

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 30

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 27 May 2009 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Members absent:

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Public officers attending:

The Hon John TSANG Chun-wah, JP
The Financial Secretary

The Hon WONG Yan-lung, SC, JP
The Secretary for Justice

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Dr the Hon York CHOW Yat-ngok, SBS, JP
Secretary for Food and Health

The Hon TSANG Tak-sing, JP
Secretary for Home Affairs

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

The Hon Eva CHENG, JP
Secretary for Transport and Housing

The Hon Mrs Rita LAU NG Wai-lan, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Mr Raymond TAM Chi-yuen, JP
Under Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Constance LI TSOI Yeuk-lin, Assistant Secretary General (1)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N.</u>
<u>No.</u>	
1. Air Pollution Control (Volatile Organic Compounds) (Amendment) Regulation 2009 (gazetted on 22.5.2009)	107/2009
2. Prevention and Control of Disease Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule 2) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 22.5.2009)	108/2009
3. Fixed Penalty (Smoking Offences) Ordinance (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 22.5.2009)	109/2009
4. Fixed Penalty (Smoking Offences) Regulation (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 22.5.2009)	110/2009
5. Fixed Penalty (Smoking Offences) (Specification of Authorities and Public Officers) Notice (Commencement) Notice (gazetted on 22.5.2009)	111/2009

Other Papers

- No. 94 - Report by the Trustee of the Correctional Services Children's Education Trust for the period from 1st September 2007 to 31st August 2008 (published on 21.5.2009)
- No. 95 - Broadcasting Authority Annual Report 2007-2008 (published on 22.5.2009)
- No. 96 - Report of changes to the approved Estimates of Expenditure approved during the fourth quarter of 2008-09 Public Finance Ordinance: Section 8 (published on 25.5.2009)

Questions

1. Hon WONG Ting-kwong asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

Six Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development replied.

2. Hon Miriam LAU asked Question 2.

The Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

Five Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Transport and Housing replied.

3. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Education replied.

Three Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education replied.

4. Hon WONG Sing-chi asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Food and Health replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Food and Health replied.

5. Hon WONG Kwok-hing asked Question 5.

The Secretary for the Environment replied.

Two Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for the Environment replied.

6. Hon IP Wai-ming asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions. The Secretary for Food and Health and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Village Representative Election Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2009
Merchant Shipping (Safety) (Amendment) Bill 2009

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Village Representative Election Legislation (Miscellaneous Amendments) Bill 2009

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Merchant Shipping (Safety) (Amendment) Bill 2009

The Secretary for Transport and Housing moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Motions

Proposed resolution under the Legal Aid Ordinance

The Secretary for Home Affairs moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that the Legal Aid Ordinance (Cap. 91) be amended –

- (a) in section 5(1), by repealing “\$165,700” and substituting “\$175,800”;
- (b) in section 5A(b) –
 - (i) by repealing “\$165,700” and substituting “\$175,800”;
 - (ii) by repealing “\$460,300” and substituting “\$488,400”.

Question on the motion proposed.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the motion as the Chairman of the Subcommittee on Proposed Resolution under Section 7(a) of the Legal Aid Ordinance (Cap. 91), and then in his personal capacity as a Member.

Four Members spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Home Affairs replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Dr Hon Joseph LEE moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that in relation to the —

- (a) Fixed Penalty (Smoking Offences) Regulation, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 66 of 2009; and
- (b) Fixed Penalty (Smoking Offences) (Specification of Authorities and Public Officers) Notice, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 67 of 2009,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 29 April 2009, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 17 June 2009.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The 4 June incident

Hon James TO raised the issue that as Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's and Hon Tanya CHAN's amendments mentioned matters which were clearly the responsibility of the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region, the Administration should designate public officers to respond to such matters.

The President stated that the Rules of Procedure provided that designated public officer might attend meetings of this Council, but the Rules did not provide that they must attend. The Administration had already informed the Secretariat prior to the Council meeting that no designated public officer would respond to the motion and any amendments thereto.

Hon James TO requested the President to make a last attempt to contact the Administration to see if it would designate public officers to attend the motion debate. He might propose to adjourn the motion debate until there were public officers attending the debate to speak on the policies within their purview.

The President stated that Hon James TO's request was not a procedural matter. As the Administration had replied that it would not designate any public officer to attend the debate, he considered that there was no justification to suspend the meeting so as to approach the Administration on this matter. Nevertheless, in the course of the debate, he would ask the Secretariat to convey Hon James TO's view to the Administration once more. If there was any change, he believed that the public officers designated by the Administration could join the debate in time.

Hon Albert HO drew the attention of the President to the absence of a quorum.

The President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council urges that: the 4 June incident be not forgotten and the 1989 pro-democracy movement be vindicated.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed.

The President stated that four Members would move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the four amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung, who would move an amendment to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung was speaking, the President left the chair at 2:17 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong, Hon Albert HO and Hon Tanya CHAN who would move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Seven Members and Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion and the amendments.

While Hon Cyd HO was speaking, Hon CHIM Pui-chung said that he wished Hon Cyd HO to withdraw her earlier remarks on his speech, but was refused by Hon Cyd HO.

At 3:44 pm, while Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Nine other Members and Hon Emily LAU spoke on the motion and the amendments.

With the President's permission, Hon Paul CHAN elucidated a point he made earlier which he considered to be misunderstood by Hon Emily LAU.

Two more Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan spoke on the amendments.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion:

To delete "and" after "the 4 June incident be not forgotten" and substitute with ", the responsibility for the crackdown be ascertained,"; and to add ", political prisoners be released, one-party dictatorship be ended, and democratic elections by universal suffrage be held for the whole nation" immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung's amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and six abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Miriam LAU rose to move the following motion without notice:

That in the event of further divisions in relation to the motion on “The 4 June incident” or amendments thereto, the Council do proceed to each of such divisions after the division bell has been rung for one minute.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan’s motion:

To add “, and urges the Education Bureau to include the 4 June incident in 1989 in the junior secondary and new senior secondary curriculum guides for Chinese History” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan’s motion proposed and put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, seven against it and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Albert HO moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan’s motion:

To add “, and urges the Central Government to endorse the principles and concepts of Charter 08, and stop detaining and keeping under surveillance the people who initiated and jointly signed the Charter, so as to prepare for the vindication of the 1989 pro-democracy movement” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Albert HO's amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 13 against it and five abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix III.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon Tanya CHAN moved the following amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion:

To add “; at the same time, this Council considers that the remarks about the 4 June incident made by the Chief Executive at the meeting of this Council on 14 May 2009 cannot represent the opinion of Hong Kong people as a whole, and also expresses grave dismay and anger at such remarks” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Tanya CHAN's amendment to Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion proposed and put.

Hon Albert HO claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 21 were present, three were in favour of the amendment, 11 against it and seven abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the amendment and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix IV.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negated.

Hon LEE Cheuk-yan replied.

Question on Hon LEE Cheuk-yan's motion put.

Hon IP Kwok-him claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 49(5) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 22 were present, four were in favour of the motion, seven were against it and 11 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 29 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion and nine against it. (Voting record in Appendix V.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

Implementation of One Country, Two Systems

Hon Emily LAU moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That, it was reported in Wen Wei Po on 11 March 2009 that LI Guikang, Deputy Director of the Central Government Liaison Office ('the Liaison Office'), said at a group meeting of Hong Kong ('HK') members of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference ('CPPCC') held in Beijing on 10 March 2009 that the Liaison Office and the Special Administrative Region ('SAR') Government had reached a 10-point agreement to allow HK members of CPPCC to participate in the political affairs of the SAR, which includes: should there be suitable talents among the HK members of CPPCC, the SAR Government may appoint them to public offices or award them Medals of Honour; the SAR Government should accord them treatment according to protocol and provide venues for them to hold activities; if conducting visits in the Mainland, the SAR Government officials may approach them for company, etc; moreover, in January last year, CAO Erbao, Head of the Research Department of the Liaison Office, published an article entitled 'Hong Kong's Governing Forces under One Country, Two Systems' in Study Times, pointing out that there are two governing teams in HK; one is 'a team of the establishment of the HKSAR', comprising the Chief Executive, principal officials, Executive Council members and civil servants of various ranks, judges and other judicial officers, etc, while the other is 'a team of the Central Government and Mainland cadres engaging in Hong Kong affairs', comprising competent authorities and representative offices of the Central Government responsible for Hong Kong affairs or specialized in work related to Hong Kong, competent authorities of the Central Government responsible for other national affairs and relevant policies, and party cadres of the relevant mainland provinces/regions/municipalities having close ties with the HKSAR, as well as government cadres responsible for matters involving HK, so as to rationalize the comments and acts of the Liaison Office and various provincial, municipal and local governments to interfere in the HKSAR affairs; in this connection, this Council urges:

- (a) the Central Government and SAR Government to solemnly clarify whether there is such a 10-point agreement and whether two governing teams exist in HK;

- (b) the Central Government to strictly abide by the Basic Law and require that no Central Government departments and local governments may interfere in the affairs which the HKSAR Government administers on its own; and
- (c) the Central Government to restrain the Liaison Office and other mainland officials from making impudent comments, so as to avoid creating confusion in governance and causing the public to worry and panic;

thereby implementing 'One Country, Two Systems', 'Hong Kong people ruling Hong Kong' and 'a high degree of autonomy'.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion.

Twelve Members and Hon Cyd HO spoke on the motion.

While Hon Cyd HO was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:14 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Another Member spoke on the motion.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Hon Emily LAU replied.

At 7:37 pm, while Hon Emily LAU was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Question on Hon Emily LAU's motion put.

Hon Emily LAU claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 19 were present, one was in favour of the motion, 16 against it and two abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 28 were present, 19 were in favour of the motion and eight against it. (Voting record in Appendix VI.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negatived.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 3 June 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 7:42 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)

President

24 June 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 27/05/2009
 時間 TIME: 05:13:12 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 梁國雄議員對李卓人議員的「六四事件」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON LEUNG KWOK-HUNG TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S MOTION ON
 "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	29	
投票 Vote	22	28	
贊成 Yes	3	19	
反對 No	13	9	
棄權 Abstain	6	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驛 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

Constance

投票 VOTE: 2
日期 DATE: 27/05/2009
時間 TIME: 05:16:17 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 張文光議員對李卓人議員的「六四事件」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON CHEUNG MAN-KWONG TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S MOTION ON
"THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 張文光CHEUNG Man-kwong

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	29	
投票 Vote	22	28	
贊成 Yes	4	19	
反對 No	7	9	
棄權 Abstain	11	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國賢 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 Li Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

Constance

投票 VOTE: 3
日期 DATE: 27/05/2009
時間 TIME: 05:18:26 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 何俊仁議員對李卓人議員的「六四事件」議案，作出的修正案
AMENDMENT BY HON ALBERT HO TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S MOTION ON "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 何俊仁 Albert HO

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	29	
投票 Vote	21	28	
贊成 Yes	3	19	
反對 No	13	9	
棄權 Abstain	5	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK



投票 VOTE: 4
 日期 DATE: 27/05/2009
 時間 TIME: 05:20:43 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 陳淑莊議員對李卓人議員的「六四事件」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON TANYA CHAN TO HON LEE CHEUK-YAN'S MOTION ON "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 陳淑莊 CHAN Tanya

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	21	29	
投票 Vote	21	28	
贊成 Yes	3	19	
反對 No	11	9	
棄權 Abstain	7	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN		何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Stary LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 5
 日期 DATE: 27/05/2009
 時間 TIME: 05:29:40 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「六四事件」議案
 MOTION ON "THE 4 JUNE INCIDENT"

動議人 MOVED BY: 李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	22	29	
投票 Vote	22	28	
贊成 Yes	4	19	
反對 No	7	9	
棄權 Abstain	11	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	棄權 ABSTAIN	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK		譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying		陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	棄權 ABSTAIN	余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE	贊成 YES	王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	反對 NO	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	棄權 ABSTAIN	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	棄權 ABSTAIN	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau	贊成 YES	陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming		Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE		黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	反對 NO

秘書 CLERK

投票 VOTE: 6
日期 DATE: 27/05/2009
時間 TIME: 07:41:26 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「落實一國兩制」議案
MOTION ON "IMPLEMENTATION OF ONE COUNTRY, TWO SYSTEMS"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉慧卿 Emily LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	19	28	
投票 Vote	19	27	
贊成 Yes	1	19	
反對 No	16	8	
棄權 Abstain	2	0	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO		曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	贊成 YES
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	贊成 YES
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG		余若薇 Audrey EU	贊成 YES
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung		張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	贊成 YES
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai		甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	反對 NO
梁家騮 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che		陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	

秘書 CLERK