

**立法會**  
**Legislative Council**

LC Paper No. CB(3) 660/08-09

Ref : CB(3)/M/MM

Tel : 2869 9205

Date : 5 June 2009

From : Clerk to the Legislative Council

To : All Members of the Legislative Council

---

**Council meeting of 10 June 2009**

**Proposed amendments to motion on  
“Immediately reviewing the  
Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme”**

Further to LC Paper No. CB(3) 639/08-09 issued on 27 May 2009, Hon Starry LEE Wai-king and Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yun have respectively given notice of their intention to move separate amendments to Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s motion on “Immediately reviewing the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme” scheduled for the Council meeting of 10 June 2009. As directed by the President, Hon Starry LEE’s and Hon Tommy CHEUNG’s amendments will be printed in the terms in which they were handed in on the Agenda of the Council.

2. To assist Members in debating the above motion and the two amendments, I set out below the procedure to be followed during the debate:

- (a) Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong moves his motion;
- (b) the President proposes the question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s motion, and orders a joint debate;
- (c) the President calls on the two Members, who intend to move amendments, to speak in the following order, but no amendment is to be moved at this stage:
  - (i) Hon Starry LEE; and
  - (ii) Hon Tommy CHEUNG;

- (d) the President calls upon the designated public officer(s) to speak;
- (e) joint debate on the motion and the two amendments follows thereafter;
- (f) the President gives leave to Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong to speak for the second time on the two amendments;
- (g) the President calls upon the designated public officer(s) again to speak;
- (h) in accordance with Rule 34(5) of the Rules of Procedure, the President has decided that he will call upon the two Members to move their respective amendments in the order set out in paragraph (c) above. The President invites Hon Starry LEE to move her amendment to the motion, and forthwith proposes and puts to vote the question on the amendment;
- (i) after Hon Starry LEE's amendment has been voted upon, the President deals with Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment to the motion; and
- (j) after Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment has been dealt with, the President calls upon Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong to reply. Thereafter, the President puts to vote the question on Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong's motion, or his motion as amended, as the case may be.

3. For Members' ease of reference, the terms of the original motion and of the motion, if amended, are set out in the **Appendix**.

( Mrs Justina LAM )  
for Clerk to the Legislative Council

Encl.

(Translation)

**Motion debate on  
“Immediately reviewing the  
Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme”  
to be held at the Legislative Council meeting  
of Wednesday, 10 June 2009**

**1. Hon CHEUNG Man-kwong’s original motion**

That, the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme, since its implementation in the 2007-2008 school year, has given rise to a number of problems, including the failure of the policy on fee remission which has rendered a number of parents having to pay higher school fees; moreover, the Administration has abolished the proposed pay scale for kindergarten teachers, resulting in the loss of salary protection for kindergarten teachers, who can hardly enjoy salary increase even after upgrading their qualifications, whereas pressure from work and studies has substantially increased; as the voucher system has aroused strong discontent among the early childhood education sector and parents of kindergarten children, this Council urges the Administration to immediately conduct a comprehensive review on the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme, including:

- (a) reviewing the Kindergarten Fee Remission Scheme and adjusting the level of fee remission in accordance with price indices, so as to ensure that low-income families receive appropriate assistance;
- (b) comprehensively reviewing the various subsidies for early childhood education institutions, including increasing the manpower and resources for whole-day kindergartens;
- (c) offering subsidies under the voucher scheme on a fair and equal basis so that all kindergarten children are benefited;
- (d) formulating a pay scale for kindergarten teachers which is commensurate with their qualifications, and directly subsidizing the remuneration of kindergarten teachers, so as to relieve the burden on parents; and
- (e) relieving the work pressure on kindergarten teachers, including simplifying the administrative work arising from self-evaluation, external evaluation and the voucher scheme, as well as providing sufficient support staff, etc.

## 2. Motion as amended by Hon Starry LEE Wai-king

That, *the purpose of introducing the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme is to lessen the financial burden of parents and provide them with direct fee subsidy, but* the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme, since its implementation in the 2007-2008 school year, has given rise to a number of problems, including the failure of the policy on fee remission which has rendered a number of parents having to pay higher school fees; moreover, the Administration has abolished the proposed pay scale for kindergarten teachers, resulting in the loss of salary protection for kindergarten teachers, who can hardly enjoy salary increase even after upgrading their qualifications, whereas pressure from work and studies has substantially increased; as the voucher system has aroused strong discontent among the early childhood education sector and parents of kindergarten children, this Council urges the Administration to immediately conduct a comprehensive review on the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme, including:

- (a) reviewing the Kindergarten Fee Remission Scheme and adjusting the level of fee remission ~~in accordance with~~ *with reference to the changes in* price indices *on an annual basis*, so as to ensure that low-income families receive appropriate assistance;
- (b) comprehensively reviewing the various subsidies for early childhood education institutions, ~~including~~ *as well as* increasing the manpower and resources for ~~whole-day kindergartens~~ *such institutions, so as to ensure the quality of early childhood education;*
- (c) offering subsidies under the voucher scheme on a fair and equal basis so that all kindergarten children are benefited *and parents are free to choose the early childhood education institutions;*
- (d) formulating a pay scale for kindergarten teachers which is commensurate with their qualifications, and directly subsidizing the remuneration of kindergarten teachers, so as to relieve the burden on parents; ~~and~~
- (e) relieving the work pressure on kindergarten teachers, including simplifying the administrative work arising from self-evaluation, external evaluation and the voucher scheme, as well as providing sufficient support staff, etc; *and*
- (f) *allowing kindergarten teachers who are still taking Certificate in Early Childhood Education courses at the end of the 2011-2012 school year to keep their teaching posts.*

Note: Hon Starry LEE's amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.

### 3. Motion as amended by Hon Tommy CHEUNG Yu-yan

That, the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme, since its implementation in the 2007-2008 school year, has given rise to a number of problems, including the failure of the policy on fee remission which has rendered a number of parents having to pay higher school fees; moreover, the Administration has abolished the proposed pay scale for kindergarten teachers, resulting in the loss of salary protection for kindergarten teachers, who can hardly enjoy salary increase even after upgrading their qualifications, whereas pressure from work and studies has substantially increased; ***as furthermore, the requirement of the voucher system that only students studying in eligible non-profit-making kindergartens may receive fee subsidies has also restricted parents' freedom in choosing kindergartens; and given that*** the voucher system has aroused strong discontent among the early childhood education sector and parents of kindergarten children, this Council urges the Administration to immediately conduct a comprehensive review on the Pre-primary Education Voucher Scheme, including:

- (a) reviewing the Kindergarten Fee Remission Scheme and adjusting the level of fee remission in accordance with price indices, so as to ensure that low-income families receive appropriate assistance;
- (b) comprehensively reviewing the various subsidies for early childhood education institutions, including increasing the manpower and resources for whole-day kindergartens;
- (c) offering subsidies under the voucher scheme on a fair and equal basis so that all kindergarten children are benefited;
- (d) formulating a pay scale for kindergarten teachers which is commensurate with their qualifications, and directly subsidizing the remuneration of kindergarten teachers, so as to relieve the burden on parents; ~~and~~
- (e) relieving the work pressure on kindergarten teachers, including simplifying the administrative work arising from self-evaluation, external evaluation and the voucher scheme, as well as providing sufficient support staff, etc;
- (f) ***reviewing the mechanism under which kindergarten teachers are subsidized to pursue further studies, so that teachers working in independent private kindergartens or non-profit-making kindergartens which do not receive or cannot benefit from voucher subsidies and those working in kindergartens receiving voucher subsidies may enjoy the same opportunities and subsidies for further studies, thereby eliminating the unfair treatment faced by kindergarten teachers in receiving subsidies for further studies;***
- (g) ***expeditiously resolving the discrepancies between the voucher system and the various fee subsidy schemes for child care centres and kindergartens, so***

*as to avoid the problem of parents with financial difficulties having to pay higher school fees after the implementation of the voucher system; and*

- (h) *immediately reviewing the existing problem that the proportion of voucher subsidies received by students attending whole-day kindergartens is substantially lower than that received by students attending half-day kindergartens, as well as appropriately raising the proportion, so that parents of whole-day students can receive subsidies in a fair manner.*

Note: Hon Tommy CHEUNG's amendment is marked in *bold and italic type* or with deletion line.