

# LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## MINUTES

No. 22

---

**Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 18 March 2009 at 11:00 am**

---

### **Members present:**

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

**Member absent:**

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

**Public officers attending:**

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP  
The Chief Secretary for Administration

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP  
The Financial Secretary

Mr Kenneth CHEN Wei-on, JP  
Secretary for Education

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP  
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP  
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP  
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP  
Secretary for the Environment

Mr YAU Shing-mu, JP  
Secretary for Transport and Housing

**Clerks in attendance:**

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

## **Tabling of Papers**

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
Independent Police Complaints Council Ordinance (Commencement) (No. 2) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 13.3.2009)	36/2009

## **Other Papers**

- No. 74 - Hong Kong Examinations and Assessment Authority Audited Financial Statements and Report on Activities for the year ended 31 August 2008 (published on 13.3.2009)
- No. 75 - The Lord Wilson Heritage Trust Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 13.3.2009)
- No. 76 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the third quarter of 2008-09 Public Finance Ordinance: Section 8 (published on 17.3.2009)

## **Questions**

1. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

2. Hon TAM Yiu-chung asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

3. Hon IP Kwok-him asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

4. Hon James TO asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

5. Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

6. Hon Tanya CHAN asked Question 6.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

### **Motions**

#### **Proposed resolution under the Matrimonial Causes Ordinance**

The Chief Secretary for Administration moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the Matrimonial Causes (Fees) (Amendment) Rules 2009, made by the Chief Judge on 24 February 2009, be approved.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Public Finance Ordinance

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the motion in Appendix I and spoke on the motion.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Motor Vehicles (First Registration Tax) Ordinance

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the Resolution made and passed by the Legislative Council on 14 May 1997 and published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 237 of 1997, as amended –

- (a) by section 3 of the Revenue (No. 2) Ordinance 2000 (27 of 2000);
- (b) by the Resolution made and passed by the Legislative Council on 19 March 2003 and published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 77 of 2003; and
- (c) by the Resolution made and passed by the Legislative Council on 8 March 2006 and published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 53 of 2006,

be amended by repealing “2009” and substituting “2014”.

Question on the motion proposed.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

**Members' Motions**

Comprehensively reviewing the role and functions of the University Grants Committee

Prof Hon Patrick LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the international trend is that more and more countries, including the United Kingdom, New Zealand, Singapore, etc, have abolished their university grants committee mechanism, this Council urges the Government to comprehensively review the role and functions of the University Grants Committee of Hong Kong, with a view to optimizing the academic quality of local universities as well as the quality of their scientific researches, including:

- (a) complementing the switch to the '334' academic structure, fostering the interface between local universities and the top universities in the world, and strengthening mutual academic exchange and co-operation in scientific researches;
- (b) improving the mechanism for approving research funding, abandoning the vetting criterion of giving emphasis to quantity rather than quality, ensuring academic freedom, and promoting research studies which meet the needs of the local community;
- (c) allocating more funds to provide subsidized undergraduate places and for the universities to determine the intake of associate degree graduates and the number of undergraduate places that need to be substantially increased after the academic structure reform; and
- (d) promoting the development and construction of campuses under the principle of university autonomy, and developing Hong Kong into the education hub of Asia.

While Prof Hon Patrick LAU was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:49 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that seven Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the seven amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Paul CHAN, Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon Starry LEE, Hon Tanya CHAN, Hon WONG Yuk-man and Hon Mrs Regina IP, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the President's permission, Hon Starry LEE explained a point she had made earlier which she considered to be misunderstood by Hon Mrs Regina IP.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou, who intended to move an amendment to the motion, declared that he was the Clinical Associate Professor (Honorary) in the Department of Psychiatry of the Chinese University of Hong Kong. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 3:14 pm, while the Secretary for Education was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Five Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG declared that she had been teaching at the School of Law of the City University of Hong Kong for 18 years. She then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Eight other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Ir Dr Hon Raymond HO declared that in the past, he had been the Council Chairman of the former City Polytechnic of Hong Kong and the Council Chairman of the City University of Hong Kong. He was currently a Member of the Court of the City University of Hong Kong. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Five more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Education spoke again.

Hon Paul CHAN moved the following amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion:

To delete "as" after "That," and substitute with "following"; to delete "is" after "the international trend"; to add "establishing a Fifth Matching Grant Scheme, continuing to encourage universities to raise funds from the community and their alumni, strengthening the link between universities and the community, and cultivating within the community a philanthropic culture in support of the development of university education; (d)" after "(c)"; and to delete the original "(d)" and substitute with "(e)".

Question on Hon Paul CHAN's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Paul CHAN's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN:

To add "; (f) comprehensively reviewing the abolition or otherwise of the University Grants Committee of Hong Kong; (g) raising the Government's target ceiling of providing 14 500 first-year undergraduate places annually; (h) there must be participation of teacher and student representatives from the institution in the decision-making process of promoting the institution's development and allocating resources; and (i) establishing a mechanism independent of the Government to impartially handle

disputes over the allocation of resources among institutions as well as complaints from teaching and non-teaching staff of the institutions, so as to ensure that the spirit of institutional autonomy and academic freedom can be realized” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU’s motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN proposed and put.

Hon Starry LEE claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, 12 were in favour of the amendment and 12 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and nine abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Comprehensively reviewing the role and functions of the University Grants Committee” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Paul CHAN’s amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Starry LEE to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Starry LEE moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU’s motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, and explained the revised terms of her amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (f) supporting Hong Kong’s universities to operate higher education institutions in the Pearl River Delta Region and collaborate with mainland education institutions in the area of scientific research, thereby enhancing the quality of these universities’ scientific researches, so as to complement the development of Hong Kong into an education hub and nurture talents for the Pearl River Delta Region” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Starry LEE’s amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU’s motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Paul CHAN's and Hon Starry LEE's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Tanya CHAN to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN and Hon Starry LEE:

To add “; (g) expeditiously reviewing the effectiveness of the work of the University Grants Committee and, based on the review results, examining the Committee's composition, structure, statutory status, mode of connection with the Government, powers and responsibilities, as well as its mode of regulation over various education institutions; (h) in vetting research funding applications, the University Grants Committee or the various education institutions should arrange for the vetting work to be carried out by persons with research experience in the academic fields for which the funding is applied; (i) reviewing the existing target that 18% of the relevant age cohort may enrol in publicly-funded undergraduate programmes; and (j) through various feasible ways, striving to enhance the corporate governance standard of publicly-funded education institutions and improve their administration, financial and human resources management systems, so as to strengthen the protection of academic freedom and enhance the transparency of the operation of the universities” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN and Hon Starry LEE proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Paul CHAN's, Hon Starry LEE's and Hon Tanya CHAN's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon WONG Yuk-man to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon WONG Yuk-man moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, Hon Starry LEE and Hon Tanya CHAN:

To add “; (k) abolishing the existing university funding mechanism and replacing it with a university funding body which is independent of the Government, transparent, open, widely represented and comprises community representatives and stakeholders, including the management of universities and representatives of university teaching and non-teaching staff as well as students, etc; (l) the mechanism for approving research funding should promote researches in humanities education, and also ensure that there will not be uneven distribution of resources among universities, and at the same time can impartially handle complaints from teaching and non-teaching staff, so that the spirit of academic freedom can be realized; and (m) making the provision of training for local university students its primary objective, and enhancing student exchange between local universities and universities in the world under the premise of not jeopardizing education for local university students” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, Hon Starry LEE and Hon Tanya CHAN proposed and put.

Hon Starry LEE, Hon WONG Yuk-man and Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, seven were in favour of the amendment, six against it and 15 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

As Hon Paul CHAN's, Hon Starry LEE's and Hon Tanya CHAN's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Mrs Regina IP to revise the terms of her amendment.

Hon Mrs Regina IP moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, Hon Starry LEE and Hon Tanya CHAN:

To add “; (k) ensuring that universities will not, as enterprises do, set increasing income as their objective; (l) promoting knowledge creation, new and high technology as well as research studies which meet the needs of economic development; and (m) improving the teaching quality and curricula under the principle of giving priority consideration to nurturing local students, and broadening the international perspective of Hong Kong students” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Mrs Regina IP's amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, Hon Starry LEE and Hon Tanya CHAN proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Paul CHAN's, Hon Starry LEE's, Hon Tanya CHAN's and Hon Mrs Regina IP's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou to revise the terms of his amendment.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following further amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU's motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, Hon Starry LEE, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon Mrs Regina IP:

To add “; (n) adjusting Hong Kong’s current development strategy on higher education which has all along emphasized the scientific, commercial and professional disciplines, and giving greater weight to humanities to enable university students to have a more all-rounded perspective and scholastic achievement; and (o) assisting the various local universities in exploring other sources of income in addition to government funding, so that the universities can have more sufficient resources to develop their teaching and research work” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou’s amendment to Prof Hon Patrick LAU’s motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, Hon Starry LEE, Hon Tanya CHAN and Hon Mrs Regina IP proposed, put and agreed to.

Prof Hon Patrick LAU replied.

Question on Prof Hon Patrick LAU’s motion as amended by Hon Paul CHAN, Hon Starry LEE, Hon Tanya CHAN, Hon Mrs Regina IP and Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou put and agreed to.

#### Promoting the development of leisure agriculture and fishery trades

Hon WONG Yung-kan moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, being affected by the policies implemented by the SAR Government, the room for survival of the trades which rely on the production of agricultural and fishery products has been shrinking; at the same time, with changes in people’s travel patterns, many places have put emphasis on upgrading their traditional agriculture and fishery industries and developing them into leisure tourism industry, which enriches the tourism resources of these places, and creates a way out for the agriculture and fishery industries to transform; yet, the SAR Government does not attach importance to the need of the agriculture and fishery industries in Hong Kong to transform, and there is a lack of a comprehensive development policy in this regard, resulting in the development of the local leisure agriculture and fishery trades still lagging far behind; in this connection, this Council urges the Government to formulate a comprehensive policy on the development of leisure agriculture and fishery trades to develop the trades into a tourism project with local characteristics; the relevant measures should include:

- (a) under the principle of sustainable development and through appropriate tourism regulation and ecological management as well as the provision of resources, conserving natural landscape with ecological values as well as rural areas and fishing villages with traditional cultural characteristics, so as to balance the needs for conservation and tourism development;

- (b) reviewing the current restrictions relating to the transformation of the agriculture and fishery industries to engage in tourism business, so as to give the industries more room for transformation and development;
- (c) drawing on overseas experiences, enhancing the facilities of local live and fresh food wholesale markets and typhoon shelters, injecting tourism elements into such facilities to provide more diversified leisure agriculture and fishery projects; and
- (d) allocating more resources to training talents and stepping up the promotion of local leisure agriculture and fishery trades, so as to attract more tourists.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon WONG Kwok-hing would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon WONG Kwok-hing moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion and spoke on the motion and the amendment:

To delete "being affected by the policies implemented by the SAR Government," after "That," and substitute with "as the SAR Government lacks an appropriate and sustainable policy on agriculture and fishery industries, the operation of traditional agriculture and fishery industries has fallen into decline, and"; to add "local" after "survival of the"; to add "and strong resources support" after "development policy"; to add "and step up its support" after "the development of leisure agriculture and fishery trades"; to delete "and" after "projects;"; and to add " (e) considering formulating a licensing system for 'water taxis', and abolishing unnecessary regulations and restrictions on the transformation of fishing vessels, so as to provide opportunities for suitable fishing vessels to engage in the leisure fishery trade; (f) formulating policies to encourage organic farming, thereby developing related leisure organic farming activities; (g) flexibly utilizing parks and open areas, etc to develop weekend and holiday bazaars for organic agriculture and fishery products, so as to attract the public and tourists and provide additional sales channels for such products; and (h) formulating policies on revitalization and greening of agricultural lands, fish ponds and woodlands to ensure that abandoned agricultural lands will not be illegally turned into waste dumping grounds or container yards, fish ponds will not be filled up and hills will not turn bare, so as to nurture a pleasant environment and atmosphere for the development of leisure agriculture and fishery trades" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Seven Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon WONG Yung-kan spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Food and Health spoke again.

Question on Hon WONG Kwok-hing's amendment to Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Yung-kan replied.

Question on Hon WONG Yung-kan's motion as amended by Hon WONG Kwok-hing put and agreed to.

### **Next meeting**

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 1 April 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:56 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)  
President  
15 April 2009

Council Chamber  
Hong Kong

**PUBLIC FINANCE ORDINANCE**

---

**RESOLUTION**

(Under section 7(1) of the Public Finance Ordinance  
(Cap. 2))

---

**RESOLVED that –**

1. Authority is hereby given for a sum not exceeding \$61,075,637,000 to be charged on the general revenue for expenditure on the services of the Government in respect of the financial year commencing on 1 April 2009.
2. Subject to this Resolution, the sum so charged may be expended against the heads of expenditure as shown in the Estimates of Expenditure 2009-10 laid before the Legislative Council on 25 February 2009 or, where the Estimates are changed under the provisions of the Public Finance Ordinance (Cap. 2) as applied by section 7(2) of that Ordinance, as shown in the Estimates as so changed.
3. Expenditure in respect of any head of expenditure shall not exceed the aggregate of the amounts authorized by paragraph 4 to be expended in respect of the subheads in that head of expenditure.
4. Expenditure in respect of each subhead in a head of expenditure shall not exceed –

- (a) in the case of an Operating Account Recurrent subhead of expenditure, an amount equivalent to –
  - (i) except where the subhead is listed in Schedule 1 to this Resolution, 20% of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead;
  - (ii) where the subhead is listed in Schedule 1 to this Resolution, the percentage of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead that is specified in that Schedule in relation to that subhead;and
- (b) in the case of an Operating Account Non-Recurrent subhead of expenditure or a Capital Account subhead of expenditure, an amount equivalent to –
  - (i) except where the subhead is listed in Schedule 2 to this Resolution, 100% of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead;
  - (ii) where the subhead is listed in Schedule 2 to this Resolution, the amount that is specified in that Schedule in relation to that subhead,

or such other amount, not exceeding an amount equivalent to 100% of the provision shown in the Estimates in respect of that subhead, as may in any case be approved by the Financial Secretary.

SCHEDULE 1

[para. 4(a)]

	Head of Expenditure		Subhead	Percentage of provision shown in Estimates
46	General Expenses of the Civil Service	013	Personal allowances	40
59	Government Logistics Department	225	Traffic Accident Victims Assistance Scheme – levies	100
90	Labour Department	280	Contribution to the Occupational Safety and Health Council	30
		295	Contribution to the Occupational Deafness Compensation Board	30
106	Miscellaneous Services	284	Compensation	40
120	Pensions	021	Ex gratia pensions, awards and allowances	50
		026	Employees' compensation, injury, incapacity and death related payments and expenses	50
152	Government Secretariat: Commerce and Economic Development Bureau (Commerce, Industry and Tourism Branch)	000	Operational expenses	25

155	Government Secretariat: Innovation and Technology Commission	000	Operational expenses	25
170	Social Welfare Department	157	Assistance for patients and their families	100
		176	Criminal and law enforcement injuries compensation	25
		177	Emergency relief	100
		179	Comprehensive social security assistance scheme	30
		180	Social security allowance scheme	30

SCHEDULE 2

[para. 4(b)]

	Head of Expenditure		Subhead	Amount \$
106	Miscellaneous Services	689	Additional commitments	0
		789	Additional commitments	1,000,000,000
184	Transfers to Funds	984	Payment to the Capital Works Reserve Fund	0
		988	Payment to the Loan Fund	0

投票 VOTE: 1  
日期 DATE: 18/03/2009  
時間 TIME: 06:05:51 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張文光議員對劉秀成議員就「全面檢討大學教育資助委員會的角色與職能」所提，經陳茂波議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG TO PROF HON PATRICK LAU'S MOTION ON "COMPREHENSIVELY REVIEWING THE ROLE AND FUNCTIONS OF THE UNIVERSITY GRANTS COMMITTEE" AS AMENDED BY HON PAUL CHAN

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	12	19	
反對 No	0	0	
棄權 Abstain	12	9	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	贊成 YES	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	贊成 YES	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩珍 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2  
日期 DATE: 18/03/2009  
時間 TIME: 06:12:06 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 黃毓民議員對劉秀成議員就「全面檢討大學教育資助委員會的角色與職能」所提，經陳茂波議員、~~及~~李慧琼議員~~及~~陳淑莊議員修正的議案，作出的修正案  
AMENDMENT BY HON WONG YUK-MAN TO PROF HON PATRICK LAU'S MOTION ON "COMPREHENSIVELY REVIEWING THE ROLE AND FUNCTIONS OF THE UNIVERSITY GRANTS COMMITTEE" AS AMENDED BY HON PAUL CHAN, ~~AND~~ HON STARRY LEE ~~AND~~ HON TANYA CHAN

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	29	
投票 Vote	24	28	
贊成 Yes	4	7	
反對 No	13	6	
棄權 Abstain	7	15	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
<b>功能團體 Functional Constituencies</b>		<b>地方選區 Geographical Constituencies</b>	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat		劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	棄權 ABSTAIN	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	贊成 YES	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳淑莊 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	棄權 ABSTAIN