

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 26

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 6 May 2009 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Members absent:

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Public officers attending:

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

Ms Julia LEUNG Fung-ye, JP
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (India) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	73/2009
2. Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Variation of Schedule: India) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	74/2009
3. Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) (India) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	75/2009
4. Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (Italy) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	76/2009
5. Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Variation of Schedule: New Zealand) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	77/2009
6. Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) (New Zealand) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	78/2009
7. Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (Russia) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	79/2009
8. Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Variation of Schedule: Russia) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	80/2009
9. Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) (Russia) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	81/2009
10. Inland Revenue (Double Taxation Relief and Prevention of Fiscal Evasion with respect to Taxes on Income) (Socialist Republic of Vietnam) Order (gazetted on 30.4.2009)	82/2009

- | | | |
|-----|---|---------|
| 11. | Electronic Transactions Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 3) Order 2009 (gazetted on 30.4.2009) | 83/2009 |
| 12. | Electronic Transactions (Exclusion) (Amendment) Order 2009 (gazetted on 30.4.2009) | 84/2009 |
| 13. | Port Control (Public Cargo Working Area) Order 2009 (gazetted on 30.4.2009) | 85/2009 |
| 14. | Product Eco-responsibility Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.4.2009) | 86/2009 |
| 15. | Product Eco-responsibility (Plastic Shopping Bags) Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 30.4.2009) | 87/2009 |

Questions

1. Hon LEE Cheuk-yan asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

2. Hon Tommy CHEUNG asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

3. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

4. Hon Alan LEONG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Hon Paul TSE declared that his solicitors' firm had also handled bankruptcy cases outsourced by the Official Receiver's Office. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

5. Dr Hon Joseph LEE asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon Jeffrey LAM asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Hon Andrew LEUNG declared that he was the Chairman of the Vocational Training Council. He then asked his supplementary question and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Another Member asked a supplementary question and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG declared that she was a volunteer of the Chi Lin Nunnery. She then asked her supplementary question and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Two more Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Voting by Imprisoned Persons Bill
Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2009
Copyright (Amendment) Bill 2009

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Voting by Imprisoned Persons Bill

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Mandatory Provident Fund Schemes (Amendment) Bill 2009

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Copyright (Amendment) Bill 2009

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Members' Motions

Demanding a comprehensive reform of the Hong Kong Monetary Authority

The President reminded Members that the Council had authorized a subcommittee under the House Committee to carry out an investigation on issues arising from Lehman Brothers-related minibonds and structured financial products. In accordance with Rule 31(2)(b) of the Rules of Procedure, the subject matter of a motion not intended to have legislative effect proposed by Members might not be substantially the same as the matters being considered by the Subcommittee. The President said that he considered that Hon Albert CHAN's motion and the amendments proposed by other Members did not contravene Rule 31(2)(b) of the Rules of Procedure. However, he reminded Members that they should refrain from speaking on the matters currently under the scrutiny of the Subcommittee. Also, according to the practice and procedure for the Subcommittee endorsed by the House Committee, all Members, including non-Subcommittee members, should refrain from making comments relating to the hearing outside the proceedings.

Hon Albert CHAN moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, as the Hong Kong Monetary Authority ('HKMA') has been seriously lacking transparency and accountability for many years and has failed to effectively monitor financial institutions, and its performance is disappointing, causing the development of the financial industry in Hong Kong to be at a standstill; moreover, the recent decision of the Central Government to develop Shanghai into another international financial centre in addition to Hong Kong will definitely further threaten Hong Kong's position as a financial centre, this Council therefore urges the Government to expeditiously conduct a comprehensive review of HKMA and implement reforms to restore public confidence in the financial system of Hong Kong; such reforms include:

- (a) expeditiously implementing a comprehensive reform of the staffing and organization of HKMA, formulating a clear accountability mechanism, and replacing the management whose performance was poor for many years;
- (b) assigning the responsibilities of developing the financial market and regulating the banking system, and managing the foreign exchange reserve to maintain the stability of Hong Kong dollars to two institutions respectively;
- (c) formulating a clear mechanism for the appointment of senior staff of the above two institutions, under which the management should be recruited by open recruitment, and stipulating a definite contract period and devising reasonable remuneration packages to ensure that the remuneration of these staff will not be substantially higher than that of the Chief Executive; and
- (d) enhancing the transparency of personal investments made by senior staff of the above two institutions, requiring the key management staff to make public the details of all their investment items, and prohibiting the management of these institutions from making personal investments in the stock market.

While Hon Albert CHAN was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:17 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed.

The President's Deputy stated that three Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the three amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon James TO, Hon WONG Yuk-man and Hon Ronny TONG, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke on the motion and the amendments.

One Member and Dr Hon David LI spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 2:23 pm, while Dr Hon David LI was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Sixteen other Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Albert CHAN spoke on the amendments.

The Financial Secretary spoke again.

With the President's permission, Hon James TO elucidated a point he had made in his earlier speech, which he considered was misunderstood by Hon Albert CHAN.

Hon James TO moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion:

To delete “, as the Hong Kong Monetary Authority (‘HKMA’) has been seriously lacking transparency and accountability for many years and has failed to effectively monitor financial institutions, and its performance is disappointing, causing the development of the financial industry in Hong Kong to be at a standstill; moreover, the recent decision of the Central Government to develop Shanghai into another international financial centre in addition to Hong Kong will definitely further threaten Hong Kong’s position as a financial centre” after “That” and substitute with “the Lehman Minibonds incident has caused the public to question whether the Hong Kong Monetary Authority (‘HKMA’) is effective in monitoring the non-deposit-taking and non-lending businesses of banks”; to delete “expeditiously implementing a comprehensive reform of the staffing and organization of HKMA, formulating a clear accountability mechanism, and replacing the management whose performance was poor for many years” after “(a)” and substitute with “introducing independent legislation on the operation of HKMA to enhance its transparency and public accountability”; to add “studying” after “(b)”; to delete “the above two institutions” after “appointment of senior staff of” and substitute with “HKMA”; to add “and other means” after “open recruitment”; to delete “of these staff will not be substantially

higher than that of the Chief Executive” after “ensure that the remuneration” and substitute with “is comparable to that of the governors of central banks in other advanced countries”; to delete “the above two institutions,” after “personal investments made by senior staff of” and substitute with “HKMA, and”; to delete “make public the details of” after “requiring the key management staff to” and substitute with “report”; and to delete “, and prohibiting the management of these institutions from making personal investments in the stock market” immediately before the full stop and substitute with “to the Chief Executive for record and to update them regularly for monitoring”.

Question on Hon James TO’s amendment to Hon Albert CHAN’s motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, six against it and 16 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 27 were present, 14 were in favour of the amendment, four against it and eight abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “Demanding a comprehensive reform of the Hong Kong Monetary Authority” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon WONG Yuk-man moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN’s motion:

To add “recently Joseph YAM, Chief Executive of HKMA, still had a substantial increase of 15% in remuneration despite the loss recorded in the Exchange Fund, such behaviour should be subject to strong condemnation, and Joseph YAM should also step down for this as he owes it to Hong Kong people; moreover, HKMA” after “many years and”.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man’s amendment to Hon Albert CHAN’s motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, 18 against the amendment and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, eight against it and 15 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion:

To delete "assigning the responsibilities of developing the financial market and regulating the banking system, and managing the foreign exchange reserve to maintain the stability of Hong Kong dollars to two institutions respectively" after "(b)" and substitute with "studying the establishment of an independent investment bank to be specifically responsible for the investment of the foreign exchange reserve, stabilization of the Hong Kong dollar and the general functions of a central bank"; to delete "the above two institutions" after "appointment of senior staff of" and substitute with "HKMA"; to delete "the above two institutions" after "personal investments made by senior staff of" and substitute with "HKMA"; and to delete "of these institutions" after "prohibiting the management".

Question on Hon Ronny TONG's amendment to Hon Albert CHAN's motion proposed, put and negatived.

Hon Albert CHAN replied.

Question on Hon Albert CHAN's motion put.

Hon Albert CHAN claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 26 were present, three were in favour of the motion, 18 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, six were in favour of the motion, eight against it and 13 abstained. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Promoting green economy

Hon Alan LEONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council urges the Government to take the following specific actions to promote green economy, so that it will become an economic driver of Hong Kong's future development to create employment opportunities on the one hand, and at the same time reverse the trend of deterioration in the environment:

- (a) making reference to the recommendations in the global report released by the United Nations Environment Programme in February this year and the Central Government's scale of investment, allocating at least an additional HK\$30 billion in this and next year to develop green economy, and focusing efforts on five areas, namely energy for health, green buildings, sustainable transport, circular economy and resource productivity, to create more employment opportunities;
- (b) expeditiously upgrading Hong Kong's environmental quality standards for air, potable water, effluent discharge, energy and land use, so as to expand the markets for local green products and professional services and promote green trade;
- (c) assuming the role of leader in green economy to enhance the requirements of government departments for green procurement and implement such requirements within the current year; and
- (d) making optimal use of the existing foundation laid by scientific research on environmental protection to foster public and private investment in scientific research on green products, with a view to turning the achievements of Hong Kong's scientific research into commodities that are beneficial to the Earth.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Andrew LEUNG, who would move an amendment to the motion, declared that he was the Chairman of the Hong Kong Productivity Council. He then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon KAM Nai-wai, who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG, who would move an amendment to the motion, declared that she was the Chairperson of the Green Council. She then spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Twelve Members and Prof Hon Patrick LAU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Prof Hon Patrick LAU was speaking, the President left the chair at 6:49 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another Member and Hon Tanya CHAN spoke on the motion and the amendments.

At 7:06 pm, while Hon Tanya CHAN was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Two more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon Alan LEONG spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for the Environment spoke again.

Hon Andrew LEUNG moved the following amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion:

To add “, the Financial Secretary has proposed in the Budget this year that promoting investments and economic activities that protect the environment and save energy will put the overall economy on a more sustainable path,” after “That”; to add “and reduce the costs of energy and materials of the community and enterprises” after “create employment opportunities”; to add “and enhance Hong Kong's competitiveness” after “in the environment”; to delete “and” after “current year;”; and to add “; (e) providing greater economic incentives and more encouragement to attract the transportation industry and the public to use electric vehicles; (f) expeditiously introducing a financial assistance scheme to assist local property owners and enterprises in formulating energy-saving targets and undertaking initiatives to reduce carbon dioxide emissions; and (g) organizing the environmental services sector and the recycling industry in Hong Kong and increasing the assistance for them, so as to provide employment opportunities for low-skilled workers; considering establishing social enterprises to provide environmental and recycling services, and providing subsidies and appropriate complementary arrangements for such enterprises, with a view to fully maximizing the benefits of the EcoPark” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Andrew LEUNG's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon CHAN Hak-kan to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon CHAN Hak-kan moved the following further amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG:

To add “; (h) establishing an emissions trading platform and expeditiously enacting relevant legislation to develop Hong Kong into a centre for emissions trading; (i) formulating a certification mechanism and labelling scheme for green products; (j) adopting more pro-active measures to strengthen the conservation of natural environment, as well as further developing Hong Kong's ecotourism through effective tourism management; and (k) making optimal use of the restored landfills to facilitate the production of renewable energy and promote the development of other environmental enterprises in Hong Kong” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHAN Hak-kan's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Andrew LEUNG's and Hon CHAN Hak-kan's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon KAM Nai-wai to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon KAM Nai-wai moved the following further amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG and Hon CHAN Hak-kan:

To add “; (l) complementing the promotion of green economy through policy changes, including, in the transport aspect, providing subsidies for franchised bus companies to replace old vehicles; (m) providing relevant facilities for the introduction of electric vehicles, including providing adequate charging apparatuses and constructing plants for manufacturing vehicle batteries; (n) operating the EcoPark in the mode of an industrial estate, flexibly adjusting the areas of lands for lease according to the needs of the applicants, and leasing the lands at low rents so as to attract investors in the environmental protection industry; and (o) encouraging the development of a waste recovery economy, establishing a licensing regime for waste collectors and providing operation space, tax concession as well as technical support for waste collectors” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon KAM Nai-wai's amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG and Hon CHAN Hak-kan proposed, put and agreed to.

As Hon Andrew LEUNG's, Hon CHAN Hak-kan's and Hon KAM Nai-wai's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG to revise the terms of her amendment.

Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG moved the following further amendment to Hon Alan LEONG's motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon KAM Nai-wai:

To add “; (p) establishing an ‘advisory committee on green economy’ and appointing representatives from different industries to sit on it, turning the notion of green economy into different types of front-line jobs so as to create more employment opportunities, and assisting the entire population in boarding the express train of green economy; and (q) enhancing education and publicity to instil the concept of green living in the public” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG’s amendment to Hon Alan LEONG’s motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG, Hon CHAN Hak-kan and Hon KAM Nai-wai proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon Alan LEONG replied.

Question on Hon Alan LEONG’s motion as amended by Hon Andrew LEUNG, Hon CHAN Hak-kan, Hon KAM Nai-wai and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG put and agreed to.

Motion for the adjournment of the Council

The President said that in accordance with Rule 16(6) and (7) of the Rules of Procedure, he had determined that if at the expiration of 75 minutes from the moving of this motion, there were Members who still wished to speak, he would extend the period of the debate to the time when all Members who wished to speak had spoken, and the designated public officer had replied. As regards the speaking time, each Member might speak up to five minutes, and the designated public officer making a reply might speak up to 15 minutes.

Hon LAU Kong-wah moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the following issue:
Commencement of the Independent Police Complaints Council Ordinance.

Question on the motion proposed.

Five Members spoke on the motion.

Dr Hon Joseph LEE declared that he was one of the Vice-chairmen of the Independent Police Complaints Council. He then spoke on the motion.

Three other Members spoke on the motion.

Hon Abraham SHEK declared that he was the Vice-chairman of the Independent Police Complaints Council. He then spoke on the motion.

One more Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 13 May 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 9:12 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
1 June 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 06/05/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:20:27 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 涂謹申議員對陳偉業議員的「要求全面改革香港金融管理局」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON JAMES TO TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON "DEMANDING A
 COMPREHENSIVE REFORM OF THE HONG KONG MONETARY AUTHORITY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 涂謹申 James TO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	27	
投票 Vote	25	26	
贊成 Yes	3	14	
反對 No	6	4	
棄權 Abstain	16	8	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	贊成 YES	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	反對 NO
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	棄權 ABSTAIN
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	棄權 ABSTAIN
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 06/05/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:23:30 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 黃毓民議員對陳偉業議員的「要求全面改革香港金融管理局」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON WONG YUK-MAN TO HON ALBERT CHAN'S MOTION ON
 "DEMANDING A COMPREHENSIVE REFORM OF THE HONG KONG MONETARY
 AUTHORITY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	28	
投票 Vote	25	27	
贊成 Yes	0	4	
反對 No	18	8	
棄權 Abstain	7	15	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培志 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驊 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	棄權 ABSTAIN

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 3
 日期 DATE: 06/05/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:29:00 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「要求全面改革香港金融管理局」議案
 MOTION ON "DEMANDING A COMPREHENSIVE REFORM OF THE HONG KONG
 MONETARY AUTHORITY"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳偉業 Albert CHAN

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	26	28	
投票 Vote	26	27	
贊成 Yes	3	6	
反對 No	18	8	
棄權 Abstain	5	13	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI	反對 NO	何俊仁 Albert HO	棄權 ABSTAIN
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG	棄權 ABSTAIN	李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	李華明 Fred LI	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan		LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	棄權 ABSTAIN
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	棄權 ABSTAIN
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	棄權 ABSTAIN
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	贊成 YES	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	棄權 ABSTAIN
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	棄權 ABSTAIN
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	反對 NO	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	Dr Priscilla LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	棄權 ABSTAIN
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	贊成 YES	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

秘書 CLERK