service mode, the Government has to adjust their service concept and operation mode, in addition to allocating additional resources to IFSCs; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to adopt the following measures:

- (a) setting up a central mechanism to regularly and comprehensively assess and co-ordinate the support and services provided by various departments;
- (b) assessing and studying afresh the mission and objectives of IFSCs, and ensuring that the information and data collected through the relevant study must be made public subject to consideration of privacy protection;
- (c) reviewing afresh the staff establishment of IFSCs to ensure that there is sufficient manpower to adequately meet the needs of potentially high-risk families, and providing preventive and support services;
- (d) clearly defining the respective roles of the Social Welfare Department ("SWD") and non-governmental organizations ("NGOs") and their division of responsibilities in respect of IFSCs;
- (e) examining in depth the difficulties faced by staff of SWD and NGOs working in IFSCs (such as being required to handle non-professional clerical work, and being authorized to vet and approve requests for social resources, etc), and formulating measures for improvement;
- (f) comprehensively reviewing the performance pledge of IFSCs, and setting a service standard that can sensitively and accurately reflect the needs of potentially high-risk families; and

- (g) formulating a comprehensive policy on family service, particularly focusing on the needs of multi-stressed and potentially high-risk families, and exploring how to support and facilitate the healthy development of families in Hong Kong.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion proposed.

The President stated that two Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the two amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che and Hon Starry LEE, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Seven Members and Hon CHAN Hak-kan spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon CHAN Hak-kan was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:07 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Fred LI, took the chair.

Two other Members and Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 6:26 pm, while Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Hon WONG Sing-chi spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare spoke again.

Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi's motion:

To delete “, as the financial tsunami has brought about a severe economic winter and rapidly deteriorating atmosphere in the community, the situation of the multi-stressed and potentially high-risk families is even more acute;” after “That”; to delete “reviewing afresh” after “(c)” and substitute with “strictly implementing”; to add “, increasing the staff ratio of both supervisory staff and senior practitioners, setting workload indicators for social workers working in IFSCs, and recruiting temporary staff to cope with the additional workload arising from social crises as necessary, so as” after “the staff establishment of IFSCs”; to add “increasing the staff establishment of frontline social workers, and monitoring non-governmental organizations (“NGOs”) so that they recruit social workers according to the salary benchmark formulated by the Government, so as to lessen their workload, boost the currently low morale among social workers and enable them to tackle family problems more

effectively; (e)” after “(d)”); to delete “clearly defining” before “the respective roles” and substitute with “striving to standardize”; to delete “non-governmental organizations (“NGOs”)” after “(“SWD”) and” and substitute with “NGOs”; to add “, and giving more powers to NGOs so that they can provide practical assistance (such as housing assistance or Comprehensive Social Security Assistance) to clients in a timely manner” after “in respect of IFSCs”; to delete the original “(e)” and substitute with “(f)”); to delete “and” after “social resources, etc.”; to add “, strengthening clerical support to staff, and referring non-core counselling or professional services to non-IFSC units for follow-up” after “improvement”; to delete the original “(f)” and substitute with “(g)”); to delete “and” after “accurately reflect the needs of potentially high-risk families;”; to delete the original “(g)” and substitute with “(h)”); and to add “; and (i) adjusting the population-to-IFSCs ratio to one IFSC serving some 80 000 to 90 000 people, and according priority to setting up IFSCs in ‘potentially high-risk communities’ ” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che’s amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon Starry LEE had indicated that she would withdraw her amendment to Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion if CHEUNG Kwok-che’s amendment was passed. Hon Starry LEE had therefore withdrawn her amendment.

Hon WONG Sing-chi replied.

Question on Hon WONG Sing-chi’s motion as amended by Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che put and agreed to.

#### Motion for the adjournment of the Council

The President said that in accordance with Rule 16(6) and (7) of the Rules of Procedure, he had determined that if at the expiration of 75 minutes from the moving of this motion, there were Members who still wished to speak, he would extend the period of the debate to the time when all Members who wished to speak had spoken, and the designated public officer had replied. As regards the speaking time, each Member might speak for up to five minutes, and the designated public officer making a reply might speak for up to 15 minutes.

Hon Albert HO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the following issue: The situation faced by Hong Kong people (including Legislative Council Members, District Council members, members of political parties, people from non-government organizations and journalists) for being persistently refused entry by the Macao Government.

Question on the motion proposed.

Twenty-four Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security replied.

While the Secretary for Security was replying, Hon LEE Wing-tat interrupted to seek elucidation of some matters raised earlier by the Secretary in his reply. The Secretary elucidated and then continued to speak.

As more than one and a half hours had lapsed since the moving of the motion, the President adjourned the Council without putting any question on the motion under Rule 16(7) of the Rules of Procedure.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 11 March 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:52 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
3 April 2009

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 04/03/2009  
時間 TIME: 04:22:42 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 劉慧卿議員對黃定光議員就「積極推動《珠江三角洲地區改革發展規劃綱要》配套政策」所提，經譚偉豪議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON EMILY LAU TO HON WONG TING-KWONG'S MOTION ON "ACTIVELY IMPLEMENTING COMPLEMENTARY POLICIES FOR THE OUTLINE OF THE PLAN FOR THE REFORM AND DEVELOPMENT OF THE PEARL RIVER DELTA" AS AMENDED BY DR HON SAMSON TAM

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	18	25	
投票 Vote	18	24	
贊成 Yes	6	18	
反對 No	9	5	
棄權 Abstain	3	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何耀泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 ALBERT HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG		陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	TAM Yiu-chung	
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG		馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM		李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG		梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK