

LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

MINUTES

No. 31

Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 3 June 2009 at 11:00 am

Members present:

President

The Hon Jasper TSANG Yok-sing, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert HO Chun-yan

Ir Dr the Hon Raymond HO Chung-tai, SBS, S.B.St.J., JP

The Hon LEE Cheuk-yan

Dr the Hon David LI Kwok-po, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Fred LI Wah-ming, JP

The Hon James TO Kun-sun

The Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong

The Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Sophie LEUNG LAU Yau-fun, GBS, JP

The Hon LEUNG Yiu-chung

Dr the Hon Philip WONG Yu-hong, GBS

The Hon WONG Yung-kan, SBS, JP

The Hon LAU Kong-wah, JP

The Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP

The Hon Miriam LAU Kin-yee, GBS, JP

The Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

The Hon Andrew CHENG Kar-foo

The Hon TAM Yiu-chung, GBS, JP

The Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP

The Hon LI Fung-ying, BBS, JP

The Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan, SBS, JP

The Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS, JP

The Hon Audrey EU Yuet-mee, SC, JP

The Hon Vincent FANG Kang, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH

The Hon LEE Wing-tat

Dr the Hon Joseph LEE Kok-long, JP

The Hon Jeffrey LAM Kin-fung, SBS, JP

The Hon Andrew LEUNG Kwan-yuen, SBS, JP

The Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC

The Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung

The Hon CHEUNG Hok-ming, SBS, JP

The Hon WONG Ting-kwong, BBS

The Hon Ronny TONG Ka-wah, SC

The Hon CHIM Pui-chung

Prof the Hon Patrick LAU Sau-shing, SBS, JP

The Hon KAM Nai-wai, MH

The Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan

The Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

Dr the Hon LAM Tai-fai, BBS, JP

The Hon CHAN Hak-kan

The Hon Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP

The Hon CHAN Kin-por, JP

The Hon Tanya CHAN

Dr the Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun

Dr the Hon LEUNG Ka-lau

The Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che

The Hon WONG Sing-chi

The Hon WONG Kwok-kin, BBS

The Hon WONG Yuk-man

The Hon IP Wai-ming, MH

The Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP

The Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS, JP

Dr the Hon PAN Pey-chyou

The Hon Paul TSE Wai-chun

Dr the Hon Samson TAM Wai-ho, JP

Members absent:

Dr the Hon Margaret NG

The Hon Timothy FOK Tsun-ting, GBS, JP

The Hon Albert CHAN Wai-yip

Public officers attending:

The Hon Henry TANG Ying-yen, GBS, JP
The Chief Secretary for Administration

Prof the Hon K C CHAN, SBS, JP
The Financial Secretary and
Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury

The Hon Michael SUEN Ming-yeung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Education

The Hon Stephen LAM Sui-lung, JP
Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs

The Hon Ambrose LEE Siu-kwong, IDSM, JP
Secretary for Security

The Hon Matthew CHEUNG Kin-chung, GBS, JP
Secretary for Labour and Welfare

The Hon Mrs Carrie LAM CHENG Yuet-ngor, JP
Secretary for Development

The Hon Edward YAU Tang-wah, JP
Secretary for the Environment

Mr Gregory SO Kam-leung, JP
Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development

Clerks in attendance:

Ms Pauline NG Man-wah, Secretary General

Mrs Vivian KAM NG Lai-man, Assistant Secretary General (2)

Mrs Justina LAM CHENG Bo-ling, Assistant Secretary General (3)

Mrs Percy MA, Assistant Secretary General (Special Duties)

Noting the absence of a quorum, the President directed the Clerk to summon Members to the meeting. A quorum was then present.

Tabling of Papers

The following papers were laid on the table pursuant to Rule 21(2) of the Rules of Procedure:

<u>Subsidiary Legislation / Instruments</u>	<u>L.N. No.</u>
1. Ozone Layer Protection Ordinance (Amendment of Schedule) Order 2009 (gazetted on 29.5.2009)	114/2009
2. Tax Reserve Certificates (Rate of Interest) (No. 3) Notice 2009 (gazetted on 29.5.2009)	115/2009

Questions

1. Hon CHEUNG Kwok-che asked Question 1.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Education and the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs replied.

2. Hon Fred LI asked Question 2.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Eight Members asked supplementary questions and the Financial Secretary replied.

3. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung asked Question 3.

The Secretary for Development replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Development replied.

4. Hon Andrew CHENG asked Question 4.

The Secretary for Security replied.

Ten Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Security replied.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung sought elucidation of a point raised by the Secretary for Security in his reply.

The Secretary for Security elucidated.

5. Hon WONG Yuk-man asked Question 5.

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

Four Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Labour and Welfare replied.

6. Hon Vincent FANG asked Question 6.

The Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Seven Members asked supplementary questions and the Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury replied.

Written replies to Questions 7 to 20 were tabled for Members' information.

Bills

First Reading

Occupational Deafness (Compensation) (Amendment) Bill 2009
Genetically Modified Organisms (Control of Release) Bill

The Bills were read the first time and ordered to be set down for Second Reading pursuant to Rule 53(3) of the Rules of Procedure.

Second Reading

Occupational Deafness (Compensation) (Amendment) Bill 2009

The Secretary for Labour and Welfare moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Genetically Modified Organisms (Control of Release) Bill

The Secretary for the Environment moved the Second Reading and spoke on the Bill.

Question on the Second Reading proposed. The President stated that in accordance with Rule 54(4) of the Rules of Procedure, the debate was adjourned and the Bill was referred to the House Committee.

Members' Motions

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon James TO moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that in relation to the —

- (a) Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (India) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 73 of 2009;
- (b) Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Variation of Schedule: India) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 74 of 2009;
- (c) Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) (India) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 75 of 2009;
- (d) Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (Italy) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 76 of 2009;
- (e) Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Variation of Schedule: New Zealand) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 77 of 2009;
- (f) Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) (New Zealand) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 78 of 2009;

- (g) Consular Relations (Additional Privileges and Immunities) (Russia) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 79 of 2009;
- (h) Administration of Estates by Consular Officers Ordinance (Variation of Schedule: Russia) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 80 of 2009; and
- (i) Consular Conventions (Application of Section 3) (Russia) Order, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 81 of 2009,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 6 May 2009, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 24 June 2009.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance

Hon Paul TSE moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that in relation to the —

- (a) Race Discrimination (Formal Investigations) Rules, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 94 of 2009; and
- (b) Race Discrimination (Investigation and Conciliation) Rules, published in the Gazette as Legal Notice No. 95 of 2009,

and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 13 May 2009, the period for amending subsidiary legislation referred to in section 34(2) of the Interpretation and General Clauses Ordinance (Cap. 1) be extended under section 34(4) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 8 July 2009.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Proposed resolution under the Race Discrimination Ordinance

Hon Paul TSE moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

RESOLVED that in relation to the Code of Practice on Employment under the Race Discrimination Ordinance, published in the Gazette as Government Notice No. 2733 on 8 May 2009 and laid on the table of the Legislative Council on 13 May 2009, the period for amending the Code of Practice referred to in section 63(5) of the Race Discrimination Ordinance (Cap. 602) be extended under section 63(7) of that Ordinance to the meeting of 8 July 2009.

Question on the motion proposed, put and agreed to.

Comprehensive review of the accountability system

Hon WONG Yuk-man moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Government of the Special Administrative Region has made countless blunders in the implementation of policies, since TUNG Chee-hwa introduced the so-called accountability system in 2002, accountability of Directors of Bureau is only empty talk; subsequently, Donald TSANG Yam-kuen adds a wretched sequel to the accountability system by appointing the so-called Under Secretaries and Political Assistants at his own discretion; this provides convenience for authoritarians to hand-pick their deputies, which results in a total collapse of the accountability system and is detrimental to the well-being of the people; this Council urges the Government to conduct a comprehensive review of the accountability system so as to implement fundamental reforms to restore its ability to govern; such reforms include:

- (a) establishing a political system which is truly accountable to the people, and expeditiously implementing dual universal suffrage for the Legislative Council and the Chief Executive elections;
- (b) formulating a political parties law to promote the development of party politics, so as to induce political parties to be truly accountable to their constituents;
- (c) establishing an impeachment mechanism for replacing those officials under the accountability system who are derelict of their duties; and
- (d) clearly defining the roles, functions and powers among the Chief Executive, officials under the accountability system and civil servants.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion proposed.

The President stated that Hon Miriam LAU would move an amendment to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the amendment would be debated together in a joint debate.

Hon Miriam LAU moved the following amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion and spoke on the motion and the amendment:

To delete "the Government of the Special Administrative Region has made countless blunders in the implementation of policies, since TUNG Chee-hwa" after "That" and substitute with "since the Government"; to delete "so-called" after "introduced the"; to delete "accountability of Directors of Bureau is only empty talk; subsequently, Donald TSANG Yam-kuen adds a wretched sequel to the accountability system by appointing the so-called Under Secretaries and Political Assistants at his own discretion; this provides convenience for authoritarians to hand-pick their deputies, which results in a total collapse of the accountability system and is detrimental to the well-being of the people" after "accountability system in 2002," and substitute with "the system has not

been working satisfactorily”; to delete “so as to implement fundamental reforms to restore its ability to govern; such reforms include” after “comprehensive review of the accountability system” and substitute with “, including”; to delete “establishing a political system which is truly accountable to the people, and” after “(a)” and substitute with “improving the accountability system step by step and ensuring that it is fully implemented and, in line with the decision of the Standing Committee of the National People’s Congress on issues relating to universal suffrage,”; to add “considering” after “(b)”;

to delete “, so as to induce political parties to be truly accountable to their constituents” after “party politics”; to delete “establishing an impeachment mechanism for replacing those” after “(c)” and substitute with “enhancing the accountability mechanism for”; to delete “who are derelict of their duties” before “; and (d)” and substitute with “as well as the transparency of the mechanism”; and to add “further” after “defining”.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU’s amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man’s motion proposed.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While the Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs was speaking, the President left the chair at 1:50 pm temporarily and the President’s Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Six Members and Hon Albert HO spoke on the motion and the amendment.

While Hon Albert HO was speaking, Hon Frederick FUNG sought elucidation of a point raised by Hon Albert HO in his speech. Hon Albert HO elucidated and then continued to speak.

Three other Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon Paul CHAN declared that he was a member of the Committee on Review of Post-service Outside Work for Directorate Civil Servants. He then spoke on the motion and the amendment.

One more Member and Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG spoke on the motion and the amendment.

At 3:23 pm, while Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Three more Members spoke on the motion and the amendment.

Hon WONG Yuk-man spoke on the amendment.

The Secretary for Constitutional and Mainland Affairs spoke again.

Question on Hon Miriam LAU's amendment to Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion put.

Hon WONG Kwok-kin claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 24 were present, nine were in favour of the amendment, five against it and 10 abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 24 were present, four were in favour of the amendment, 14 against it and five abstained. (Voting record in Appendix I.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the amendment was negatived.

Hon WONG Yuk-man replied.

Question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion put.

Hon WONG Yuk-man claimed a division. The President then ordered the Council to proceed to a division under Rule 47(1) of the Rules of Procedure.

While the division bell was ringing, Hon CHIM Pui-chung rose and requested the President to be impartial to everybody when chairing Council meetings in future.

The President stated that it was the convention of the Council that Members should not challenge the President's ruling at Council meetings.

Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung rose. He and Hon CHIM Pui-chung then spoke aloud to each other.

The President reminded them that it was not the time for Members to speak and ordered Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung to be seated. As the two Members kept speaking aloud to each other, the President suspended the meeting at 4:20 pm. At this juncture, the division bell had not been rung for three minutes.

The Council resumed at 4:25 pm.

The President ordered that the division on the question on Hon WONG Yuk-man's motion would be held after the division bell had been rung for three minutes.

The President announced that among the Members returned by functional constituencies, 25 were present, two were in favour of the motion, 19 against it and four abstained; while among the Members returned by geographical constituencies through direct elections, 25 were present, 15 were in favour of the motion, eight against it and one abstained. (Voting record in Appendix II.) Since the question was not agreed by a majority of each of the two groups of Members present, he declared that the motion was negated.

Promoting research and development

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That the Task Force on Economic Challenges has identified six economic areas where Hong Kong enjoys clear advantages as the targets of focal development to boost Hong Kong's economic growth and provide job opportunities, and in order to successfully promote the development of these economic areas, Hong Kong must lay a solid foundation for research and development ('R&D'); in this connection, this Council urges the Government to:

- (a) set up committees to make recommendations on policies and various complementary measures for promoting R&D, for implementation by bureaux;
- (b) consolidate and coordinate the existing relevant policies as well as the structures and resources of various related public organizations, so as to more effectively boost Hong Kong's technological R&D business;
- (c) through education and publicity, foster an atmosphere that emphasizes technological research and innovation;
- (d) take the lead in allocating more funding to enhance the capability of technological research, and stipulate the interim and long-term targets that government funding in R&D shall represent a certain proportion of local gross domestic product;
- (e) establish negotiation platforms in conjunction with Guangdong Province and other regions in the Mainland to achieve complementarity of edge, maximal application of R&D results and effective protection of intellectual property;
- (f) formulate policies for nurturing local talents in R&D and systematically bring in overseas professionals under the principle of giving priority to local talents;
- (g) introduce tax concessions and other incentives to encourage private organizations to invest in R&D work in Hong Kong; and

- (h) make optimal use of the land of the existing industrial estates and science park, etc, and expeditiously develop the land in the boundary districts between Hong Kong and Shenzhen for the purposes of technological R&D and talent training, so as to facilitate the establishment of industry clusters.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion proposed.

The President stated that five Members intended to move amendments to the motion. In accordance with the Rules of Procedure, the motion and the five amendments would be debated together in a joint debate.

Dr Hon Samson TAM, Hon Fred LI, Hon Andrew LEUNG, Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and Hon LI Fung-ying, who intended to move amendments to the motion, spoke on the motion and the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Thirteen Members spoke on the motion and the amendments.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou spoke on the amendments.

The Secretary for Commerce and Economic Development spoke again.

Dr Hon Samson TAM moved the following amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion:

To add “, in order to meet the challenges of globalization,” after “That”; to add “improve the existing rotation system of administrative officers to nurture a batch of talents with technological R&D mindset, so that long-term technological research strategies can be implemented effectively; (d)” after “(c)”; to delete the original “(d)” and substitute with “(e)”; to delete the original “(e)” and substitute with “(f)”; to delete the original “(f)” and substitute with “(g) strive for setting up more state partner laboratories in Hong Kong so that Hong Kong may directly participate in more technological research projects at the state level, and assist the relevant industries to strive for participation in formulating the standards for state products; (h)”; to delete “local” after “nurturing”; to delete “systematically” after “in R&D and” and substitute with “strategically”; to delete the original “(g)” and substitute with “(i)”; to add “, and at the same time bring in multinational enterprises to set up R&D centres in Hong Kong to promote the integration of local and overseas technological research capabilities” after “work in Hong Kong”; and to delete the original “(h)” and substitute with “(j)”.

Question on Dr Hon Samson TAM's amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion proposed, put and agreed to.

The President stated that Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and Hon LI Fung-ying had indicated that they would withdraw their amendments to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion if Dr Hon Samson TAM's amendment was passed. Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung and Hon LI Fung-ying had therefore withdrawn their amendments.

As Dr Hon Samson TAM's amendment had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Fred LI to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Fred LI moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; (k) introduce concessionary land premium and concessionary loans to encourage private organizations to operate in the above six economic areas; and (l) collaborate with the cities in the Pearl River Delta region to enhance the promotion of technological research projects on clean fuels (including electricity generation and transport), green construction, effluent treatment and solid waste treatment etc, which can facilitate the transformation of industries and upgrade the quality of life in the region” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Fred LI's amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM proposed, put and agreed to.

As Dr Hon Samson TAM's and Hon Fred LI's amendments had been passed, the President granted leave for Hon Andrew LEUNG to revise the terms of his amendment.

Hon Andrew LEUNG moved the following further amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM and Hon Fred LI, and explained the revised terms of his amendment to the Council:

To add “; and (m) make optimal use of Hong Kong's comprehensive and effective protection regime for intellectual property rights ('IPR') and consider establishing a 'Patent Trademark Authority' to promote Hong Kong as the IPR service centre in the region, so as to attract local and overseas organizations to allocate more resources to R&D work” immediately before the full stop.

Question on Hon Andrew LEUNG's amendment to Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM and Hon Fred LI proposed, put and agreed to.

Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou replied.

Question on Dr Hon PAN Pey-chyou's motion as amended by Dr Hon Samson TAM, Hon Fred LI and Hon Andrew LEUNG put and agreed to.

Motion for the adjournment of the Council

The President said that he had determined under Rule 16(6) and (7) of the Rules of Procedure that if at the expiration of 75 minutes from the moving of this motion, there were Members who still wished to speak, he would extend the period of the debate until all Members who wished to speak had spoken, and the designated public officer had given his reply. As regards the speaking time, each Member might speak up to five minutes, and the designated public officer making a reply might speak up to 15 minutes.

Hon Ronny TONG moved the following motion and spoke on the motion:

That this Council do now adjourn for the purpose of debating the selection of candidates for the post of Chief Executive of the Hong Kong Monetary Authority.

While Hon Ronny TONG was speaking, the President left the chair at 7:37 pm temporarily and the President's Deputy, Hon Miriam LAU, took the chair.

Question on the motion proposed.

Ten Members and Hon Vincent FANG spoke on the motion.

At 8:31 pm, while Hon Vincent FANG was speaking, the President resumed the chair.

Four other Members spoke on the motion.

The Financial Secretary replied.

Question on the motion put and agreed to.

Next meeting

The President declared that the next meeting of the Council would be held on 10 June 2009 at 11:00 am.

The Council was adjourned at 8:58 pm.

(Jasper TSANG Yok-sing)
President
7 July 2009

Council Chamber
Hong Kong

投票 VOTE: 1
 日期 DATE: 03/06/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:13:10 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 劉健儀議員對黃毓民議員的「全面檢討問責制」議案，作出的修正案
 AMENDMENT BY HON MIRIAM LAU TO HON WONG YUK-MAN'S MOTION ON
 "COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF THE ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 劉健儀Miriam LAU

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	24	24	
投票 Vote	24	23	
贊成 Yes	9	4	
反對 No	5	14	
棄權 Abstain	10	5	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	反對 NO
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	反對 NO
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	反對 NO	李華明 Fred LI	反對 NO
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	棄權 ABSTAIN
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	反對 NO
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	棄權 ABSTAIN	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	贊成 YES	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	反對 NO
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	反對 NO
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	贊成 YES	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	贊成 YES	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	反對 NO
方剛 Vincent FANG	贊成 YES	余若薇 Audrey EU	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	贊成 YES
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	棄權 ABSTAIN	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	反對 NO
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	棄權 ABSTAIN	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	反對 NO
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	棄權 ABSTAIN
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU		湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	反對 NO
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	贊成 YES	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	反對 NO
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	贊成 YES	李慧琼 Starry LEE	
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	棄權 ABSTAIN
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	反對 NO	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	反對 NO
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	贊成 YES	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	贊成 YES
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	反對 NO
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyou	贊成 YES	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	贊成 YES
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	反對 NO
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	贊成 YES	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	贊成 YES

投票 VOTE: 2
 日期 DATE: 03/06/2009
 時間 TIME: 04:27:52 下午pm

動議 MOTION: 「全面檢討問責制」議案
 MOTION ON "COMPREHENSIVE REVIEW OF THE ACCOUNTABILITY SYSTEM"

動議人 MOVED BY: 黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man

	功能團體 Functional Constituencies	地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	最後結果 Final Result
出席 Present	25	25	
投票 Vote	25	24	
贊成 Yes	2	15	
反對 No	19	8	
棄權 Abstain	4	1	
結果 Result	否決 Negatived	通過 Passed	否決 Negatived

個別表決如下 THE INDIVIDUAL VOTES WERE AS FOLLOWS:

議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE	議員 MEMBER	投票 VOTE
功能團體 Functional Constituencies		地方選區 Geographical Constituencies	
何鍾泰 Dr Raymond HO	反對 NO	曾鈺成 TSANG Yok-sing	出席 PRESENT
李國寶 Dr David LI		何俊仁 Albert HO	贊成 YES
吳靄儀 Dr Margaret NG		李卓人 LEE Cheuk-yan	贊成 YES
張文光 CHEUNG Man-kwong	贊成 YES	李華明 Fred LI	贊成 YES
梁劉柔芬 Mrs Sophie LEUNG	反對 NO	涂謹申 James TO	
黃宜弘 Dr Philip WONG	反對 NO	陳鑑林 CHAN Kam-lam	反對 NO
黃容根 WONG Yung-kan	反對 NO	梁耀忠 LEUNG Yiu-chung	贊成 YES
劉皇發 LAU Wong-fat	反對 NO	劉江華 LAU Kong-wah	反對 NO
劉健儀 Miriam LAU	反對 NO	劉慧卿 Emily LAU	贊成 YES
霍震霆 Timothy FOK		鄭家富 Andrew CHENG	贊成 YES
石禮謙 Abraham SHEK	反對 NO	譚耀宗 TAM Yiu-chung	反對 NO
李鳳英 LI Fung-ying	棄權 ABSTAIN	陳偉業 Albert CHAN	
張宇人 Tommy CHEUNG	反對 NO	馮檢基 Frederick FUNG	贊成 YES
方剛 Vincent FANG	反對 NO	余若薇 Audrey EU	
李國麟 Dr Joseph LEE		王國興 WONG Kwok-hing	反對 NO
林健鋒 Jeffrey LAM	反對 NO	李永達 LEE Wing-tat	贊成 YES
梁君彥 Andrew LEUNG	反對 NO	梁家傑 Alan LEONG	贊成 YES
黃定光 WONG Ting-kwong	反對 NO	梁國雄 LEUNG Kwok-hung	贊成 YES
詹培忠 CHIM Pui-chung	棄權 ABSTAIN	張學明 CHEUNG Hok-ming	反對 NO
劉秀成 Prof Patrick LAU	反對 NO	湯家驊 Ronny TONG	
林大輝 Dr LAM Tai-fai	棄權 ABSTAIN	甘乃威 KAM Nai-wai	贊成 YES
陳茂波 Paul CHAN	反對 NO	何秀蘭 Cyd HO	贊成 YES
陳健波 CHAN Kin-por	反對 NO	李慧琼 Starry LEE	
梁家驩 Dr LEUNG Ka-lau		陳克勤 CHAN Hak-kan	反對 NO
張國柱 CHEUNG Kwok-che	贊成 YES	陳淑莊 Tanya CHAN	贊成 YES
葉偉明 IP Wai-ming	反對 NO	梁美芬 Dr Priscilla LEUNG	反對 NO
葉國謙 IP Kwok-him	反對 NO	黃成智 WONG Sing-chi	贊成 YES
潘佩璆 Dr PAN Pey-chyau	反對 NO	黃國健 WONG Kwok-kin	反對 NO
謝偉俊 Paul TSE	棄權 ABSTAIN	黃毓民 WONG Yuk-man	贊成 YES
譚偉豪 Dr Samson TAM	反對 NO	葉劉淑儀 Mrs Regina IP	棄權 ABSTAIN